Nigerian Taxi Drivers in Dublin: The Preferred Narrative Versus the Lived Experience

A dissertation submitted to the Department of Sociology
at Trinity College, in fulfilment of the requirements for the
award of Doctor of Philosophy

May 2023

Robert Sean O'Keeffe
Trinity College Dublin
University of Dublin

Declaration

I declare that this thesis has not been submitted as an exercise for a degree at this or any other university and it is entirely my own work.

I agree to deposit this thesis in the University's open access institutional repository or allow the Library to do so on my behalf, subject to Irish Copyright Legislation and Trinity College Library conditions of use and acknowledgement.

I consent to the examiner retaining a copy of the thesis beyond the examining period, should they so wish (EU GDPR May 2018).

Robert O'Keeffe

Summary

The liberalisation of the Irish taxi industry in 2000 coincided with the Irish State becoming a place of net immigration for the first time in its history (Ruhs, 2005). Over the following decade, Dublin's taxi fleet increased from 3000 to 15,000, and the oversupply created a highly competitive industry. During this time, many migrants became taxi drivers and a racialised discourse emerged that focused on African drivers (Jaichand, 2010; Maguire and Murphy, 2012). This racialisation corresponds to the wider discursive construction of the 'uncivilized Nigerian' who have become a particularly stigmatised group in Irish society (Fanning, 2018; McGee, 2003; Lentin and Moreo, 2012). The Dublin taxi industry presents a unique field in which Nigerians converge with an almost complete cross-section of society. I therefore focus on Nigerian taxi drivers' lived experience in Dublin and examine how they interpret and respond to racism.

The data for this qualitative research is sourced through in-depth interviews with twenty-eight Nigerian taxi drivers and taxi rank observation. I also draw on the findings of my master's dissertation, which was based on interviews with ten Irish taxi drivers and customers (O'Keeffe, 2013), as well as my own experience driving a taxi in Dublin for eleven years (2002-2013). I incorporate Michel Laguerre's (1999) spatial framework to establish how the various spatial sites that Nigerians occupy in the industry are experienced. The theoretical framework incorporates Gramsci´s ´hegemonic theory´ (1971) and Foucault's ´governmentality´ (1991) to examine the relationship of 'race' to power in the Irish State and the conduct of the self. I examine the dominant hegemonic discourses, or ´regimes of truth´, that establish and reproduce racism through three main theoretical strands - ´race´, ´racial neoliberalism´, and 'everyday racism'. Philomena Essed's concept of 'everyday racism' (2002) helps illustrate the systemic nature of racism that flows between institutions and individuals. However, it is not only racism that defines respondents experience and I examine the importance of Pentecostalism and family values that help explain respondents attitude to work and individual agency.

The interviews took place between 2015 and 2018 and are contextualised against the backdrop of the global recession in 2008, which saw an escalation of the ´multicultural crisis´ discourse and the process of ´(in)securitisation´ (Bigo, 2012). The ´legitimising´ discourses of ´incompatibility´ and ´security´ inform how Nigerian taxi drivers are narrated and, as I argue within, provided consent for 're-regulated deregulation' in the 2013 Taxi Regulation Act (Irish Statute Book, 2013). I examine the neoliberal rationalities of new surveillance technologies that allowed the industry better able to self-regulate and police. I argue this 'recapture' assisted existing racism and the common practice of choosing White taxi drivers over Black taxi drivers. New technologies, such as the TFI Taxi Driver Check App and FreeNow, allowed racism to move from overt acts to covert acts which are now practiced from the privacy of the mobile phone. Having established the conditions of current racisms, the aim of this research is to privilege the 'subjugated knowledge' (Foucault, 1980: 81) of Nigerian taxi drivers as revealed through lived experience. I examine this knowledge against the dominant 'regimes of ´truth´ and the current racialised representation in mainstream discourse. The findings show that although Nigerians reproduce hegemonic discourses and display the attributes of ´good diversity´, they are nonetheless continually narrated as ´bad diversity´. Ultimately, respondents are unable to escape ´Afrophobia´ (Michael, 2015) and ´the fact of blackness´ (Fanon, 1967) to make access to 'model minority' space (Laguerre, 1999), let alone to majority space, practically impossible.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Table of Contents

Chapter One: Introduction

Introduction

The liberalisation of the Irish taxi industry in 2000 coincided with the Irish state becoming a place of net-immigration for the first time in its history (Ruhs, 2005: 7). Over the following decade, Dublin's taxi fleet increased from 3,000 to 15,000 to include significant numbers of Nigerian drivers as well as many Irish from the margins of the economy (Goodbody Economic Consultants, 2009). The oversupply created a highly competitive industry and the emergence of a racialised discourse that depicted Black Africans as 'bogus' operators to justify exclusionary practices (Jaichand, 2010; Maguire and Murphy, 2012). This racialisation corresponds to the wider discursive construction of the 'uncivilized Nigerian', who have become a particularly stigmatised group in Irish society (McGee, 2003; Haynes, Breen, and Devereux, 2005, 2006). In Ireland, institutional and individual racism effect those who do not conform to 'Irish norms' and the existing literature outlines the significant historical and contemporary racism towards Traveller, Roma, Jewish, and Muslim populations, as well as non-White groups (Fanning, 2002; J. O'Connell, 2002; Joyce, 2018; Joseph, 2018; Carr, 2014; Lentin, 2008). Although the processes involved in constructing the racialised Other are similar, racisms vary in that they are marked by different experiences and are predicated on various signifiers, such as phenotypical features, that are deemed outside constructions of Irishness. The Dublin taxi industry presents a unique field, or zone of encounter, in which Nigerians converge with an almost complete cross-section of society. I therefore focus on Nigerian taxi drivers' lived experience in Dublin and examine how they interpret and respond to the discursive construction of their identity and the material effects of this in their working lives.

The data is sourced primarily through in-depth interviews with 28 Nigerian taxi drivers and taxi rank observation. I also draw on the findings of my master's dissertation, based on interviews with ten Irish taxi drivers and customers (O'Keeffe, 2013), as well as my own experience driving a taxi in Dublin for eleven years between 2002 and 2013. When I first began working as a taxi driver there was hostility towards all new taxi drivers from the pre-deregulation drivers who were angry at the opening of the market. However, as a steady stream of new drivers entered the industry and the attention turned toward Black and Nigerian drivers, I noticed how hostility and racialised language became normalised. I witnessed daily racialised practices such as customers refusing to use Black taxi drivers. My experience corresponds to existing

research that highlighted this trend as far back as 2007 when the National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism (NCCRI) voiced concerns that a "significant number of black drivers have reported racist incidents at taxi ranks [claiming] some passengers refuse to get into their cars… and some white colleagues are accepting these passengers" (Irish Times, 2007). On the occasions at ranks when a customer chose me on account of my Whiteness, I often asked why they did not take the first taxi. The replies varied from, "they don't know where they're going," to, "I like to support local drivers" or, "Nigerian drivers always try to rip you off" (O'Keeffe, 2013). I would often talk to the first driver on the rank and say, *"I have a racist customer, do you mind if I take them?"*. The majority were appreciative, and it sometimes developed into conversations about racism in the industry and their feelings around it. On many occasions, the passenger waiting in my taxi would see what was happening and either walk off or take the next available White driver.

I was therefore drawn to this research by witnessing the racism directed at Black and Nigerian taxi drivers. Participant observation effectively began during this period in which I recognised my economic advantage as a White/Irish taxi driver and the regular practice of customers choosing White/Irish drivers over Black/African drivers. I began to develop critical insight into the privilege of occupying White Irish ethnocentric majority space. My undergraduate thesis and my master's dissertation focused on racism in the taxi industry, first from the perspective of the State and then from the perspective of Irish taxi drivers and customers. As an undergraduate, I framed my thesis around governmental regulatory structures and focused on existing legislature, policy measures, and the role of the Commission for Taxi Regulation (now absorbed into the NTA). In my master's dissertation I focused on public perceptions to examine how racism is spoken of and practiced in the industry (O'Keeffe, 2013). In this dissertation I now centre the voice of Nigerians by examining their lived experience working in the Dublin taxi industry.

The interviews took place between 2015-2018 and are contextualised against the backdrop of the global recession in 2008 which saw an escalation of the ´multicultural crisis´ discourse that, as I argue within, helped facilitate consent for a process of ´(in)securitisation´ (Bigo, 2012) through 're-regulated deregulation' provided by the Taxi Regulation Act in 2013 (Irish Statute Book, 2013). This marked a transitional period in the industry in which taxi licence holders in Ireland fell from its peak of 47,000 in 2009 to 36,976 in 2015 (NTA, 2016) and a further drop to 26,012 in 2017 (Macarthaigh, 2019). Re-regulated deregulation therefore signalled a key moment in the industry and

in this dissertation I examine both the neoliberal governmentality of this intervention and the implications of this on Nigerian taxi drivers' lived experience. I chart the shifting nature of how 'race' and racism is talked about and practiced, and the effect of new technologies of surveillance implemented during this period. This moment of 'recapture' left the industry better able to self-regulate and, as explored throughout, marked the move from overt forms of racialised exclusion to racism now being practiced through the privacy of mobile phones.

In this chapter I outline the issues of researching 'race' from a position of privilege. I also examine the constraints of the language I use in theorising 'race', the risk of reproducing 'race', and positioning the migrant Other within a 'grid of debt' (Back, 2007). I then discuss the gap in the existing literature, the central thematic strands that are the focus of this research, and the research questions that underpin this dissertation. Finally, I provide a summary of each subsequent chapter and explain how they relate to the literature and conceptual debates relevant to this research.

1. Researching 'Race' and the 'Treacherous Bind'

The central tension in the study of 'race' is the issue of reproducing the categorisations of which I am trying to deconstruct (Holloway, 2010: 78). This is the paradox of 'antiracist racism' whereby to combat racism it is necessary to use the same categories as those implicated in oppression (Sartre, 1963; Jeanpierre, 1965). This is what Rajagopalan Radhakrishnan calls the 'treacherous bind' in the continued use and reliance upon racial and ethnic categories that can be complicit with racial typologies and thinking (Radhakrishnan, 1996). I argue that the first step to overcoming racism is to embrace the collective identity as part of the struggle against racism (Judaken, 2008: 34). However, strategic essentialism risks reproducing 'race' unless it is "marshalled as part of a committed effort to explode the racial order as a whole" (Judaken, 2008: 34).

Careful attention to language is therefore required to warn against reproducing categories of 'race' and ethnicity as defining core inherent experiences. On this, Paul Gilroy argues that we need to stop seeing Black life as nothing more than an answer to racism that moves "on to the ideological circuit which makes us visible in two complementary roles – the problem and the victim" (Gilroy, 2002: 263). He says antiracism seems comfortable with this idea of Blacks as victims which must be rejected outright (Ibid). Imogen Tyler says classifications such as this operate as a form of governance which legitimises the reproduction and entrenchment of inequalities

and injustices (Tyler, 2013: 212). However, rather than condemning all research on 'race' and ethnicity as ultimately oppressive, Yasmin Gunaratnam argues that what is needed is a 'doubled' research practice that works both with and against racialised categories, and that make the links between lived experience, political relations, and the production of knowledge (Gunaratnam, 2003: 23). My task, therefore, is to engage with, understand, and support the emergence of 'declassificatory politics' that attempt to reconstitute those who are in some way labelled 'revolting' (Tyler, 2013).

2. Problematising Language and Positioning the Migrant Other

My first concern is to understand my motive for researching Nigerians lived experience of racism and examine my 'entitlement' to speak on these issues. This is particularly important considering conversations on racial equality are often mediated through Irish eyes. Ruadhán Mac Cormaic points out that although migrants use various media to portray their own lives and experiences these alternative narratives rarely impinge on the wider public consciousness (Mac Cormaic, 2007). Elena Moreo said the most striking aspect of events related to migrant integration and equality is that most speakers were White academics, NGO spokespersons, and journalists (Moreo, 2012: 73-74). Moreo said this is indicative of the scarcity of public space available to migrants to speak about their own experiences in their own terms and according to their own agendas (Ibid). Bryan Fanning addressed this issue quoting the slogan used by disability activists 'nothing about us without us' (Fanning, 2021: 117). He says the expertise to make integration work needs to be developed with the participation of those who are supposed to benefit (Ibid).

Les Back argues for a type of sociology that embraces the commitment to interpretation without legislation and says the sociologist's job is to "pay attention to the fragments, the voices and stories that are otherwise passed over or ignored" (Back, 2007: 2). This kind of sociology offers an opportunity to hear those who are not listened to and challenges the claims placed on the meaning of events in the past and in the present (Back, 2007: 2). This requires the recognition of the limitations of language through careful and reflexive attention to guard against misinterpretation, homogenisation, and the positioning of racialised groups into marginalised spaces. I therefore aim to sensitively make meaning out of Nigerian lived experience against the backdrop of the social world in which it takes place. As such, I pay close attention to the words used to try to mitigate against the propensity of language to shape meaning

rather than convey meaning. This is particularly important considering discourses on migration are often racially loaded. Terms such as 'migrant', 'Nigerian', 'inclusion', 'diversity' and 'integration' all risk reproducing 'race' and homogenising whole groups into a few essential characteristics.

Existing research also points to the compulsory gratitude expected for the host's 'charity' from those who made it past the border (Sennett, 2003; Arendt, 1963; Back, 2006, 2007). Back says that 'race' is now spoken primarily through the ´immigration line´, replacing the 'colour line´ (Du Bois, 1903) and 'diversity' (Hall, 1997b) as "the fate of the modern world" (Back, 2007: 31). A 'grid of immigration' has thus been established to create a relationship of debt and gratitude between host and migrant. On this Back says the host is cast as being gracious and as granting the exile a favour and the immigrant is forced to express gratitude (Back, 2007: 41-2). The script is therefore already written in 'the project of assimilation' whereby immigrants have to become like wider society (Back, 2007: 42).

The commitment to interpretation without legislation must therefore be willing to question the interconnection of 'race' and nation, along with the corresponding language that defines the terms of citizenship and belonging. Paul Gilroy said, "the figure of the immigrant is a part of the very intellectual mechanism that holds us – post-colonial Europeans, black and white, indeterminate and unclassifiable – hostage" (Gilroy, 2004: 165). Categories like the 'illegal immigrant' and 'bogus asylum seeker' retain their power and currency precisely because they provide the limit point of who belongs and who does not (Back, 2007: 41-2). Back says this is ultimately about the legacy of racial thinking and Whiteness "that continues to provide a privileged passport to those who seek to move across the lines drawn around European nation states" (Back, 2007: 41-43).

In the Irish political landscape, the 'grid of immigration' is inserted into discourses on integration. Lentin and Moreo say that the Irish state has established a complex classification system to delineate 'good diversity' versus 'bad diversity' that is marked on racialised lines (Lentin and Moreo, 2012: 6). Early on these lines were drawn in the classification of asylum seekers in which the State and media began to construct them as a problem with terms such as ´floods of refugees´ and ´refugees on the rampage´ (Guerin, 2002). The classification system differentiated between 'deserving' programme refugee, who had been invited, and 'undeserving' asylum seekers, who arrived uninvited (Lentin, 2012). Various other euphemisms were later employed, such as ´non-nationals´ and 'foreign nationals', as rhetorical strategies that disguise the

5

racialisation and homogenisation of the non-White Other. Irish discourses on immigration and integration are infused with these terms and are important rhetorical devices to maintain division between Irishness and the Other.

John Holloway pointed out that the reification involved in 'identification' is a source of fetishisation of all socially categorised groups (Holloway, 2010: 78). I therefore recognise the danger language inserts and aim to make explicit the meanings of problematic terms I use throughout such as 'race', Nigerian, migrant, inclusion, integration, and diversity. Throughout the writing process I tried to remain conscious of the power of language and its ability to position migrants into minority spaces. However, the use of the universalising terms such as ´race´, ´multiculturalism´, and ´migrant´ are necessary to discuss the research findings. Lentin and Moreo say these concepts are indispensable and we need to use them 'under erasure' until a more adequate language is developed:

> In order to think and act, we must position ourselves within contemporary language games on the underside, the disturbed, subverted side of the positive concepts. (Lentin and Moreo, 2011: 6)

While I also use the homogenising term ´migrant´ to refer to Nigerian taxi drivers who migrated to Ireland during their lifetime, I accept that this terminology is contested (see Fanning, 2018: 3). Equally, describing a Nigerian 'community' is problematic due to the inherent essentialised properties and false sense of unity it implies (Landy, 2011; Naples, 2003: 57). The Nigerian 'community', like any community, is fractured and diverse and using this term is problematic due to the inherent hierarchal structures and forms of exclusion it defines.

One simple example that emerged early on in this research was the use of the term 'Nigerian' which is problematic because several participants identified as Biafran. Others commented on the colonial legacy in the establishment of the Nigerian nation, that artificially merged over 250 ethnic groups, and have not conceptualised this 'imagined community' into their identity. Regardless, each of the 28 participants accepted the term Nigerian to describe themselves in the context of this research. Despite the problematic nature of the term 'community' I occasionally use the term but remain conscious of its reductive properties. No doubt, and despite my efforts, other problematic terms remain that expose my positionality in majority culture. While I can never fully escape the conditioning of my unique social location I nonetheless tried to remain reflexive throughout the whole research process.

As discussed, the ability of language to shape meaning can lead to the reproduction of 'race', the centring of 'Irish norms', and the creation of figurative border guards that justify the literal ones. In chapter three I discuss these issues in more detail and provide a clear definition of racism as understood in the context of this research. I provide a comprehensive review of the literature on 'race', racial formations, and its relevance to the context of the Dublin taxi industry.

3. The Gap in the Literature

Existing research on migrant integration in Ireland and across Europe tends to be policy-driven rather than exploratory and there are increasing claims to the value of qualitative research looking at the lived experiences of racialised groups (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 3; Phenninx, Spenser, and Van Hear, 2008: 7). Policy-driven research is sometimes criticised because it fails to account for the effects of 'everyday racism' and the experience of those who are subject to racism 'vanishes from the scene' (Omi and Winant, 1986). As I discuss in chapter two, quantitative studies consistently show that Nigerians are the most disadvantaged group in the Irish labour market despite being one of the most well educated. However, I argue that a non-critical stance can overlook 'race' as a factor and lead to the conclusion that labour-market differentials are due to a deficit in capacity, experience, or qualifications (Zuberi, 2008; Joseph, 2018: 25).

In this research I examine the circumstances that have led the significant presence Nigerians in the taxi industry. I examine their lived experience while working to explore the tactics they employ toward integration and how those tactics are received by the host population. It adds to the existing literature to provide further insight into what integration means for respondents, how this is perceived by the host population, and how 'race' and racism is talked about and practiced. I compared the preferred narrative – how they are discursively constructed by the host society – against this lived experience.

Based on my previous research the salience of 'race' is established, and I draw on the literature around 'race' and racism in both the Irish and the wider global context. However, I use a predominantly grounded theoretical approach and much of the theory incorporated is designed to contextualise the voices of Nigerian taxi drivers against the broader social setting in which they are spoken. As I discus in the literature review, Ireland is considered an exemplar neoliberal state and that neoliberal rationalities are at the centre of government and academic responses to immigration.

Research is therefore often framed within the 'grid of immigration' in which 'good diversity' are those self-managing migrants capable seamlessly integrating from below. 'Bad diversity' are those on the margins and 'racism', where it appears, is the product of those incapable of 'integration' (Gray, 2011). I therefore examine how these neoliberal rationalities, with its inherent post-race standpoint, relate to contemporary racisms in the context of the taxi industry. However, it is not only 'race' that informs respondents lived experience and I provide examples of solidarity from wider society. I also emphasise the significance of Pentecostalism and family values to explain participants attitudes to work and individual agency.

The aim of this research is to disrupt their misrecognition under the few essentialised characteristics that have sustained anti-Nigerian racism in Ireland over recent decades. I seek the 'subjugated knowledge' found within the lived experience of anti-Nigerian racism by centring the voices of the racialised (Foucault, 1980: 81). I therefore place central importance on the testimonies and lived reality of those who experience racism while also theorising those voices. This research therefore provides a deeper understanding of racism by sourcing subjugated knowledge that is often undervalued in favour of top-down knowledge. While the research is exploratory, it is nonetheless underpinned by the argument that aversion to such subjugated knowledges forecloses deeper understanding and prevents, intentional or otherwise, any meaningful action toward combatting racism and a fairer redistribution of power.

4. The Central Themes and Research Questions

The three central themes that emerged are 1) the 'Discursive construction of Nigerians in opposition to the 'Irish family'', 2) 'Regulation and the State' and, 3) 'Nigerian attitudes to work and Individual agency'. As I discuss in chapter three, I adopt Pierre Laguerre's spatial framework (1999) under 'race' to map out the various sites in which Nigerian taxi drivers are excluded from 'majority space' and forced to occupy 'minority space'. The three overarching spatial sites relevant to the themes are the 'ideological site', the 'structural site', and the 'locational site'. Below I outline the research questions related to these themes with an overview of the related theories and spatial sites incorporated to examine them.

1) In what ways are Nigerian taxi drivers discursively constructed in opposition to concepts of Irishness, how do they perceive this, how is this experienced in exclusionary ways, and what tactics do they employ to change this narrative?

Throughout the interviews respondents consistently talked about their desire to integrate into their new 'Irish family' and the difficulties they faced in doing so. This is a central theme that is examined in each of the findings chapters. They described a 'moral panic' between 2011-2015 in which they experienced heightened discursive hostility towards them in the media and while working. This is examined under 'representational site', a subheading of the ideological site, in which the preferred narrative is constructed in opposition to conceptualisations of Irishness. Postcolonial theories of 'race' (Said, 1979; Hall, 1996, 1997), the 'fact of Blackness' (Fanon, 1969) as well as the concepts of 'banal nationalism' (Billig, 2017) and the 'ideal citizen' (Sassen, 2002) are incorporated to illustrate how conceptualisations of 'Irishness' are mobilised to 'justify' the regulation of majority space that exclude participants. This is examined against the backdrop of the 'multicultural crisis' discourse at that time which utilised the trope of 'security' leading toward a process of (in)securitisation (Bigo, 2006, 2012). I also examine this against the current debates on the rise of nativist populism and conceptualisations of Irishness as White.

2) How is regulation and the State subjectively experienced by respondents and how does this inform the spaces they occupy? Throughout the interviews, respondents described different experience depending on the locations they were working. Here I examine Irish modes of neoliberal governance and how power is exercised through Gramsci's concept of 'hegemony' (1971) and Foucault's concept of 'governmentality' (1991). I examine the impact of various legislation, related to both the taxi industry and immigration generally, on the regulation of the spaces Nigerian taxi drivers can occupy while working. These are mapped through Laguerre's 'structural' and 'locational sites' and theorised through Essed's concept of 'everyday racism' (2002) to show how the city centre, the suburbs, and Dublin airport are regulated and experienced. Here I examine the specific forms of exclusions experienced in each space that help explain a much higher concentration of Nigerians working in the 'cosmopolitan' city centre compared to the 'parochial' suburbs where discriminatory practices are more common. I also examine how the specific regulation of the Dublin Airport taxi holding area has created a 'safe space' for respondents free from the exclusionary practices experienced elsewhere.

3) What are Nigerians attitudes to work and how do they exert individual agency in a hostile working environment? Most participants refuse to be defined in racialised terms and provide alternative narratives in which they present themselves as hard working, ethical, and determined to become valuable and valued members of Irish

society. While 'race' is a dominant factor, it only offers a partial explanation of respondents lived experience. Other themes emerged that add insight and help explain responses to discrimination, such as Pentecostalism, family values, and the internalisation of neoliberal ideologies. These are explored against the wider structural context of neoliberalism that underpins this research. This theme is explored through respondents response to the 'ideological site' (Laguerre, 1999) and informs each of the findings chapters. In chapter seven I examine the importance of Pentecostalism and family values that determine much of respondents approach to work and individual agency.

In the following section I provide a summary of each of the following chapters in this dissertation. They are designed to address these research questions in the context of the current conceptual debates and existing literature on immigration and racism in Ireland.

5. Dissertation Structure

In chapter two I provide a review of the relevant literature related to the data that emerged from those interviewed in this research. All respondents are all fluent English speakers, many have high levels of education, and most described the difficulties they had accessing work. I therefore review African and Nigerian lived experience in Ireland with a particular focus on education, language fluency, African Pentecostalism, and family. I outline the existing literature on discrimination in the labour market to help explain Nigerian taxi drivers' presence in the taxi industry. I also provide a review of the literature on African experiences working in the taxi industry as well as comparable industries such as Dublin Bus. I examine the literature on Afrophobia, policing practices, and the debates on the reporting of racism. Finally, I outline the various policies and legislations related to migrant integration in Ireland over the last two decades as well as a legislative process chart of government intervention in the taxi industry.

In chapter three, I outline the theoretical framework of the dissertation. I illustrate the salience of 'race' to this research by arguing that the system of racial classification is tied to the legacy of colonialism to 'legitimise' exclusionary practices. I outline my incorporation of Philomena Essed's concept of 'everyday racism' (2002) to examine the systemic nature of racism as flowing between institutions, structures and individuals. I examine this in the context of the taxi industry by analysing the discursive

construction of Nigerian identity in opposition to Irishness. I draw on Foucauldian insights on discourse (Foucault, 1980b), Hall's work on 'representation' (Hall, 1997b), and what Franz Fanon describes as the 'fact of blackness' (Fanon, 1967) to argue that anti-Nigerian racism is nested in historical regimes of representation of the African Other.

I provide a discussion on power through Gramsci's concept of 'hegemony' to illustrate how the Irish state governs through a process of consent rather than force (Gramsci, 1971). I argue that 'race' determines the value of a group's consent by contrasting the inclusive constitutional changes in recent Irish history, related to gender (2015) and sexuality (2018), against the exclusionary constitution change related to 'race' (2004) (Irish Statute Book, 2015, 2018, 2004). I illustrate this in the context of the taxi industry by examining the most recent legislative intervention, The Taxi Regulation Act (2013), to argue that Nigerian taxi drivers' consent had little political capital during this period (Irish Statute Book, 2013). I examine this moment of 'recapture' and argue the introduction of new surveillance technologies was nested in the neoliberal modes of governance, (in)securitization (Bigo, 2006, 2012), and processes of subjectification including racialisation (Maguire and Murphy, 2014).

However, the State is only one actor and I incorporate Foucault's concept of 'governmentality' (1991) to situate the role of the State dialectically with the 'regimes of truth' that circulate at the global, local, and everyday level. I provide a discussion on Irish neoliberal governmentality on immigration and the discourses that establish 'good diversity' as those migrants constructed as capable of integrating seamlessly from below. I contextualise this against respondents' attitude to work and individual agency by examining other factors such as Pentecostalism and family values. Finally, I outline my use of Laguerre's spatial framework (1999) to map out how respondents are excluded from 'majority space' leading to the creation of 'minority space'. This includes both the discursive space, in which their identities are narrated, and the geographical spaces they occupy while working.

In chapter four I outline the methodological framework and the justifications for the methods I employ. Here, I outline the importance of a qualitative research design that pays close attention to migrant voices to access the 'subjugated knowledge' found in lived experience (Foucault, 1980b: 81). I outline the research design and methods of data analysis. Although the salience of 'race' is established and informed theme one, the second two thematic strands were established through a grounded theoretical approach. I therefore provide a discussion on the methodological issues and explain

the reasons for the methods chosen to address the questions that are the focus of this research. I also provide a discussion of the issues of access, the ethical considerations, and a reflection on my own standpoint epistemology as a White student researching 'race'.

In chapter five, the first of the findings' chapters, I explore the themes of 'Integration into the Irish Family' and 'Regulation and the State'. Using Laguerre's spatial framework, I map out the various ideological, locational, and structural sites that space is regulated (Laguerre, 1999). Here, I examine how concepts of citizenship and nationalism are understood by respondents and how they are experienced in exclusionary ways. I map out how this informs the locational sites participants occupy to explain their higher concentration in particular spaces. I theorise this under Essed's concept of 'everyday racism' to argue that there is a 'minoritisation agreement' between the State, representatives of the State, and the wider population to regulate majority space. Finally, I discuss the 'Kesh' (the Dublin Airport taxi holding area) that respondents described as an intercultural 'safe space' due to 'site specific' regulation (Nelson and Dunn, 2017: 27). Here, the DAA (Dublin Airport Authority) implemented measures to create a space free of the racialised exclusion faced elsewhere that may be useful to antiracism initiatives in other locations.

In chapter six I elaborate on both these themes. I begin by outlining how respondents understand and experience the anti-Nigerian discourse that narrate them in opposition to Irishness. I examine the 'moral panic' (2011-2015) in which interviewees describe a period of heightened discursive hostility. I expand on the theme of regulation by examining the effects of new surveillance technologies in both the private and public spheres. I examine the discourse of 'security' that accompanied the latest State intervention though the Taxi Regulation Act 2013. Here I expand on the work of Maguire and Murphy (2014) to analyse this latest moment of 'recapture' as a process of (In)securitisation (Bigo, 2006, 2012) and to reveal the evolving nature of racism and how it is subjectively experienced. I also incorporate Gramsci's concept of 'contradictory consciousness' to explain the wider consent for increased surveillance as well as to explain how racialised thinking is rationalised as 'common-sense', that maintain alternative conceptualisations ('good-sense') outside acceptable discourse.

In chapter seven I explore the theme of Nigerians attitude to work and individual agency in more depth. I examine the ways in which Nigerian taxi drivers respond to neoliberal regulation and the 'tactics' (De Certeau, 1984) they deploy toward successful integration while working in a hostile working environment. However, not

all of their experiences are marked by racism with several accounts that indicate there are signs of solidarity both with their customer base and with Irish taxi drivers. Most respondents refuse to be defined in racialised terms and their approach to work illustrates their compatibility to Irish norms. Here I examine the significance of Pentecostal and family values to provide insight into participants attitude to work and individual agency. Neoliberal and Pentecostal principles both promote the values of self-reliance and taking responsibility for one's own material conditions. This chapter therefore provides insight into the logic behind their 'racism-denial' that emerged throughout the interviews.

In chapter eight I provide the conclusion to the research and re-examine the findings and theoretical arguments against the methodological constraints. I argue that a tacit 'minoritisation agreement' exists between State structures, institutions, and individuals to regulate majority space. I argue that Afrophobia and anti-Nigerian racism 'justify' exclusionary practises and that the 'fact of blackness' is the central signifier through which this is experienced. I summarise the findings that debunk the discourses of Nigerian incompatibility to Irish norms and illustrate their self-perception as 'pioneers for the next generation'. I summarise the gains that have been made within the Irish hegemony that is expanding to include 'race' with signs of solidarity emerging amongst various actors in the field. However, I argue that racism-denial is a tactic to avoid further scrutiny under the White gaze. This may assist antiracism initiatives, such as iReport, in which the reporting and documenting of racism to build large data sets is a central strategy. Finally, I discuss current debates on the rise of nativist populism, Irishness as White, and the call for 'neoliberal antiracism' to focus on site-specific regulation in which responsibility is shared across the State, local, and individual level.

Chapter Two: Nigerian Positionality in Ireland and the Dublin Taxi Industry

Introduction

In this chapter I establish the positionality of respondents by providing a literature review of African and Nigerian immigrants in Ireland. Positionality refers to the elements of our identity shaped by socially constructed positions which are embedded in societal systems and can lead to social stratification (Misawa, 2010: 26). Lived experience, as understood in this dissertation, refers to the 'lived reality' of this for respondents, their efforts to integrate against this backdrop, and how those efforts are received by the host population. I begin with the relevant literature to provide an historical overview of Nigerian pathways into Ireland. I then review the literature on African and Nigerian lived experiences in Ireland with particular focus on the areas that emerged as significant to the participants of this research – education, Pentecostalism, family, and labour-market discrimination. I also review the literature on Afrophobia, policing practices, and antiracism initiatives that seek to report and document racism to create data sets on the extent and nature of racism. Finally, I review the various State policies and legislations aimed to address issues related to integration as well as a legislative process chart of the liberalisation of the taxi industry.

1. Nigerian Pathways into Ireland

Nigeria is Africa's most populous country with an estimated 150 million people and over 250 ethnic groups, (Blessing and Pongou, 2010). The country deals with a range of migration issues ranging from massive internal migration to a 'brain drain' of a large well-educated diaspora emigrated into the West (Blessing and Pongou, 2010; Fanning, 2018: 180). Thousands of Nigerians also seek refuge and asylum each year, transiting through North Africa and then crossing the Mediterranean to Europe. Existing research has outlined how poverty drives much of this movement with more than 70 percent of Nigerians living below the national poverty line (Blessing and Pongou, 2010).

Although Nigerians were a presence in Ireland, it was only since 1996 that they found it particularly desirable due to the 'Celtic Tiger' economic boom (Ruhs, 2005). By 2008, they represented the fourth largest immigration group in Ireland (McFadyen, 2008). From 2001 to 2013, Nigeria was recorded as the top country of origin of persons seeking international protection in Ireland (McGinnity et al., 2020: 9). According to the

2006 Census, there were around 16,677 Nigerians in the country, which grew to 19,780 as reported in the 2011 Census (Central Statistics Offfice, 2006, 2011). It also reported that Dublin had the largest population of Nigerian immigrants in Ireland (Central Statistics Offfice, 2011). The CSO figures from the latest Census (2016) on Black or Black Irish living in Ireland is at 64,639 (McGinnity et al., 2021: 17). The figures also show the largest group of migrants from Africa are Nigerian at 32 percent (McGinnity et al., 2020: 20).

Julius Komolafe says that Nigerian migrants move predominantly to the countries where they are more likely to adjust in terms of "being able to understand the host country's language, to secure gainful employment, and to reunite with members of their family and friends" (Komolafe, 2002: 226). Komolafe highlighted the diversity and complexity of the Nigerian population in Ireland that are all varied in terms of movement, motivation and experiences (Komolafe, 2008: 228). He found that existing networks are central to how well they settle in Ireland (Komolafe, 2002: 226).

Nigerian taxi drivers are not a considered a vulnerable group and most of the participants of this research are well-educated, have significant social capital in Nigeria, and are supported by Nigerian networks in Ireland. However, they are also heavily stigmatised by the host population and some participants arrived through Direct Provision (DP) after experiencing traumatic migratory paths. In this research I provide a more recent examination of Nigerians' motivation and experiences that help explain their presence in the Dublin taxi industry.

2. African Lived Experiences in Ireland

A European wide study that looked at African's experiences placed Ireland amongst the worst five countries for racist violence and harassment (European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, 2009). In this section I review the relevant literature on African and Nigerian lived experience in Ireland. The literature crosses different domains, such as Direct Provision, education, Pentecostalism, family, and work, that are the central focal points for respondents in this research.

Carceral Institutions, Direct Provision, and Migrant Activism

The literature on Irish carceral institutions and Direct Provision (DP) have established the damaging effects on Black groups as well as the difficulties for these former residents to enter politics (Dillon 2019; Evers 2021; Fanning 2018; Komolafe 2008;

15

Maguire and Murphy 2012; Titley 2013). Early accounts of Africans experiences of carceral institutions were documented by Christine Buckley and Rosemary Adaser who described the forms of abuse 'mixed-race Irish' children received in institutional care (Evers, 2021; Fanning, 2018: 183). The incidents they described included being made to unblock toilets with bare hands because 'her skin was black already' or being the last child to bathe in the same bath water as thirty other girls for fear that 'black skin would contaminate the white girls' (Fanning, 2018: 183).

There is also significant literature on the experiences of Africans in DP as well as the experiences of former asylum seekers who have been granted leave to remain (Fanning, 2018; Komolafe, 2008; Maguire and Murphy, 2012). Komolafe described the hardships some Nigerians endured, such as those who paid traffickers to cross the Mediterranean, and who saw the Irish asylum process an opportunity to build new lives (Komolafe, 2008: 225-1). Many knew that if they had a baby in Ireland, they would be granted leave to remain and a "degree of security not available elsewhere in the European Union" (Fanning, 2018: 185). However, maternity care research found that many of these women lived with their babies in substandard conditions in overcrowded accommodation (Fanning, 2018: 187).

Former DP resident and current activist, Vukašin Nedeljkoić, set up the *Asylum Archive* project to provide a 'photographic testimony' on the "architecture of confinement, traces, remnants and ghosts with a focus on emergency accommodation centres" (Nedeljković, 2020). As such, he filled a gap in the "visual information about previous incarcerations of the poor, the marginalised and the undesired in institutions including Mother and Baby Homes and Industrial Schools" (Ibid). Many African activists, including former asylum seekers, have ran in local and European elections with a view to challenge the Irish Direct Provision system (Maguire and Murphy, 2012; MASI, 2020). However, they were often met with public scepticism and internal hostility in what has been described as an 'unyielding political system' (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 139). The most difficult aspect for these 'new immigrant candidates' to overcome were the 'dense local bonds of clientelism and brokerage' and the existing 'historical and national sentiment' across Irish society (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 139). This aligns with other findings that point to how mainstream political parties fail to encourage immigrant candidates and members of ethnic minorities to run in elections (Chadamoyo et al, 2007; Fanning, 2021; Fanning, Shaw., and O'Connell, 2012). Overall, the literature describes the 'exhausting efforts' of these immigrants to

have a voice in Irish politics, act as role models, and to represent what really matters in their localities (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 139).

Education and Language Proficiency

The ESRI *Growing Up in Ireland Survey* found that by 2005 one quarter of African children in Ireland attended a school that was designated in a disadvantaged area compared to 9 percent of Irish children (McGinnity, Darmody, and Murray, 2015). It found that African families were much more likely to experience economic hardship and their children were far more likely to have limited knowledge of English (Fanning, 2018: 198; McGinnity, Darmody, and Murray, 2015). This, despite that African mothers of these children were better educated than Irish mothers and had higher expectations that their children would attend third-level education (Ibid).

Fanning says that it seems likely that the children in disadvantaged schools detailed in the study were most likely living in poverty (Fanning, 2018: 198). Conversely, higher educated Africans, fluent in English and better off, were less likely to be living in marginal areas or attending disadvantaged schools (Ibid). Fanning said the 'entrenched disadvantage' of these African migrants, who live in deprived areas and experience language barriers and low levels of education, are likely to remain marginal (Fanning, 2018: 199). Nigerians, however, were found to fare better than Africans from non-English speaking countries who are less well-educated and were found to experience greater barriers (Fanning, 2018: 198). Furthermore, Nigerians are found to be more successful at building connections with Irish neighbours – such as the parents of their children's schoolfriends – as well as with each other (see Fanning, 2018: 193).

Since the foundation of the State, Ireland's educational system has been mainly a denominational one which poses problems for integration amongst migrant children with strong religious backgrounds. Although the education system has been overlain by a discourse of 'interculturalism' research shows the denominational core of the system remains intact (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 114). Some academics claim that celebrating diversity for its own sake in schools can lead to a sense of 'culturelessness' among 'native' students (Hinchion and Hennessy, 2009: 7-22). This is echoed by some teachers who also perceive 'intercultural' teaching methods as a 'weak approach' (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 113). However, the main body of research has demonstrated that school systems that disregard pupil's cultural background and 'heritage' can lead to underachievement (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 112).

Maguire and Murphy's research found that African parents actively promote intercultural approach to schooling to preserve their culture and heritage for their children. (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 113). They found that many are very active in mediating with their children's school and local institutions with a 'deep and horizontal connection across their locality' as well as maintaining 'a strong connection to transnational politics of Nigeria' (Ibid). Other migrants, however, did not have the same diplomatic and conciliatory approach to intercultural matters and instead sought to 'rearticulate Irish traditions and incorporate them into their own meaningful schemes' (Ibid).

The literature also reveals that religion is a central factor influencing Nigerian parents approach to education. Maguire and Murphy quote one parent who said: "we are Christians, but we are not Catholics or Protestants, we are Pentecostals and we hold onto that" (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 113). They found that many African Pentecostals think the Irish education system is "sectional, partial and secular, even within ostensibly Catholic schools" (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 114). These parents therefore developed alternative faith-based teaching that influences all aspects of a child's life: "the physical, morals, manners, prosperity, personal relationships – true believers in all things" (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 114).

African Pentecostalism in Ireland

It is estimated that there are 30,000 African 'immigrants' in 'Black Majority churches' in Ireland (Maguire and Murphy, 2016: 843). Although African-led Pentecostal groups in Ireland are dominated by sub Saharan Africans, their membership is diverse, as are the paths to and reasons for joining (Ugba, 2006: 171). By 2002 Nigerians had established more churches in Ireland than all the other immigrant nationalities combined and most large towns had at least one 'black-majority church' (Haughey, 2002). By 2001 more than 40 Nigerian Pentecostal congregations were established in the greater Dublin area (Fanning, 2018: 191). Outside Dublin the largest and most widespread African Pentecostal church, the Redeemed Christian Church of God, had about 40 branches spread throughout the country by 2007 (Ibid).

The literature indicates that many African immigrants turn to religious associations in their struggle for economic and social survival in an environment often characterized by hostility and racism (Fanning, 2018: 208, 219; Maguire and Murphy, 2012; Soothill, 2010: 216; Ugba, 2006). However, it also finds that the aversion to mainstream churches is also due to the perception that these churches are 'spiritually dead'

(Pasura, 2011: 154). The literature also indicates that many migrants who have attended mainstream churches have experienced discrimination (Haughey, 2002; Maguire and Murphy, 2016; Pasura, 2011; Ugba, 2006, 2009). An early study by the Irish Council of Churches found that that while ministers were generally welcoming, some members were resistant to the presence of immigrants (Haughey, 2002). While the study recognised that some had been discriminated in mainstream churches, it pointed out that African immigrants generally seek a sense of ownership in their churches as well as a source of social support (Haughey, 2002).

Abel Ugba said that the attraction of these churches lies in the opportunities they present for self-definition, social empowerment, and modest economic mobility (Ugba, 2009). Ultimately, they enable African immigrants to redefine their position and role in Irish society who feel they are 'living in a parallel social and moral universe' (Ugba, 2009: 124). Ugba says that they do not view themselves as a precarious racialised minority group, but rather, as "agents of social and religious change with a God-given mission to preach moral regeneration and spiritual revival in Ireland' (Ugba, 2009: 173). On this, Jane Soothill says they rely on the transformative experience of 'rebirth' to transcend their identity as a racial minority and to reconceptualize themselves as agents of social and religious change (Soothill, 2010: 216). Ugba argues a main driving force is a perceived 'mission' to reintroduce the gospel to Europeans and that the regeneration of Irish society frames their self-perceptions (Ibid). Maguire and Murphy also noted that African Pentecostals view their presence here in terms of spreading the gospel in Ireland, amongst both immigrants and natives, and quoted one Pentecostal pastor;

> It's all because they don't know God, that's why we are here to let them know you can live a good life, a quality life – that all these evil things exist but you can still be happy. (Maguire and Murphy, 2016: 857)

However, others say that these churches act primarily as refuges from the daily stresses and insecurities of immigrant life rather than vehicles for promoting social integration or, indeed, moral regeneration (Soothill, 2010: 216). Asonzeh Ukah criticises Ugba's 'unproblematic acceptance' of informants' self-description that "obscures the primary reason for African immigrants coming to Ireland which is economic and political rather than evangelistic" (Ukah, 2013: 74). Ugba agrees, however, that there is little evidence these churches actually have a significant role in social integration, political mobilisation, or spreading the gospel into wider society (Ugba, 2009).

Bryan Fanning said that Pentecostal services give expression to a 'health and wealth' gospel that focuses on "material conditions in Ireland with prayer requests and public worship sessions dominated by concern about work and residence permits, employment and money worries" (Fanning, 2018: 192). Quoting Ugba, he said the future that congregations wished for in prayer and songs was a permanent and settled life in Ireland (Ibid). Maguire and Murphy also referenced this element and quoted a pastor working with asylum seekers in a DP centre;

> A lot of people here are not really comfortable: a lot of stress, a lot of depression, a lot of trouble going through their minds… There is no one here that likes being here, and that's the truth… We are doing things to keep them busy, to make them feel they belong somewhere. (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 3)

They quote another Nigerian pastor, who preaches DP residents to live as a good ambassador; "You came into this society and they must see you as someone that is here to be helpful, not to be a burden to the government or the people, but your little contribution what you can do" (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 12).

Pentecostal churches are also sites of activism and pastors use these platforms to encourage their congregations to integrate more successfully (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 44, 55, 61). Maguire and Murphy argue that little can be understood about the political campaigns and activism of African immigrants without consulting the role of Pentecostal churches as spiritual forces (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 61). They reference another pastor who said she views herself more as a community activist and noted that her and other political campaigns were often held in churches (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 44, 69). They also noted that the intersection of Pentecostalism and activism was also on display during taxi disputes and African drivers often ending their meetings with prayers (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 69).

Criticism of multiculturalism often present immigrant ethnic or religious groups 'living separately' (Fanning 2018; Meer and Modood 2011; Rattansi, 2011). The literature indicates that Pentecostalism offers people a 'spiritual and worldly home away from home' (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 68) and helps African immigrants' maintain attachment to their cultural and traditional values (Soothill, 2010: 216). However, it also, as discussed above, provides a vehicle to engage with wider society in what they consider a meaningful way.

Maguire and Murphy developed the concept of 'ontological (in)security' to theorise the power of contemporary Pentecostalism in late modernity (Maguire and Murphy,

2016: 842). They said that many immigrants had "converted asylum seeking into spiritual journeys … [and] found power, co-presence and ontological security amid conditions of great insecurity" (Maguire and Murphy, 2016: 856). Pentecostalism is therefore an important factor to understand Nigerian taxi drivers everyday lifeworlds. This research adds to the literature by considering this spiritual dimension of participants in terms of both the ontological (in)securities and 'spreading the gospel' in the context of the modern neoliberal world we inhabit.

Family

Fanning's review of African migrant lived experiences found that individual migration was often undertaken on behalf of wider family groups (Fanning, 2018: 179). Extended family regularly subsidised their trips with the expectation of remittances sent back home so that other family members might follow (Ibid). Fanning compared these attempts at family reunification with the experiences of Irish emigrants and found that Africans had to contend with "greater restrictions than those experienced by Irish emigrants abroad" (Ibid).

Maguire and Murphy detail the struggle of childrearing for parents who migrated from Africa with young children, and subsequently raised Irish-born children, into a new culture (Maguire and Murphy, 2012). They found many parents had a vision of 'cultural mixing' to encourage the building self-expression among their children. They quote one woman who said "not everything in Africa is good; not everything in Europe is good… take the good things from both sides and try to build them into one" (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 131). They also described the tensions between the two generations and, quoting a daughter of a Nigerian taxi driver, revealed the gulf in terms of experiences and values:

> It's just different… my parents are very African minded… it's everyway you live… the way you live your life, how you view stuff, marriage, anything, it's different. Although I do have Nigerian culture, I still have the other side… I couldn't do anything until I was eighteen. (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 135)

She said that most Nigerians parents are too strict and that their children tend to be inexperienced and closed to exploring the world: "they are scared to do anything… they [parents] don't understand that their kids learn from the culture here, they can't see that" (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 135). Maguire and Murphy also interviewed her father who, they say, discusses his children's identity in terms of racialisation:

> I said to them whether you have ten Irish passports or not, you are not an Irish man, not an Irish woman. Having your passport does not make you be one of

them… Because no matter what happens, you are not white, you are not that colour'. (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 134)

He also tells them of his experiences of racial abuse while driving a taxi to prepare them for the outside world (Ibid). The reality of this was brought into sharp focus when the family woke up to find the tyres of his taxi slashed outside their house (Ibid).

Conclusion

In the first phase of interviews in this research I looked for details on participants' access into the country. However, in one interview it became clear that the participant was traumatised from his experiences of both forced migration and while in a DP centre. In subsequent interviews I decided not to pursue information on migratory paths or while in DP because, given these sensitivities, it did not meet the ethical standards I wanted to maintain. Nevertheless, important insights were gained throughout some interviews in which unsolicited information illustrated the psychological impact of forced migration that influenced how those respondents manage racism in the taxi industry.

The importance of education was consistently raised by participants throughout the interviews. This was in relation to their children's future as well as equality of opportunity in having their own qualifications recognised. All participants in this research are fluent English speakers which, according to the literature discussed later, should afford them significant advantage over migrants whose English is less proficient. Pentecostalism also emerged as central to the lives of Nigerian taxi drivers' interviewed in this research and determines much of their attitude to work, individual agency, and response to hostility. Pentecostalism also encourages self-reliance in terms of financial prosperity that relates to the wider structural context of neoliberalism that underpins the analytical framework of this research. This connection to neoliberalism is examined in the following chapter.

The majority of respondents in this research are also parents and it became clear that family is a central guiding factor. As discussed throughout each of the finding chapters, their obligation as 'providers' and 'moral guides' inform much of their approaches to work, individual agency, and how they interact with customers. Many viewed themselves as pioneers for the next generation and their job was to establish a platform for their children's' successful integration.

3. African and Nigerian Labour-market Discrimination

Introduction

Throughout the interviews respondents talked about their frustration at not being able to find employment related to their education and skill set. Many described the discrimination they faced from potential employers and felt that the candidates they were competing with were chosen based on being Irish or European. In this section I begin with a review of the various ESRI studies and quantitative research that consistently show African and Nigerian workers are the most disadvantaged group in labour-market outcomes. However, a central argument I make in this research is that qualitative studies that focus on lived experience, albeit with much smaller sample sizes, can offer deeper insight into both discrimination and responses to discrimination. Although they are not generalisable to the specific group or facilitate comparisons with other groups, they can help qualify the findings of quantitative studies or explain discrepancies within them. I therefore also provide a review of the literature on African lived experience of labour market discrimination in Ireland, experiences in comparable industries, such as Dublin Bus and LUAS, and the experiences of African and Nigerian drivers in the Irish taxi industry.

Quantitative Studies on African Discrimination in Irish Labour Market

In this review I examine the findings of studies related to the time before the interviews took place (2000-2014), the period in which the interviews took place (2015-2018), and those published more recently. It consolidates the major studies of labour market discrimination with a particular focus on language fluency, education, and ethnicity due to its relevance to the respondents of this research. The principal sources are the Economic and Social Research Institute (ESRI), articles that analyse the data produced by these studies, and non-governmental organisation (NGO) reports.

There is extensive literature on labour market discrimination in both Europe (Bergbom, Vartia-Vaananen, and Kinnunen 2015; Hogh et al. 2011; Kaas and Manger, 2012; Silberman, Alba, and Fournier, 2007) and in Ireland (Barrett and Duffy, 2008; Joseph 2018b; Kingston, McGinnity, and O'Connell, 2015; McGinnity et al., 2009; O'Connell and McGinnity, 2008). The research in Europe outlines the difficulties immigrants have accessing labour markets, workplace racism, and wage inequality and finds that those from Africa are most likely to perceive discrimination (Schmidt, 1992: Amnesty International, 2001, Altonji, 1999; McNabb, 1981; O'Connell and McGinnity, 2008;

Kingston, McGinnity, and O'Connell, 2015: 216). The literature in Ireland echoes that of Europe to reveal that African and Black immigrants are particularly vulnerable to discrimination in both accessing employment and while working.

During the Celtic Tiger years (up till 2008) the problems immigrants had in accessing employment, discrimination in the workplace, and unemployment rates are well established (O'Connell and McGinnity 2008; Russell et al. 2008). Early research found that in 2004 'non-nationals' were significantly more likely to be unemployed than natives in Ireland (O'Connell and McGinnity, 2008). Another study found there was little difference between those of White, Asian and other ethnic backgrounds who were all two to three times more likely to be unemployed than Irish nationals (McGinnity et al., 2009: 5). However, Black Africans had the highest rates of unemployment, experienced the most discrimination and, after controlling for differences such as education and length of stay, were seven times more likely to experience discrimination than White Irish while looking for work (McGinnity et al., 2009: 5). Overall, early research found that the Black African group suffered particular labour market disadvantages and were much more likely than any other group to have experienced discrimination (Kingston, O'Connell, and Kelly, 2013: 32).

This trend continued after the economic downturn in 2008 with higher rates of work-based discrimination for all immigrant groups (Kingston et al., 2015: 214). However, there was substantial variation across ethnic groups (see Joseph, 2018; MRCI, 2010). The 'Black non-Irish' group, when compared to White Irish people, were 0.4 times as likely to be employed and are five times more likely to experience discrimination when seeking employment (McGinnity et al., 2018: 54). The research found much higher rates of unemployment for African nationals than the national average with only 40 percent employed (O'Connell and Kenny, 2017).

A more recent study carried out by the ESRI, based on data from 2004, 2010 and 2014, captured how labour market outcomes and the experience of discrimination have changed through economic boom, recession, and early recovery (McGinnity et al., 2018). They found that the gaps between ethnic groups become smaller over time. For White EU-West nationals they found that in 2004 they were more likely to experience discrimination than White Irish, but in later years do not differ from White Irish (Frances McGinnity et al., 2018: 58). For the White EU-East group, by 2014 they were actually less likely to experience discrimination in recruitment than White Irish (Ibid). They found that Black non-Irish nationals were still much less likely to be employed than White Irish natives (McGinnity et al., 2018: x). A significant finding was that Black

Irish nationals had about the same employment rate as the majority White Irish population (McGinnity et al., 2018: x). The Black non-Irish group still experienced high levels of discrimination in recruitment compared to the Irish White group between 2004 and 2010. However, by 2014 the difference was halved and, although it was still a salient feature, the difficulties Nigerians faced in getting employment significantly decreased (Frances McGinnity et al., 2018: 58).

Analysing the Variables: Language, Education/Skills, and Ethnicity

The literature clearly shows that African immigrants in Ireland have poor labour outcomes. Overall, there is little evidence to suggest the reason for this disadvantage is due to economic sector or occupation (Kingston et al., 2015: 227). However, minority ethnic groups made up a small proportion of the Irish labour market, particularly the Black group, and statistical modelling imposes limits on how much one can say about group differences (O'Connell and McGinnity, 2008: 45-47). Irish research mostly takes account of characteristics such as sex, age, education, experience, and language but that these do not fully account for poorer labour market outcomes (O'Connell, 2019: 275). Respondents of this research are all fluent English speakers with high levels of education and training and, based on these factors, should fare well in the Irish labour market. I therefore examine factors of language, education, and skill set to explore the significance of ethnicity in Nigerian labour market outcomes.

Fluency in the host country language is shown to have a significant impact on immigrants' employment prospects (Barrett and McCarthy 2007a; Dustmann, Fabbri, and Preston 2003; Shields and Wheatley Price 2001). In Ireland, studies show that labour market disadvantage permeates almost all immigrant groups with the exception of those coming from English-speaking countries (Barrett and McCarthy, 2007; O'Connell and McGinnity, 2008). Furthermore, White respondents from English speaking countries had the same likelihood of securing the most privileged jobs and are no more likely to report experiencing discrimination than Irish nationals (Barrett and McCarthy, 2007; O'Connell and McGinnity, 2008: 8, 45).

However, there is a clear disadvantage for immigrants from non-English speaking countries in the labour market with variations across different ethnic groups (O'Connell and McGinnity, 2008: 6-7). Those of Black ethnicity from non-English speaking countries were the most disadvantaged and were nine times more likely than Irish nationals to be unemployed (O'Connell and McGinnity, 2008: 6; McGinnity et al., 2009: 5). While all immigrants from non-English speaking countries are disadvantaged,

there was no evidence of an additional penalty on the basis of ethnicity in both quantitative and subjective reports on workplace discrimination (McGinnity et al., 2009: 5-6). A more recent study found that migrants with poor or no English are 50 percent less likely to be in employment compared to those who reported that they spoke English well (O'Connell, 2019: 290-91). That research also looked at ethnic groups from non-English speaking countries and found that the risk for immigrants from non-English speaking countries is still very high with Black Africans having the highest rates of unemployment (O'Connell, 2019: 275). While all the Nigerian taxi drivers in this research speak fluent English it adds to this literature in which accent, tone of voice, and dialectical differences are problematic for participants in the workplace and may account for discriminatory practices.

Education is another important factor considered by researchers. By 2006, 41 percent of Nigerians living in Ireland were educated to degree level making them better educated than both European immigrants and the Irish population (Fanning, 2018: 180). The findings of labour market outcomes show earlier immigrants from English-speaking parts of African, particularly Nigeria, were successful in securing professional employment such as doctors (see Fanning 2018: 180; O'Connell 2019: 227). However, recent studies have found all ethnic/national groups have on average attained higher levels of education than White Irish but are less likely to occupy managerial or professional jobs (McGinnity et al., 2018: 70-73; O'Connell, 2019: 290).

Researchers point to the difficulties non-Irish nationals have in gaining recognition of existing skills and qualifications attained abroad (see McGinnity et al., 2018: 72). Those seeking work in a regulated profession must have their qualifications recognised by the relevant professional body. However, this only serves EU nationals who benefit from the mutual recognition among EU Member States (Ibid). Such rules do not apply to non-EU nationals and may provide one potential explanation for under-employment and over-qualification across most ethnic/national groups (McGinnity et al., 2018: 72-73). Although The Migrant Integration Strategy (MIS) has established systems to have non-EU qualifications recognised, there are questions around the levels of awareness of this among both immigrants and employers (McGinnity et al., 2018: 72).

Overall, language fluency and education are well established as major factors in labour market outcomes. However, as the literature attests, these are not applied equally with varying outcomes across different groups. Again, attempts to analyse the significance of these findings are difficult. For example, the data shows that the White non-EU group were more likely to report discrimination when looking for work in 2004

compared to 2010 (McGinnity et al., 2018: 59-60). This may be due to the shift in policy, with permits issued for highly-skilled workers within the enlarged EU, to meet Irish labour shortages (McGinnity et al., 2018: 59-60). This statistical change may also be reflective of a shift in the composition of non-EU immigrants in the Irish labour market over this period (Kingston et al., 2015: 224). Another factor considered is that non-EU immigrants working in Ireland in 2010 were more likely to have been recruited into high-skilled occupations with identified skills shortages, and thus encountered less discrimination than in 2004 (Kingston et al., 2015: 224-5). However, this effect does not hold for the Black African group, strengthening the argument that *ethnicity* is particularly salient when looking for work (Kingston et al., 2015: 225).

Researchers have pointed out that most studies on Irish labour market discrimination focus on nationality and not ethnicity (Kingston et al., 2015: 218; Rafferty, 2012; McGinnity et al., 2009: 35). The importance of ethnicity was recognised by McGinnity et al. who sought to distinguish Black ethnicity between those who do and do not have Irish citizenship (McGinnity et al., 2018: 69). They found that Black non-Irish are 0.4 times as likely to be employed than White Irish but that Black Irish are almost equal to the White Irish population in terms of overall employment (Ibid). However, the Black Irish group showed significant disadvantage for occupational position, being 0.3 times as likely to hold a managerial/professional job as White Irish (McGinnity et al., 2018: 69). They conclude that there is an advantage to being Black Irish, rather than Black non-Irish, in terms of access to the workplace but that Black ethnicity is a key factor in workplace discrimination with no advantage for Black respondents in being Irish (McGinnity et al., 2018: 61).

Although nationality plays a role, this suggests that discrimination on the basis of ethnicity is an important factor. A recent ESRI study identified other sources of information to demonstrate that ethnic minority groups are consistently discriminated in the Irish labour market (McGinnity et al., 2021: 27). They found that there is clear evidence for discrimination against the Black ethnic group "arising from ethnic penalty analyses, informal reporting of racism, list experiments to assess masking of negative attitudes, large representative surveys of self-reports of discrimination and field experiment on interview call-backs" (McGinnity et al., 2021: 27-8).

McGinnity et al. argue that the regular collection of ethnicity in labour market research should be a key priority to inform labour market integration policies and programmes (McGinnity et al., 2018: 70). Several surveys have been conducted by the QNHS Labour Force Survey to monitor equality and discrimination based on the CSO figures (2004,

2010, 2014, 2019). These prove valuable, given the large sample size, and are potentially representative of the population thereby allowing the findings to be generalisable. Based on this data, McGinnity et al. found that the Black ethnic group, particularly Black non-Irish, report the highest rates of discrimination in recruitment (McGinnity et al., 2021: 24). Overall, they found that all non-White ethnic minorities reported more discrimination in the workplace than White Irish – with Black non-Irish experiencing the highest rate of workplace discrimination (Ibid). They also found that experiences of racism and discrimination are worse in Ireland compared to other EU countries (McGinnity et al., 2021: 24). This finding is echoed by European Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA) who revealed that Ireland, alongside Luxemburg and Sweden, has the highest rate of reported discrimination in the workplace experienced by sub-Saharan Africans (FRA, 2017).

This is supported by other research that identified several areas of exploitation and wage inequality with higher discrimination against Black workers (Kingston, McGinnity, and O'Connell, 2015; Joseph, 2018). The relevance of ethnicity aligns with the earlier studies that found that Black Africans encountered very high rates of discrimination in both 2004 and 2010, with a preference for White immigrants, that is consistent with discrimination based on racial prejudice (Kingston et al., 2015: 224, 229). Although the groups vary in nationality they share minority ethnicity suggesting that ethnicity is a common factor in their experience of discrimination (Kingston et al., 2015: 224). However, the literature on the impact of ethnicity is limited despite being an important factor to help explain differential outcomes (O'Connell, 2019: 275). While nationality is important, this points to the need for greater focus on 'race' and ethnicity in Irish research as a possible explanation for various labour market outcomes across different groups.

Lived Experiences of Labour Market Discrimination

The findings of the various quantitative studies provide useful data to help identify variations in labour market outcomes across different groups. However, qualitative research provides the means to gain further insight into these differentials and to assess the significance of 'race' and ethnicity to these outcomes. As well as large-scale social surveys, experiences of discrimination can be investigated by a more in-depth approach through qualitative interviews which can considerably enhance our understanding (McGinnity et al., 2021: 25). An early qualitative study found Black South/Central Africans experience the most discrimination in the work domain of all

the groups studied with 38 percent reporting discrimination in access to employment (McGinnity et al., 2006: vi). Ugba's research echoes this and found Africans in Dublin set up their own business as a means to sidestep racism amongst Irish employers (Ugba, 2009: 45).

Non-governmental organisations (NGOs) are a useful means of reporting discrimination and racism in the workplace. In Ireland, the most significant of these is the iReport system established by the Irish Network Against Racism in 2013 (INAR). iReport encourages those who experience or witness racism to report it with the aim to provide data sets on the level and extent of racism in Ireland (Michael, 2016, 2019, 2020). Lucy Michael, who authors the reports based on this data, found consistent racialised discrimination at the workplace. She said the racial abuse toward African workers are usually accompanied by verbal abuse, bullying, harassment, being given worse jobs because of ethnicity, and being forced to quit employment (Michael, 2019: 13). Interestingly, she also found that men were almost three times as likely to illegally discriminate as women, and five times more likely in the workplace (Michael, 2019: 18). The Dublin taxi industry is male dominated and, although this is not examined here, the relevance of the intersection of gender and 'race' is discussed both the methodology and conclusion chapter as a potential theme for future research.

In 2015 Michael presented a thematic report, *Afrophobia in Ireland*, and found that Africans are a particularly vulnerable group who experience racism in almost all domains of social life (Michael, 2015). Philip O'Connell said the report points to broader problems of hostility and antipathy directed specifically at people who belong to the African diaspora (O'Connell, 2019: 276). In relation to workplace racism, Michael found this manifests in verbal abuse, repeated social situations of exclusion and mockery, lack of job security, refusal of promotion and illegal workplace practices (Michael, 2015: 24). She also said that staff who are racially abused at work cannot respond to the abuse without raising concerns about their employment (Ibid). Although physical attacks are rare, Michael argues that there are serious physical consequences "since targeted persons are repeatedly pushed to work harder and longer than their colleagues under conditions of isolation, denigration and severe stress" (Michael, 2015: 25). The latest iReport received 700 incidents of racism and discrimination with 99 cases deemed to be illegal discrimination (Michael, 2021). The group most commonly reporting experience of discrimination is the Black ethnic group and represent one-third of all cases of discrimination reported (McGinnity et al., 2021: 20).

This was echoed in Ebun Joseph's ethnographic study in which she presented a landscape of 'White-over-Black ascendancy' in the Irish labour market (Joseph, 2018: 25). She focused on the intersections of 'race' and nationality and analysed migrants' perception of the racial hierarchy in Ireland (Joseph, 2018: 46). Joseph analysed the findings against several databases of labour market differentials and found that this hierarchy particularly disadvantages Black workers (Ibid). She found that labour force participation rates between Irish nationals and White non-nationals are almost even but that Black participation was much lower (Joseph, 2018). Ultimately, Joseph concluded that there is hierarchical racial order in Ireland with Whites at the top, Blacks at the bottom (O'Connell, 2019: 276).

Joseph's study highlights the importance of in-depth qualitative research in order to enhance our understanding of the variations in labour market outcomes and experiences between different groups. She argued that these differentials in workplace attainment are due to 'race' and not a deficit in capacity, experience, or qualifications (Joseph, 2018: 25). She said that traditional ways of presenting data often obfuscate the experiences of workers at the bottom of the social strata;

> The centring of race in the study illuminates the Irish organisation of racial inequality… [and] reveals the implications of racial hierarchies for workers along the labour supply chain and the whiteness of the top tiers of the Irish labour market (Ibid).

Joseph outlined the value of migrant perspectives and argued that this subjectivity, taken alongside secondary quantitative data and race theory, provides a more comprehensive picture of the racial dichotomy (Joseph, 2018: 48). Despite anti-discrimination policies she concludes that the Irish labour market is rife with incidents of discrimination, in both recruitment processes and workplace practices, and that skin colour influences these discrepancies (Joseph, 2018: 47).

Workplace Discrimination in Comparable Industries

Another study, *Taking Racism Seriously*, investigated workplace racism in Dublin Bus and the LUAS transport system, and found that racism is a 'fact of everyday life' for immigrants workers (Fanning et al., 2011: 29). It documented immigrant's experiences of racism in these workplaces and highlighted a discrepancy between perceptions of the levels of racism to the actual levels. The report found that some Black bus drivers experience frequent and sometimes 'extremely distressing' experiences of racist abuse from customers (Fanning et al., 2011: 20). Overall, it found that the majority had experience of a racist incident and many believed racism to be more prevalent in

Ireland than in many other countries in which they had lived (Heneghan, 2011; Fanning et al., 2011: 20).

The report found that much of the racial abuse appears to be triggered by efforts to do their job properly such as asking passengers to pay their bus fare and for Black LUAS transport revenue protection officers (Fanning, 2011: 20, 24). This is similar to Nigerian taxi drivers experiences who, in an effort to be beyond reproach, rely on the price indicated on the meter as opposed to a pre-agreed rate, sometimes offered by Irish drivers, that often results in hostile encounters (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 20). Michael also found bus drivers are particularly vulnerable to abuse but it is unclear whether they are likely to report all cases to their employers (Michael, 2015: 29). In a subsequent report Michael documented that verbal racist abuse towards African bus drivers is continuing, quoting one driver who said it is still a regular occurrence (Michael, 2019: 18).

Workplace Discrimination in the Taxi Industry

Maguire and Murphy's research into racism in the taxi industry (specifically Louth and Dublin) began in 2008 and outlined systematic racism with targeted hostility towards migrant taxi drivers from a broad spectrum of society (Maguire and Murphy, 2012, 2014). They detailed Irish drivers complaining about African drivers, customers choosing drivers on the basis of racial appearances, and conflicts erupting in over-crowded taxi ranks that escalated into harassment and violence (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 287). Jaichand's report into the Galway industry claimed a campaign against African taxi drivers appealed to customers to 'Support Irish' during the economic recession (Jaichand, 2010: 6).

This is aligns with similar campaigns in Dublin with ´Buy Irish´ stickers on taxis and the ´greenlight´ controversy (Daly, 2012; O'Carroll, 2012). Stickers with the words '100% Irish' were reported on the back of taxis to indicate that the taxi driver is Irish (Murphy, 2008). It was also reported that greenlights attached to taxi roof signs were also intended to let customers know that the driver is of Irish origin (O'Carroll, 2012). Irish taxi drivers justified these tactics through racialised discourses of security with one Irish taxi driver reported to have said, "you won't get ripped off… it's not racist" (Ibid). Irish consumers also use the trope of security to defend this practice:

> I prefer an Irish taxi driver. Be it the latent aggression, the blaring music, the nattering into his mobile phone, or the aggressive solicitation, I nearly always feel uncomfortable when being driven by an African driver. If that makes me

racist, so be it, I've a right to feel comfortable when receiving a service I'm paying through the nose for. (Daly, 2012)

Michael also found that Irish taxi drivers frequently shout at Black taxi drivers "thumping or kicking their cars, shouting abuse at them in the street and in traffic" (Michael, 2015: 28). She identified several reports that describe White taxi drivers warning passengers not to take a taxi driven by a Black African (Ibid). This was well documented in the media and culminated in an order from the National Transport Authority for drivers to remove green lights used to indicate the 'Irishness' of the taxi driver. This corresponds with the popular discourse at this time, discussed in the next chapter, that claimed that there was a massive criminal element within the Black taxi driver group. Michael said this discourse created distrust amongst the public toward African drives and quoted one customer who said that "there is often one driving and one in the boot ready to pounce" (Ibid). She also found that accusations of fraudulent charges are commonly levied at Black taxi drivers in which Irish people describe a 'feeling' that they had been overcharged as the reason for not taking taxis driven by Africans (Michael, 2015: 28-9).

Racialised Attitudes Affecting Labour-market Outcomes

Many of these aforementioned studies cannot determine the degree to which discrimination leading to differential labour market outcomes is based on nationality or ethnicity. Equally, self-reported experience of discrimination may be prone to error or misunderstandings on what constitutes racial discrimination (McGinnity et al. 2009: 7). However, research that focuses on attitudes to immigrants are useful for giving insight into general attitudes towards a particular group, how this changes over time, and how it varies according to group characteristics (McGinnity et al., 2021: 21). Kingston et al. suggest part of African immigrants disadvantage may be attributed to the long-term effects of an asylum system (Kingston et al., 2015: 227). Africans who came as asylum seekers were prevented from working for years and only recently had this ban lifted by the State. While they could not relate respondents' experience of discrimination to residency status, as the NQHS does not establish this detail, they posit that employers might stereotype Black Africans as former asylum seekers with long periods out of the labour market (Ibid).

A study in the US pointed to 'social desirability bias' which refers to a tendency among survey respondents to not reveal negative attitudes (Pager and Quillian, 2005). They found a large discrepancy between what employers said in the survey compared to who they called to interview. A similar study in Ireland found that 66 percent of

respondents were more supportive of Black immigration when asked directly compared to 50 percent when offered anonymity (McGinnity et al., 2020: 22). This is significant when considering that recruitment decisions are usually taken in private (Ibid). Earlier studies have suggested that recruitment discrimination may be one reason why many immigrants are working in jobs below their level of education (Barrett, Bergin, and Duffy 2006; Barrett and Duffy 2008; Barrett and McCarthy 2007b; O'Connell and McGinnity 2008). More recently, O'Connell also suggested employer discrimination based on ethnicity may be a significant factor (O'Connell, 2019: 275). This, he said, may be due to prejudice, preference to hire from within their own national or racial/ethnic group, or due to a belief that such minority groups are less productive (Ibid).

Several other studies have found that the framing of migrants, asylum seekers, and refugees in the media influence racialised attitudes that translates into broader disadvantages for immigrant groups (inter alia Haynes, Devereux, and Breen, 2006). Siapera et al. analysed patterns of 'racially-loaded toxic' online speech and also found it is often framed in anti-immigrant discourse (Siapera, Moreo, and Zhou, 2018). They said these generally focused on a perceived fiscal burden and pivoted on arguments around which immigrants are considered morally deserving (Ibid). They also found that racist speech against Black people incorporated anti-immigrant tropes that reinforced stereotypes such as laziness and criminality (Ibid). Martina Byrne's ethnographic study of Irish professionals found that the use of racial tropes, such as the 'sexually predatory Black man', are designed to racially distance White Irish professionals from other ethnic groups and are only done in private (Byrne, 2014: 15).

Fanning also addressed this issue and, while recognising the extensive hate speech online and elsewhere, argued that this is not reflected in Irish mainstream politic rhetoric (Fanning, 2021). He pointed out that nativist populism has not, thus far, infected Irish politics with the mainstream parties deciding not to capitalise on anti-immigrant sentiment (Fanning, 2021: 38, 80). Furthermore, McGinnity et al. argue that while studies into hate-speech reveal the 'attitudinal climate' in a way that surveys do not, there is still the issue of how representative these views are of others in society (McGinnity et al., 2021: 22). They point out that not everyone, particularly in decision-making positions, are active on social media or express negative views there (McGinnity et al., 2021: 22-3). They conclude that while both types of research – media/online hate-speech analysis and attitudinal climate social surveys – provide a useful indicator of racist sentiment in society, they may not be clearly related to

unequal treatment in recruitment or in the workplace (McGinnity et al., 2021: 23). However, the public nature of the Dublin taxi industry presents an opportunity to evaluate the extent of this type of social desirability bias and how it plays out in terms of workplace discrimination. In the following chapter I examine the discursive construction of Nigerian taxi drivers to offer further insight into public attitudes toward this group.

4. Afrophobia, Policing Practices, and Reporting Racism

In 2013 the UN established a framework to work with those identified as 'Black' and the emerging literature adopted the term 'Afrophobia' to cover all forms of anti-Blackness (Michael, 2017). As Michael explains, 'Afrophobia' came to mean "hostility and discrimination towards people identified as Black, including in housing, education, healthcare, policy, as well as characterising experiences of violence and harassment" (Michael, 2017: 1). Data from the OSCE (Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe) and EU Fundamental Rights Agency has repeatedly shown that rates of hate crime victimisation are significantly higher for people identified as Black than for most other groups (Michael, 2017; Thompson, 2015).

Michael says these figures correspond to widespread discrimination against people of African descent in Ireland that extend to "poor policing practices and responses by Gardaí to racist crime" (Michael, 2015: 1-2). An Garda Síochána have tried to deal with these issues through several action plans including an explicit anti-racism strategy. In 2008 it adopted the *Diversity Strategy and Implementation Plan* to address diversity within the force as well as appointing ethnic liaison officers (OMI, 2008). While this was initially welcomed by human rights bodies, the change was not facilitated by increased funding and personnel and diluted the Gardai's existing anti-racism work (Lentin, 2012: 238). By 2011 there were only 46 people from an ethnic minority background in the force and by 2018 this reached 63 out of a total of 12,000 rank and file Gardai (Gallagher, 2018). Garda Representative Association spokesman, John O'Keeffe, warned that the lack of racial diversity in the force is 'a ticking time bomb' and a failure to correct it "may mean an explosion in our communities sooner than we might have ever imagined" (Gallagher, 2018).

Some have argued that the general shift away from explicit anti-racism initiatives from 2008 have facilitated a culture of racism within An Garda Síochána to go unchecked (Lentin, 2012: 238). There is also evidence of racism against members within the

organisation with inadequate structures in place to make complaints against racism (Clifford, 2017b; O´Faolain, 2017). Internal racism was revealed in the case of Garda Deming Gao who suffered sustained racialised bullying over several years. Gao, who is of Chinese origin, claimed to have suffered racism while working and that the internal complaints procedures were inadequate (Clifford, 2017b; O´Faolain, 2017). After an initial complaint, he was labelled a 'rat' by colleagues. This led to increased harassment including an alleged incident in which a picture of a US patrol car appeared on a station notice board with Goa's face superimposed and the words '*To Serve, To Protect'* scrawled over and replaced with *'To Serve, To Deliver Chicken Curry and Chips'* (Ibid). A judicial review found that he was forced to stop working due to the culmination "of years of bullying and harassment, most of which was based on his race and religion" (Clifford, 2017).

These findings are positioned alongside the wider malpractice within An Garda Síochána with highly publicised cases of Gardai mismanagement and a culture of silencing criticism within its ranks. The reputation of Gardai has been damaged due to the findings of the Morris Tribunal (ICCL, 2006), ´doctored´ breath test figures (Bardon and Hilliard, 2017), the handling of the Corrib gas line (Davis, 2011), speeding fine scandal (MacNamee, 2017), and the smear campaign to discredit whistle-blower Sergeant Maurice McCabe, who brought to light systemic malpractice in the force (Clifford, 2017a). A report from twenty years ago in 2003 concluded that the Gardai had inappropriate access to the PULSE database (Looney, 2003). A privacy audit ten years later in 2013, conducted by the Data Protection Commissioner, concluded that a culture of corruption still exists with extensive cases of inappropriate use of the PULSE system (McQuinn, 2013). More recently, the killing of Nigerian George Nkencho by Gardai in 2020 (Michael and Joseph, 2021) as well as David McInerney's internal report indicate that racism is still an issue within the institution (Gallagher, 2020).

The Issues of Reporting Racism

McGinnity et al. say that monitoring the experience of immigrants is necessary if adequate policy responses are to be developed (McGinnity et al., 2018: 74). They say there is the need to enhance awareness across the public sector of their legal obligations as well as raising this awareness of equality legislation among the general public (McGinnity et al., 2018: 71). However, there is limited awareness or understanding within public bodies of immigrant integration policies and of their duty to address racialised discrimination (Murphy, Caulfield, and Gilmartin, 2019: 27).

Equally, an individual needs to be informed about the system, have the resources to actually report a racist incident, and believe that it is worthwhile to do so (McGinnity et al., 2021: 21). Ultimately, McGinnity et al argue the need for both government and employer-led policies to monitor, prevent and respond to incidences of discrimination in recruitment and in the workplace (McGinnity et al., 2018: 70). They point to the Public Sector Equality and Human Rights Duty as important mechanisms through which public bodies "can take a proactive approach to addressing discrimination on the grounds of race, skin colour, nationality or ethnic origin and ensuring equality for ethnic minority groups" (McGinnity et al., 2018: 70-71). However, they say invoking employment equality legislation and accessing redress for discrimination also relies on the individual's knowledge of their rights under equality legislation and their capacity to make a complaint (McGinnity et al., 2018: 71).

Furthermore, research has highlighted that individuals who experience the highest levels of discrimination are the least likely to know their rights and to take appropriate action in response (McGinnity, Watson, and Kingston, 2012). The data from the Equality module in 2014 show that the White Europeans have the highest understanding of their rights under Irish equality law, while the lowest understanding was found to be among the Black non-Irish population (McGinnity et al., 2018: 71). Kingston et al. referenced other countries in which 'over-reporting' was actually more likely among White respondents and concluded that Irish statistics on ethnic discrimination were also likely to be underestimated (Kingston et al., 2015: 219).

While legislative measures to respond to employment discrimination are in place (Michael, 2015: 42; 2019: 13), measures to prevent discrimination are lacking (McGinnity et al., 2018: 70). Fanning et al. also pointed out that the recording and monitoring of racist incidents by Gardai fall under existing public order or criminal damage legislation with no 'racial aggravated offence' category (Fanning et al, 2011: 6). Michael argues for clarity in the legislation that outlines how victims should report racist incidents and Gardai procedures to ensure that they are recorded as racist incidents (Michael, 2019: 12-13). This, she says, should include support in following up investigations to ensure that the full range of incidents are recorded and information given to victims (Michael, 2019: 12-13).

However, Michael found that most criminal offences are not reported to Gardaí because victims and witnesses are unsure about the legislation and feel they will not be taken seriously (Michael, 2015: 15, 29). More recently, she found that five out of

six immigrants would not report racist incidents to Gardaí because of the risk of exposing oneself to further victimisation (Michael, 2019: 3). The most recent iReport found that 44 percent of the 99 instances of illegal discrimination were not reported to any other body (Michael, 2021). Michael says that the research indicates that distrust of the police will continue into the second generation: "as young ethnic minority citizens are also more likely to have experienced racial profiling (Michael, 2019: 17). She provides an example of a young Black-Irish man who was taken into police custody on discriminatory grounds with four of his friends arrested after they complained about the rough treatment he received. One alleged that Gardaí assaulted him while in custody and had threatened to kill and sexually assault him (Michael, 2019: 16). A complaint issued by his mother seeking an explanation for his injuries was disregarded and he was hospitalised the next day (Ibid).

This aligns with the findings of McInerney's recent internal Gardai report on racist attitudes amongst its members and the impact this has on policing practices (Gallagher, 2020). The report comprised of interviews with 182 Gardai and found that: "racially disparaging comments are quite common within the workplace from the perspectives of both ELOs [Ethnic Liaison Officers] and frontline officers" (Ibid). The report found that eighty three percent of frontline officers did not take any action on hearing such remarks, zero percent said they would challenge the behaviour, and twenty eight percent of ELO officers said they would take no action (Gallagher, 2020).

Most of the respondents in the Fanning et al. report said that racially motivated crimes needed to be taken more seriously by gardaí and found that they were unsure what, if anything, had been done once incidents had been reported (Fanning, 2011: 24). Since 2003, Dublin Bus has been part of the *One People* programme to address anti-social behaviour such as stone-throwing, verbal abuse, and racist abuse directed at bus drivers (Fanning et al., 2011: 19). Dublin Bus, at that time, was also developing a reporting structure that included liaising with An Garda Síochána in relation to follow-up actions (Fanning et al., 2011: 21). Fanning et al say the programme is considered to be effective in "building good community relationships, reducing incidents of anti-social behaviour and racist abuse" (Ibid). However, they also found that some Black bus drivers felt that such initiatives "ameliorated rather than fully addressed experiences of racism" and felt pressure "to keep their heads down rather than to seek redress for any discrimination and bullying they experienced" (Fanning et al., 2011: 29). Some said they were hesitant to report racist incidents because they did not want to be perceived as troublemakers and others distrusted that supervisors would take

them seriously (Fanning et al., 2011: 20, 24). The authors of the report recognised these are sensitive issues and argue that clear systems, that provide confidential environments, are needed to discuss and address racist incidents (Ibid).

This under-reporting is a key concern amongst anti-racism advocates and iReport is designed to fill that gap (Michael, 2015: 29). Its strength is in bringing awareness to the nature and extent of racism and provide insight to the lived experience of racism. Michael also found that victims of racism are unlikely to report it if they perceive that their employment would be at risk as a result. This is particularly the case when they perceive that their racialised identity will make it more difficult for them to acquire new employment elsewhere (Michael, 2015: 42). iReport therefore provides a safer mechanism for victims of racism to document their experiences.

Another issue with reporting is the limitations in presenting subjective interpretations of discrimination (McGinnity et al., 2021: 23). For example, discrimination in recruitment may be underreported because it is not observable to the job applicant or overreported if respondents falsely attribute their treatment to discrimination when it may be due to poor performance (McGinnity et al., 2021: 23-24). Nonetheless, the findings can inform the questions asked in subsequent surveys or interviews to better explain the impact of discrimination on individual lives and the actions they may or may not have taken, such as reporting it to a relevant body (McGinnity et al., 2021: 24). This also allows researchers to assess the proportion of incidents that are reported and actions that are taken as well as tracking change over time (McGinnity et al., 2021: 23).

Many anti-racism initiatives have also focused on the importance of reporting in order to build data sets on the nature and extent of racism in Ireland. However, as the literature reveals, there are difficulties establishing a framework where victims of racism feel confident that their complaints will be treated fairly. Much of the literature on policing and reporting strongly align with the experiences of the respondents outlined in the subsequent findings chapters here. However, there are discrepancies in terms of levels of reporting and the definitions respondents gave of what constitutes racism. Many participants are resistant to naming racism and are wary of reporting racialised discrimination to the relevant authorities. While growth in awareness will improve the effectiveness of iReport, the issue of it being 'worthwhile' to report racism is complicated. This research adds to the literature with new understandings of

Nigerian workplace racism, experiences with Gardai, and provides further insight to the issue of underreporting.

5. Interventions and Legislation in the Taxi Industry

Introduction

Regulation and the State emerged as a central them in this research. It is well established that State regulations on migration, citizenship, and employment significantly influence integration and labour market outcomes (O'Connell, 2019: 275-6). EU nationals have a range of employment rights that are broadly similar to those of Irish citizens (O'Connell, 2019: 275-6). However, rights for non-EU nationals have been governed by a restrictive employment permit system that can limit immigrants' options to a specific job with a specific employer, as well as stymie family reunification (Barrett et al., 2017; O'Connell, 2019). Another major limitation imposed by the State relevant to this research was the denial of the right to work for asylum seekers until 2018. As discussed, Direct Provision not only excluded asylum seekers from working while awaiting a decision, but employer stereotyping may affect labour market outcomes even when residency status is attained.

To date there have been a series of action plans adopted by the State to address racial discrimination in Ireland. In 2005 the first National Plan Against Racism 2005–2008 sought to provide protection and redress against racism, economic inclusion and equality of opportunity with full participation in Irish society (Department of Justice, Equality and Law Reform, 2005). In 2008, Migration nation: A Statement on Integration Strategy and Diversity Management set out the State's vision for an increasingly diverse society (OMI, 2008). This document is reviewed in the following chapter to examine Irish neoliberal governmentality and its aim to produce self-reliant migrants capable of integrating from below. More recently the Migrant Integration Strategy (2017–2020) was established to strengthen hate crime legislation, provide intercultural awareness and training, and develop positive relationships with minority communities (McGinnity et al., 2021: 11).

The most recent initiative is the independent Anti-Racism Committee set up in 2020 to review current evidence and practice (Anti-Racism Committee, 2021). Its intention is to design a new National Action Plan Against Racism with recommendations for how Ireland should strengthen its response to racism in education, employment, and

providing access to justice and policing (McGinnity et al., 2021: 11). An interim report from the ESRI provided the latest and most comprehensive study on labour market discrimination to date and was based on a consolidation from all the major studies (McGinnity et al., 2021: 11). The report measured outcomes that controlled for educational qualifications, age, gender, family type, length of time living in Ireland, language skills, and the probability of having come through Direct Provision (McGinnity et al., 2021: 19). It found that even after accounting for these factors discrimination remains with clear and consistent evidence of disadvantage for the Black ethnic group (McGinnity et al., 2021: 19). It also found this was particularly strong among those who are not Irish citizens and/or are born abroad (Ibid).

Its aim is to identify and classify policy, initiatives, and the merits of possible interventions such as affirmative action and equal opportunities policies (McGinnity et al., 2021: 11). They identified a set of priority issues that include "a focus on adequate complaint and redress mechanisms, the role of information and communications, as well as supports for victims" (McGinnity et al., 2021: 11). It is yet to be seen how the Committee and the latest set of measures will influence future data sets or, indeed, the material conditions for African and Nigerian migrants in Ireland.

Legislative Process Chart of the Irish Taxi Industry

In the taxi industry there is little overt acknowledgement of the existence of racism by legislators let alone the implementation of initiatives such as that introduced by Dublin Bus. Here I provide a legislative process chart that documents the government interventions into the taxi industry. The taxi industry is marked out into three stages in the government-commissioned *Goodbody Report* (Goodbody Economic Consultants, 2009). The first stage marks the time leading up to deregulation in 2000 described as the 'Pre-Liberalisation Period' (Goodbody Economic Consultants, 2009: 8). This is characterised by restricted entry to the taxi market, a fragmented administrative structure, and diversity in taxi fare structures and levels across the country (Ibid). The second stage, described as the 'Post-Liberalised Period' (2000-2004), marks the complete liberalisation of entry to the market following deregulation (Ibid). The third is described as the 'Reform Period' and established the Commission for Taxi Regulation in 2004 and the introduction of a new national taximeter area and fare structure (Goodbody Economic Consultants, 2009: 8-9). In this section, I provide a brief outline of the first three stages and examine the socio-economic-political landscape that informed each of the various changes.

The 'Pre-Liberalised Period' (Before 2000)

In the earlier part of the 'Pre-Liberalisation Period' from 1978 to 1993, there was no change in the number of taxi plates issued in Dublin (Weir, 2019). However, the industry was often referred to as a cartel occluded from the government gaze and therefore required regulatory instruments to make drivers' practice visible (Faber, 1998: 5). The period from 1994 to 2000 was characterised by efforts to reform the industry and address the issues related to the lack of regulation (Weir, 2009). In 1999, the State attempted to implement a new licensing scheme but was challenged by trade union representatives who voiced the concerns of existing taxi driver's desire to protect their income and investment. The proposal was rejected by the High Court that found the government's decision was 'unreasonable' under Irish competition laws (Irish Times, 2001). Regardless, given the significant pressure on the government to implement an immediate measure, both the NTDU and politicians recognised that reform of the industry was inevitable.

The 'Post-Liberalised Period' (2000-2004)

In 2000, Bobby Molloy, Minister of State for the Environment, signed the Road Traffic Public Service Vehicles Amendment No. 3 into law to "end the taxi licensees' de facto 21-year control of public service vehicle licensing policy" (Weir, 2019: 114). This statutory instrument provided for the full resumption of taxi licensing and the revocation of regulatory restrictions on the licensing of taxis and hackneys (Weir, 2019: 114). Deregulation was presented as a practical response to the significant need for an increased supply of taxis that would also help the public transport infrastructure catch up with the rapid economic growth of the Celtic Tiger period. The value of a taxi plate immediately dropped from an average of £80,000 to a standard price of £5,000 (€6,500) purchased from the State (Ibid). Deregulation, therefore, was envisaged as a move that would increase supply to meet demand and to increase quality, transparency, and accountability (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 22). This period was marked by a huge number of new drivers entering the industry, rising from 2,700 in 2000 to 8,400 in 2003, and continued with a steady increase of drivers entering the industry throughout the 2000s (Goodbody Economic Consultants, 2009: 11-13).

The 'Reform Period': Taxi Regulation Act 2003

The Reform Period saw the implementation of the Taxi Regulation Act 2003, and the establishment of the Taxi Regulation Commission in 2004 which was designed to

address some of the issues of deregulation (Irish Statute Book, 2003). The Act states that the Commission's function is to amend the Road Traffic Acts 1961 to 2002, and in Section 9.1, states that its role is the "development and maintenance of a regulatory framework for the control and operation of small public service vehicles [SPSV's] and their drivers" (Irish Statute Book, 2003; 8). A subsequent clause (9.2.c.) states that the Commission is to "oversee the development of a professional, safe, efficient and customer-friendly service by small public service vehicles and their drivers" (Irish Statute Book, 2003: 9). Both clauses explicitly state the responsibility of the Commission is to 'oversee' and 'develop' the national taxi service with the introduction of policies that ensure a better standard of service for the customer and a 'framework' that ensures 'driver suitability'. All these legislative obligations of the Commission indicate awareness for the need for a comprehensive framework that includes driver vetting and training in the pursuit of an adequate taxi service. Another clause (9.2.b) further highlights this obligation, stating the requirement of a "regulatory code and standards for small public service vehicles… and small public service vehicle" (Irish Statute Book, 2003: 9). The Commission was established in 2004 and appointed Kathleen Doyle as the regulator responsible for executing the guidelines set out by the 2003 Act.

Over the following years, multiple regulations were imposed regarding taxi meters, fares, identification cards, licensing, colour-codes, tamper-proof discs, and roof signs. Doyle assured that this 'enhanced information' was designed to give customers a sense of 'general security' and that higher safety and standards were being applied to the industry. The Commission also introduced the requirement of a 'driver pack' that includes a fire extinguisher and a first-aid kit (at a cost of €75), despite there being no obligation for drivers to be trained in first aid. Another revenue source was the SPSV licence increase from €3 to €250 in 2009, and altogether, these measures generated a 'surplus fund' of €20 million for the Commission (Kelly, 2011). Trade union representatives criticised these measures and said that much of what has been 'put back' into the industry has been for trivial items, such as the 'glossy', quarterly *Industry Update* brochures posted to all licence holders. John Usher of the Irish Taxi Drivers Federation complained that the policy was unfair and was critical that the money generated was not going to be reinvested into taxi industry to the benefit of taxi drivers (O'Doherty, 2012).

Deregulation, however, created a very competitive industry and frustrations were soon directed toward the new drivers (Gartland, 2010). Taxi drivers expressed

concerns about Doyle's management of the industry, the oversupply of taxis (by 2009 had reached 35,000), and excessive expense incurred by drivers to comply with the new standards for vehicles (Gartland, 2010). Tensions escalated, and in 2010 the taxi driver group, Tomanai Tacsaí na hÉireann, threatened legal action citing the failures of the Commission to uphold obligations under the Taxi Regulation Act 2003 (Gartland, 2010). However, there was little discussion within this forum around the significant number of immigrants in the industry and the racism they experienced from disgruntled Irish taxi-drivers was not legislated for.

The Reregulated Deregulation Period (2013 to Present)

A fourth period I wish to add is the ´reregulated deregulation´ of the industry facilitated by the latest State intervention through the Taxi Regulation Act 2013 (Irish Statute Book, 2013). In 2011 the documentary, *Dodgy Cabs Ltd,* aired on national television and revealed an 'industry in chaos' with a significant number of 'rogue' drivers operating with impunity (RTE, 2011). This was the key moment that precipitated the 'moral panic' toward African/Nigerian drivers, discussed in the following chapter, and spearheaded the process of 're-regulated deregulation'. While 'rogue' Black taxi drivers were featured in the documentary, the official responses to the controversy avoided overt reference to 'race'. However, prior to the programme being aired, existing research had already depicted a racialised and chaotic taxi industry (Maguire and Murphy, 2012; Jaichand, 2010).

The Taxi Commission had previously denied that 'rogue' drivers were a significant issue and, citing their complaints procedure, said an average of only 65 complaints per month are made. However, the programme detailed the mismanagement of the industry and was centred around fears for passenger safety. It showed a Nigerian man who owned a taxi leasing company failing to check for the relevant documentation when leasing out taxis. Another Black driver was shown to be working a taxi directly after finishing a shift for Dublin Bus, raising concerns of driver fatigue. Many of the criminal elements detailed in the programme were Irish drivers and had connections to organised crime but the 'rogue' element it identified were mostly Black men working in the industry. The programme also highlighted allegations of racist abuse and a 'white only' rank in O'Connell Street.

The controversy following the broadcast put pressure on the Commission to respond (Melia, 2012; Freeman, 2012) and Minister of State, Alan Kelly, initiated a Garda

operation which he said revealed the scale of rogue operators (McGreevy, 2012). Kelly said the best way to regulate the industry was to initiate a system to ensure compliance (Ibid). He subsequently set up the *Taxi Review Steering Group* to provide:

> …reforms of the sector to allow consumers to have confidence in the taxi system while ensuring that legitimate and competent operators and drivers can be rewarded fairly by operating under a regulatory framework that is adequately enforced. (Oireachtas Report, 2011)

The steering group was composed of a cross-section of industry figures but failed to include Irish or migrant taxi driver representatives. Kelly argued that the reason for the omission of a taxi representative was because the taxi sector is 'too fragmented' (Oireachtas Report, 2011). He said if there is evidence of consolidation of taxi driver organisations into one constituted organisation, he may reassess membership of the review group (Ibid). Kelly rationalised excluding taxi drivers from the political sphere by narrating them as disorganised and incapable of contributing meaningfully to the objectives of the steering group. Taxi driver unions said that this was a cynical move and argued that Kelly was conspiring to steer the industry away from the 'single owner-driver model' and toward the economic and political interests of the large taxi companies and their political allies. On this, Stephen Weir found that there were strong indicators of increased interest group influence over taxi regulation policy during this time (Weir, 2019: 130). This, he says, is not necessarily a bad thing and it is important that policy remains balanced, but that indications show that interest groups have 'recaptured policy' in the Irish taxi industry (Weir, 2019: 130).

These 'interest groups', including large taxi company owners, were invited onto Kelly's steering group and allowed to take part in the consultation process. This led to the *Taxi Regulation Review: Report of the Review Group 2011* which informed the subsequent Taxi Regulation Bill 2012. Kelly said the Bill was 'the most radical examination of the taxi sector in Ireland ever' (Freeman, 2012) and included legislative changes to strengthen enforcement and ensure compliance with the taxi regulations:

> [This Bill] underpins a new approach to taxi regulation, with a series of radical and reforming changes to the taxi sector that embrace new technology and have been sought by many players in this field for years…. and I am confident that the new enforcement provisions of this Bill will be broadly welcomed by the industry and consumers alike. (Kelly, 2013)

The Bill was designed to increase consumer confidence in the sector and eliminate the rogue elements, as well ensuring that legitimate drivers will be 'rewarded by the market' (Ryan, 2014). The State's response to the moral panic was therefore 'strong

leadership' in which it will clean-up the previous government's mismanagement by inserting surveillance technologies as measures of control. Kelly argued that the previous government's management of the taxi industry was inadequate, and this intervention was required to 'make visible driver practices' (Kelly, 2013). However, none of the 46 measures it sought to implement made any reference to the evident racism in the industry (NTA, 2012).

The Neoliberalisation of the Taxi Industry

This intervention established an industry in which the governed would govern themselves. Maguire and Murphy, referencing the original deregulation in 2000, said economists demanding deregulation were engaged in a political project of regulatory capture themselves (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 286). The rationalities behind taxi deregulation did not take the market as a natural order but as a process in which governance would be adjusted in order to facilitate competition (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 286). However, as discussed in the next chapter, neoliberalism demands the reengineering of the state to enable the emergence of a competitive market and is presented as a positive economic transformation for all (Hilgers, 2013: 82). This aligns with Foucault's argument that newer laissez-faire economic theories were turning principles of competition back on the State in the form of a 'permanent economic tribunal confronting government' (Foucault, 2008: 247).

The new Taxi Regulation Act was implemented in 2013, and the subsequent measures included a wide array of surveillance technologies. These included CCTV systems and mobile phone applications that provide interfaces that connect drivers to inland revenue and social welfare. This latest form of intervention is not an end to laissez-faire policy, but rather, a tweaking for improvement before a return to government-at-a-distance. As Maguire and Murphy point out, in the centre of this neoliberal terrain of political rationalities and surveillance interventions 'are the processes of subjectification and racialisation' (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 290). In chapter six I examine how respondents experience these new technologies and the affects they have on the spaces they occupy. I examine how the motif of 'security' was deployed by exploring the connections between surveillance, neoliberal policies, and the contexts in which these come to be nested together in the taxi industry. The chapter therefore expands on the themes of 'the Irish family' and 'regulation' to illustrate how exclusion is maintained through the biopolitical function of new technologies such as taxi driver applications.

6. Conclusion

This chapter has outlined the literature on Nigerian taxi driver positionality. Positionality refers to the fluid and relational qualities of social identity formation that are shaped by socially constructed positions that are embedded in society as a system (Ambrose et al. 2010; Collins, 2001; Duarte, 2017; Misawa, 2010: 26). Acknowledging positionality also requires acknowledging the intersecting social locations and the power dynamics contained within them that produce racialised inequalities (Collins, 2001: 18). The literature describes Nigerians as fluent English speakers, well-educated, regular church goers, and present Nigerian parents as 'very ambitious for their children' (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: Fanning, 2018: 193). The literature also indicates the importance of Pentecostalism and family values for Nigerians and are significant factors that relate to the attitudes of respondents toward work and individual agency. Pentecostal churches not only serve as refuge but are also central to the ways that Nigerians can reconceptualise themselves and are an important guiding factor for them in understanding their circumstances. In the following chapter I analyse this against the wider structural context of neoliberalism that unpins this study.

The literature also shows that poor English language fluency, education, and training gaps, and enforced unemployment whilst living in DP result in poor economic outcomes for migrants. However, the studies have shown that 'race' adversely influence levels of educational attainment and, for those who are suitably qualified, limits equal access to the labour-market. The literature on labour-market outcomes consistently place Black migrants as the most disadvantaged group (Barrett and Duffy, 2008; Joseph 2018b; Kingston, McGinnity, and O'Connell, 2015; McGinnity et al., 2009; O'Connell and McGinnity, 2008). These findings are significant because, although the discrimination experienced narrowed over the time period, they indicate discrimination was largely based on ethnicity rather than education, experience, or skillset. The review indicates that, despite high levels of education, Nigerians suffer the highest rates of unemployment and that racism is prevalent in the workplace.

While the respondents of this research are all first-generation immigrants, it nonetheless adds to the literature on discrimination based on both nationality and ethnicity. In this study I explore how Blackness intersects with nationality/citizenship to examine how each informs Nigerian lived experience working in the taxi industry.

This research, in which respondents have English fluency and particularly high levels of education (obtained in Ireland and elsewhere), adds to this literature as well as assessing the impact of 'race' to labour market outcomes.

This review concludes that the three main issues that need to be addressed are greater focus on ethnicity/'race' in research, clarity in legislation, and a streamlined reporting system. The second two also need to have clear mechanisms to promote awareness of individuals rights and how to proceed if those rights have been abused. Ebun Joseph agrees that measuring and representing discrimination is of utmost importance to all societies but says that the main challenge is what we measure and how the data is presented (Joseph, 2018: 49). She agrees that factors such as language and educational may account for some parts of labour market outcomes but argues that couching racism in these terms obfuscates its structural nature (Ibid). The two issues that emerge, therefore, are that the data does not always reflect the reality (e.g. the issue of underreporting) and that diversity in labour market outcomes can be used to support racialised thinking. A non-critical stance can lead to the conclusion that there must be something wrong with Blacks for being at the bottom of the racial ladder (Zuberi, 2008).

Joseph warns against this and argues for the need to theorise these outcomes because, "without framing this within a critical racial framework [they] are open to flawed conclusions and interpretations" (Joseph, 2018: 25). She says that to properly contextualise 'race' we need to introduce new ways of thinking about racism in Irish sociology (Joseph, 2018: 49). To do this requires a theoretical analysis of the lived experience of marginalised people that examines if Blackness influences outcomes in an Irish context (Joseph, 2018: 49). As I discuss in the following chapter, the complexity of 'race' is evident in the various ways in which it has been conceptualised; as an illusion, an ideology, biological, or socially constructed (Joseph, 2018: 50).

Chapter Three: Theoretical Framework

Introduction

In this chapter I provide the theoretical framework used to examine the main themes and research questions explored in this dissertation. The theory I incorporate is largely the result of a grounded theoretical approach in which Nigerian taxi drivers directed me to the main themes of their lived experience. As discussed, the central themes that emerged are the 'discursive construction of Nigerians in opposition to the 'Irish family', 'regulation and the State', and 'Nigerian attitudes to work and Individual agency'. The argument I present is that to understand Nigerian taxi drivers response to their situations requires looking at the racial and regulatory regimes that they must contended with. I adopt a definition of racism consistent with the standards set by the OSCE's Office for Democratic Institutions an Human Rights (ODIHR), INAR's iReport system, and which has been adopted by An Garda Síochána (Michael, 2019: 4). It aligns with the definition of racism established by the UN International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD):

> Any distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference, based on race, colour, descent, national or ethnic origin, which has the purpose of modifying or impairing the recognition, the enjoyment or exercise on an equal footing of human rights and fundamental freedom in the political, economic, social, cultural, or any other field of public life constitutes racial discrimination. (CERD, 1969)

However, the complex nature of defining what constitutes racism requires a conceptualisation that is capable of establishing the relationship of 'race' to power. In the first section I demonstrate the salience of 'race' to respondents lived experience that continues as a central barrier in their attempts to integrate into the 'Irish family'. I draw on the postcolonial theories of Stuart Hall (1997a, 1997b, 2016), Edward Said (1979) and Franz Fanon (1967) as well as the new racisms of the 'cultural turn' (Goldberg, 2002) to explain how the non-White Other is historically constructed and informs contemporary discourses on 'race'. I then outline my use of 'everyday racism' (Essed, 2002) that I argue is better suited than the more state-focused conceptualisations of Racial State Theory (RST) or Critical Race Theory (CRT).

In the second section I discuss the specifics of anti-Nigerian racism and outline how this is experienced in the taxi industry. I discuss the literature on discursive formations that connect the global regimes of racialised representation to local 'regimes of truth' (Foucault, 1991). I outline how this manifested in the taxi industry during a 'moral panic' between 2011-2015 in which respondents experienced heightened discursive

hostility toward them. I show how 'race' and racism is talked about by examining a particular rumour that depicted Nigerian taxi drivers as 'uncivilised' in contrast to the 'civilised' Irish drivers. I then provide a discussion Antonio Gramsci's concept of 'hegemony' (1971) to argue that Ireland is expansive in terms of gender and sexuality but remains limited in terms of 'race'. I illustrate how the corresponding concept of 'contradictory consciousness' (1971), that includes elements of both 'common-sense' and 'good-sense', help explain the logic behind much of Nigerian and Irish taxi drivers response to regulatory processes. I demonstrate this with the example of their response to the latest government intervention in the Taxi Regulation Act 2013. I argue through Didier Bigo's concept of (in)securitisation (2006, 2012) that the State's 're-regulated deregulation' of the industry deployed the motif of 'security' that drew on existing racisms.

In the third section I illustrate how power flows through 'regimes of truth' that operate at the global, local, and individual level. Foucault's concepts of governmentality and 'regimes of truth' are incorporated to help explain how the preferred narrative of Nigerian taxi drivers is established and maintained. I argue that the racism experienced is inflected by neoliberal governmentality and I outline how this is operationalised in wider society and in the context of the taxi industry. Although 'race' is a central component, it does not fully explain Nigerians lived experience. This section therefore also relates to the theme of 'attitude to work and individual agency' in which Pentecostalism and family values also influence how respondents manage a hostile working environment. I examine this against the so-called 'crisis of multiculturalism', current debates on immigration, the rise of nativist populism, and the concept of the 'ideal citizen'.

In the fourth section I outline my incorporation of a spatial analysis to this research. Space is presented as hierarchical and a framework of power (Lefebvre, 1991) and I examine this through the lens of 'race' to map out the spatial dimension of respondents experience running throughout each of the findings chapters (De Certeau, 1984b; Lefebvre, 1991; Nelson and Dunn, 2017; Soja, 1989). While recognising the importance of the intersection of class to the analysis of 'race', I explain the reasons why I did not incorporate a deeper class analysis to this research (Crenshaw, 2000; Delgado and Stefancic, 2012; Dabiri, 2021, 2022). I then illustrate my use of Laguerre's spatial framework and the specific spatial sites relevant to this research (Laguerre, 1999).

1. The Salience of 'Race'

In recent years, the salience of 'race' has re-emerged, exemplified globally in the BLM movement and locally with The Movement of Asylum Seekers in Ireland (MASI), to challenge the post-race narrative that dominated political and mainstream discourse in previous decades. However, during the period in which the interviews took place, liberal discourses framed racism as an individual concern in which the State structures and institutions were largely immune. While gains have been made in recent years with positive state intervention, 'race' is still a significant factor to Nigerian taxi drivers' lived experience. In this section I provide an overview of 'race' and 'everyday racism' to contextualise how anti-Nigerian racism functions in the Dublin taxi industry.

Contemporary prejudices against Black and ethnic minorities rely upon a code of common assumptions about racial distinctiveness that are the product of colonial ideologies of Western 'superiority' (Fanning, 2002: 8). The literature debunks the myth that Ireland was immune to or insulated from the racisms that justified the subjugation of Black people by the West (Fanning, 2002; Kiberd, 1997). Fanning says popular debates on intolerance towards new immigrant minority communities have implied that these are the "natural response of a homogeneous society which knows no better" (Fanning, 2002: 8). The concept of xenophobia has been used to explain such prejudice rather than the concept of racism but such distinctions "ignore how such fear of the other is often rooted in understandings of cultural difference superimposed upon beliefs about biological difference of races" (Ibid).

It is therefore important to distinguish between racisms, xenophobia, and other forms of prejudice whilst "acknowledging the impact and consequences of race thinking on beliefs about distinct groups within dominant ideologies, beliefs and stereotypes" (Fanning, 2002: 11). As Fanning explains, the term 'racialisation' describes a process of 'race' thinking by which specific groups of people "are 'constructed' as a 'type' with reference to a limited number of physical and cultural characteristics… [and] their actual assumed behaviour, abilities and values are then explained by reference to those selected features" (Fanning, 2002: 12).

Throughout the interviews many respondents were hesitant to name the racism they experienced as 'racism' and preferred to use euphemisms, such as 'economic bullying', to avoid stepping further under the White gaze. This, I argue, is tied to the post-race narrative in which naming racism is often interpreted as not taking responsibility for one's own material conditions. Existing research has also pointed towards this issue in

which those who experience racism are often hesitant to name it (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 20, 34). I therefore need to explain the salience of 'racism', even for those respondents who deny it, to this research.

Theoretical Clarity and Societal Praxis of 'Race'

John Solomos argues that 'race' and ethnicity are not natural categories and, like nations, are imagined communities, with unfixed boundaries or uncontested membership (Solomos, 2001: 119). 'Race' is therefore a social construct and the discursive category around which very real systems of socio-economic and cultural power, exploitation, and violent exclusion have been organised (Hall, 2016: 56). The debate about 'race' is not whether there are any differences between populations but about the *significance* of such differences (Malik, 2008). It is now accepted that small genetic differences that account for what Du Bois described as 'hair, skin and bone' (1903), have no bearing on human characteristics such as intelligence, levels of compassion, or propensity for violence (Clinton, 2000). Nonetheless, the meaning attached to racial differences still operate to sort out the world into its superiors and inferiors along some line of biological and genetic 'race' (Hall, 1997a). Racialisation is therefore a systemic discursive practice and to analyse Nigerian taxi drivers' lived experience, a clear understanding of 'racism' is required to show how it functions in subtle, insidious ways. While this will not combat their racialisation, I argue that theoretical clarity on 'race' needs to be established before moving to the societal praxis of 'race'.

Edward Said describes how the West created stereotypes to reduce the Other to a few essentials and present them as fixed in nature (Said, 1979). He says that 'Eurocentric universalism' presents Eastern culture with gendered and raced images of men as primitive, sexual predators, devious, and bloodthirsty, and women as docile, nurturing, and sexually available (Said, 1979). David Theo Goldberg says that the meanings attached to racial difference stem from liberal rationalities that ignore the racialised ideologies that underpin its thinking (Goldberg, 2002: 294). He argues that the concept of 'race', and the new racisms that exist today, have their origins in Enlightenment thought to "deny the rational capacity of blacks, to deny the very condition of their humanity" (Goldberg, 2002: 294-5).

While the idea of biological 'race' is now seen as an archaic vestige of the colonial past, notions of Western *cultural* superiority continue and have very real consequences for the non-White Other. The evolving discourses on 'race' point to the 'new racisms' in

which the biological connotations of 'race' are replaced with ethnic difference and cultural immaturity (Balibar and Wallerstein, 1991: 21; Garner, 2012: 129). Goldberg describes this as 'the cultural turn' in which 'new racisms' rely on Eurocentric notions of a further advanced Western culture (Goldberg, 2002). Biology is thus removed and, while the Other has the potential to evolve, they are narrated as 'not yet ready' and in need of management until such time as they mimic Eurocentric values appropriately.

However, replacing the concept of 'race' with culture is not yet an option due to the artificial nature of the separation made between racial and cultural arguments. Lentin and Titley say the generalising conflations and homogenising stereotypes derived from culture reveal how race thinking can be equally applied to these new racisms (Lentin and Titley, 2011: 62). They say the contemporary fixation with the 'relativist' language of culture has almost completely supplanted one of race but that the effects of such a language produces racialised divisions, hierarchy, and exclusion (Ibid).

On this, Gilroy says discourses on 'race' have been unable to reconcile the paradox in the narratives around racial difference that fix both culture *and* provide a strong sense of surmountable cultural and experiential divisions (Gilroy, 2002: 250). He says most discussions on 'race' are seen as peripheral to social and political life and placed as an individual concern or that of far-right nationalist ideology (Gilroy, 2002: 253). His criticism extends to liberal antiracism and argues that a more productive starting point is to see 'race' and racism not as fringe questions but "as a volatile presence at the very centre of politics" (Gilroy, 2002: 252). Understanding racism therefore requires being able to historically locate the politics of 'race' from which it springs and to reclaim 'race' and racism from the margins of post-race politics.

I argue that the debates around 'too much diversity' or the 'crisis of multiculturalism', discussed later, rest in these resilient common-sense distinctions in which the biology of 'race' is still present in contemporary discourses on culture. This understanding is central to Nigerian taxi drivers' lived experience in which their biology, their 'race', is rationalised through the trope of 'cultural immaturity' in opposition to Irish and Eurocentric 'values'. Critical engagement with the new racisms is therefore needed to disrupt the formal distinction made between 'race', deemed immutable, and culture, deemed mutable.

The Race-as-State Debate

This research is framed within the political factors of Irish governmentality towards the taxi industry and examines how this influences the societal praxis of racism at the

everyday level. Different understandings exist on the extent to which the state imposes racialised structures and practices. The main schools of thought in political theory are 'autonomous state', 'pluralism' and 'neo-Marxism' (Bracey, 2014; 557). The autonomous state perspective identifies interests being upheld through safeguards, such as democratic elections, despite potential capitalists' objections (Evans et al., 1985; Skocpol and Amenta, 1986). The pluralist perspective considers the state as neutral whereby any group or coalition can potentially amass enough power to manipulate the state apparatus according to their shared interests (Bracey, 2014; 557). The Neo-Marxist perspective holds an instrumentalist view that considers the state is a tool, created and controlled by the dominant class interest, and inherently biased toward capitalists' interests (Ibid).

However, theories of 'race' and state differ with respect to how much autonomy the state has vis-à-vis Whites' collective racial interests. The autonomous state perspective identifies independent racial interests that are historically contingent, but which are distinct from Whites' collective interests. Pluralists consider that any coalition, regardless of racial makeup and interests, has the potential to control the state. Whereas, instrumentalists view the state as an inherently White supremacist tool under Whites' collective control (Bracey, 2014; 557). Given the centrality of the nation-state to influence public attitudes on ethnic and racial matters both Racial State Theory (RST) and Critical Race Theory (CRT) were considered.

Racial State Theory (RST)

Omi and Winant's early conceptualisation of the 'Racial State' adopted an inconsistent view of state autonomy, alternating between autonomous and pluralist perspectives (Omi and Winant, 1994; Bracey, 2014; 557). For them, the state acts upon its own interests, protecting the racial status quo, but is also a passive entity available to any sufficiently popular racial project (Bracey, 2014; 557). David Goldberg (2002) later conceptualised all modern nation states as 'racial states', in which 'race' and 'nation' are defined in terms of each, and exclude in order to construct homogeneity, or 'heterogeneity in denial' (Goldberg, 2002; 4).

In the Irish context Ronit Lentin uses RST to analyse the State's treatment of racialised groups such as Irish Travellers and asylum seekers (inter alia Lentin, 2008). She draws on Goldberg's work and views racism as "a political system aiming to regulate bodies rather than the consequence of individual prejudice, involving state, rather than individual or societal formations" (Lentin, 2008). For Lentin, the law is considered

central to racial rule by shaping national identities through legislating on citizenship rights and immigration controls. She argues that the system of categorising populations based on 'race' therefore shapes policies that feed into common-sense racisms, which manifest in everyday incidents of racial discrimination (Lentin, 2004: 7; Lentin, 2012: 7). Lentin pointed to the citizenship referendum in 2004, in which citizenship became constitutionally grounded through bloodline, as evidence that Ireland transitioned from a racial state to a *racist* state (Lentin, 2008).

However, the application of RST to the Irish context has been heavily criticised. Bryan Fanning, for example, says the notions of Western racial superiority coexisting with interchangeable meanings of race and nationality have waned considerably (Fanning, 2012: 182). He argues that essentialist nationalisms that fostered such thinking are less prevalent, and race-as-nation has long been replaced with 'ethnicity' to describe populations within nation-states (Ibid). He says that Ireland is better described as an 'ethnic state' to reflect the institutionalisation of Irish *ethnicity* as the dominant national identity (Fanning, 2012: 182). Fanning agrees that the State has engaged in the biopolitical regulation of bodies as illustrated in the 2004 referendum (Fanning, 2012: 188). However, he disagrees with Lentin's suggestion that the State choreographed the referendum outcome as it disregards "the will of a huge majority of the wider Irish society that voted in favour" (Fanning, 2012: 184).

Ultimately, Fanning contests Lentin's argument that the State imposes, as opposed to influences, exclusionary societal rules of belonging (Fanning, 2012: 184). The two main points he makes are 1) that the Irish state is not a central monolithic entity exercising a clear care and coercion programme on the entirety of the population and 2) that racism or 'ethnic nepotism', with distinctions between 'natives' and 'invaders', are often drawn at the communal level (Fanning, 2012: 189). Fanning recognises the value of theories of racism but warns against the reductive tendencies of RST to obscure other factors outside the 'race-as-state' perspective (Fanning, 2012: 199). While examples of State racism exist, Fanning warns against the limited scope of RST and points to Goldberg's own argument that race, however states might seek to define and codify it, is 'ultimately uncontainable' (Fanning, 2012: 198).

Critical Race Theory (CRT)

I also considered using a Critical Race Theory (CRT) framework to this research. As with RST, it views the state as central to maintaining racialised inequalities but varies on the degree of power it is able to exercise (Bracey, 2014; 556). CRT takes an instrumentalist

position that sees the state as a tool created, maintained, and used by Whites to advance their collective interests and maintain White dominance (Bracey, 2014; 558). This framework contests race-neutral perspectives and investigates the intersectionality of human experience within broader national and world contexts (Crenshaw, 2000; Delgado and Stefancic, 2012).

In the Irish context Ebun Joseph says CRT brings a perspective of White supremacy that identify sites of domination and subjugation rather than White privilege as sites of dominance without subjugation (Joseph, 2018: 55-6). Joseph illustrates this by examining labour market differentials that are based on 'race' rather than a deficit in capacity. She argued that CRT allowed her to focus on social, economic, and political systems and how they influence the relationship and labour-market outcomes between majority and minority groups (Joseph, 2018: 55). She said that the value of CRT lies in its direct focus on the effects of race and racism while also "addressing the hegemonic system of white supremacy on the meritocratic system" (Joseph, 2018: 56). The strength of CRT is that it does not view outcomes in isolation but, rather, "defines a kind of racial consciousness as a necessary element in fostering and understanding the contested position of those in power vis-à-vis racialised and subjugated minorities" (Joseph, 2018: 59).

However, CRT is criticised about its ability to be applied outside the context of the US where it originated. Another criticism is its tendency to place 'race' over 'class' as well as its use of the term 'white supremacy' as a direct description of everyday experiences of racism (Cole, 2009). CRT therefore does not adequately explain non-colour-coded discriminations and often fails to draw groups together to fight against racism (Cole, 2009). Joseph agrees CRT fails to provide a clear sense of what liberation means but argues that its ability to expose inherent racial hierarchies provides a solid starting point (Joseph, 2018: 60).

Both RST and CRT have proved useful and helped expose racialised stratification in various domains as Lentin and Joseph's work illustrate. While the Irish state is implicated in existing racisms, it also shows its flexibility to accommodate the will of the people as the two recent referenda indicate (Irish Statute Book 2015, 2018). The Irish state, therefore, cannot be considered a monolithic entity wielding dominion over a docile public. Furthermore, many current debates on anti-immigrant sentiment, discussed later, centre on the argument that the term 'racism' should not be conflated with 'ethnic nepotism'. Racism, therefore, cannot be attributed to the State alone and the wider social and cultural contexts in which racism finds expression must also be

examined (Fanning, 2012: 184). While exercises of governmental power are important parts of Nigerian everyday lifeworld, they are not the complete picture. Instead, it needs to be contextualised in its relationship to other aspects, such as Nigerians' subjectivity and agency, to provide a more comprehensive understanding of lived experience. Due to the complexity of the racisms Nigerian taxi drivers experience, a broader theoretical approach that goes beyond the 'race-as-state' understanding is required. For these reasons both RST and CRT theory was rejected in favour of Philomena Essed's concept of 'everyday racism' (2002).

Essed's 'Everyday Racism'

Essed's concept of 'everyday racism' dissolves the separations made between institutional and individual racism as operating independently of each other. While it is important to move beyond the rigid focus on the state, it also important to move beyond seeing racism as an individual 'moral dilemma' (Myrdal, 1972). Essed does this by contesting the post-race narrative in liberal discourse that present racism as an individual concern:

> The problem is when the individual is placed outside the institutional thereby severing rules, regulations, and procedures from the people who make and enact them, as if it concerned qualitatively different racisms rather than different positions through which racism operates" (Essed, 2002: 176).

Instead, racism is seen as a systemic discursive practice between institutions and individuals that cement structural racism. The distinctions made between institutional and individual racism are thereby problematised. 'Institutional racism' narrows the problem down to 'institutional discrimination' in a pragmatic orientation that underrates the power of ideology in the structuring of racism in society (Essed, 2002: 178-9). 'Individual racism' is a contradiction because racism is by definition the expression or activation of group power (Essed, 2002: 178-9). The concept of 'everyday racism' transcends these traditional distinctions to show racism as interweaving in the fabric of the social system. It is all the same racism, just expressed from different positions, and greater weight is given "to the mutual interdependence of macro and micro dimensions of racism" (Essed, 2002: 178-79). Everyday racism identifies the 'small acts' as symptomatic of the whole and is a useful means to uncover and challenge the root causes of racism on a societal level. While overt or violent acts of racism are of concern, it is the interrogation of 'everyday racism' which poses the bigger threat to the racialised status-quo (Ibid).

To understand systemic nature of racism in the Dublin taxi industry requires connecting the structural forces of racism with the routine situations in everyday life. For Essed, 'system' refers to the reproduced social relations between individuals and groups organised as regular social practices (Essed, 2002: 181). From a macro point of view, racism is a system of structural inequalities and a historical process, both created and re-created through routine practises (Essed, 2002: 181). From a micro point of view, specific practises, whether their consequences are intentional or unintentional, can be evaluated in terms of racism only when they are consistent with existing macro structures of racial inequality in the system (Ibid). Ultimately, specific practices are by definition racist only when they activate structural racial inequality in the system (Essed, 2002: 181). Essed thus links the ideological dimensions of racism with daily attitudes and interprets racism in terms of lived experience:

> In our everyday lives sociological distinctions between 'institutional' and 'interactional,' between ideology and discourse, and between 'private' and 'public' spheres of life, merge and form a complex of social relations and situations. (Essed, 2002: 176-7)

Everyday racism therefore involves socialised attitudes and behaviour and is infused into familiar everyday practices (Ibid). Essed explains that these practices are not just 'acts' but include a complex relation of acts and attributed attitudes (Essed, 2002: 178). For example, the practice of choosing a White taxi driver over Black taxi driver is an 'act' and shows 'attributes' connected to an existing racialised 'regime of truth' (Foucault, 2008). For the most part, acts such as these are successfully rationalised through the attributed 'attitudes' but sometimes the act cannot be reconciled easily. Although everyday racism is normalised, sometimes the individual or institution sense the racialised transgression and, as discussed in later, seek validity through complementary 'common-sense' rationalities (Gramsci, 1971) and existing racialised 'regimes of truth' Foucault (1980).

There is a need, therefore, to link an account of the racialisation of social and political structures and discourses with an understanding of individual action and institutional behaviour (Gilroy, 2002: 250). Omi and Winant describe racial formation as the process by which: "the social, economic, and political forces determine the content and importance of racial categories, and by which they are in turn shaped by racial meanings" (Omi and Winant, 1986: 61-2). Crucial to this formulation is the treatment of 'race' as a central axis of social relations which cannot be reduced to some broader category of conception (Ibid). This runs parallel to Essed's theory whereby once we

understand that race and ethnicity can operate through any social relation, "it becomes possible to speak of everyday racism as the situational activation of racial or ethnic dimensions in particular relations in a way that reinforces racial or ethnic inequality" (Essed, 2002: 189). Each instantiation of 'everyday racism' is therefore interrelated to the whole complex of relations and practices and "can be reduced to the fundamental structuring forces… [of] oppression, repression, and legitimation" (Essed, 2002: 189-90).

Essed therefore breaks down everyday racism as a process in which 1) socialised racist notions are integrated into meanings that make practices immediately definable and manageable, 2) practices with racist implications become in themselves familiar and repetitive, and 3) underlying racial and ethnic relations are actualised and reinforced through these routine or familiar practices in everyday situations (Essed, 2002: 190). This formulation is helpful to show that people are involved differently in the process of everyday racism according to gender, class, status, and other factors determining the content and structure of their everyday lives (Ibid). It also emphasises that everyday racism occurs thorough indirect contact such as policy makers or journalists:

> Policymakers formulate and enact rules and conditions that reinforce existing racial injustice… [and] racist newspaper articles are part of the process of everyday racism, whether or not based on direct interaction with Blacks. (Essed, 2002: 190)

In this understanding, not all racism is everyday racism, but the concept of everyday racism distinguishes the reproduction of racism, through routine and familiar practices, from incidental and uncommon expressions of racism. I therefore understand 'everyday racism' as a systemic discursive practice and examine the symbiotic relationship between institutional and individual racisms in relation to Nigerian lived experience. The 'host society' is therefore a symbiosis of the institutional and the individual, and this understanding creates a more detailed picture of how race and racism is talked of and practised in the Dublin taxi industry.

'Everyday racism' is therefore better suited to the context of this research and, although it recognises the role of the State, it places greater emphasises on the pluralist perspectives missing from some race-as state theorisations. Respondents' exclusion from the 'Irish family' is, as the findings chapters show, systemic and experienced across several domains. I incorporate Essed's conceptualisation to argue that everyday 'individual' acts of racism respondents experience, whether from State

representatives or members of the public, are 'learned' racism that are connected to the structures and systems operating throughout society as a whole.

2. Anti-Nigerian Racism and 'The Fact of Blackness'

The category 'Nigerian' is invested with negative stereotypes, both globally and in Ireland. Despite Nigerian taxi driver heterogeneity, they are reduced to a few racialised characteristics that correspond to the wider global anti-Nigerian racism (Asuzu, 2006) as well as the interethnic xenophobia toward Nigerians within Africa (Anyim, Chijioke, and Anyim-Ben, 2019; Farouk, Ukeaja, and Ishaka, 2019). In this section I provide a background to the specifics of anti-Nigerian racism in which the global negative stereotypes have come to be associated with Nigerian taxi drivers. I illustrate how it manifests in the taxi industry by examining a particular rumour that depicts them as 'uncivilised' in opposition to 'civilised' Irish taxi drivers. Finally, I outline my use of hegemonic theory (Gramsci, 1971) to explain 'race' in Ireland and the taxi industry. I provide an example of 'contradictory consciousness' in which 'common-sense' responses to the trope of 'security' relied on existing racialised discourses and helped provide the consent required for new technologies of surveillance.

Anti-Nigerian Racism

Nigerians are only one of many new migrant groups working as taxi drivers yet are narrated in mainstream discourse as being the 'bogus' element in an 'industry in chaos' (Maguire and Murphy, 2014; RTE, 2011). Okechukwu Asuzu argues that Nigeria, as the most populous Black nation on earth, is seen as an embodiment of the Black concept and heritage:

> Nigeria acts as a mirror… reflective of the potential, ability and weakness of the Black person. Nigeria is viewed as a political barometer, with which Africa is measured. Positive or negative indices, inexorably, from international community's point of view, reflect on the rest of the continent. (Asuzu, 2006: 7)

Chimamanda Ngozi Adichi, in *The Danger of a Single Story*, deconstructs the dominant narrative that depicts Nigeria, and by extension the continent of Africa, as culturally immature (Adichi, 2009). She says that if she had not grown up in Nigeria, and all she knew about Africa were from popular images, she too would think Africa was "a place of incomprehensible people fighting senseless wars, dying of poverty and Aids, unable to speak for themselves and waiting to be saved by a kind white foreigner" (Adichi,

2009). The single story inserts a collectively internalised narrative of what constitutes the Other.

In the Irish context, Fanning points out that anti-Nigerian racism appeared in the late nineties with "racist graffiti, stickers, posters and leaflets bearing slogans such as 'Save Ireland – Stop the Nigerian invasion'" (Fanning, 2002: 23). In 2003 Harry McGee pointed to the conflation of African asylum seekers with Nigerians and said "from the start Nigerians [were] often portrayed as criminals and scam artists" (McGee, 2003: 194). McGee described how the media rarely interrogated government policy and discourses but "often led the charge against 'bogus' asylum seekers, including detailing generic stories on Nigerian drug dealers" (McGee, 2003: 197). Elaine Moriarty (2005) noted how the term 'non-national' was used as a euphemism for 'Nigerian' through the many 'urban myths' circulating around Ireland of 'non-nationals' taking advantage of Ireland's welfare system (Moriarty, 2015). She examined the prevalent 'buggy at the bus stop' rumour about a woman who left a pram on the street because there was no room on the bus and 'the state would get here a new one' (Moriarty, 2005: 96). Moriarty argued that the 'non-national' woman's presumed Nigerian identity, her Blackness, but most importantly her character, is constructed through her presumed casual casting away of the pram (Moriarty, 2005: 96).

More recently, Irish politician Noel Grealish voiced his concern to the Dáil that Nigerian remittances reached over €1 billion a year (O'Halloran, 2019). Grealish said he could understand transfers to other EU countries but, in reference to Nigeria, he said that this figure was 'astronomical' and asked whether "the Revenue Commissioners had a method of tracking the source of this money to ensure it was not the proceeds of crime and fraud" (O'Halloran, 2019). In response, an Irish-Nigerian woman said that Nigerian immigrants are always portrayed in a bad light: "it's very misleading for the common Irish man or woman who hears these things, because they tend to conclude that every Nigerian is a scoundrel or a scrounger" (McNeice, 2019).

The representation on an 'uncivilised' Nigerian culture is designed to distance itself from accusations of racism. Descriptive terms such as Black or African are generally avoided because they are deemed racial categories. Failure to recognise this often leads to controversy for not using the 'appropriate' language. For example, politician Darren Scully said he would not deal with 'Africans' in his capacity as Mayor because they were 'too aggressive' (Titley, 2011). A public backlash ensued due to the overt reference to 'race' and he was subsequently removed from the Fine Gael political party. Scully was reinstated two years later to run in the local elections and qualified

his previous statement by inserting culture in place of 'race'. He said that he was wrong to have said 'Africans' and quoted a conversation with a 'Ugandan gentleman' who told him "if you had said Nigerians you would have been perfect" (Heaphy, 2014). This strategy to reference support from 'other Blacks' is an attempt to lend credibility. My previous research also found that some non-Nigerian Black taxi drivers also contribute to the anti-Nigerian discourse in an attempt to distance themselves from the identifiable Other (O'Keeffe, 2013). This aligns with my own experience as a taxi driver whereby customers often qualified their 'issues' with Nigerians with details of inter-African xenophobia and how "even *they* can't stand Nigerians" (O'Keeffe, 2013). Richard Dyer describes this process as 'varying degrees of Whiteness' where solidarity between certain minoritised groups are mobilised to direct focus away from them and onto an identifiable 'Other' (Dyer, 1997: 19).

Whiteness and 'The Fact of Blackness'

The term 'Nigerian' has therefore become a euphemism for 'Black' in an attempt to justify racism as a cultural issue and as a response to a perceived ´uncivilised´ ethnic group. As discussed, 'race' is a discursive construct that claims to ground social and cultural differences on biological and genetic differences (Hall, 2016: 55). The genetic level must be materialised so that it can "be 'read off' in easily recognisable, visible signifiers of the body" (Hall, 2016: 56). For Nigerian taxi drivers it is 'The Fact of Blackness' that is the primary signifier leading to discriminatory practices.

Franz Fanon argued that Blacks are labelled as being a 'race' while White is constructed as naturally superior and thereby constructing the Black 'Other' (Fanon, 1967). He says that structures of 'race' status rely on the 'fact of blackness' as a principle signifier (Fanon, 1967). In the Irish context Elisa White says that Blackness is the main reason for discrimination against Africans and "any nationality affiliation is reduced to a code for black" (White, 2002: 104). Obey, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 30's), whom I interviewed for this research, described his first experience of this reality:

> **Obey**: I remember the moment I became aware of my black skin, truly aware. I was only a few weeks into the country and was walking with a Nigerian friend on the street when a car drove by and the occupants shouted racist slurs towards us. First, I thought it was friends of the other man and it was banter and that my friend knew the people in the car. But my friend had to explain to me that no, they are hostile and don't like us blacks being here. (Interview 2017)

Obey explained to me that it took him time to process the concept of 'race' and the significance of his Black skin. The discursive meaning attached to his Blackness changed in the context of his new surroundings that he said did not exist in Nigeria: "everybody is black and yes there are problems, but I suppose racism isn't one of them". Obey's lived experience of racism began in Dublin in 2006 and echoes Frantz Fanon's own account:

> I discovered my Blackness… I am being dissected under white eyes… I am fixed, I am laid bare… I see in those white faces that it is not a new man who has come in, but a new kind of man, a new genus. Why, it's a Negro! (Fanon, 1967: 84-87)

The practice of choosing an Irish/White driver over a Nigerian/Black driver In the Dublin taxi industry is justified on the grounds of culture but is practiced on the grounds of 'race'. It relies, in the first instance, on 'The Fact of Blackness' and 'race' is imposed on all Black taxi drivers while Irish/White taxi drivers remain 'race-neutral'. In my own experience as a taxi driver, in the immediate years following deregulation, I also faced hostility and exclusionary practices from other taxi drivers. The central signifier was the taxi plate roof-sign in which any number over 4,000 would indicate the driver was part of the new cohort that entered the industry post-deregulation. However, the original drivers quickly became outnumbered and the hostility turned towards 'foreign-nationals' working in the industry. A change in the numbering system in the mid-2000s also helped obscure the distinctions between pre-deregulation and 'new' drivers. On this point one participant said, "you can change the numbers, but you can't change my face".

Despite the euphemisms of the cultural turn, the fact of Blackness is further indication that biology is never truly absent. Hall says that regardless of whether racialisation is conceived primarily in biological or cultural terms, nature "is the unspoken signifier, *the* referent through which the system of hierarchies represents itself as natural and closed" (Hall, 2016: 55). 'Race' is therefore a discursive practice that grounds social and cultural differences on genetic and biological differences to make racial difference appear as a fixed, scientific fact. Fanon described this as epidermalization; the writing of racial differences on the body (Fanon, 1967: 15). The discourses of 'race' thus work through a system of equivalences between the biological and socio-cultural registers, allowing one to be symptomatically 'read off' against the other (Hall, 2016: 55-56).

These understandings of 'race' therefore help explain the discursive construction of Nigerian taxi drivers as 'uncivilised' to 'justify' racialised practises. However, the 'fact

of blackness' is the biological marker that is 'read-off' and is experienced by all Black taxi drivers.

The Discursive Construction of Nigerian Taxi Drivers

The categorisation of 'Nigerian' as uncivilised, illegal, and threat to 'our' way of life is concretised in the Nigerian taxi Driver. Throughout the interviews respondents describe experiences of racism primarily through the 'space of representation' that rely on the banal everyday racisms spoken through stories and rumours to construct the 'uncivilised' Nigerian. This aligns with previous accounts that indicate that the racism experienced in Ireland is discursive rather than physical (Freyne, 2012). Evarest Chisi, a Nigerian taxi driver, said that "in Poland racism is more direct, here [Ireland] they try to tarnish our name telling lies about us ripping people off" (Freyne, 2012). Nonetheless, this results in discriminatory practices with very real material consequences.

Fanning's definition of racialisation illustrates how a specific group are constructed as a 'type' with a limited selection of characteristics that are used to explain their behaviour, abilities, and values (Fanning, 2002: 12). Racialisation means that members of the group are not afforded their individuality, unlike those in majority groups, and come to be representative of the whole (Pred, 2000: 66; Simmel, 1950; Titley, 2011). This is cultural racism's discursive sleight-of-hand that works to disguise overt reference to biology through a commonsense logic which resonates with the majority culture. Racialised social constructions become naturalised, made to appear in the guise of a stable thing, and are projected to concrete places (Lehtovuori, 2011).

The term 'discourse' has broad connotations but is described by David Macey as "any organised body or corpus of statements and utterances governed by rules and conventions of which the user is largely unconscious" (Macey, 2000: 100). Discourse is influenced by symbolic systems, such as language, which is not an expression of subjectivity, but the agency that produces subjectivity by positioning human beings as subjects (Macey, 2000: 100). Emile Benveniste explains discourse as a supra-linguistic phenomenon that is the product of the combination of more basic units such as phonemes and signs (Benveniste, 1996). Language is considered the most complex of the system of signs and in the analysis of the sentence, the domain of linguistics proper is abandoned and "the analyst enters a universe in which language is an instrument of communication, with discourse as its form of expression" (Macey, 2000: 100).

Michel Foucault stresses that discourse is an intersubjective phenomenon and has a constitutive role in the production of the symbolic systems that govern human existence (as quoted in Macey, 2000: 100-101). While things may exist or not exist, it is only through discourse that meaning can be ascribed. Foucault describes discursive formation as a group of statements in which it is possible to find a pattern defined in terms of order, correlation, position and function (Foucault, 1969). These formations are therefore the product of discourses and of their formations of objects, subject positions, concepts, and strategies (Ibid). Knowledge is always a form of power, and the 'relations of force and power' are involved at every level of a discursive formation (Macey, 2000: 101). Discursive formations do not refer to ´things´ in the way that the linguistic referent designates an extra-linguistic object as "they both constitute their objects and generate knowledge about those objects" (Macey, 2000: 101). Although discursive formations are not subject to the mechanical determination of the non-discursive, they constantly interact with them such as institutions, political events, and economic processes (Foucault, 1969).

Foucault thus provides a theory of ideology that relates to the practices and configurations of power rooted in organisations that both "control and are structured by distinct disciplinary knowledges of power" (Frow, 2005: 92). For example, Foucault shows how the discourses of prison reform or medicine construct the possibility for certain truths to prevail, and for others to be without social effectivity or power (Frow, 2005: 92). These discourses create 'regimes of truth' (Foucault, 1980) that draw upon and reinforce certain structures of discursive authority such as the voice of the doctor or the scientist (Ibid). Simultaneously, they displace others, such as the voices of the criminal or the patient, whose knowledge is subjugated to those configurations of power. In the context of this research, I argue that the voice of the academic or policy maker prevails over the voice of Nigerian taxi drivers whose knowledge, gained through lived experience, is what Foucault calls 'subjugated knowledge' (Foucault, 1991: 81). The aim of this research is to access this 'subjugated knowledge' and analyse it against the wider discourses that narrate their lives.

Discursive formations are not only made up of language but are "the material practices and structures which determine whether and how they will be repeated across different social fields… and the objects and truths which they will designate and endow with a certain reality" (Frow, 2005: 92-93). Hall described 'race' as a ´floating signifier´ (1997) to highlight that, as a discursive construct, its meaning is never fixed. This helps us understand how racism is "cultivated in our imaginations… so that we can better

combat it on the streets" (Jhally, 1997). This process requires us to examine the discourses that surround 'race' to analyse "the metaphors, the anecdotes, the stories, the jokes that are told by culture about... physical racial difference" (Jhally, 1997). We therefore need to pay attention to the stories that cultures spin about the meaning of biological physical differences. The ways in which anti-Nigerian racism is spoken points to their cultural attributes in an attempt to bypass the physical ones. I have outlined the 'historical source' through the relevant postcolonial theories on 'race' and the regimes of representation that have constructed the non-White Other. To illustrate how this is reproduced within the taxi industry I provide an example of how stories circulate to depict Nigerian taxi drivers as the 'rogue' element in the industry.

Rumours: Anti-Nigerian Racism in the Dublin Taxi Industry

The literature reveals the centrality of stories, or rumours, to the racism African taxi drivers experience in Ireland. Jaichand's research on the Galway taxi industry found 46 percent of the opinions of those interviewed regarding Black taxi drivers had been informed through hearsay and indirect experience (Jaichand, 2010: 6). Maguire and Murphy's research in Louth found that many rumours exist that depict 'rogue' African drivers who illegally share their taxi with unlicenced friends to maximise the profitability (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 28). Elaine Moriarty says rumours, or urban myths, help construct reality and mediate who belongs in Irish society (Moriarty, 2005: 2). Here I draw on my previous research to provide an example of a rumour that is used to maintain these racialised narratives of Nigerian taxi drivers (O'Keeffe, 2013). It presents a landscape in which Nigerian taxi drivers operate under 'Lagos rules' in contrast to Irish taxi drivers supposed 'civilised' etiquette (O'Keeffe, 2013).

The following extract is taken from an interview with Ruth, a 22 year old Irish taxi customer, who relayed a story to me that she had heard on a radio chat show (O'Keeffe, 2013). The show's format centres on listeners calling in to discuss the 'hot topic' of the day and often generated heated debates. The discussion that Ruth heard was centred on the issue of 'foreign nationals' working in the Dublin taxi industry. She recounted a story from an Irish taxi driver who described an incident he experienced outside the National Concert Hall. Here, the driver told how 'non-national' taxi drivers had 'swooped in' to 'intercept' fares from Irish taxi drivers who were waiting patiently at a rank across the road.

> **Ruth**: "The Irish men were queuing up for ages outside the Hall, and there is a rank there isn't there?

Robert: "There is one across the road from it, at the hotel."

Ruth: "And the minute that… whatever gig is on at the Concert Hall finishes up, the non-nationals swoop in and, eh, call all their friends… all of a sudden the place is like completely flooded with taxis that haven't been waiting at all... Just swooped in and people are like jolly, they probably have had a few glasses of wine, just get into the first taxi they see which is begging for them to get into…"

Robert: "How do you mean begging?"

Ruth: "They are just straight up there. They are not over across the road waiting patiently for them to walk over. They have, like, intercepted, do you know what I mean?"

Robert: "And where did you hear this, or did you see this yourself?"

Ruth: "I heard it on the radio… one of the Irish taxi men who sat at that rank was talking about it… he says it's a common occurrence."

This story illustrates the central role of rumours in maintaining the racial formations that legitimise racism as common-sense response to illiberal cultural practices. The existing literature on rumours explains how they operate both as messages and as a particular process of dissemination (Bhabha, 1994; Das, 2007; Jaichand, 2010; Kapferer, 1988; Maguire and Murphy, 2012; Walker and Beclerly, 1987; Walker and Blaine, 1991). Vas Das says that rumours are events and that their power and importance does not lie in their often tenuous connections to some actual events elsewhere but, rather, in the lived experiences of their telling (Das, 2007: 108). Homi Bhabha isolates the enunciative aspects of rumours and their performative aspects (Bhabha, 2004: 201). He says the enunciative aspect allow rumours to work like social glue that binds people together, while the performative aspects result in a "contagious spreading, an almost uncontrollable impulse to pass it on to another person'" (Ibid). Rumours therefore play an integral role in creating and sustaining negative homogenous racial and ethnic stereotypes.

Studies have shown how anxiety and uncertainty are essential conditions for the generation and transmission of rumours, and that negative or 'dread' rumours are more likely to be transmitted than positive or 'wish' rumours (Walker and Blaine, 1991: 135-153). Rumours therefore incorporate commonly used words in immigration discourse, such as 'swamped', 'influx' or 'overrun', that tap into the existing anxieties and fears of the Other. Ruth's story becomes a rumour due to the repeated telling, of which I am now also a part, and its initial live broadcast on a radio platform. The dread invoked in this rumour presents threatened Irish identities – identities encapsulated in

the law abiding, 'civilised' Irish taxi drivers waiting patiently on the official taxi rank. The narrative depicts them as being invaded by uncivilised 'non-nationals' who 'swooped in' to 'intercept' their fares. It is stories such as this that define who belongs and who does not. Moriarty, discussing the 'buggy-at-the-bus stop' rumour, argued the term 'non-national' signals a presumed Nigerian identity, Blackness, and a lack of character (Moriarty, 2005: 96). The rumour that Ruth reproduced identifies the 'non-nationals' casually disregarding the 'rank rule etiquette' and are presumed Nigerian as it fits the preferred narrative. Such stories contain rich narratives of the Other, as well as containing devices to dilute or disguise the racialised content such as the 'non-national' euphemism.

The rumour is damaging as it deployed the existing racialised stereotypes that are foundational to the construction of Nigerian taxi driver identity. Most tellers rely on the frequency of the telling as evidence of widespread abuse rather than raising suspicions about the veracity of the story (Moriarty, 2005: 5). Kapferer says that while this 'snowballing' effect allows rumours to survive they also require exaggeration or additional elements to be added:

> Identical repetition kills the news value of all information… and were a rumour to be repeated word for word, without any modification whatsoever, throughout the diffusion process, its death would thereby be accelerated. (Kapferer, 1990: 108)

The permanent additions of new details, such as the inflation of figures etc., are value-boosting devices and the contagious process of information exchange would not last long without this value-adding process (Ibid). For Nigerian identity to be constructed, stories such as these must be told in an attempt to challenge the listener or convert them to the preferred narrative, and the repeated telling is to reinforce membership or sense of belonging. Just as the Irish taxi driver challenged the radio audience, Ruth challenged me to accept the narrative according to how she perceived the event. The loaded and vivid imagery in her choice of words such as 'swoop' an 'intercepting' reveals the extent to which she accepts the taxi driver's version and its correlation to the preferred narrative. It demonstrates her active participation in the discursive construction of identities – Nigerian, Irish taxi drivers, and her own – articulated in the routinised social practises of storytelling. Ruth also pointed to the need for a structured queuing system that reflects a supposed Irish etiquette:

> **Ruth:** I don't think that's fair at all… I think the queuing is, like it's one of the few taxi etiquette rules that there are… I mean if that's not going to be adhered to then it's just chaos... Whereas if you're in like a structured system, your turn

is going to come up eventually. You're the first in the rank, you're going to get a fare, it's just a matter of waiting. (O'Keeffe, 2013)

However, in both my previous research and here I found that the practice of choosing a White driver over a Black driver at taxi ranks is widespread. In reality, the assumption of fairness, that if you are 'orderly' and wait your turn that you will get your fare, does not exist for Nigerian taxi drivers. As I discuss later, this practice is defended under neoliberal rationalities that defends the customers' right to choose the service they want. The 'service you want' is considered, understandably, as the one in which you deem fair and free of exploitation. Discrediting the provider of the service with rumours of malpractice therefore helps legitimise this form of racialised exclusion. My previous research identified many similar stories told by Irish taxi drivers and customers that connect to these negative stereotypes and present Nigerians as a rogue element in the industry (O'Keeffe, 2013). These include rumours such as the taxi knowledge test is made easier for Nigerian drivers which ties into the stereotype that Nigerian drivers do not know where they are going. Another asserts that some Nigerians receive lump sums from the State to buy a taxi which ties into the stereotype that Nigerians exploit Ireland's 'generous' welfare state. Many others describe cases in which Nigerians are not vetted properly and share their licence with each other, linking to the stereotype that they often are not the person in the photograph because, of course, 'they all look the same' (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 291). Rumours such as these, I argue, are integral to the racial formation of Nigerian taxi drivers and operate to sustain racialised thinking**.** These rumours serve as justifications for a customer to take a White driver and deploy 'common-sense' rationalities to mitigate accusations of racism by arguing cultural incompatibility to Irish norms.

These rumours place 'reasonable' anxieties on specific groups of people to reclaim a sense of control. The 'sexual predator' trope also emerged in regard to Black drivers that draws on the existing anxiety women have of getting into a car with an unknown man. This extract from Cathy, Irish taxi customer (30's), illustrates how this legitimate fear is supplanted onto Nigerian taxi drivers:

> **Cathy:** I actually felt very unsafe within the taxi, tried to throw me out… terrified I was because I questioned which way he went … he was going a weird way and I was very polite in the way I asked… I'm guessing he was Nigerian, but he was very aggressive, and I was afraid. (O'Keeffe, 2013)

Cathy said that the experience was something that stayed in her mind but agreed that she did not have the same response to bad experiences with Irish drivers. Throughout my interviews with Irish customers there was often the presumption that a Black taxi

driver was Nigerian, and many stories of a bad experience began with 'I got a Nigerian taxi'. I also found that other immigrant taxi drivers play a supportive role in this anti-Nigerian discourse as they attempt to distance themselves from the identifiable 'Other'. Many interviewees expressed that their difficulty was specifically with Nigerians and often qualified anti-Nigerian feeling with examples of good experiences with other Black immigrants. The following quote from Niall, an Irish taxi driver (50's), illustrates this:

> **Niall**: Not all Black drivers, we are not talking about Black drivers, I know a Cuban guy who is Black as the ace of spades and he's wonderful fun, he's a great guy and we hang out on a few occasions. And there is the Cuban, a couple of guys from the Ivory Coast, some from Ghana. And let me tell you what I've heard those guys say of the Nigerians is unrepeatable, even by me, it's unrepeatable. (O'Keeffe, 2013)

And Anne, an Irish taxi customer (40's) said:

> **Anne:** I actually know a few foreign nationals of all races and that, but I actually find the Nigerians are the worst, and I know a few coloured people that are not from Nigeria and they say that as well, that the Nigerians give them a bad name. (O'Keeffe, 2013)

This reflects Dyer's 'varying degrees of Whiteness' with interviewees, presenting themselves as experts on race, highlighting the cultural adeptness of 'good' immigrants (Dyer, 1997: 19). My previous research has shown that the fake expertise that differentiates the 'good diversity' from the 'bad diversity' is an important justificatory aspect of racism (O'Keeffe, 2013). Narrating racism as a response to the perceived illiberal cultural practices of Nigerian taxi drivers appeals to the 'civilised' and 'rational' Irish mind and is further 'substantiated' by the xenophobia articulated by other African drivers. While these distinctions suggest Black heterogeneity, they construct Nigerian homogeneity that, due to 'The Fact of Blackness', essentialises all Black taxi drivers.

Ultimately, what is important is not whether the rumour is true, but the need for it to be retold. Rumours around Nigerian taxi drivers glean narratives held within racialised regimes of truth that resonate with the majority population as well as providing a stickiness, or social glue, that binds those from one group in opposition to another. A rumour is therefore never 'just a rumour', and its underlying function serves to maintain the racialised social structures in place. These rumours therefore need to be understood in how they contribute to anti-immigrant discourse as they narrate who belongs and who does not. Nigerian taxi drivers have been homogenised into a set of

cultural and ethnic traits and, although they may contain a kernel of truth, it is the exaggerating or twisting of elements to fit the preferred narrative that they manage to essentialise whole populations. Rumours are examples of how historical regimes of representation of Black/Nigerian populations become nested together, encapsulated in one incident, and used as 'proof' that they are not yet capable of adhering to Irish/Eurocentric 'values'.

To understand anti-Nigerian racism therefore requires a dialectical approach that considers the interrelationships of discourses, narratives, and the constitution of identities (Moriarty, 2005: 1). One aim of this dissertation is to deconstruct these rumours by sourcing their connection to power vis-a-vis the global and local 'regimes of truth' and to consult the 'subjugated knowledge' of the racialised (Foucault, 1980). This approach is designed to allow new narratives to emerge that challenge the existing dichotomy of the 'uncivilised' Nigerian versus the 'civilised' Irish. Throughout the finding chapters I outline how Nigerian taxi drivers experience these discourses, the various sites in which they are expressed, and how they interpret them into their understanding of both themselves and wider society.

Ireland's Limited Expansive-hegemony: The Moral Panic (2011-2015)

I have outlined how racialised perceptions of Nigerian identity are constructed in opposition to 'Irishness' to 'justify' the exclusionary practices and restriction from the 'Irish family'. In this section I illustrate my use of Antonio Gramsci's concept of hegemony (1971) to illustrate the role of the State in the powerful social system. Here, I examine the latest State intervention with new technologies of surveillance that, I argue, deployed the motif of 'security' against 'foreign threats' and produced new forms of racialisation (Irish Statute Book, 2013).

Gramsci's sees power in modern nations states as exercised through consent rather than through force. He points to the symbiotic relationship between the ruling elite who adapt and change to the wishes of the majority to maintain control. However, various groups within the hegemon differ in the value of the consent they provide. In line with Western liberal values the Irish hegemon can be considered ´expansive´ in that it has adapted to include former discriminated groups, as evidenced by the liberalisation of marriage equality (Irish Statute Book, 2015) and abortion laws (Irish Statute Book, 2018) facilitated by two referenda. However, Ireland is ´limited´ in that it excludes ethnic/racial minorities, as evidenced by the citizenship referendum in 2004 (Irish Statute Book, 2004).

Irish born, White citizens hold the most political capital in this sense and, as I argue, Nigerian consent holds significantly less political capital for the State to respond equally to their wishes. While the salience of 'race' explains this, it also indicates the potential for positive change. Hegemonic theory suggests that when the non-White population reach a critical mass the value of their consent will garner enough political capital for the State to act in their interest. However, during the period in which the interviews took place this was not the case and, as the rumour above illustrated, respondents experienced a period of 'moral panic' between 2011-15 with heightened discursive hostility towards them in the media, by certain politicians, and the general public.

Contradictory Consciousness: Common-sense and Good-sense

Gramsci sees power functioning through two major ideologies: a ruling ideology which is a coherent system of thought, and a subordinate ideology which exhibits 'contradictory consciousness' (Cheal, 1979: 109). Contradictory consciousness is a central facet of hegemonic theory and helps explain the logic behind both racialised practices and Nigerian taxi drivers response to racism. For Gramsci, contradictory consciousness explains how the cultural hegemony shape the consciousness of subalterns to provide elites with the ´spontaneous consent´ of the masses. The elite's attention to consent, as opposed to force, implies that subordinate groups participate in their own domination. Ideology is therefore a 'spontaneous philosophy' to which members of a society accept as normal and correct. Contradictory consciousness explains the passivity of the 'individual conscious' as 'man-in-mass' giving him two theoretical consciousness:

> One which is implicit in his activity and which in reality unites him with all his fellow workers in the practical transformation of the real world; and one, superficially explicit or verbal, which he has inherited from the past and uncritically absorbed… It holds together a specific social group, it influences moral conduct and the direction of will, with varying efficacity but often powerfully enough to produce a situation in which the contradictory state of consciousness does not permit of any action, any decision or any choice, and produces a condition of moral and political passivity. (Gramsci, 1971: 333)

Such individuals are therefore not always committed to the prevailing hegemony but feel restricted from acting outside the consensus. Ultimately, the hegemony is powerful enough to prevent them from translating their implicit consciousness into a conception of the world that will directly challenge the established order (Lears, 1985: 569). Even though they may be aware of the contradictions, hegemony deprives them

of a space in which to articulate that contradiction. To effectively utilise the concept of contradictory consciousness to the taxi industry, I identify the three main characteristics among subordinate groups who exhibit this type of thinking. The first is a difficulty to conceptualise an alternative vision to the hegemonic ideology or status quo. Second, a lack of language in which to articulate possible alternative visions. Third, a passivity or a sense of inevitability that prevents them from challenging the hegemony (Robyn, 2008).

Of the first characteristic, Gramsci says that every society has its own 'common-sense' and its own 'good sense' which are historically and socially situated (Gramsci, 1971: 326). He defines common-sense as the "diffuse, uncoordinated features of a general form of thought common to a particular period and a particular popular environment" (Gramsci, 1971: 330):

> It is a conception which, even in the brain of one individual, is fragmentary, incoherent and inconsequential, in conformity with the social and cultural position of those masses whose philosophy it is. (Gramsci, 1971: 419)

Common-sense is therefore 'the chaotic aggregate of disparate conceptions' and, due to its contradictory nature, one can find 'anything one likes' (Gramsci, 1971: 422). However, Gramsci also says that it contains truths and a healthy nucleus of 'good sense' that, if the hegemony is to be altered, requires it to be made more unitary and coherent (Gramsci, 1971: 419). This relates to the third element, passivity to the existing hegemony, which can be disrupted with a greater focus on 'good sense'. In the conclusion chapter I discuss this and the possibility to create counter-hegemonic alternatives that disrupt the existing discursive construction of Nigerian identity.

The second characteristic of contradictory consciousness is the significant role of language in shaping perceptions of the world (Gramsci, 1971: 326). Particularly relevant to this research is the language of ´security´ which I argue was deployed to provide consent for new forms of surveillance. Security is presented as the normal functioning of democracy and presents alternative arguments as 'irresponsible', lacking common-sense, because: 'if you´ve done nothing wrong, you have nothing to hide'.

To illustrate these components of hegemonic theory to the taxi industry I analyse the latest State intervention of 're-regulated deregulation'. Here I argue that contradictory consciousness helps explains the consent of both Nigerian and Irish taxi drivers towards their own domination. Nigerian taxi drivers, as the findings show, are aware

of the dominant hegemonic discourses and are therefore careful to echo them, even when it comes to justifying racism. For Irish drivers, contradictory consciousness helps explain both their acceptance of the anti-Nigerian discourse and their consent towards more authoritarian modes of control. Here I utilise Bigo's concept of (in)securitisation to illustrate that the consent to surveillance technologies was in response to the rhetoric of ´security´ (Bigo, 2006).

New Technologies: Steering Toward (In)securitisation

In chapter two I provided a background to the taxi industry and examined the socio-economic-political landscape that informed each of the various State interventions. In this chapter I reviewed the 'moral panic' that drew on the existing anti-Nigerian racism present in the taxi industry. Although this vilification was not orchestrated by the State, I argue that it facilitated the consent needed for the latest intervention, the Taxi Regulation Act 2013, that included new technologies of surveillance that has negative implications for society as a whole.

Alan Kelly said the proposed legislation in the Taxi Regulation Bill (2012) provided "a series of radical and reforming changes to the taxi sector that embrace new technology" (Alan Kelly, 2013). He utilised the motif of ´security´ to justify new surveillance measures by pointing to 'repeated calls' to tackle the ´rogue´ element and that "enforcement is the biggest issue taxi drivers always raise" (Ryan, 2014; Kelly, 2013). Kelly said that those within the industry were demanding that the regulatory body catch up with the private sector who were already providing individuals with new surveillance technologies, such as in-car cameras, to alleviate security concerns (Kelly, 2013).

Kelly said that the measures provide a "robust legislative basis for strengthened enforcement of the taxi regulations… to encourage higher standards of professionalism and make it more difficult to operate illegally in the sector" (Kelly, 2013). The measures also had a wider objective that encompassed the compliance of all taxi drivers in several realms of public and private life with "a real time data link-up between the National Transport Authority, Revenue and Department of Social Protection… and the introduction of continuous tax compliance measures for drivers" (Kelly, 2013).

Although Kelly was cautious to avoid racial discourse, he did feel the need to clarify an issue raised by taxi representatives and their "contention that many *local* taxi drivers feel they are discriminated against vis à vis *foreign nationals*" (Dail Debates, 2013

emphasis mine). He said this had been provided for in the legislation where vetting "will apply to people with equivalent convictions from outside the State" (ibid). This was disingenuous on two counts. Firstly, there are the obvious difficulties accessing criminal records of 'foreign nationals' outside the State such as the records held by states from whom they had fled persecution. Secondly, to address the perceived discrimination, of allowing those drivers whose records cannot be accessed, would mean that ´local´ drivers should also be relieved of criminal vetting. Or, as the argument made by one ´local´ driver, such ´foreign nationals´ should automatically be excluded from entering the industry due to the issue of vetting (O'Keeffe, 2013).

The Discourse of Security

I argue that the legislative gesture to protect ´discriminated local drivers´ utilised the existing racialised trope of 'security' to distract from the overall aim of implementing a system of surveillance and control that affects everyone in the industry. Surveillance studies have made important contributions by tracking the 'surveillant gaze' and its targets, especially in situations where new technologies are being deployed (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 295). While the literature has recognised the explicit gaze exercised through surveillance, such as CCTV deployments and software tracking, there is the need to discuss the processes of (in)securitisation that lean on existing fears of the racialised Other (Ibid).

Research that have questioned the liberal readings of securitisation processes contest the naturalisation of the 'security' motif in responses to real or imagined threats emanating from the migrant Other (Bigo, 2006, 2012; Lentin, 2007; Maguire and Murphy, 2014). This was particularly important after the events of September 11th in which Western regimes 'war on terror' found a new means for *coerced consent* based on the global moral panic toward the racialised Other. Didier Bigo´s work describes this security process as (in)securitisation (Bigo, 2006). He says that the post-9/11 fear, that garnered consent for liberal interventions into the Middle East, traversed into domestic spheres:

> [This] makes obsolete the conventional distinction between the constellation of war, defence, international order and strategy, and another constellation of crime, internal security, public order and police investigations. (Bigo, 2006: 10)

Lentin and Lentin say this contemporary politics of fear is designed "to construct consensus, [and] aims to bring to an end the long term settlement of migrants in Western societies" (Lentin and Lentin, 2006: 206). Although the fear of the migrant

Other was primarily related to the Muslim 'threat', its focus on security facilitated consent for the tightening of immigration control, both at the border and within. Maguire and Murphy say that this serves to naturalise security and argued the need to analyse the active production of threats, real or imagined, and the associated production of fear it produces (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 295). These software applications are thus understood as 'surveillance technologies' in the sense that they exercise a gaze that facilitates, not only self-regulation and self-policing, but also reproduces racialised practices (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 292). I argue that the assumed threat of 'uncivilised' Nigerian taxi drivers to internal security helped facilitate consent for this process of ´(in)securitisation´. While the 'war on terror' is analogous to the vilification of Nigerian taxi drivers, they are linked to the naturalisation of security that underpin the rationalities used to implement new technologies of surveillance in the taxi industry. These new technologies can therefore be mapped onto the spectrum of ´race´, demarcated through the signifiers of skin colour and driver names, that empower White or Irish drivers and exclude Black and Nigerian drivers.

In Gramscian terms, 'security' has become a major motif in current politics and is used to garner consent for increased surveillance and control. The ´moral panic´ is an episode illustrating the ´tyranny of the majority´, as opposed to the tyranny of the state, within expansive hegemonic power regimes (Mill, 1913). This cooperation results in security discourses becoming 'common-sense' without any interrogation of the associated production of unease and fear it produces. Unsurprisingly, the legislation was welcomed by taxi drivers who were at the vanguard of pushing those applications and measures to increase their own and their customers' security (McCarthnaigh, 2013; Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 289-290).

Thinking in terms of surveillance captures the regulatory instruments and technologies affecting drivers' everyday lives. While there is significant research on neoliberal 'regulated deregulation', there remains a need to explore the relationships between neoliberalism and (in)securitisation (Goldstein, 2012; Maguire and Murphy, 2014; Wacquant, 2012). In chapter six I examine how these technologies facilitate a neoliberal approach to self-regulation and, in doing so, regulate majority spaces to exclude Black taxi drivers. I outline the ways in which Nigerians experience these new technologies, how they navigate the new forms of racism they produce, and the effects they have on specific working practices.

3. Neoliberal Governmentality and Regimes of Truth

I have argued that the discursive formation of Nigerian taxi drivers is connected to global regimes of racialised 'truth'. The logic behind racial difference shapes the ways in which social relations and practises are experienced by Nigerian taxi drivers. I have argued that conceptualisations of Irishness are maintained in opposition to Blackness and the social praxis of 'race' relies on the 'fact of Blackness' as a central signifier. Racism is therefore a complex system of power that relies on global racialised 'regimes of truth' to rationalise, make 'common-sense', the racisms operating at the everyday level in the industry. As discussed, everyday racism is the recognition of the systemic nature of racism of which the State is only one actor. However, this does not absolve the State of its refusal to answer the 'modest pleas' by Nigerians to tackle racism in the industry (Maguire and Murphy, 2012). Nor in its failure to adequately admonish overtly radicalised comments of party members towards the industry (Byrne and Bright, 2002; Heaphy, 2014). I've argued that this failure can be explained by the lack of political capital to be gained in speaking up for racialised minorities. In this section I argue that Irish modes of neoliberal governmentality also help explain this inaction. I examine the post-race neoliberal rationalities, in which individuals are considered responsible for their own material conditions, under Foucault's concept of governmentality (1991) to illustrate how power flows through various 'regimes of truth' that operate at the global, local, and individual level.

Governmentality

Foucault's concept of 'governmentality' explains power as the organised political mentalities, rationalities, and interventions through which governable subjects and economic actors are produced (Foucault 1991). However, government has been reconfigured in recent decades to go beyond the territorial confines of the nation state (Rose, 2005: 153). On the one hand, there are attempts to shift various powers of government upward to transnational bodies, such as the European union, and on the other hand, there are attempts to shift other powers of government downward to localities and communities (Ibid). This has resulted in the 'hollowing out of the state' (Rhodes, 1994) which is now considered the terminal point, not the point of origin, of a range of networks of power. As such, states can only govern to the extent that they are able to "translate their calculations and objectives into the judgements of actors in a multitude of territorially distant sites and practices" (Rose, 2005: 153).

Governmentality therefore explains how power functions through a network of technologies that include, but are not limited to, the state.

In the Irish context, James Carr studied anti-Muslim racism and argues that Foucault's concept of governmentality is particularly useful tool to interrogate how our 'conduct is conducted' in the social through the ´rationalities and techniques´ of government (Carr, 2016: 5). He says the theory of governmentality allows for incisive analyses into the way power permeates society penetrating the population and the interactions between individuals (Ibid). This facilitates understanding of the interrelated mechanisms in which power operates and identifies the power of both the State and its subjects in the context of global power networks (Ibid). This perspective therefore aligns with 'everyday racism' and 'hegemony' to reveal the systemic nature of racism and help explain how anti-Nigerian racism gains legitimacy.

Regimes of Truth

Foucault identifies the 'rationalities and techniques' of government as a means to explain how the dominant ideology is reproduced to maintain the hegemonic order. He describes the matrix of discourses, or 'regimes of truth', that work together at the global, local (the State) and everyday (individual) level to reproduce the common-sense ways of thinking and acting in the world (Foucault, 1980). This helps to link the racialised discourses with power and explain how Irish politics involves the relations among a range of public and private entities without a clear authority through which governance occurs. Ultimately, to understand how minoritised subjects are racialised, we need to look at how the State interacts with these other networks of governance and how these are internalised in the popular imagination. This helps explain how discursive formations are created and deployed as ´truth´ to legitimate rationalities of both government of the state and the government of the self, at the expense of competing discourses (Carr, 2016: 5).

This perspective reveals the connection between dominant 'regimes of truth´, their impact on governmental rationalities, and how they become imbibed as common-sense. It is the alignment between the dominant legitimising discourses, the 'truths´, and the rationalities of government, that "reveal the manner in which governmental rationalities inform the conduct of the state and that of personal behaviour" (Carr, 2016: 5). Studying governmentality therefore provides the opportunity for research to go beyond the lived immediate experience of racist incidents to understand how hegemonic ´truths´ inform and underpin ´lived´ racism and the rationalities of

government (Carr, 2016: 13). This provides is a particularly useful means in which to explore the ideological underpinnings of racism in the taxi industry that draws on the global, the local and the ´everyday´. Ultimately, the everyday ´regimes of truth´ played out in the taxi industry are informed by global hegemonic discourses that are also connected to local practices of government.

Neoliberalism: The Dominant Regime of Truth

Throughout the interviews neoliberal rationalities emerged as a central factor in how respondents experience discrimination as well as in their attitudes to work and individual agency. Neoliberalism cannot be explained as one single coherent ideology or economic model, and instead merges into all things social (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 141; Harvey, 2005: 13). On a global scale, it has been ingested into the body-politic so thoroughly that is has become the prevailing common-sense of everyday life (Thompson, 2007; Dean, 2010; Harvey, 2005; Carr, 2016) and informs contemporary rationalities at the level of the state and the self (Dean, 2010a: 10). Foucault said biopolitics is the process of liberal modernity in which biopower describes the development of life as its governing imperative (Foucault, 1990: 137). This form of power "exerts a positive influence on life, that endeavours to administer, optimize, and multiply it, subjecting it to precise controls and comprehensive regulations" (Foucault, 1990: 137). Mezzadra et al argue that it is this insistence on the need to develop 'life' which has permitted neoliberalism to proliferate:

> Taking over entire states and societies as conditions for its spread, installing markets, commodifying anything it can lay its hands on, monetizing the value of everything. (Mezzadra, Reid, and Samaddar, 2013: 3)

Neoliberalism, therefore, is best understood as an economic theory that proposes human well-being can be best advanced by the maximisation of entrepreneurial freedoms within a framework of private property rights, individual liberty, unencumbered markets and free trade (Mezzadra, Reid, and Samaddar, 2013: 3). However, the claims of being able to increase wealth and freedom also became correlated with claims of developing life itself, "blurring the very boundary between public and private established and so carefully policed by classical liberalism" (Mezzadra, Reid, and Samaddar, 2013: 3). Neoliberalism therefore represents a realignment of governmental objectives to regulate the populace in accordance with these rationalities (Carr, 2016: 22).

Neoliberal discourse heavily emphasises 'human capabilities' and 'capacities', with development from a macro socio-economic context into something more attentive to the needs of individual human beings (Mezzadra, Reid, and Samaddar, 2013: 3). The centrality of agency means it is thus presented as emancipatory. But to govern effectively authorities must govern through reshaping the ways in which autonomous political subjects understand and enact their own freedom (Rose, 2005: 153). The application of the market principles has infused social mentalities and practices so that people come to perceive the 'truth' of the world through this neoliberal lens (Carr, 2016: 22). Ultimately, neoliberalism 'idealises' individualism, self-care, and competition and shapes how 'autonomous' subjects' understand and enact their own freedom through self-reliance and self-regulation (Ibid). The free market 'truth' therefore merges into common-sense understandings of the self and through which the success or failure of the individual can be judged.

However, critics say 'the human' within neoliberal development discourse is a highly biopoliticised and when analysed we can find a 'degraded view' of what it is to be human (Gallagher, 2012; McCrea, 2016). Goldberg's term 'racial neoliberalism' (2009, 2010) helps interrogate the implicit colour-blind assumptions to reveal how racism is embedded in neoliberal thought. He says racial neoliberalism is about techniques of the self and creating oneself as a proper subject of this neoliberal worldview. He defines it as the contemporary extension of racial historicism, "embedding cultures of whiteness silently into its self-conception, neoliberal sociality simply renews and updates these modes of racial management" (Goldberg, 2010: 596). Nicholas Rose also said that 'race' is present in this instrumentalisation of self-government of individuals in political objectives such as economic regeneration and crime prevention (Rose, 2005: 153).

In the Irish context, Carr also argues that racism is a central aspect of Irish neoliberal governmentality and that incorporating Foucauldian insights enables us to contest this hegemonic 'truth' (Carr, 2016: 15). Ultimately, neoliberalism informs how nation states recognise and react (or not) to ´race´ and broader forms of hate and exclusion (Carr, 2016: 9). Carr says that the Irish state is disengaged when it comes to caring for those vulnerable to racism and that, true to neoliberal rationalities of government, "by not ´caring´, actively encourages those who are targeted with racism to either care for themselves or to seek support among privatised providers of care" (Carr, 2016: 14).

In this dissertation I argue that neoliberalism continues to cement existing racialised inequalities in the Dublin taxi industry. As discussed in the findings chapters,

respondents describe 'presumptions of guilt' and the automatic questioning of their citizenship or legal residency by Gardai. These are symptomatic of the deeper antagonisms against those supposedly not belonging to the national family and 'not white like us' (Goldberg, 2010: 596). Goldberg says that racial neoliberalism makes the terms of such assertions, and their denials, harder to pinpoint (Ibid). I argue, however, that these assertions rest in Nigerian Blackness and, despite adhering to the prescribed values of neoliberalism, are presented as culturally immature and not yet capable of exhibiting behaviour in line with 'civilised' Irish values. I also argue that respondents 'racism-denial' is a 'tactic' to display their neoliberal credentials.

Neoliberal Pentecostalism

Pentecostal values were also found to heavily influence respondents' attitude to work, individual agency, as well as their response to a hostile working environment. As mentioned in the previous chapter, Pentecostalism strongly aligns with neoliberal values of self-reliance and taking responsibility for one's material conditions. The literature on African Pentecostals identifies a particular focus on financial prosperity. As one pastor said:

> God is not glorified in churches being poor or people worshipping in a poor church… so there is no point preaching holiness and leaving prosperity behind. The thing must be balanced, so there is no holiness without prosperity. (as quoted in Maguire and Murphy, 2016: 857)

Maguire and Murphy found that the goal for African Pentecostals is "redemption with a healthy financial bottom line produced by tangible returns on investments" (Maguire and Murphy, 2016: 858). Pentecostalism therefore accords with the ideology of entrepreneurial non-victims, as found in neoliberalism, and offers respondents a certain level of control over their lives. The focus on financial self-reliance is reflected in this research as respondents were keen to stress that they have no interest in handouts or accessing social welfare. However, Pentecostal values differ from neoliberalism in that respondents, also identified by Maguire and Murphy, do not see themselves as units in an atomised society. Pentecostalism helps addresses some of the more sterile components of neoliberalism by taking responsibility to preserve both the Nigerian community and extend themselves out to their new 'Irish family'. As I discuss in the conclusion chapter, the emphasis on self-reliance found in both neoliberal and Pentecostal values pose problems for antiracism advocates who see the reporting of racism as a key strategy.

Migration Nation: Producing the Self-reliant Neoliberal Subject

Neoliberalism it is not a singular and coherent ideology but has various applications from one state to another that are cultural in its origins, cultural in its operations, and cultural in its consequences (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 4-6). It is widely argued that Ireland is an exemplar neoliberal state with policies and legislation aimed at ensuring efficiencies and meeting targets (Carr, 2016; Gray, 2013) that extends "to all sorts of areas… such as the family… the birth rate… and crime and delinquency" (Dean, 2010: 72). Existing research has also connected Irish neoliberal governmentality to contemporary racism (Gray, 2011; Carr, 2016; Lentin and Lentin, 2006; Maguire and Murphy, 2014) in which the Irish State does the bare minimum to counter racism (Carr, 2016: 14). Irish integration policies reflect similar policies across the European Union and are structured around an ideal of the migrant citizen, which is in turn benchmarked against a neoliberal homo-economicus (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 141). Neoliberalism therefore informs how the Irish state recognises and reacts to ´race´, and migrants are constructed as problematised populations and subjected to a mode of neoliberal governmentality (Gray, 2006: 130; Carr, 2016: 9).

This form of Irish governmentality of the migrant population was exemplified in the government document 'Migration Nation' (OMI, 2008). The document presented a new approach to integration policy that involved mainstreaming as a means to manage diversity and leave the rest to civil society and everyday life (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 141). It was intended to deal with the so-called 'parallel communities' and the spectre of 'ghettoisation' but, true to neoliberal rationalities, framed racism as an individual concern. The main outcomes it described were new immigration laws to ensure "the shoring up of residency and citizenship rights and enhanced anti-discrimination policies and laws" (Murphy and Maguire, 2010: 141). The writers said that successful integration "hinges on a vibrant civil society… [because] integration lives and breathes, and indeed dies, at the level of community" (OMI, 2008: 17). Ultimately, it set out integration policies that aimed to foster self-sufficient and autonomous immigrants, who must work on themselves to be independent and committed to contributing to the Irish economy and society (Gray, 2006: 130).

The document coincided with the economic downturn in 2008 as well as the dissolution of the NCCRI (NCCRI, 2007). This period, therefore, marked the end of interculturalism as the official State integration strategy and the rhetoric moved towards placing responsibility onto migrants to 'integrate from below'. However, as

Breda Gray argued, these new integration politics and policies imagine migrants as "bearers of fixed and essentialised cultures and identities who must learn to be self-managing citizens capable of integrating into society" (Gray, 2006). In this context, Nigerian taxi drivers are constructed as problem populations and are subjected to a mode of neoliberal governmentality in order to make them responsible and self-empowering citizens.

The literature has shown that African efforts toward integration, in schools and churches and other areas of life, occur in a space characterised by government-at-a-distance (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 140). The ramifications of neoliberal government were found across all domains that included a "struggle against discursive formations of Africans that share a family resemblance" (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 140). For Africans and Nigerians, integration must be negotiated against "an austere neo-liberalism whereby immigrants are regarded as responsible for their own integration" (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 139). This dissertation expands on the literature and, as I argue, the intersection of neoliberal governmentality and the discursive construction of their identity determine how respondents understand, experience, and respond to living and working in Irish society. In chapter seven, I explore how Nigerian taxi drivers evoke these neoliberal and Pentecostal standards, as well as the importance of family and education, as a means toward 'successful' integration.

The Crises of Multiculturalism

As discussed, neoliberalism is the central mechanism against which Nigerians are judged and, despite aligning with these values, they are nonetheless framed within discourses of security and criminality. The publication of Migration Nation and the global economic crash also corresponds to a period described as the 'crisis of multiculturalism' (Lentin and Titley, 2011). Although criticism of multiculturalism is not new, anti-immigrant sentiment in the US, the UK and across Europe escalated significantly during this time (Lentin and McVeigh, 2006; Lentin and Titley, 2011; Rattansi, 2011). The perceived failure of multiculturalism was used to explain growing economic insecurity and the general social fragmentation in Western societies. Lentin and Titley say this period marked the changing discourses around integration and the global political consensus that multiculturalism had failed with new rhetoric around ´sensible´ management of ethnic and cultural difference (Lentin and Titley, 2011).

This was accompanied by a rise in anti-immigration rhetoric and the subsequent period of austerity led to scapegoat theories in which race and racism were spoken through the 'immigration line' (Back, 2007: 32). Ali Rattansi says that the worries caused by growing economic insecurity, and more general social fragmentation, have been displaced onto issues of immigration;

> Multiculturism has become the container into which Western European nations have poured anxieties whose origins often lie in social and economic changes that are considerably wider than those stemming from the consequences of immigration and multiculturalist policies. (Rattansi, 2011: 5-6)

Rattansi argues that many of the ills attributed to multiculturalism are exacerbated by the vulnerability of the nation state to globalisation, the demands of economic expansion, and the retrenchment in previously generous welfare state provisions (Rattansi, 2011: 5-6). He says this is the backdrop against which the narratives of multiculturalism have been played out and fed "into even more anxiety for populations already uncomfortable in the maelstrom of increasingly fast moving dislocations produced by the furious pace of change… in Europe and the West" (Rattansi, 2011: 5-6).

In the Irish context, the same anxieties toward the migrant Other were played out in political, economic, and social discourses. The new framing of the migrant Other in Ireland resonated with the hegemonic mass who were suffering from austerity and experiencing a more competitive labour market. This was reflected in the 2011 election campaign in which immigration, interculturalism and integration played little part (Lentin and Moreo, 2012: 8-9). Integration thus became the responsibility of migrants who had to manage these categorisations of 'good diversity' – those who mimicked Eurocentric and Irish values appropriately and were aiding the economy – and 'bad diversity' – asylum seekers, refugees, Muslims, and the non-white Other.

Lentin and Titley say the certainties and recited truths of the 'multicultural problem' are one of the central ways in which racist discourse is constructed (Lentin and Titley, 2011: 63-64). This is vital to understanding anti-Nigerian racism in which they are consistently constructed as 'bad diversity' despite their effort at integration. As I discuss later, migrants who are deemed 'good diversity' have the possibility to enter 'model minority spaces' (Laguerre, 1999). However, Nigerian taxi drivers' *diversity* nestles on the ´clash of civilisations' myth that is central to the 'multicultural crisis' discourse. This myth presents Western civilisation as having evolved independently of

the Other despite the deep connections in the development of European liberalism to the ´liberalism´ of Asian, African and Indian cultures (Rattansi, 2012; Brown, 2006: 15).

Current Debates on Immigration, Racism, and Nativist Populism

As discussed, 'contradictory consciousness' helps explain how racism is rationalised through 'acceptable' discourses, or 'regimes of truth', and thereby 'legitimise' racism. These can include discourses on nationalism and citizenship in which the new racisms of the cultural turn present an imaginary definition of the nation as a unified cultural community (Gilroy, 2002: 254). Gilroy says this facilitates the denial of racism because it is able to link 'race' with nationhood, patriotism, and nationalism (Gilroy, 2002). More recently, debates have centred on trying to understand the rise of nativist populism over the last decade. While this has not yet affected Irish mainstream politics, I argue against complacency given the presence of certain figures attempting to leverage nativism for political gain.

Fanning in *Diverse Republic* (2021) addresses this debate in the Irish context (Fanning, 2021). He references influential writers, Roger Eatwell and Mathew Goodwin, who argue that it should not be regarded as racist to prefer one's own race or ethnic group (Fanning, 2021: 37-38). He also references Kaufmann and Goodhart who say that 'group partiality' is not the same as 'racism' which they define as the irrational hatred, fear, or contempt for another group (Fanning, 2021: 43). Such arguments draw on evolutionarily psychology to explain nativism, or ethnic nepotism, as a natural response to preferring 'one's own'. These writers problematise the term 'racism' and argue for a narrower definition of racism which would allow public debate about immigration and other majority group anxieties to occur without being censured as racist (Fanning, 2021: 37-47).

Fanning says the interpretation of these arguments depends on ones view of nationalism but that the 'cosmopolitan' perspective, that admits no shade of grey, risks dismissing all nationalism as fascistic (Fanning, 2021: 45). While definitions of national identities are contestable, he says the "Irish political conversation about immigration and national identity is not between nationalists and post-nationals and anti-nationalists but one between different shades of green" (Fanning, 2021: 45). Some of these writers also encourage Western governments for a politics that seeks slower change, including policies that discriminate migrants, so that 'native' society can adapt (Fanning, 2021: 38, 45). Fanning does not agree such arguments justify discriminatory policies but says they provide insight into the rationalities, fears, and anxieties some

have toward large scale immigration (Fanning, 2021: 38). Although nativist populism has not yet affected Ireland to the degree seen in the US, UK, and other European and Anglophone countries, Fanning says that we must exercise caution. He argues that these insights into anti-immigrant sentiment should not be dismissed and may help understand the logic behind ethnic nepotism and racism within the imagined Irish community.

However, it is uncertain how Blackness can be incorporated into conceptualisations of Irishness in discussions on citizenship, nationalism, and belonging. The salience of Whiteness to Irishness has been addressed in both Michael's work on Afrophobia and Joseph's work on racial stratification in the workplace. In Joseph's most recent work she argued Whiteness is enshrined in conceptualisations of Irishness and called for a radical interrogation of this if the disadvantages Black Irish experience in Ireland are to be resolved. She said the "recategorization of the Irish as white and the subsequent change in positioning on the racial ladder came at a price of subscribing to white supremacy" (Joseph, 2022: 79). However, she defines White supremacy in this context as "the unacknowledged, everyday positioning of white superiority, as opposed to white extremism". Joseph argues that Whiteness is thus employed as a determinant of Irishness and calls for a decolonized narrative in Ireland (Ibid). In this research I provide a perspective on the logic of racism as experienced by Nigerian taxi drivers. I argue that a more radical examination of Afrophobia and anti-Black racism is required if we are to move away from conceptualisations of Irishness as White.

Citizenship

Throughout the interviews citizenship emerged as a central aim for respondents in terms of providing the security of residency status as well as providing a sense of being welcomed into the Irish family. Goldberg says the distinctions made by the state between citizen and non-citizen are done on racial grounds to identify 'their own' as racially and culturally homogenous in order to protect resources from non-citizens (Goldberg, 2002b). He argues that nation-states attempt to control those Others who try to cross their borders and is done through increasingly restrictive immigration regulation (Ibid). For the 'citizen' to exist, it therefore requires the production of the Other and "the definition of citizen carries around the non-citizen, or the shadow citizen as part of its constitution" (Cresswell, 2006: 752).

Roger Brubaker says citizenship has two forms of 'social closure' (Brubaker, 1992). First, it creates external boundaries, separating citizens from potential immigrants

from poorer countries and, second, it creates internal boundaries, separating citizens from foreign residents through rights and privileges (Ibid). Some approaches to measuring citizenship regimes focus exclusively on naturalisation (the legal category) while others examine how citizenship bestows an individual's membership in a 'national political community' (Howard, 2009). Huddleston and Vink say there are two contrasting views on the way states can use naturalisation and immigrants' rights policies to set out their broader agenda of immigrant integration (Huddleston and Vink, 2015: 1). In one instance, citizenship is complementary to the granting of social and political rights to immigrants in the process of full integration in the political community. In the other, as is the case in Ireland, granting access to formal membership through naturalisation is instead seen as "an alternative to granting social and political rights, independent of citizenship status" (Huddleston and Vink, 2015: 10).

Citizenship regimes are part of the various ways within law and policy-making that, alongside other immigration controls, make inclusion only possible through exclusion. It affords certain rights, privileges, and relief from the fear of deportation. Ostensibly, it links citizens to the nation-state and confers the rights and advantages of protection by the state (Koopmans et al., 2005). This understanding of citizenship explains why Nigerians pursue citizenship and why the State makes it difficult for them to obtain. Throughout the interviews many respondents described the long bureaucratic struggle to obtain residency rights to provide security for them and their families.

However, as Fanning points out, citizenship on its own does not ensure integration nor, as the experiences of some Irish citizens reveal, does it ensure social inclusion (Fanning, 2021: 121). Koopmans et al. say that there is a gap between formal citizenship and what happens in practice (Koopmans et al., 2005: 6). Despite citizenship, exclusion can continue with the restriction of economic and social rights of minorities as a result of discrimination, laws, and policies (Ibid). This points to the concept of the 'ideal citizen' in which, regardless of naturalisation, Nigerian taxi drivers continue to experience exclusion on racialised grounds (Sassen, 2002). From the perspective of the State these are imposed by bureaucracy and government technologies of categorisation that reinforce the distinctions between ´Irish´ and ´Black Irish' (King-O'Riain, 2007). These distinctions are also reproduced in daily life in what Michael Billig calls ´banal nationalism´ (2017) to help construct an imagined Irish community (Anderson, 1983) with invented histories, traditions, ceremonies, and cultural imaginings that demarcate who belongs and who does not.

Ultimately, the 'ideal citizen' is reserved for indigenous Irish (Irish Travellers a notable exception) and those deemed 'good diversity'. However, the existing notions of citizenship and national identity can change by the experience of immigration and "the resulting ethnic, racial, cultural and religious diversification of the population" (Koopmans et al., 2005: 6). In chapter five, I discuss this possibility and the importance of citizenship, naturalisation ceremonies, for respondents who describe the feeling of being welcomed into their new 'Irish family'. In the conclusion chapter I discuss Fanning's point on the Irish government's 'benign neglect' in which he argues for 'adaptive nation building' and the importance of citizenship to successful integration (Fanning, 2021: 125, 117). Fanning agrees that citizenship will not resolve everything but, nonetheless, is an important step and one in which the respondents of this research agree.

4. The 'Spatial Turn' and Laguerre's Framework

Stuart Hall´s concept of 'race' as a floating signifier explains how 'race' and racism change meaning and are dependent of the social conditions, through both time and space, in which they are spoken. As such, I incorporate Pierre Laguerre's spatial framework (1999) to map out how Nigerian taxi drivers are regulated and positioned into various 'minority spaces' within the Irish hegemon. I begin this section with a discussion on the relevant literature on space and the 'spatial turn' (De Certeau, 1984a; Lefebvre, 1991; Soja, 1989). However, the Dublin taxi industry is largely occupied by Irish drivers from working class backgrounds and I explain why a deeper class analysis was not undertaken. I then outline my use of Laguerre's framework, through the lens of 'race', to explain how it relates to the specific themes and questions explored in this dissertation.

The 'Spatial Turn'

In the late 1960s, there was a ´spatial turn´ in a movement Edward Soja calls ´postmodern critical human geography´ (Soja, 1989: 15). Soja says it was an attempt to break out of the historical arguments that dominated critical thought and attempt to "deconstruct and recompose the rigidly historical narrative… to make room for the insights of an interpretive human geography, a spatial hermeneutic" (Soja, 1989: 1). Soja argues that space theory promotes a flexible and balanced critical theory that "re-entwines the making of history with the social production of space, with the construction and configuration of human geographies" (Soja, 1989: 12).

Spatial theory does not deny the importance of historicism as a mode of insight but, rather, identifies the subordination of space to time that obscures geographical interpretations of the changeability of the social worlds (Soja, 1989: 15). Soja argues that space tends to be treated as fixed and dead whereas time is richness, life, dialectic, and the revealing context for critical social theorisation (Soja, 1989: 15). He says that historicism is an overdeveloped contextualisation of social life that actively submerges the spatial imagination (Soja, 1989: 15). Space theory therefore offers new possibilities for a transformative re-theorisation of the relations between history, geography, and modernity (Soja, 1989: 12).

Henri Lefebvre is a central figure in space theory and his book *The Production of Space* (1974) presented space as hierarchical and a framework of power (Lefebvre, 1991). He says the social relations of production have a social existence only insofar as they exist spatially; "they project themselves into a space, they inscribe themselves in a space while producing it" (cited in Soja, 1989: 127). Lefebvre conceptualises space through a ´triple dialectic´ of space, time, and social being to provide a simultaneously historical and geographical materialism (Gottdiener, 1993: 131). He applies this triple distinction to the analysis of different environments and focuses on how various societies have particularised space in both form and meaning over time. He accomplishes this by considering the distinction between ´abstract space´ and ´social space´. Abstract space is hierarchical space constituted by the intersection of knowledge and power and is pursued by those who wish to control social organisation such as political rulers, economic interests, and planners. Social space arises from practice – the everyday lived experience that is externalised and materialised through action by all members of society. Mark Gottdiener says those operating from abstract space continually try to control the social space of everyday life, with its constant changes, whereas social space always transcends conceived boundaries and regulated forms (Gottdiener, 1993: 131).

This distinction between abstract and social space illuminates how power functions to position Nigerian taxi drivers into racialised minority spaces while also pointing to the potential for them to transform those spaces. On this, Michel de Certeau (1984) offers a helpful description of ´space´ as a 'practiced place'. He provides the example that the street, as geometrically defined by urban planning, is transformed into a space by walkers in the same way an act of reading is "the space produced by the practice of a particular place: a written text" (De Certeau, 1984: 117). Harvey Molotch also argues that humans *produce* the space, and is shaped by the "interests of classes, experts, the

88

grassroots, and other contending forces" (Molotch, 1993: 887). Space is not simply inherited from nature but is produced and reproduced through human intentions and is therefore a useful framework to map out stratification (Molotch, 1993: 887). Spatial theorists therefore see space as fluid, with simultaneous events occurring in the geographical point that work alongside historical accounts to give it meaning.

The Intersection of Class

Given the working-class nature of the industry I considered class, and the corresponding levels of education commonly attached, as potentially influencing the nature of the discrimination Nigerian taxi drivers experience. Intersectionality is widely accepted as providing a deeper understanding of social stratification in which issues such as gender, race, and class, are interconnected (Crenshaw, 2000). An early argument for the intersection of class in antiracism work was made in 1992 by Gupta and Fergusson who said that we need to account sociologically for "the fact that the 'distance' between the rich in Bombay and the rich in London may be much shorter than between different classes in the same city" (Gupta and Ferguson, 1992: 20).

More recently the importance of the intersection of class to 'race' emerged in the controversy surrounding Black celebrity activists who crossed a picket line at an Oscar's afterparty (Dabiri, 2022). Emma Dabiri said that this was a clear example that representational antiracism, that is ahistoric and devoid of class analysis, does not have the tools to adequately deal with racism (Ibid). She argued that antiracism must separate itself from "a liberal, bourgeois consciousness … packed with capitalist ambitions" and, instead, embrace a more "radical proletarian consciousness" if an antiracist world is to be achieved (Ibid). The literature in Ireland has found that Nigerian taxi drivers often explain the racism they experience through class and levels of education. Maguire and Murphy, for example, identified a theme in which Black taxi drivers say the racism they experience indexes a very particular 'them' who are "archetypically drawing welfare benefits and are judged to be 'uneducated' (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 34).

The intersection of class is undoubtedly a determining factor in many racialised attitudes and behaviour. However, it is also important to point out the racisms in which class does not feature as prominently. The 'common-sense' opinion views that people in the lower socio-economic group are 'more racist' or 'less tolerant' than other socio-economic groups due to the competition with immigrants for jobs and State resources such as welfare, housing, and education. Such resource-competition arguments

suggest hostility intensifies in economic downturns. However, research in Ireland indicates that scapegoat theories do not always explain racialised attitudes and some studies found anti-immigration sentiment was highest during the economic boom (ESI, 2022; Eurobarometer, 2022; Haynes, Devereux, and Breen, 2009; Garner, 2004). Although several respondents in this research pointed to the parochial attitudes of the 'uneducated' and of those who have 'not travelled outside Ireland', it was not a significant theme. In my previous research I also found that class was not a significant factor as middle-class Irish taxi drivers and customers also reproduce racialised discourses (O'Keeffe, 2013). It was a racist comment from one such Irish taxi driver that propelled my interest in this research. His racial stereotyping of 'Black' taxi drivers questioned my own assumption that class and education are central factors determining racialised attitudes. Ultimately, there was little evidence that the class or educational levels of Irish taxi drivers and customers significantly influences the racism respondents experience.

In respect to the class of those interviewed in this research, most are representative of the wider Nigerian group in Ireland with particularly high levels of education. Many had arrived in Ireland with significant economic and cultural capital held in Nigerian. I therefore considered using Pierre Bourdieu's Social Capital Theory (1986) as a possible theoretical tool to explain how individuals negotiate their space within this 'field'. Social Capital Theory contends that social relationships are resources that can lead to the development and accumulation of human capital (Bourdieu, 1986). However, it became clear that Nigerian's class and education levels were not transferable into the Irish context. As outlined in the literature, the general advantages that class, education, and skill-sets provide in accessing the labour market are not equally distributed to Nigerian taxi drivers.

Furthermore, Irish taxi drivers from working-class backgrounds act against their class interests, and it is 'race' – protection from 'bogus' drivers – that form part of their campaigns for better working conditions. The findings show that Irish drivers have not, as of yet, sought solidarity and mobilised to seek better working conditions for all drivers in the industry. I therefore decided to incorporate Laguerre's framework under 'race' as more appropriate tool to explain how respondents are spatially regulated.

Space and 'Race'

More recent research has shown the value of space in understanding racial inequalities in urban space in the West (Joseph, 2008; Nelson and Dunn, 2017) and within Ireland

(Joyce, 2018; Stout, 2016; White, 2002, 2011). Nelson and Dunn, for example, examined anti-racism initiatives in Australia by drawing on the existing literature on space (Nelson and Dunn, 2017). They say the site-specific nature of racism warrants an 'everywhere but different' antiracism with formal localised responses based on the specific dynamics in a given place (Nelson and Dunn, 2017: 26). In Ireland, Sindy Joyce's ethnographic study on young Travellers in Galway identified the racialised boundaries that restricted their 'right to the city' (Joyce, 2018). Joyce argued that the State produces space as exclusionary for Travellers and these boundaries are socially constructed, policed, and governed by majority culture (Joyce, 2018: 12).

The conceptualisation of space vis-à-vis 'race' therefore provides a fuller account of the lived experiences of Nigerian taxi drivers and informs each of the findings' chapters. Spatial theory helps to map out the 'strategies' (De Certeau, 1984a) that are deployed by those in majority space to limit Nigerian taxi drivers' 'right to the city' (Lefebvre, 1991) and the 'tactics' (De Certeau, 1984a) deployed by Nigerians to manage the various spatial sites across the city (Laguerre, 1999). However, like all constructions, 'space' is mutable and I also examine its emancipatory potential for Nigerian taxi drivers to change how space is conceived and experienced. This helps to identify Nigerian taxi drivers' agency by highlighting the 'tactics' they use to manage racialised spatial practice.

Laguerre's Spatial Framework

I incorporate Laguerre's spatial framework to outline the various sites of minoritised space respondents experience related to the themes examined in this research. Laguerre says that to have ethnic minorities one must also have a minoritised space; a space which circumscribes their lives and reinforces minority status (Laguerre, 1999: 95). He argues that conceptualising the mechanisms that produce this minoritised space, the way it operates, and the technology of its reproduction, is necessary for the revaluation of minority status in Western societies:

> The social production of the minority as a social entity implies the social construction of a minoritised space that can be used as an infrastructure to sustain that reality. Just as there can be no colonisation without a colonised space, there can be no minority without a minoritised space. (Laguerre, 1999: 95)

Just as majority and minority subjects are positioned in a social hierarchy, so too is space. Nigerians respond to workplace racism by choosing ´paths of least resistance´ and therefore predominantly work in low paid industries (Joseph, 2016). This accounts

for Nigerians' presence in the taxi industry, but, as the findings chapters reveal, racism continues with various mechanisms deployed to regulate majority space and exclude Nigerian taxi drivers. Laguerre's framework helps identify these mechanisms by identifying the different spatial sites found throughout the industry. While the construction of the minoritised subject is made possible by the existence of minoritised space, "minoritised space is not univocal; it appears in different shapes that help incarcerate the minority subject in specific spatial positions" (Laguerre, 1999: 95-6). I therefore map out the relationships between the majority space and the minoritised space in its multiple shapes and forms (Laguerre, 1999: 96).

'Model Minority' and 'Relational' Spatial Sites

Laguerre identified 'model minority' and 'relational' spatial sites to help account for the minority status of racialised individuals who might otherwise be eligible for majority status (Laguerre, 1999: 96). Many of the Nigerians interviewed are highly skilled, well-educated, and have high cultural and social capital in their home country. However, in Ireland their ethnic and racial status means they have been unable to 'cash-in' and are forced to occupy minority space. The intersection of class is illustrated by Nigerian doctors who arrived into Ireland in previous decades and occupied higher status positions (Komolafe, 2002: 2008). While Nigerian doctors also experienced racism, their class, and the particularities of the labour market at that time, afforded them access to what Laguerre calls 'model minority' spaces.

Laguerre says these distinctions are important because the construction of these spaces is always relational (Laguerre, 1999: 106). He explains that the fundamental mechanism for creating minority space "lie in the structural relations between the mainstream and the nonmainstream groups: relations that link majority space, individuals, and ideology to their minority counterparts" (Laguerre, 1999: 106). He says that these ongoing relations between majority and minority may be said to take place in ´relational space´ which "belongs to everyday experience… [that] can either enhance or hinder the ability of the system to reproduce the majority-minority divide" (Laguerre, 1999: 106).

> The villain is the relations, the mechanism through which people become minoritised. They are related to a hegemonic system that in turn converts them into minorities occupying a minoritised space. (Laguerre, 1999: 106-7)

The *villain* is therefore the *relations* and is the mechanism through which Nigerian taxi drivers have become minoritised. However, as Laguerre explains, the distance that

characterises these relations "will be small when two communities get along well; this is the phenomenon of heterophilla" or the distance can be enormous, "as in the case of heterophobia, if the community's ties are hostile to one another" (Laguerre, 1999: 106-7). While the relational site of Nigerian doctors may not necessarily be described as heterophilla, their distance to majority space is closer than that of Nigerian taxi drivers, whose relation to the majority culture can be described as heterophobia. Komolafe identified this feature pointing out how former Nigerian migrants distance themselves spatially to more recent Nigerian immigrants by living in middle class neighbourhoods better 'suited' to their educational and occupational status (Komolafe, 2008). Furthermore, non-Nigerian Black taxi drivers also try to distance themselves from the identifiable Other – a common practice of those in model minority positions. Spatial theory therefore treats 'race' as a 'floating signifier' that is contingent on the social location, the *space*, in which it is spoken (Hall, 1997).

Although all taxi drivers have limited power, Irish taxi drivers are considered as occupying majority space within the industry and benefit from the privileges Irishness/Whiteness affords. Laguerre's framework helps map out the shifting nature of Nigerian identities in Ireland and the specificities of the discursive construction of Nigerian taxi driver identity. This conceptualisation of 'relational' and 'model minority' space illustrate the attributes required to enter model minority space changes over time and space. Throughout the findings chapters I outline the 'tactics' Nigerian taxi drivers employ to develop a more favourable relational space.

Laguerre's Spatial Framework to the Dublin Taxi Industry

Laguerre identifies three overarching components of minoritised space that align with Essed's concept of 'everyday racism'. First, it serves for the maintenance and the reproduction of minority identity and the asymmetrical relations between the two spaces (majority/minority) to maintain respondents position in minoritised space (Laguerre, 1999: 96). Second, minoritised space is constructed and patrolled by the dominant system. Third, it is produced to regulate the presence and location of minorities in the hierarchal system (Ibid). The application of this framework to the Dublin taxi industry offers a productive way to explain the disparities in social conditions between the majority and minority, and their reproduction through time. It also helps uncover the various forms of positionality that generate social distance and maintain and reproduce a racialised social hierarchy (Laguerre, 1999: 5). This conceptualisation of space helps illustrate how 'everyday racism' and a tacit

'minoritisation agreement' is spatially practiced. This framework therefore provides insight into how various spaces are regulated and the implications of this for Nigerian taxi drivers. I have identified three spatial sites most relevant to the themes that emerged. They come under three main headings – ideological site, structural site, and locational site.

The ideological site relates to the discursive formation of Nigerian taxi driver identity. This is the 'representational site', a subsection of the ideological site, and is a space in which respondents are excluded. Gottdiener says space is simultaneously a ´spatial practice´ (an externalized, material environment), a ´representation of space´ (a conceptual model used to direct practice), and a ´space of representation´ (the lived social relation of users to the environment) (Gottdiener, 1993: 131). The 'representation of space' and 'space of representation' are addressed in Laguerre's framework and are sites that are of central concern to respondents in this research.

These representational sites are the locations in which Nigerians' *experience* existing narratives as well the sites in which new narratives can emerge. I identify how Nigerian taxi drivers manage these representational spaces by examining how they experience the narratives and the 'tactics' they deploy to change them. I argue that Nigerian racism-denial, for example, is tied into this representation of space and their use of euphemisms, such as 'discrimination' or 'economic bullying', is an attempt to influence this space and challenge existing narratives such as the 'ungrateful foreigners that we feed'. As I discuss throughout the findings' chapters, representation is the central concern for respondents, and it is through this 'ideological site' that they primarily engage with racism. This understanding illustrates one of the ways participants are regulated and excluded from access to the Irish family. It also helps illustrate Nigerian attitude to work and individual agency by exploring the tactics they deploy, as they challenge this representation site, and create more favourable working conditions.

Furthermore, theorising 'race' and its relationship with power under the concepts of everyday racism, hegemony and governmentality point to the mutability of representational politics. Laguerre also views the spaces of representation as the sites in which power is contested and agency can be achieved. However, according to his framework, even if Nigerian compatibility to Irish norms were to be incorporated into the narrative the best they can hope for in the current political and social climate is access to model minority space.

The second two sites in which spatial practice is explored are 'structural' and 'locational' sites. The structural site relates to theme of 'Regulation and the State' and the effects of governmental-led policies on Nigerian lived experience of space. The locational site identifies the geographical spaces Nigerians occupy while working and illustrates the material effects of racism. These two sites need to be understood as imbricated to reveal how minority space is managed within the hegemony. Whereas the representational sites are the discursive distinctions made between Nigerian/Black taxi drivers and 'Irish' taxi drivers, these sites focus on spatial practice and the societal praxis of race. These sites therefore facilitate an analysis focused on the intersection of spatial factors and the regulation of these spaces. In chapter five I illustrate how this impacts the geographical spaces respondents occupy with a with higher likelihood of discrimination in the suburbs resulting in a higher concentration in the city centre and in Dublin airport. I also discuss Dublin Airport as an example of 'neoliberal antiracism' (Nelson and Dunn, 2017: 27) in which regulation of this space, tailored to the specifics of the location, proved to be effective at alleviating racialised tensions in that space.

5. Conclusion: Accessing 'Subjugated Knowledge'

In this chapter I have argued the salience of 'race' to Nigerian taxi drivers lived experience. I argued that Essed's 'everyday racism' is best suited to explain the systemic nature of the racism they experience that circulates between institutions, structures, and individuals. I illustrated how 'race' and racism is talked about and practiced in the Dublin taxi industry. I have also argued that Nigerian lived experience of racism is inflected with neoliberal rationalities and subjectivities and explains how Nigerian taxi drivers are regulated and the 'tactics' they deploy in response.

I have argued the usefulness of spatiality as a means of understanding this. The ethnic Other occupy a minoritised space in opposition to the majority space and the control of this space by the dominant sector of society is part of the subtle, but unending, project of the hegemonic mainstream (Laguerre, 1999: 95). The social production of the minority implies the social construction of a minoritised space that can be used as an infrastructure to sustain the hegemonic ´reality´ (Laguerre, 1999: 95). Throughout the findings chapters I analyse the representational sites that maintain this reality through discourses of 'security' and 'incompatibility'. I also argue that 'The Fact of Blackness' is the main signifier in a tacit 'minoritisation agreement' that manages majority space for the those deemed part of the 'Irish family'.

Throughout the findings chapters I illustrate the power of anti-Nigerian narratives to survive, despite evidence to the contrary, to remain fixed and immutable in opposition to Eurocentric values. However, I argue that changes to the Irish constitution, mentioned earlier, are tangible signifiers of the processual nature of hegemonic power and the ability for certain social groups to affect progressive change. Furthermore, my analysis here is based on how 'race' and racism was talked about and practiced in the years directly preceding when the interviews took place. In the conclusion chapter I discuss the advances that have been made in the intervening years whereby Black Africans appear to have reached a critical mass and the State is taking the power of their consent more seriously.

Finally, the aim of this research is to seek the 'subjugated knowledge' (Foucault, 1980: 81) found in lived experiences to provide a deeper understanding of how 'race' and racism is talked of and practiced in the Dublin taxi industry. Foucault says subjugated knowledges are the blocs of historical knowledge that are present but disguised within the body of functionalist and systemising theory (Foucault, 1980: 82). These take the form of ´historical contents´, the multiplicities of history from below, whose existence has been denied and hidden (Foucault, 1980: 81-82). It also takes the form in the stratification of contemporary knowledges that are eschewed, presented as ´inadequate´ or poorly defined and baseless (Foucault, 1980: 82). Foucault argues that an 'insurrection of subjugated knowledge' can be gained through the revelation of these historical contents to make alternative 'contemporary knowledges' adequate and more clearly defined (Ibid).

The aim, therefore, is to understand how this relates to racism in Ireland and its connection to wider global regimes of racialised 'truths'. Ultimately, I seek to uncover the ways in which local (Irish) and global racialised 'regimes of truth' (Foucault, 1980b) regulate Nigerian taxi drivers to exclude them from 'majority space' (Laguerre, 1999) and restrict their 'right to the city' (Lefebvre, 1991). Furthermore, the dissertation positions Nigerians as agential beings and I explore the 'tactics' (De Certeau, 1984a) they employ to manage hostility and the racialised spaces they encounter.

I also try to make sense of the often-contradictory viewpoints Nigerian taxi drivers hold and the various ways they manage the racialised tensions in a ´post-racial´ neoliberal taxi industry. However, to do this requires that I examine the positionality of both my own and Nigerian taxi drivers unique social locations. As Duarte outlines, 'positionality' is a methodology that requires researchers to identify their own degrees of privilege, through factors such as race, class, and citizenship, for the purpose of analysing and

acting from one's social position "in an unjust world" (Duarte, 2017: 135). Keeping this in mind, I outline the methodological tools employed that I argue is best suited to uncover these subjugated knowledges.

Chapter Four: Methodology Chapter

Introduction

The objective of this chapter is to explain the methodology I used in this research and to outline the rationalities for the decisions taken. The aim is to create new empirical and theoretical understandings of how participants experience and respond to working in a hostile and competitive environment. The data collection methods and analysis are designed to address the central themes and to answer the research questions of this dissertation. I chose to work within a qualitative paradigm to access the subjugated knowledge of Nigerians everyday life experiences and how they make meaning of them. While this research is exploratory it nonetheless requires a strong plan from the outset on the most appropriate methodological approach (Law and Urry, 2004: 401).

The qualitative tradition was initially characterised by its opposition to the strict research designs demanded in most quantitative work (Silverman, 2010: 84). David Silverman says the idea of qualitative research, such as ethnography, was to grasp the 'reality' by just 'hanging out' and that "somehow meaning would 'emerge' by itself from 'in-depth' exposure to the field" (Ibid). Entering the field with prior conceptualisations were thus considered a hinderance to the aim of acquiring a "sensitive understanding of the slice of the cultural world to which one was being exposed" (Silverman, 2010: 84). Most qualitative research, therefore, works inductively and generates and tests hypothesis during the data analysis process (Alasuutari, 1995: 183).

However, as Michael Patton points out, before accessing the subjective meaning of issues for participants, one first needs to recognise the 'lived reality' in how they are viewed by wider society (Patton, 2002: 39). Dianne Watt says people's behaviour becomes meaningful and understandable when placed into the context of their lives and the lives of those around them (Watt, 2007: 91). On this, Heppner et al. say researchers need to study behaviour in context and suggest that it is "the interpretation of the context that is the essential process to be studied" (Heppner, Kivlighan, and Wampold, 1999: 246). This helps provide access to the depth of the 'true' human experience by studying the 'how' and the 'why' participants construct meanings and actions in specific situations (Charmaz, 2006: 130). As such, I foreground my existing understanding of the 'preferred narrative' of those being studied. My previous research and experiences 'in the field' as a taxi driver established the

'context' and the significance of 'race' to this research before the interviews took place. Although the best position for 'grand theoretical models' are usually in the final pages (Alasuutari, 1995: 183) I presented an initial 'theoretical model' to illustrate the salience of 'race' to participants' lives and how the 'preferred narrative' is used to justify exclusionary practices.

However, 'fixity of purpose calls for flexibility of method' and I allowed for an emergent methodological design in which flexibility is embedded (O'Leary, 2010: 101). This flexibility is required to mitigate against the tendency to 'fit in' my preconceived notions to the subsequent data. The focus of this research is the 'lived reality' for respondents, and to gain 'meaningful understanding' I use both deductive and inductive processes (O'Leary, 2010: 265). In this chapter I outline the research design and methodological tools used in this dissertation.

The nature of interethnic research has obvious ethical concerns and requires a carefully considered methodology to mitigate majority culture bias, and to avoid the pitfalls of 'knowledge extension' (Freire, 1974). I therefore begin with a discussion of the challenges of researching 'race', interethnic interviewing, and other issues raised throughout this research. In the second section I outline my conceptualisation of 'lived experience' through the concept of the 'local' (Hannerz, 1996) that produce 'habitats of meaning' for Nigerian taxi drivers. I also provide a discussion on 'the art of listening' (Back, 2007) to ensure close and reflexive attention is paid to the voices of participants. In the third section, I outline the research design. I begin by discussing the sampling methods used and the challenges of obtaining research participants. I outline the demographics of those interviewed that were obtained through snowball and targeted sampling. The data collection is sourced primarily from in-depth interviews with some ethnographic elements. These include participant observation and a logbook maintained during my time as a taxi driver for ten years. In the fourth section I outline my mixed methodological approach to analyse the data. Here I explain my use of narrative inquiry as an empowering means for respondents to articulate their own viewpoints and disrupt the distinctions of 'race'. I discuss my use of grounded theory in the mapping of salient themes within a flexible and contingent theoretical framework. I also incorporate Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) to provide insight into how exclusionary conceptualisations of Irishness are maintained, respondents' level of awareness of this, and the tactics they employ in response. In the fourth section, I discuss ethical research practices and the limitations of the research. Here, I outline my standpoint epistemology and positionality in majority space and the concerns this

poses for interethnic research. I conclude the chapter with a discussion on the potential for social change in qualitative research that centres the voice of those whose lives are being investigated.

1. Researching Across 'Race': A Discursive Practice

In chapter one I outlined the 'treacherous bind' in which the reliance upon and use of racial and ethnic categories risks reproducing 'race' (Radhakrishnan, 1996). I therefore incorporate a 'doubled' research practice that works both with and against racialised categories (Gunaratnam, 2003: 23). I maintain a social constructionist perspective to understand 'race' and ethnicity as socially and ideologically produced, heterogeneous and dynamic processes of being and becoming. Nonetheless, the strategic essentialism in this approach means I must navigate the 'slippery elisions' in new racisms of the cultural turn in which euphemisms such as 'ethnicity' and 'culture' disguise overt reference to biology. As discussed, these elisions are present in anti-Nigerian discourse in which racism is framed as a response to an uncivilised Nigerian culture. The aim, therefore, is to challenge, transform, and deconstruct these categories rather than reproduce racial thinking in a reductionist manner (Gunaratnam, 2003: 23).

The problems of researching 'across race' are compounded by the social distance imposed by the existing 'race' relations in society (Anderson, 1993: 41). The question this raises is how can I, a White doctoral student, understand 'race' relations experienced by racial minorities? Specifically, how can I study those who have been historically subordinated without further producing sociological accounts distorted by the political economy of 'race'? (Anderson, 1993: 41). A common strategy is to match the ethnicity of the interviewer and research participant. Matching practices, however, are based upon ideas of racial identities as primary, pure, non-cultural, and unaffected by difference of gender, class, disability or sexuality (Gunaratnam, 2003: 8). On this point, several Nigerian participants expressed a closer affinity to me than with other Nigerian taxi drivers that they deemed 'uneducated' or 'backward' in contrast to the perceived cultural capital we shared.

Philippa Levine says research should view racism as a discursive practice to work against the 'epistemology of political control' in current understandings of 'race' and ethnicity (Levine, 2000: 17). The first idea underpinning this argument is to see 'race' as reproduced by changing, complicated, and uneven interactions between social processes and individual experience (Gunaratnam, 2003: 7-8). The second is to

recognise colonialism and the 'idea of Europe' as the founding moment of racial categorisation and of "classifying and reducing ways of being visible, embodied and hierarchically ordered forms of difference" (Ibid). As such, Gunaratnam says we must move away from methodological practices, such as 'ethnic matching', that "simplify and codify the complexity and contingency of difference into unambiguous, predictable and apparently manageable processes" (Gunaratnam, 2003: 81). Interethnic research therefore helps to de-stabilise the dominant discourses of racial difference. However, I must also recognise that research itself as a discursive practice and part of the social construction of the meanings and effects of 'race' and ethnicity (Ibid).

2. Social Inquiry, Lived Experience, and the Art of Listening

Qualitative research has been described as a cocktail of methodologies in which personal engagement with the subject is the key to understanding a particular culture or social setting (Ejimabo, 2015: 364). Ilja Maso describes ethnography as a study of a culture's relational practices, common values and beliefs, and shared experiences for the purpose of "helping insiders (cultural members) and outsiders (cultural strangers) better understand the culture" (Maso, 2001: 138). Description resides at the core of social inquiry and it is the intense meaning of social life from the everyday perspective that is sought (Ejimabo, 2015: 359).

These styles of research, however, have become denigrated in recent decades as 'overly textual' and are often devalued in favour of 'verifiable' quantitative data (Butler and Solomon, 2004: 10). The criticism points to 'intrusive empiricism' in which the descriptions are so thick on detail that they occlude and hide what's at stake (Back, 2007: 16). However, quantitative styles of enquiry, which takes data from large samples, can result in 'abstracted empiricism' and often result in thin insight both philosophically and socially (Back, 2007: 16).

In this dissertation I use thick description by providing low-inference descriptions of Nigerian taxi drivers experiences. This is designed to help the reader 'step into' the research by using respondents actual language, dialect, and personal meanings (Johnson and Christnesen, 2012: 267). However, to make meaning out of lived experience the empirical needs to be theorised. The descriptions respondents give are therefore contextualised against existing literature on labour market outcomes and the current narratives that construct their identity. It is designed to get a balance

between 'intrusive' and 'abstracted' empiricism to understand how respondents make meaning of the social world they live in. The findings are therefore co-constructed and are informed by their descriptions and my theorisation of these descriptions.

Lived Experience

The challenge for researchers is to unpack the ways in which large scale events and processes are folded into ongoing relationships and into people's experiences of the world. Back says sociological inquiry is not simply a matter of quarrying into people's individual secrets but about "connecting those biographies with a wider history of social, political and economic relations, to make 'private troubles' connect with shared public issues and global concerns" (Back, 2007: 15). To connect those 'private troubles' to the wider issues, I employ the concept of 'the local' (Hannerz, 1996) to illustrate the complexities of lived experience and how these subjectivities reveal themselves through time and space. 'Locality' is where government-level processes and lived experiences connect and is the central frame through which they come together (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 5). The concept of 'the local' denotes "the connections between families and friends, collegial and business relations, ethnic and other identities that produce and reproduce 'habitats of meaning'" (Hannerz, 1996: 22-5). 'Habitats of meaning' encompass the ways in which people "make use of their cultural competencies, knowledge, cognitive and interpretive abilities in order to meaningfully interact with physical and behavioural environments" (Hannerz, 1996: 22). I therefore take locality as a starting point from which to develop two interconnecting threads.

The first thread follows what Veena Das terms 'the descent into the ordinary', whereby people learn about their worlds primarily through their experiences of life and words (Das, 2007: 4). Das says perspectives are important as people do not live in worlds that are structured as a coherent whole, but, rather, "their perspectives are levelled upon available horizons" (Das, 2007: 4). She describes experience as limited, forever being remade, and the voices that emerge in qualitative research come from what she calls 'frayed everyday life' (Das, 2007: 9). Das takes 'voices' to denote more than mere utterances and her concern is with that which animates words and gives them life. Occasionally, those voices may be heard on larger stages but "more often than not we just hear words, disembodied and removed from their contexts – words without the shared experiences that would allow for meaningful conversations across cultural lines" (Das, 2007: 4).

The second thread is concerned with the ramifications of government policies on how Irish localities are understood and lived in as diverse places. The subjectivity and specificity of Nigerian taxi drivers' lived experience therefore need to be understood in their socio-cultural and geographic context. Making sense of the 'ordinary' by looking at the 'locality' of Nigerian taxi drivers allows me to highlight the specificity of their unique social locations as diverse places, experienced and interpreted differently. 'Locality' is therefore the site in which we "perceive new ways of examining governmental and societal discourses on 'race', nationality or belonging, because in everyday life they acquire much of their sociocultural content" (Murphy and Maguire, 2012: 5).

The two strands, the descent into the ordinary (the everyday) and connecting it to the wider (the local and global), are a means to theorise the 'frayed voices' and give them meaning by contextualising them against the social location in which they are spoken. The two strands are therefore imbricated and help explain respondents lived reality and the 'tactics' they use in response.

This approach, alongside the spatial framework, adds to the literature on urban ethnography. Existing research reveals that spatial encounters are acted out through the interrelations between people and their environment (Colombijn and Erdentugm, 2002; Joseph, 2008; Lefebvre, 1991; Joyce, 2018). Sindy Joyce says urban spaces operate with a particular purpose and audience that conforms to the myth of the 'ideal city' (Joyce, 2018: 51). She says 'urban utopias' claim to have an emphasis on equality, social justice and freedoms (Joyce, 2018: 51). However, she says the experience of everyday life in urban space depends on the divisions that are created that can obstruct social justice (Ibid). My qualitative research design therefore provides me with the framework to analyse the sociospatial practices of Nigerian taxi drivers across the city and how various urban divisions are created, managed, and maintained.

Art of Listening

In the *Art of Listening* (2007), Back argues that sociology requires listening to what goes on behind the public façade, attending to the ways that people achieve a 'bit of humanness in a world become inhuman' (Back, 2007: 166-7). This does not mean an unquestioning agreement, rather, it means "being a partisan to the human story in all its manifold diversity" (Ibid). Eric Fromm also argues the need to maintain a critical orientation to the story:

> Critical thinking is a quality, it's a faculty, it is an approach to the world, to everything… it stands in the service of life, in the service of removing obstacles to life individually and socially which paralyse us. (Fromm, 1994: 169)

While this research places the voices of Nigerian taxi drivers at the centre, my responsibility as a researcher is to critically theorise their voice against the social location in which it is spoken. Theoretical analysis is therefore needed to avoid ethnographic voyeurism and, instead, develop knowledge that provides a richer understanding of respondents lived experience.

Nigerian taxi drivers in Dublin are unique in that they are a highly visible 'stranger' and in regular and close contact with the majority population. This visibility, however, is a distorted visibility and requires a rethinking of the position of 'the stranger' (Simmel, 1950) that is constituted as a synthesis of nearness and remoteness (Back, 2007: 23). I therefore add to the literature on Nigerian '(in)visibility' to make sense of the 'frayed voices' that emerge with a focus on the Nigerian point of view. Franz Fanon´s concept of 'visibility' is used to analyse the tension between respondents´ practices of self-determination and the hegemonic regimes of representation that attempt to contain them (Fanon, 1967). Equally, Fanon's work is helpful in terms of understanding Nigerian taxi drivers' practices of self-determination which are often in line with existing hegemonic discourses. My task, therefore, is to connect the two 'locals', in Hannerz' terms, in which the individual biographies of respondents are contextualised against the larger social and historical forces.

Speaking 'on behalf' of the participants indicates my responsibility to pay genuine attention to the stories and narratives that emerge and to problematise my writing as another White voice speaking about racism. However, I also need to pay attention to both the insights and blindness in respondents accounts. While I must respect respondents' refusal to be identified as victims, equally, I should carefully consider their responses to victimisation that were at times ambiguous and contradictory. When writing about stigmatised social groups there is also the temptation to omit anything deemed negative and to construct glowing narratives in opposition to the dominant negative discourses. The danger in creating 'heroic portrayals' is that it denies the full complexity of Nigerian taxi drivers humanity that I wish to defend (Back, 2007: 158). Sociology, therefore, needs to open up the false comforts achieved in absolute moral categories. Some interviewees describe approaches that align with the negative stereotypes such as 'exploiting' former *jus soli* citizenship loopholes or 'aggressive' working practices. Rather than skip over inconvenient truths, I document

them to provide a fuller picture of the complexity of Nigerian taxi drivers. This approach develops a deeper understanding of participants motivations and working practices, as well as to expose the separate set of standards expected of those from whom they are judged.

While this research will always be an 'act of betrayal' to some degree, the main concern is imposing my own biased counter-discourse (Back, 2007: 151). The methodologies employed in this dissertation are designed to address these concerns and I maintain a reflexive approach throughout. The aim is to challenge Nigerians' distorted 'visibility', that present a crude and limited picture of their lives, and allow newer, more representative, narratives to emerge. However, I also recognise that participants view of the world combines both insight and blindness and I therefore balance my own 'expertise' with the 'expertise' and social know-how of those I interviewed.

3. Research Design: Data Collection and Sampling

Introduction

Research design refers to how you plan, structure, and realise your research as well as all the decisions you make throughout the study (MacMillan and Schumacher, 2001: 166). The design aims to answer the research questions and includes electing subjects, research sites, data collection procedures, and data analysis (Blanche and Durrheim, 2004; De Vos, 1998). The data collection methods for this research relied predominantly on 28 in-depth interviews with some ethnographic elements. In the previous chapter I provided an example of how rumours function to keep the stereotypes alive and sustain a narrative of Nigerian taxi drivers in opposition to Irishness. I therefore came to this research with a pre-existing framework that identified the salience of 'race' to this narrative. However, it is important that I remain flexible with a willingness to acknowledge the unexpected arising from the data and to be able to generate alternative explanations inductively (O'Leary, 2010: 262). This flexibility was also required for the mapping of other themes that emerged from the interviews discussed later in the data analysis section. Most of the theory therefore emerged through an inductive, ground-up processes. However, as those theories begin to emerge from the data I also moved to a process of deductive confirmation (O'Leary, 2010: 262).

In this section I begin by explaining the reasons for the methods chosen. Here I explain why I chose in-depth interviews, participant observation, and 'walking the city'. I discuss some of the theoretical issues, such as the 'race of interviewer effect', and outline the strengths and weaknesses of the data collection methods to provide insight into lived experience. I then outline my sampling methods and the issues I encountered related to access that led to my choice of snowball and target sampling strategies. Finally, I outline the interview and participant observation process designed to mitigate against the theoretical issues and to provide the richest data possible.

Data Collection

In-depth Interviews

Interviews are the main technique used in qualitative research and give more rapid results than participant observation (Silverman, 2010: 306). The main benefit of in-depth interviews is that they allow access to real people to find out first-hand how they genuinely feel and provide for detailed data analysis (O'Leary, 2010: 196). They also allow you to develop rapport and trust and provide rich qualitative data that allows for interpretation of verbal and non-verbal cues (Ibid). Interviews are also flexible enough to allow you to explore tangents and are structured enough to generate standardised, quantifiable data (O'Leary, 2010: 196).

However, like any other data collection method, its opportunities are balanced by a series of challenges. Many of the pros are the result of the human element in interviewing that also present concerns that need to be addressed. These include misunderstandings and misinterpretation, as well as the potential urge to 'lead' respondents (Ibid). There is also the risk of 'making good impressions', particularly when access is difficult, to try to keep the doors open for snowballing or return interviews (Ibid). It was important that I stay true to my role and, rather than get 'swept up' in the interview, I kept focus on my primary objective to source credible data and produce academically robust interpretive work (O'Leary, 2010: 205). The main concerns I identified and kept in mind during the interview process were to facilitate honest and open responses, suspending all judgement, and figuring out how attributes such as race, gender, ethnicity, class, and age might affect the interview process (O'Leary, 2010: 197).

Interracial interviewing is often assumed to be characterised by distance and estrangement which the interviewer needs to overcome (Gunaratnam, 2003: 81). Traditionally, discussions have also been based upon assumptions that the research

106

encounter is pre-judged (see Fine, 1994: 80) in which participants are known as the 'already-recognised 'stranger' (Gunaratnam, 2003: 80). Some researchers try to fix the mess with methodological strategies, such as matching, or provide an analysis that erase the complexities of difference and power relations in the interview (Gunaratnam, 2003: 104). Gunaratnam argues that there is much to be achieved by distrusting any neatness, and actively searching out and valuing the complexity and richness that comes with the mess (Ibid). As such, I aimed to destabilise the lack of clear distinctions of 'race' and ethnicity and interrogate the points of commonality from the dislocations and differences that they carry (Gunaratnam, 2003: 104). The distance of difference can be closed by such practices that bring the researcher closer to the research participant and can render the difference knowable (Gunaratnam, 2003: 80).

Another issue with interviews is that there may be multiple meanings of a situation represented in what participants say to me in an interview compared to what they say to each other or, indeed, customers in their taxi. It is therefore not appropriate to think that respondents attach a single meaning to their experience (Silverman, 2010: 48). This raises the important issue of whether interview responses are to be treated as giving direct access to 'experience' or as actively constructed 'narratives' involving activities which themselves demand analysis (Silverman, 2010: 48). Later I discuss the interview process and the strategies I used to mitigate this and other issues I faced.

Participant Observation and Walking the City

In ethnographic studies participant observation is considered a valuable method of data collection in which the researcher gains access to a particular community and lives among the people under study (Bryman, 2006; Cook and Crang, 1995; Geertz, 1973; Goodall, 2001). Alan Bryman says it helps us to understand the world through the eyes of those being studied, contextualises the research by viewing it as part of the wider social processes in which it takes place, and allows for the emergence of new narratives (Bryman, 2006). This is designed to help to take on their world views and ways of life in which the researcher tries to make sense of this through writing up an account (Ibid). My participant observation was limited due to the difficulties I faced gaining trust. However, I was eventually invited to house parties, a Pentecostal church service, support group meetings, and other occasions. Participant observation therefore formed part to my data collection and allowed me to observe 'cultural happenings' of respondents.

De Certeau said that 'walking the city' is another valuable data collection method in social research (De Certeau. 1984). Shortell and Brown say that walking is a social activity that can be used as a method to study places and people (Shortell and Brown, 2016: 14). They point out that the advantages of this method lie in its ability to capture rich information including sights, sounds and odours: "the presence of the researcher in the space studied, and the interaction with people also allows for a critical reflection about that space" (Shortell and Brown, 2016: 89). Although the walking method is subjective, it is also coherent and systematic, and, as both Joyce (2018: 56-58) and Shortell and Brown (2016: 155) point out, it can be used to understand the complex social factors behind the patterns observed in other methods. The 'walking method', such as taxi rank observation, formed part of this study in capturing the cultural and social aspects of African taxi drivers in Dublin. This, alongside my experiences in the field as a taxi driver, in which I maintained a logbook, proved valuable in terms of validating or challenging my existing understandings and informed my analysis of Nigerian lived experience.

Sampling Methods

Why Dublin?

I chose Dublin because it is Ireland's largest city and offers a more varied experience of the types of discrimination Nigerians' experience than is the case in smaller cities and towns throughout Ireland. The figures, as of 2017, show that 50 percent of taxi licence holders in Ireland work in Dublin (Macarthaigh, 2019). Although racism exists throughout the industry as a whole it is marked by different experiences within different locations. The literature of racism in the taxi industry have mainly focused on the local dynamics in smaller towns/cities throughout Ireland (Jaichand 2010; Mcguire and Murphy, 2010, 2012, 2014). The most significant of these focused on Galway and Louth and show that racism takes on different forms depending on the specific spaces they occur (Jaichand, 2010; Murphy and Maguire, 2012, 2014). Although the processes of racialisation are the same, the forms of racism are marked by different experiences because the mechanics of the industry vary in places like Galway and Louth to that of Dublin. While some of the broader themes are similar, the dynamics specific to the Dublin industry are overlooked. Dublin is also the city in which I grew up and worked in as a taxi driver. I therefore have greater knowledge of both the culture of the city and the mechanics of the industry compared to other cities.

Vanessa Stout's research provided a cross comparison of Nigerian experiences of racism and access to city space in Dublin and Los Angeles (Stout, 2016). She quotes Musterd (2005) who argues that while "many immigration studies … emphasise similarities in their findings, there have been few efforts to look at differences in segregation patterns and population" (Stout, 2016: 2-3). I have therefore also interviewed three taxi drivers in Cork, Ireland´s second largest city, to look for similarities and differences in the lived experience of Nigerian taxi drivers operating there. This helps locate the various advantages and difficulties that affect Nigerian experience in each city and, unlike research that has a national perspective, identifies the defining factors that impede or help their access to city space.

Nigerian Heterogeneity

It is important to separate the African Diaspora based on ethnicity, culture and religion, because their experiences can be different (Stout, 2016). This is equally important for the Nigerian diaspora who come from an extremely diverse country with over 250 ethnic groups. For the purpose of this research, distinctions are made in relation to the ethnic/geographical locations of the Muslim North, Yoruba (mainly north-western and north-central), and Igbo/Biafra Southwest. These territories themselves hold heterogenous populations with diverse ethnic groups. Similarly, the Igbo and Yoruba ethnic groups are not solely contained within these territories and have origins in other African countries.

There is no quantitative data on the ethnic origins of Nigerians residing in Ireland or driving a taxi in Dublin. However, this and other research suggest that Yoruba and Igbo are the two main ethnic groups in Ireland. This was also borne out by ´door-stepping´ at ranks with the clear majority of Nigerian drivers identifying themselves as Yoruba or Igbo. Of those interviewed here, 12 were Yoruba, 11 Igbo and 5 from other areas in Nigeria. The sample, therefore, represents these two main Nigerian ethnic groups. Those who I talked to at ranks who identified as neither declined my request for an interview – although many provided worthwhile information about their experiences that I transcribed from memory. Of those I approached at taxi ranks, there were significant differences of opinions, approaches, and attitudes to racism and integration.

Many of participants interviewed are well-educated and had significant cultural and social capital in Nigeria. Education levels ranged from those who are highly-educated, those who are education to western standards but without third level degrees, and a

smaller group who have little formal education. Those who were more forthcoming to engage with me, or agreed to be interviewed, generally originated from Western Nigeria and were more likely to have higher levels of education. Those who were more resistant said they were from other regions of Nigeria where there is less opportunity for high levels of educational attainment. As all respondents were initially hesitant to be interviewed, it is difficult to deduce any significance in the refusal at taxi ranks by Northern Nigerians to be interviewed. However, it does suggest that those educated and socialised to Western standards believe this cultural capital provides agency vis-à-vis the host culture. Therefore, I argue this research provides insight into those absent despite the data set is not being conclusive.

These intra-ethnic tensions between the 'educated' and 'uneducated' Nigerians also emerged throughout the interviews. Some stressed that the ethnic/regional differences in Nigeria signify levels of education and Western/non-Western attributes. Ethnic distinctions were also made between Yoruba and Igbo respondents. Most Yoruba participants identified as Nigerian whereas Igbo participants were more likely to identify as Biafran as a result of the Biafran War (1967-1970). Nonetheless, all participants were chosen based on their Nigerian nationality and working as a taxi driver in Dublin (with the exception of three who work in Cork). All 28 respondents interviewed were male, aged between 30 and 62, and, despite the small sample size, provide an illustration of Nigerian taxi driver heterogeneity. All are first-generation immigrants, 24 are parents, and, although it was not always overtly expressed, 19 indicated that their religious faith influenced how they interpret and function in society. Although some were willing to forego anonymity, pseudonyms have been used for all participants.

Despite the lack of clear quantitative data, I deduced from the interviews that roughly twenty-five percent of respondents' pathways into Ireland were through forced migration, with some having experienced Direct Provision. For this group, class did not fully determine this pathway and one highly-educated respondent sought asylum because of threats to his life due to his political affiliations. There are also Muslim Nigerian drivers working in Dublin but I was unable to secure an interview with anyone from this demographic. One respondent encouraged his Muslim friend to take part in this research, but this attempt proved unsuccessful. A few respondents were disparaging towards ´Northern Nigerans´ (the area of Hausa and Fulani with a majority Muslim population) that some narrated as ´uneducated´ and the problem population 'that gives the rest of us a bad name'. However, within Yoruba ethnicity there is a

significant Muslim population who are culturally distinct from the Hausa Muslim population and hold similar Westernised attitudes to the general Yoruba population. While there are no figures on the Muslims population from the Hausa North working as taxi-drivers in Dublin, I gleaned from the interviews that they represent a small percentage. The main conclusion I draw is that Nigerian Muslim taxi drivers do not have a radically different experience of racism, vis-à-vis majority culture, but may experience isolation within the Nigerian 'community'.

There is also small percentage of female Nigerian taxi drivers working in Dublin. I was aware of two Nigerian women taxi drivers', one of whom I spoke to directly, but I was unable to secure interviews with either. However, the intersection of gender is significant and, as pointed out to me be Ebun Joseph, many Nigerian men hold strong patriarchal attitudes that may partly account for their presence in the industry. In private conversation Joseph suggested some may have had difficulty working in industries where they occupy subordinate roles to female colleagues. Furthermore, existing research shows that men are five times more likely to racially discriminate in the workplace as women (Michael, 2019: 18). Although the Dublin taxi industry is dominated by men there are about 400 women working as taxi drivers in Dublin (Healy, 2008). However, this research could not determine if respondents' experiences vis-à-vis men drivers varied significantly vis-à-vis women drivers.

In 2008 a taxi company, *Angel Cabs,* was established to provide an all-female driver service that was marketed at women customers who want to feel safer taking a taxi (Healy, 2008; Foley, 2008). The owner of the company said that his research found that one in four women would prefer a female driver and, similarly, female taxi drivers feel safer and more comfortable with female passengers (Healy, 2008). However, I was unable to determine how many Nigerian drivers, if any, work in the company or interview them on their experiences with women taxi colleagues. The intersection of gender, as I suggest in the conclusion chapter, is a worthwhile theme to explore in future research.

Snowball and Targeting Sampling

The sample came from a combination of snowball sampling and target sampling. Initially, I wanted to use stratified sampling to get an equal representation of the subgroups defined by geographical origins in Nigeria, class, network, education, and access route into Ireland. However, as members of certain subgroups were difficult to

access, I also relied on snowball sampling whereby the trust gained from respondents from the targeted group provided leads from within their social networks.

The first respondent I interviewed for this research presented himself as a community leader and considered himself 'representative' of the whole group. However, he was resistant to my request to attend community events or help me access further interviewees. This served as a pilot interview and pointed to the need to become more creative in accessing as broad a demographic as possible. It also taught me the importance of distinguishing between 'opinion leaders' who come prepared with a 'script', and others who are less likely to have a narrowed agenda.

To access participants, I was aided by three gatekeepers – two are Nigerian taxi drivers I interviewed, and the other is a Kenyan professional working on behalf of immigrants in Ireland. These gatekeepers provided over a third of the sample set and the remaining interviewees were obtained through direct approaches to drivers at taxi ranks, referrals from friends, and other sources. I also introduced myself to members of the Nigerian community at social functions and community meetings that I was invited to by friends or gatekeepers. This proved a valuable source for more interviewees as well as opportunities for participant observation. Predictably, the snowballing method often provided Nigerians from the same ethnic group, although there was some amount of crossover. One gatekeeper, a Nigerian taxi driver I interviewed in the first phase of interviews, provided me with five more participants. He was particularly valuable as the referrals were not from his community but were from mixed backgrounds that he interacted with while working out of 'the Kesh' (Dublin Airport taxi holding area).

The gatekeeper who works with migrants' rights groups was instrumental in providing access to the community and facilitating respondents trust in both me and the research. The first occasion involved arranging a trip to a Pentecostal church service in a Dublin suburb after which I held a meeting with nine Nigerian taxi drivers. This functioned as a focus group whereby each member discussed issues of interest to them and generated a lively discussion on issues in the industry. During this meeting I was also interviewed about my research, what my motivations and intentions were, and what areas I would be focusing on. I provided them with a brief description of the research as well as the types of questions I would be asking and all nine agreed to a full interview. Ultimately, only five followed through and those interviews were arranged and completed over the following weeks. This gatekeeper provided several

more interview leads, some of which materialised and provided a mixture of Yoruba and Igbo in both Dublin and Cork.

Gaining the trust of participants was a significant issue and required me to employ various strategies to elicit confidence in both me and the research. In sociology the concept of 'verstehen' is understood as the 'social actions' which occur through the 'inner-motives of acting individuals' (Herve, 1988: 143). Joyce says verstehen is dependent on trust and to become close to the participant "it is necessary to establish rapport, and create a comfortable environment, to encourage openness and enthusiasm" (Joyce, 2018: 48-49). Trust was therefore of central importance and even with personal assurances from their colleagues or gatekeepers, I was always vetted before each interview was allowed to go ahead. This trend of 'vetting' continued in every interview whereby during the first few minutes I was the interviewee, before permission to record the conversation was granted.

To ensure as broad a demographic as possible I used targeted sampling and approached drivers at taxi ranks. Although I gained valuable data from some of these interactions, I still experienced resistance to recorded interviews. As a further measure to gain trust I printed out college business cards as well as a brief explanation of the research on departmental headed paper. I handed these to potential participants at taxi ranks and was met with a positive response indicating that participants were reassured about the credibility of the research.

The Interview and Participant Observation Process

Given the limited data collection methods, the interview process and subsequent data analysis is all the more important. Most researchers engage in cycles of inductive and deductive reasoning. As discussed, I have identified the salience of 'race' to Nigerian lived experience in Ireland and the taxi industry before the interviews took place. Also discussed, deductive verification depends on my willingness to generate alternative explanations inductively (O'Leary, 2010: 262). Silverman says that identifying the main elements of your data to some theoretical scheme should only be the first stage of your data analysis (Ibid). By examining how these elements are linked together, you can bring out the active work of both interviewer and interviewee and, like them, say something lively and original (Silverman, 2010: 49). I therefore needed to think through the most appropriate interview methods to ensure I don't impose my own preconceived ideas with the interview process, in terms of both the practical and analytical issues.

The interviews were conducted over a three-year period (2015-2018) with twenty five held in Dublin and three in Cork City. Conducting interviews over a longer period allowed me to continually readjust my questions to the salient issues raised by previous interviewees, as well as document changes occurring in the industry. The length of the interviews ranged between thirty minutes to two hours, with the majority lasting an average of 70 minutes.

As interviews are 'narrative occasions', I tried to create an atmosphere that encouraged reciprocal and empowering interaction to produce rich and meaningful data (Riesman, 2008: 23). I adopted a flexible, semi-structured approach to interviews to manage my influence and allow the interviewee to set the agenda within the parameters of the topic under investigation. However, my own lived experience of working in the industry helped 'close the distance' and provided the cultural capital of an insider during the interview process. Firstly, it helped gain trust – I was described by one respondent as a ´brother´ due to my status as a former taxi driver – and secondly, my knowledge facilitated a deeper discussion into the issues as respondents did not need to ´set the scene´ by explaining the mechanics of the industry. I offered comments throughout the interviews that indicated my working knowledge of the industry, allowing participants to become comfortable and feel understood.

As mentioned, the first interview served as a pilot interview and was held in a room in the university sociology department. It proved to be beneficial in highlighting some of the pitfalls of the interview process. The interviewee was a well-respected opinion leader in his community and was active in organising church activities and other events. It became clear that he was agenda-setting and, although I wanted discussions to be interviewee-led, I realised I needed to be more proactive in directing the conversation to the salient issues. In subsequent interviews I became more authoritative and asked more probing questions, albeit sensitively, to challenge the interviewee into the relevant areas of the research. A second lesson was the importance of the interview setting and although a quiet office was free from distractions it felt too formal. Where possible, most of the remaining interviews were held in the drivers' taxis, either driving around the city or parked at taxi ranks. This proved to be conducive to establishing a more natural conversational-style interview. The activity on the street or on the taxi rank often provided inspiration, or sparked a memory of a previous experience, in which respondents would then relay to me. The remaining interviews took place at a Pentecostal church, participants homes, in my car, and in cafes.

Before each interview, I prepared notes on how I sourced the interviewee and any relevant issues or difficulties experienced in the process. Each interview was recorded, transcribed, and analysed for emerging themes. Holding interviews over several years – which included a follow-up interview with two respondents – helped capture the processual nature of racism. The first eight interviews were conducted in the first month of the field work and established the main themes that were to be discussed in the remaining twenty interviews. In the subsequent interviews I monitored the changes in experiences or attitudes over this period. In the two follow-up interviews, I asked for their thoughts on the emerging themes and whether they noted any changes in the industry. Here, I was able to identify the shifts in how 'race' and racism are practiced, and the themes evolved to include the experiences of new technologies.

I opened each interview by introducing myself and explaining that my motivation to conduct the research was based on my experiences as a taxi driver and the discrimination that I had witnessed. I explained that the research is exploratory, and the focus is on understanding the lived experience from the point of view of Nigerian taxi drivers. In each interview I brought a set of questions to address the various themes I wanted to discuss. These included open-ended questions to allow space for new themes to emerge. I divided the questions into three sections, 1) lead-in questions, 2) central questions and 3) lead-out questions.

The lead-in questions contained background questions such as their age, where in Nigeria they are from, their motivations for coming to Ireland, and why they became a taxi driver. I also asked how long they had been resident in Ireland, how long they had been driving a taxi, and questions related to their network of family and friends. These questions often developed into discussions about their experiences of workplace discrimination elsewhere, the expectations they had entering the industry, and how their lived experience compared to those expectations. The central questions focused on the specifics of the taxi industry and the experiences they encountered whilst working. These included a series of general questions about the industry related to themes such as 'over-competitiveness', 'standard of service' and 'driver vetting'. I asked questions related to the oversupply of taxis, advice they would give to friends entering the industry, and their interactions with customers and other taxi drivers. The latter interviews included questions about their experiences with new technologies that were altering how the industry was being managed. The lead-out questions varied depending on how the interview progressed. For those who named racism as racism, I asked them for their opinion on how solidarity might be achieved between taxi drivers

and what measures they would like to see introduced to mitigate racism. I also questioned them about their thoughts on integration and whether they have incorporated a sense of Irishness. These often led to discussions on the importance of family, community, and concerns about their children's future.

This semi-structured approach provided flexibility and the space to respond to unanticipated turns in the conversation or to clarify ambiguous points. I began each interview explaining that the questions were only a guide and I encouraged them to lead the discussion to the areas they wanted. However, the interviews often started slowly before the interviewee would hit on something of particular interest to them. Often this was the point in which respondents became more enthusiastic or animated and began to provide rich data. While I always allowed the conversation to diverge into those areas of interest, I also intervened where appropriate to keep the discussion relevant.

The transcription process also indicated the importance of robust methodological practices that aid reflexivity and avoid superimposing my own viewpoints and standards. Transcription proved to be an important methodological phase in this research and helped mitigate misinterpretations and to clarify what respondents said. Riesman says transcription is an interpretive process that is influenced by theoretical beliefs and practical considerations of the researcher (Riesman, 2008: 23). During transcription, I developed a deep appreciation of my position as co-author of the narrative and, on several occasions, I noted that I had misunderstood respondents during the interview. Transcription, therefore, is more than just putting words on the page and also requires adherence to the principles of the 'art of listening' discussed earlier.

The participant observation process was also a valuable source to compare against the data gleaned from interviews. The 'walking method', for example, helped verify the existence of White only taxi ranks. Participant observation continued throughout the whole research process and on the occasions I witnessed a racist incident, I would approach the driver to discuss what had happened. These sometimes led to extended conversations about their experiences in industry. On one such occasion in 2018, I witnessed an altercation involving a passenger who used racially abusive language and refused to pay a Black taxi driver. I approached them and told the passenger he must pay, that the police had been called, and I would be attesting in favour of the taxi driver. The matter was resolved, and the driver expressed appreciation at my intervention. It transpired that he was Nigerian and due to the trust created over my

116

handling of the incident, he talked freely of his experiences and explained that such incidents were still a common occurrence.

Limitations of the Data Collection Methods

Silverman says the tendency to identify research design with interviews has blinkered researchers to the possible gains of other kinds of data (Silverman, 2010: 306). Although interviews are the most established method in qualitative research, there are limits to what interviews can explain. Interviews are only one way to 'slice the cake' so it is important not to make grandiose claims about originality, scope, or applicability of this social problem.

Of the various alternative methods focus groups are considered very beneficial when a 'natural' setting is required (Liamputtong, 2010: 114; Neuman, 2003: 396). Joyce says the group context provides the space for marginalised groups to openly discuss their opinions more easily and provide a 'collective power' that amplify the voice of participants (Joyce, 2018: 54). Given the sensitivity of this research topic, situated within the racialised discourses of 'security' and 'criminality', I considered that focus groups may provide the space of mutual support and facilitate respondents to speak about uncomfortable topics. However, the meeting with nine Nigerian taxi drivers, discussed earlier, indicated that focus groups may not be conducive to open and honest discussion. While it provided valuable insights into shared group experiences, I also detected a level of censorship in which participants seemed hesitant to speak on certain topics that may not have aligned with a potential consensus existing amongst their peers. My subsequent attempts to organise focus groups were also met with resistance and suggested to me that focus groups may not be an optimal environment to talk about sensitive topics.

As with all research, the collection methods can only ever provide partial data and I cannot claim it gives the whole picture. Although attending the Pentecostal church service, house parties, and activist meetings proved valuable, more extensive participant observation would undoubtedly have been useful. For instance, the significance of Pentecostalism emerged later in the study and more participant observation may have highlighted this central theme earlier. Nonetheless, despite these deficits in the ethnographic methods, the interviews provided very rich data and offer significant insight into Nigerian taxi drivers lived experience. In the conclusion chapter I suggest future research could include a broader suite of methods that may be useful to examine potential themes not included in this research.

4. Research Design: Data Analysis

Introduction

Data analysis is a process of managing and ordering a mass collection of data to meaning and structure to a research project (Marshall and Rossman, 1999). It is described as the 'heart' of the project where the researcher makes sense of, interprets and theorises the data that they have collected (Schwandt, 2007: 6). The main point of difference to quantitative approaches is the use of thematic analysis rather than the distinct and ordered steps required of statistical analysis (O'Leary, 2010: 257). The four key stages are identifying initial themes or concepts, labelling or tagging data, sorting the data by theme or concept and summarising or synthesising the data (Ritchie and Lewis, 2003: 261). Qualitative research therefore demands a more organic process that sees these steps influencing each other and working in overlapping cycles (Ibid). The concepts researchers explore can arise from the literature, the research question, intuition, or prior experiences (O'Leary, 2010: 265).

In this research 'a priori' themes began with the collection of data from my observations working as a taxi driver and my previous research. Theories of 'race' were thus mapped from the outset with an existing knowledge of the preferred narrative in mainstream discourse. However, this understanding was compared, contrasted, and manually sorted against the data gleaned from interviews and subsequent taxi rank observations. Several concepts were also derived from 'standard' social science categories of exploration, such as found in the literature on 'power' and 'race'. These allowed me to deductively uncover certain themes. However, with such predetermined categories I needed to be wary of 'fitting' this data to my expectations and blind myself to alternative explanations. Several concepts emerged inductively from the data, such as racism denial, that challenged my existing understandings, mitigated against bias, and thereby lending credibility,

Various distinct disciplinary and paradigmatic approaches to data analysis have emerged and each have its own particular goals, theory, and methods. However, researchers don't have to adopt just one and I draw on insights from various strategies in an approach that cycled between the data and the research project (O'Leary, 2010: 269). In this section I discuss my thematic analysis related to the themes identified in the literature review. I describe how they link to the central research themes and questions that are the focus of this research. I begin by outlining my grounded theoretical approach that uncovered the main themes of concern to this research and

from which this research can contribute back to the literature. I explain my use of both narrative analysis and Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) to make meaning of Nigerian taxi drivers lived experience and provide insight into how they understand and respond to the themes identified.

Grounded Theory: Coding and Mapping for Themes

Grounded theory is a way of inducing theoretically based generalisations from qualitative data. It is highly inductive and produces theory that is 'grounded' in data rather than theory presumed at the outset of a research study (Glaser and Strauss 1967; O'Leary, 2010: 270-271). This requires taking an 'imaginative' approach to provide insight into what the data are reflecting instead of simply supporting existing understanding of well-known phenomena (Strauss and Corbin, 1990: 256; Silverman, 2010: 356). In this research the inductive process proved very important in terms of readjusting my initial framework based on the data that emerged from interviews and participant observation. The data revealed that experiences of racism are systematic in nature and, as a result, I readjusted the theoretical framework to replace RST in favour of 'everyday racism'.

Grounded theory is a comparative method that explores each data source in relation to those previously analysed (O'Leary, 270-271). It involves open coding in which labels are ascribed to data to generate a set of workable categories (Konechi, 2008: 6). However, theoretical insights only gain legitimacy when they are accompanied "with sufficient instances of data… [so that] they are understood to be linked with life-experiences that everyone can recognise" (Seale, 2000: 88). The main themes of the literature emerged through the interview process. During the initial eight interviews I began reducing and coding the raw data and developed categories and themes to illuminate the data. I began to 'saturate' these categories with many appropriate cases in order to demonstrate their relevance (Hammersley and Atkinson, 2009: 158; Merriam, 1998: 178; Vanderstoep and Johnston, 2009: 167).

The central themes that emerged relate to the literature on Nigerian experiences of racism, lived experiences, labour market discrimination, government intervention, the experiences of new technologies, education, and the centrality of neoliberal, Pentecostal, and family values. I then developed these categories into a more general analytic framework to establish theoretical ideas that have relevance to wider social processes (Silverman, 2010: 235; Coffey and Atkinson, 1996: 163). The three central themes that emerged are the 'Discursive construction of Nigerians in opposition to the

'Irish family'', 'Regulation and the State', and 'Nigerian attitudes to work and Individual agency'. To generate meaningful understanding, I theorised the relationship between these themes, the relationship between conditions and consequences, in order to assess if the experiences of Nigerian taxi drivers may relate to wider societal issues (O'Leary, 2010: 265).

Theorising Narratives: Humans as Storytelling Organisms

Humans are storytelling organisms who, individually and collectively, lead storied lives and the study of narrative is the study of the ways humans experience the world (Connelly and Clandinin, 1990: 2-14). There has been what is described as a 'narrative turn' within the social sciences in recent decades (Clandinin and Connelly, 2000; Connelly and Clandinin, 1990; Riessman, 2008; Duque 2010; Alvermann, 2000; Flicker, 2004; Cohn and Lyons, 2003). The movement toward narrative inquiry comes with many definitions of the concept and there is a lack of consensus as to what constitutes 'narrative'. Riessman describes it as the ties that bind the different definitions such as ´attention to sequences of action´, ´choice of language and narrative style´, and the ´varying degrees of analytic interest in audience/reader response´ (Riessman, 2008: 5). However, narratives are not static entities, but are situational, which highlights the importance of the context in which data is constructed and meaning is made (Duque, 2010: 3; Schegloff, 1997: 46). Narrative research therefore needs to consider why, when and where a story is told, and the position of the storyteller (Graugaard, 2013: 2).

Throughout the interviews respondents described a period of heightened discursive hostility, or a 'moral panic', that relates to the literature on Afrophobia and anti-Nigerian racism. Their representation also has material consequences and helps explain the poor labour market outcomes for African and Nigerian immigrants documented in the literature review. Throughout the interviews it became clear that this representation is a key mechanism through which respondents are excluded from the Irish family. I therefore used narrative analysis to evaluate how they experience this 'preferred narrative', if it informs their self-perception, and what tactics they employ to disrupt it. As such, I incorporated postcolonial theories of 'race' (Said, 1979; Hall, 1996, 1997), the 'fact of Blackness' (Fanon, 1969) as well as the concepts of 'banal nationalism' and the 'ideal citizen' to show the ways in which they are excluded vis-à-vis conceptualisations of 'Irishness'. These were mapped out under the 'ideological site' in Laguerre's spatial framework.

Narrative analysis also helped provide insight into how regulation and the State are subjectively experienced and explains the higher concentration in 'minority spaces'. Throughout the interviews respondents described different experience depending on the locations they were working. This relates to the literature on Irish neoliberal governmentality and interventions that can underpin exclusionary practices in both the taxi industry and wider society. As such, I incorporated the conceptual literature on neoliberalism and mapped out the various sites this is experienced under 'structural' and 'locational' sites in Laguerre's spatial framework.

For both these themes I incorporated the concept of 'everyday racism', 'hegemony', and 'governmentality' to capture the systemic nature of the discrimination respondents' experience. I also incorporated the concept of (in)securitisation to examine the 'common-sense' rationalities that underpin the discourse of 'security' and to examine the shifting nature of racialised practices. This theorisation was also used to examine the theme related to Nigerians attitudes to work and how they exert individual agency in a hostile working environment. Throughout the interviews it became clear that Pentecostalism, family values, and the internalisation of neoliberal ideologies are central to how respondents self-narrate.

Interviewees refuse to be defined as victims and provide alternative narratives in which they present themselves as hard working, ethical, and determined to become valuable and valued members of Irish society. Narrative analysis, and close attention to the language deployed, therefore helps explain the racism-denial of respondents in this research. This theme, I argue, provides insight to the literature on the extent of racism, how it is talked of and practiced, and the issues of reporting. I therefore incorporate elements of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) as a means to contextualise the language used against the wider 'regimes of truth' and to analyse respondents understanding of those 'truths'.

Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA)

CDA is well suited to address the theoretical issues and interrogate the new racisms of the cultural turn. I use CDA to explore how respondents engage with and manage mainstream discourses on integration, neoliberalism, and their identity. This helps make transparent the reciprocal relationship between discursive action and political and institutional structures that is 'critical' and challenges the dominant ideology (Wodak et al., 2010: 7-8). I examine the macro-functions to distinguish between the

discursive strategies that may be perpetuating/justifying the racial status quo or as strategies of transformation that challenge the status quo.

I therefore sought rich descriptions to help categorise divergent meanings of particular concepts. These include observing non-verbal cues contained in the raw data though notes taken throughout the interview. I also manually sorted out the words and phrases that respondents' used in the transcripts by their repetition and in the context in which they were spoken (O'Leary, 2010: 264). Rather than using software, this kept me close to the data and allowed me to be better able to discern the various euphemisms and synonyms describing similar incidents or viewpoints (Patton, 2002; Strauss and Corbin, 2007).

As I discuss throughout the findings chapters, these observations lent significant meaning to content and themes by noting respondents tone, volume, change in accent or pace of speech, laughter (whether genuine or nervous), facial expressions, and body language. This approach to exploring words, linguistic devices, and non-verbal cues facilitate the 'constant comparison' needed in grounded theory for the development of themes and concepts (O'Leary, 2010: 264). Examples of its use are found throughout each of the findings chapters in which racism-denial is about choosing the 'right language'. This is illustrated with various examples where respondents are shown to be aware of the racialised discourse, show hesitancy to name it as 'racism', and instead elect to use euphemisms as a tactic to integrate quietly from below.

Conclusion to Data Analysis

As I analysed Nigerian taxi drivers' narratives and the descriptions given of their everyday lives it became clear that many experiences were shared. The theoretical insights arrived at in this research are thus illustrated by 'lived realities' that span beyond the individual and are reflective of group experiences. Using this grounded theoretical approach meant that most themes were discovered inductively as I continually added to, or readjusted, the theoretical map as I worked through the data. Analysing the data, therefore, was not a linear process and further themes or concepts continued to be discovered while in the field, during the interview process, and continued to emerge while writing up.

There are, however, limits to such coding schemes that are based upon a given set of categories and can create 'a powerful conceptual grid' from which it is difficult to escape (Silverman, 2010: 238). While the 'grid' helps organise the data analysis, it may deflect attention away from uncategorised activities (Ibid). My coding scheme

therefore included the search for 'uncategorised activities' and deviant cases so that they could be accounted for in the final analysis (Silverman, 2010: 238). My process of data reduction meant I reinterpreted the meaning throughout the various stages. I minimised speculation by respecting the complexity of human relations and recognition of the multiple realities that are rendered meaningful in personal and collective narratives (Maines, 1993: 129).

While narratives organise experience and memory, people's self-perceptions and the empirical world are inherently interpretive (Graugaard, 2013: 2; Bruner, 1991). It is therefore important that I do not impose my own pre-existing understanding of the industry dynamics or impose a larger, single narrative to explain respondents' motivations and responses (O'Leary, 2010: 205; Maines, 1993: 128; Elliot, 2005: 4; Riessman, 2008: 22). Equally, I need to ensure that the emerging narratives consider the power relations of minority and majority space produced by 'race' in interethnic research. I therefore took an interpretive stance to recognise the power effects of the research methods employed and allow the multiple narratives that arise speak for themselves. Ultimately, what emerges are two narratives – the narratives presented by Nigerian taxi drivers and the narrative I have made of their narratives. My theoretical perspectives, epistemological standpoint, research questions, and the type of data I was dealing with all informed the way the data is analysed and interpreted. However, as Dickie points out, narrative analysis helps to disrupt power relations, not only of me and the participants in producing narratives, but "go beyond labels and let the reader into the process of analysis and interpretation" (Dickie, 2003: 51). The methodologies I employ therefore avoid imposing closure on the narratives and, instead, provide the opportunity for new stories and ways of self and world-making to emerge (Cook, 1997: 78).

I also need to respect the contradictory elements that emerged and recognise any outliers that went against the dominant narratives produced. While I focused on the dominant themes that emerged, I recognise that they do not speak for all respondents, let alone, all Nigerian taxi drivers in Dublin. Despite the difficulties in drawing conclusions from so much detail and contradiction I am on firmer empirical grounds than without them (Maines, 1993: 129). Furthermore, I cannot take a naïve stance that what I was told is the absolute 'truth' but, rather, I needed to get "involved in the struggle to produce intersubjective truths, to understand why so many versions of events are produced and recited" (Crang and Cook, 1995: 11). I recognise the multiple realities and, rather than producing neat narratives, the findings reveal the

inconsistencies that naturally emerge when researching a heterogeneous group. Nonetheless, I also provide an 'imaginative' conclusion with a critical view of the overall implications of the research.

5. Verification Procedures and Ethical Research Practices

Ethical approval for this research was straightforward provided I followed basic practices such as informed consent. However, I faced considerable difficultly accessing participants who understandably required reassurances of how the information was to be used. Although no research is neutral, participants must at least trust that I will use the data ethically. This points to the 'ethical turn' that emerged in response to the damage done by Eurocentric thinking and the 'clash of civilisations' discourse (Lemert, 2004: 46; Back, 2007: 97). Back says that it questions the 'masquerade' of universal principles like freedom, justice, and equality, "that may conceal implicit ethnocentrism or dominant global interests" (Back, 2007: 97). My responsibility to participants therefore requires I maintain reflexivity to this throughout the whole research process and analyse the data in an honest and methodologically-sound way.

I maintain analytical control with an awareness that my sociological 'authority' is always "historically situated, reflective, contestable, uncomfortable, partisan and fraught" (Back, 2007: 22). I therefore maintain reflexivity upon my biases, preferences, and theoretical predispositions and recognise I am not an objective outsider but am embedded within the research process (Schwandt, 2001: 224). As such, I acknowledge my active role in shaping the construction of knowledge, retain responsibility over the analysis and the narratives generated (Hammersley and Traianou, 2012).

Verification Procedures

Various steps were taken to maximise the quality of the data and to aid the trustworthiness of the conclusion made in this research. John Creswell provided eight verification procedures appropriate to qualitative research in which at least two should be incorporated (Creswell, 2007: 201-203). Of these the main two I have adhered to are 'rich thick description' and 'clarifying for research bias' (Ibid).

Rich thick description is seen as a foundation of qualitative study in which 'low-inference descriptions' are used to enhance accuracy in the description of the study (Joyce, 2018: 65). It does this by allowing the reader 'step into' the research setting by describing the scene in such detail that the reader can come to their own evaluations

and conclusions (Creswell, 1998: 203). This also allows for transferability in which the reader can ascertain if the findings can be applied outside the specific study: "to other times, people, settings, and situations as a result of mutual features" (Joyce, 2018: 65). As such I provide thick description of the context of the research setting alongside unedited quotes from respondents to allow the reader to draw their own conclusions and to question my analysis and interpretation.

Procedures to check for research bias included 'external audits' and 'member checking'. External audits were given through department presentations and external conferences that proved valuable advice and guidance on potential revisions. Member checking is the technique of sharing data and interpretation with participants to obtain their feedback on the credibility of the findings (Creswell. 2012; Joyce, 2018; Lincoln and Guba, 1984). The purpose is to find out whether the data analysis is congruent with the participants experiences and provides the opportunity to detect and correct any possible misrepresentation (Maxwell, 1996; Joyce, 2018)**.** As discussed, I conducted repeat interviews with the same participants that helped determine changes occurring in the industry as well as confirm or challenge my initial analysis of the data.

Standpoint Epistemology

My experience as a taxi driver proved valuable in gaining the trust of respondents and providing credibility. Respondents became visibly more receptive during interviews on the occasions I displayed my first-hand knowledge of the day-to-day working practices in the industry. This knowledge also allowed me to direct the discussion toward the salient issues they raised without the need for them to establish the context and background. This is a particularly valuable attribute when considering that existing research on racism in the Irish taxi industry has received criticism from industry spokespeople, who claim researchers have little understanding of the mechanics of the industry (Nee, 2010). Although the inaccuracies that they point to are minor, it can nonetheless undermine the validity of the overarching arguments presented in these studies.

One such example is the criticism of the report on racism in the Galway taxi industry, Riding Along with Racism (Jaichand, 2010), in which industry spokespeople tried to discredit it as being the work of an 'ivory tower' academic with no real knowledge of what it is like on the ground (Nee, 2010). The result is a polarisation of views with antiracists, on one side, portrayed as pontificating about something they are not

qualified to comment on, and Irish taxi drivers and industry representatives, on the other, portrayed as inherently racist. I experienced a similar attempt to undermine my credibility with criticism of my previous research into this area. A message thread in a well-known online taxi platform, *taxi.org.ie*, discussed the details of my conference paper abstract, The Discursive Construction of Nigerian Taxi Drivers, that they sourced online and posted at the top of the thread. Most of the comments were dismissive of the research and included a particularly interesting critique from an Irish taxi driver identified as 'John M BSSc (Econ. BSScPol)'. Based solely only on the abstract, he concluded that the research was evidence of academic redundancy:

> The unintended consequence of taxi deregulation has had an incremental increase in students offering a dissertation with reference to the deregulation of the taxi industry in support of their Thesis for academic qualification… This blind lazy ignorance by present day students has led to a vista of the taxi industry which is more the recollection of drunken students than proper academic research. It would be wrong to focus on the taxi industry as portrayed by our academics without questioning the academics themselves…. anybody trying to apply some pseudo intellectual understanding to National Characteristics or racist stereotypes to the Taxi industry, has probably started with their conclusion and worked backwards to create a scenario where by their conclusion is validated. (John M, 2014)

DiAngelo's concept of 'white fragility' may help explain this reaction in which discussions on racism are often met with defensiveness, as well as an unwillingness to understand racialised processes and the individual's position within them (DiAngelo, 2018). Laguerre says that the way space is represented may serve to reinforce, degrade, downgrade, reposition, or challenge the status of majority and minority space (Laguerre, 1999: 16). While some may blame the minorities in the power system, I am speaking from a site of resistance and aim to present the voices of the racialised (Laguerre, 1999: 16). However, there is no privileged location where one can stand, either to construct the representation of space or to decode its meanings because, "every subject is spatially located and views from that angle the relations between the space of representation and the representation of space" (Laguerre, 1999: 16). Nevertheless, I argue that the value of my unique social location, albeit from the position in majority space, means I have intimate knowledge of the industry with lived experience of some of the 'realities' being spoken. This offers a level of protection from criticism, such as that cited above, as a 'blind lazy student' applying some 'pseudo intellectual understanding' of the issues.

This criticism also shows that sociological inquiry must come from self-inquiry and to move beyond the absolutes of 'good versus evil' or 'truth versus untruth'. Instead, the work of this research is not about casting individual blame, but to provide sociological insight into how and why racisms circulate. This necessarily requires honest self-inquiry that interrogates 'common-sense' racialised thinking. I therefore draw on my personal transformations to understand the subtle, everyday racism of unrecognised White privilege in order to expose the limitations of Eurocentric universalism embedded in ´common-sense´ rationalities of 'race'. I am therefore interested in Nigerian lived experience of the subtle forms of everyday racism projected by those in majority space with little awareness of the historical conditions that have produced racialised thinking. It is only through self-examination of my own racism and recognition of my White privilege that I can enter this space between the polarised camps of the 'racists' and the racialised while also challenging the 'grid of debt' in immigrant discourse.

However, my experience as a former taxi driver brings dangers of 'knowing' certain related experiences of respondents. Back says that listening to others can sometimes become irrelevant "because s/he already knows the culture form the inside and paradoxically the accounts of the people being listened to become muted" (Back, 2007: 159). He says that the role of experiential knowledge is an interpretative devise and "subjectivity becomes a means to try to shuttle across the boundary between the writer and those whom s/he is writing" (Back, 2007: 159). As such, I apply reflexivity to make explicit my unique social location as White, Irish, and a former taxi driver. I also make transparent that the research is entangled with wider social and historical relations that produce the ideological construction of Nigerian taxi drivers. Self-reflexivity is therefore essential to help mitigate the inherent problematic nature of qualitative sociology with continual recognition that the knowledge produced is filtered through my Irish ethnocentric eyes.

6. Conclusion: Nigerian Taxi Drivers' Point of View

Jerome Bruner says that the ways of telling and conceptualising narratives become "so natural that they finally become recipes for structuring experience itself [and] for laying down routes into memory" (Bruner, 1987: 31). He argues that not only do they guide the life narrative up to the present but direct it into the future (Ibid). However, stories also operate within 'interpretive communities' of speakers and hearers who are

political as well as cultural actors (Squire, 2008: 55). Narratives are therefore well-situated to study identities which are storied, and transformative because they are rhetorical devices aimed at shaping audience perceptions of their identity (Riessman, 2008: 3). This points to the potential for narratives to be reclaimed to build collective identities that can lead to cultural shifts and political change. An aim of this research is to seek new narratives and counter-frames that may serve antiracism initiatives.

While participants lives are still narrated though my 'Irish' eyes, the narrative I produce is mitigated by a reflexive theoretical and methodological framework. As such, I pay genuine attention to the voices of research participants to avoid both voyeurism and 'knowledge extension' (Back, 2007; Freire, 1970, 1974; Fanon, 1967). The methodological tools detailed in this chapter are chosen to source the 'subjugated knowledge' in respondents lived experience (Foucault, 1980: 82). However, subjugated knowledge is a 'struggle from within' and must reject any claim to homogeneous racial or ethnic categories. As Fanon says, the "negro experience is not a whole, for there is not merely one Negro, there are Negroes" (Fanon, 1967: 104). This is a particularly salient point in light of the mainstream discourses on Nigerian taxi drivers that ignore the mixed cultural, socio, ethnic, and economic diversities of Nigerian taxi drivers.

My approach to studying lived experience, therefore, is designed to remain true to the voices of participants as shared through their narratives, their 'knowledges' (Foucault, 1980). In the following findings chapters I attempt to source this 'subjugated knowledge' that has been relegated to outside ´acceptable´ discourse and from which hegemonic discourses are protected. My aim is to elevate these hidden knowledges to contest the current and preferred narratives that may aid an ´insurrection of subjugated knowledge' (Foucault, 1980: 81). I provide a qualitative account of Nigerian taxi drivers' experiences to examine their 'point of view' of the 'everyday racism' they experience against the backdrop of a post-racial, liberalised taxi industry.

Chapter Five: Regulation, the State, and Spatialised Practises

Introduction

In the background chapters I outlined the shift in Irish integration policy from interculturalism to a greater focus on immigrants' responsibility to 'integrate from below'. This raises questions on what migrants are expected to integrate into and how this integration is measured. I also outlined Laguerre's spatial framework and illustrated how 'model minority' and 'relational' spatial sites reinforce the minority status of some ethnic groups (Laguerre, 1999: 96). In this chapter I explore the themes of 'Regulation and the State' and 'Integration into the Irish Family'. I examine the 'ideological', 'structural', and 'locational' sites to map out the systemic nature of 'everyday racism' which, I argue, illustrates a tacit 'minoritisation agreement' circulating throughout society. The chapter examines spatial practice in various locations and identifies the 'majority spaces' where respondents experience hostility. Here I argue that this has led to the production of 'minority spaces' in which respondents' experience less discrimination and helps explain the higher concentration of Black/Nigerian drivers in specific locational sites.

In the first section I examine how the minoritisation of Nigerians is maintained through conceptualisations of the 'ideal citizen' and 'banal nationalism'. These 'ideological sites', I argue, reproduce racism regardless of citizenship status due to the 'The Fact of Blackness'. I document how this is experienced in 'structural sites' such as the Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Services (INIS). Here I discuss what Irishness and citizenship mean to respondents and outline the importance they place on naturalisation ceremonies in their aim to integrate into the 'Irish family'. In the second section I examine two 'structural sites' related to the taxi industry – the National Transport Authority (NTA) and An Garda Siochána (Irish police force) – and outline how Nigerian taxi drivers experience and interact with representatives of these institutions. In the third section I map out the 'locational sites', the geographical spaces, to illustrate the minoritisation agreement between Irish taxi drivers, customers, and Gardai to regulate 'majority space' and produce 'minoritised space'. I examine how respondents experience spatial practices in the city centre, in the suburbs, at various taxi ranks, and in cab companies. I also examine 'the Kesh', the Dublin airport taxi holding area, which has become an intercultural 'safe space' for Nigerian taxi drivers that is free from the discrimination experienced elsewhere.

1. Minoritisation and the 'Ideal Citizen'

In Ireland, access to both long-term residence and naturalisation are considered restrictive compared to other European countries (Huddleston and Vink, 2015: 10-11; Lentin, 2008: 206). The Nigerian taxi drivers interviewed here arrived in Ireland through various means and, regardless of the avenue of entry, their experience of Irish border control was at best unpleasant, and at worst traumatic for those who endured forced migration and the experiences in Direct Provision. In this section I argue that the rhetoric on integration, which divides 'good diversity' from 'bad diversity', fails to interrogate conceptualisations of Irishness as White. I illustrate this under the ideological site of the 'ideal citizen' and identify the everyday 'banal nationalisms' that undermine efforts to be accepted into the 'Irish family'.

Citizenship and the Minoritisation of Nigerian Taxi Drivers

Throughout the interviews, respondents described many instances of overt racism including from government officials. Alani, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 40s), argued that most Black people's experiences with Irish bureaucrats are often marked by hostility and suspicion. He provided an example of this in a conversation he overheard between an immigration officer and an African immigrant:

> **Alani:** I don't like passing rumours right because I don't want to be a rumour monger. But I've been in immigration office before when somebody was saying, "why will you not renew for me? I have lived here for ten years. I've been paying my tax". But you know what yerman said to him? He said, "take your tax and go back to your country", an immigration officer!... This is not a rumour, I heard it, I witnessed it. They were having a conversation right, a South African guy, Black South African right. He was talking to an immigration officer and I was there... they were having their conversation and I overheard them. (Interview 2015)

Citizenship affords certain rights and privileges that explain why it is so important for Nigerians to pursue. However, for the 'citizen' to exist it requires the production of the Other and nation-states use restrictive immigration regulation to control their borders (Cresswell, 2006: 752; Goldberg, 2002b). Many respondents in this research described the hardship they endured trying to attain legal recognition and the right to live and work in Ireland. Abegunde, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 40s), has been ´properly´ resident in Ireland since 2000 but is yet to receive citizenship. He is studying Nigerian law and sees the taxi industry as a gateway to a better life for him, his wife, and

children. Although most respondents were hesitant to name racism, Abegunde described his experiences in clearly racialised terms:

> **Abegunde:** It's [racism] right across the board, it's not only taxi driving… I have lived in this country for 15 years. I have not taken a dime from the social welfare. I found a way of making myself working, washing toilets, selling perfume in the toilets and, you know, because I don't believe in collecting anything… I´ve been properly resident in the country since 2000… and I've been working since then... I got refused [citizenship] two years ago so I have reapplied… but they have been asking me for different documents since June this year. (Interview 2015)

Abegunde's story exemplifies the weight of the difficulties and frustrations many respondents faced in dealing with Irish immigration law and bureaucracy. We maintained contact over subsequent years where he provided updates on the bureaucratic obstacles he faced. He managed to pass his exams but before his 'call to the bar' he needed to return to Ireland to obtain a 're-entry stamp' in line with immigration regulations:

> **Abegunde**: During my stay here [in Ireland] I have managed to educate myself. I have a law degree. I've done my Masters in Business and Administration and I wanted to be a Nigerian barrister. I applied to the Nigerian law school and I need to be in Nigeria to attend the classes and write the exams and everything. So I was going back and forth... But I always come back because my wife and children are here… Stay one month, go back, stay one month in Nigeria, stuff like that. And before I knew it there is a new law and you can't stay more than ninety days outside the State, [or] you won't get renewed entry. I can't stay outside the State, Ireland, for ninety days. If I stay my re-entry visa will be refused… I have two mortgages I am paying. I'm working here right, for 15 years.

Abegunde explained that on this occasion he was told by an immigration official that the ninety day policy had changed from ninety days consecutive to ninety days accumulative over each year period. He explained that he had done everything needed to become a barrister but in one instant he said a change in immigration policy had major implications on his life. He was allowed re-entry but was advised that he must wait out the year until a new ninety day cycle began, preventing him from attending the ceremonial 'call to the bar' that required his physical presence:

> **Abegunde:** I can't be called to the Nigerian bar because if I go to Nigeria I won't be allowed back into the State and my wife and four children are here … Now they won't give me a re-entry visa… these are the policies that are being put in place in Ireland right. How does that favour anyone who is foreign?... I have

met a consultant, he was an immigration officer, and he said it's terrible but that is what is happening... I don't have time to do that ceremony, right, my year of study is in vain.

The vulnerability of not 'having their papers in order' means citizenship is very important to respondents to provide the stability to build their careers and provide security for themselves and their families. However, it also became clear, as the following section shows, that citizenship is also about the security of belonging and being welcomed into their new 'Irish family'.

Naturalisation Ceremonies: Welcome into the 'Irish Family'

Ndulue, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 40s) and a naturalised Irish citizen, is very critical of Irish citizenship laws and expressed his resentment at the extent of the struggle he was forced to endure. However, he also described the overwhelming warmth he felt at the naturalisation ceremony that welcomed him and hundreds of other 'new Irish'. He described the ceremony as a 'wonderful event' in which a former judge delivered a speech about the social contract they were entering:

> **Ndulue:** I want to applaud something of this past government. I am not applauding them all day because people that have been oppressed, suffering to be able to become citizens of the country. But there is one area they always invite [new citizens] into the Convention Centre... and you see a high court judge talking to you, giving you a sense of belonging... I'm not even just talking about the giving of the passport which is very positive and good thing and gets people settled in their mind and all that, that's one thing. The most important area is the naturalisation when they invite everybody into the convention centre. And that process of trying to tell you what it means to be Irish... that thing is much more important than the passport issued. (Interview 2015)

Ndulue said before they introduced the ceremonies into the naturalisation process: "they would just fling the passport to you... [and] when you get it you just see this nonsense piece of paper that has been giving me problems". He also expressed his frustration at the cynicism of the assumption that Nigerians are opportunistic and only interested in the passport:

> **Ndulue:** It´s more than that... that sense of belonging that you get from being welcomed, the way the judges will talk to you, oh man... If somebody is about to bomb a tram, carrying a bomb into a tram you might just run away. But that talk can make you stop the person. Do you get me? ... Or you might just say, ´I watch my business, since he is not bombing my house´. But after that talk he

can make you say, 'this man is about to commit a crime to my fellow human beings,' because he has given you a sense of belonging [and] part of [a] system.

Ndulue explained that his perception of Irishness changed after the ceremony and that most people do not understand the word 'Irish': "if they understand the word, all these terms [foreigner, immigrant etc] we shouldn't be talking about... we shouldn't be talking about it in the first place". Ultimately, Ndulue and others described the ceremony as a cathartic ritual that helped ease their anger and frustration at the immigration bureaucracy they had experienced.

The 'ideal Citizen'

These accounts demonstrate the relational space in which the non-White Other must also manage the racialised regimes of representation to access rights more easily attained by White immigrants. Although naturalisation relieves many of the fears and anxieties, it does not fully resolve their exclusion from the Irish family. Respondents are constantly reminded of being 'matter out of place' (Douglas, 2001) and the language of difference, such as 'foreigner' and 'immigrant', is regularly used to describe the non-White Other by politicians, the media, and the general population. Citizenship is undoubtedly important, but respondents also have to deal with the concept of the 'ideal citizen' that sustains the gap between formal citizenship and what happens in practice (Koopmans et al., 2005: 6). In terms of the State, this gap is illustrated by government technologies of categorisation to reinforce distinctions between ´Irish´ and ´Black Irish' (King-O'Riain, 2007). These distinctions are also reproduced through the everyday ´banal nationalism´ (Billig, 2017) of an imagined Irish community that struggles to include Blackness. While many expressed an increased sense of belonging, others expressed a sense of betrayal when it became clear that exclusionary practices continued after naturalisation.

However, the existing notions of citizenship and national identity can change by the experience of immigration (Koopmans et al., 2005: 6). Ndulue's account points to this possibility and suggests that the reason that the ceremony´s symbolism is so important is because it broadcasts to society that he *does* belong. He also expressed his hope that it may help change definitions of Irishness: "If they had given it [the passport] to everybody without that [the ceremony] nobody will know that it has been given". Other respondents described that the welcome they received in naturalisation ceremonies went some way to easing the pain of the ill-treatment by immigration bureaucrats in the often lengthy, uncertain struggle for residency rights. They talked

of how they could better deal with individual racism on the street while working – from other taxi drivers and customers – because they had been so warmly welcomed in an official capacity.

2. Technologies of Exclusion and Presumptions of Guilt

Nigerian taxi drivers therefore continue to face 'everyday racism' circulating within society regardless of residency status. In this section I outline the two other main areas, identified by respondents, in which the technologies of the State manage majority space. I begin by exploring Nigerian experiences with the National Transport Authority (NTA), who oversee the regulation of the taxi industry, before providing detailed accounts of their interactions with An Garda Siochana (the Irish police force).

National Taxi Authority

A theme emerged whereby most respondents described experiences of hostility and 'presumptions of guilt' from State representatives. This extended to their interactions with the NTA which took over control of the industry from The Commission for Taxi Regulation (commonly referred to as 'The Regulator'). The issues generally revolved around the taxi driver complaint procedure that was identified by several respondents in this research. For example, Abegunde said that he was reported to the NTA on four different occasions and argued that his treatment by the NTA was more hostile compared to the experiences of Irish taxi drivers:

> **Abegunde:** I've dealt with police officers, right, I've dealt with people from the National Transport Authority and the way they treat you is different right. They call me for an interview because a customer complained that I took a long way... I told them [that] before they got into the taxi they said they were going to Loughlinstown [and] how much would it cost?. And I said, "I don't know because I don't usually go to Loughlinstown on a daily basis... at the end of the journey the meter will tell us". And they [say], "that will be the M50 from the airport". I didn't say anything, grabbed their bags and put them into the boot and drove off. Got onto the M50 and when I got to the Finglas exit then one of them said, "where are we? are we not supposed to be on the tunnel?" Wow, "one of you said the M50 and that is why I am here". And they said, "Oh no, how can you?... How can we be on the M50?" And I said, "well, one of you said so." ... And then I got a phone call [from the NTA] there was a letter that there was a complaint. At the interview there were two of them but one of them already wrote me off before I even came in... One was a bit polite... and the

other one was a bit aggressive. But these are the ones you make complaints to. If I had been racially abused or anything, I would go to these people… he doesn't know me and he already concluded that yes, I did it. How, how did he come to that conclusion?

Abegunde explained that this was one of four complaints made against him, of which two were dropped, and the other two resulted in official warnings. His accounts point to the extra burden placed on Nigerian taxi drivers to prove themselves against the dominant stereotypes. He was anxious that I believed him while relaying a very plausible story that would not normally elicit incredulity if told by an Irish driver. The presumption of guilt is an insidious aspect of the everyday racism that Nigerian taxi drivers experience and one in which Abegunde says must be addressed.

> **Abegunde**: We need to make it a public awareness thing… If you are going to tackle it from the authorities, it's going to be difficult… because they have that sort of mindset.

The misrepresentation of Nigerian identity is at the centre of his argument and was found to be the single most important issue raised by respondents. It illustrates the more subtle racisms that circulate without notice compared to the single acts of overt racism that illicit condemnation. It is an example of everyday racism in which a sense of being judged on existing stereotypes lead to 'racial profiling' and 'presumptions of guilt'. Here, Abegunde pointed to the difficulty of challenging the racism of individual representatives of the State and that only through 'public awareness' can this be changed.

Despite Abegunde's probity, he received a significant number of complaints that an Irish person in his position would unlikely receive. While a lack of cultural adeptness might explain some of the altercations, I argue that racialised presumptions of guilt account for the swiftness to report and act upon alleged cases of misconduct. Based on my own experience as a taxi driver, I would question why Abegunde did not clarify the route. On the route specified, taking the M50 motorway is faster than driving through the city centre but, given how the meters are calibrated, it is significantly more expensive. Although I may have sought clarification (to avoid potential conflict), I know from my conversations with Irish drivers that many would have acted similarly to Abegunde and defend it as 'simply following orders'. The best approach, in my opinion, is to explain to the customer the variations beforehand and negotiate a price in which the fastest route is taken. On these occasions I normally offered a discount approximate to the price of the cheaper, but more time-consuming, alternative route.

Abegunde's transparency in his explanation of the event indicates that his failure to seek clarification was not exploitative but, rather, indicative of Nigerian taxi drivers' conformity to rules as a means to mitigate racism. The literature shows how Black taxi drivers often apply rigid adherence to the law to avoid accusations of non-compliance or illegality (Maguire and Murphy, 2012; Jaichand, 2010b; Irish Examiner, 2009a). These include examples that reference the common practice of informal 'price fixing' by Irish drivers and when African drivers insist on the metered fare are accused of overcharging.

The incident described by Abegunde also highlight the differences in my lived experience as a taxi driver and the freedom I had to engage and negotiate with customers without the same degree of suspicion. The other three complaints he received were for not issuing a receipt, not following directions, and for his picture not appearing on the NTA Taxi Driver Check APP. It became clear that the four complaints Abegunde received were less a reflection of him, but rather, a reflection of preconceived stereotypes that force Nigerian taxi drivers to be beyond reproach. During my time as a taxi driver, I also experienced many altercations in which customers accused me of 'taking the long way' to increase the price of the fare. Despite the threats to report me I was never called before the NTA to account for any alleged misconduct. As I discuss in the following chapter, the negative stereotypes around Nigerian taxi drivers nestle in a security-positive discourse that narrate them as uncivilised, and a group from whom the hegemonic majority must protect themselves. The accounts given by Abegunde represent the experiences of many other respondents to indicate that this viewpoint is reflected in the attitudes of some of those working in the NTA.

Experiences with Gardai: Aggression and Presumptions of Guilt

The literature consistently shows the distrust immigrant populations have toward An Garda Síochána (Michael, 2015; Maguire and Murphy, 2012; ENAR, 2016, Stout, 2016). People of African descent experience worse outcomes from Garda involvement, even when the incident is perpetrated against them, and are more likely to be suspected of instigating the incident (Michael, 2015). In relation to the taxi industry, African taxi drivers feel Gardai are 'constantly targeting' them and when an incident is reported 'don't do their job effectively' (Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 20). Respondents here identified Gardai interaction as particularly difficult and provided many accounts of

hostile encounters. I argue that this is part of the systemic nature of 'everyday racism' in which Gardai play a significant role in an implicit 'minoritisation agreement'.

Respondents regularly cited hostility from Gardai and described feelings of hopelessness that those the State employ to protect them are a significant part of the problem. The main issues were presumptions of guilt, racial profiling, disproportionate aggression to Black drivers, and a disinterest in following through on cases even when evidence exists for charges to be made. There were some accounts of excellent police work for which respondents expressed gratitude. For example, Agembe, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 30s), relayed an incident in which he felt certain he was going to be physically attacked by a passenger if were not for the intervention of a very alert Garda. Agembe described his relief that this Garda had 'sensed' that he needed help, followed his taxi, and then pulled up beside him when he eventually stopped in a housing estate.

However, an overall theme emerged in which most respondents, including Agembe, do not trust Gardai. Most participants said that they felt that there was a presumption of guilt towards them that underpinned Gardai mediation of disputes with Irish taxi drivers and customers. One particularly telling illustration of this was relayed by Azubuike, a Nigerian taxi driver and a naturalised citizen (mid 40s), who described an altercation with a Garda who he had contacted due to a problematic customer:

> **Azubuike:** I said to one [Garda], "I rang you for this issue and you didn't even listen to me and then went to your brother [white/Irish customer] and talk to him. And then to me just ask for my ID. I need to see this and this. I didn't see you ask anything from him. That's discrimination. You ask for my licence, for everything. You supposed to ask him for the same. Just because he´s white or because he spoke to you, or that he´s Irish. He could be Irish, so what". We have to be treated equally, we have the same offenses. I feel discriminated you know… "I called you for this incident… but you did it one sided. I felt bad when you asked for my ID, for my everything"… It was worse because she [the policewoman] was asking for immigration card. I said, "what do you mean?' I said, "you are not immigration [immigration officer]. Do you have any immigration card yourself?" I asked her, "where is your own immigration card?" [laughter]… From my face they know you are a foreigner. I said, "do you have your own immigration card?" She said, "I don't need one". I said, "neither do I". (Interview 2015)

Azubuike claimed that during disputes, the Gardai turn the offender, not the offended, as the victim: "if the police is failing to protect you… not fighting a situation by doing what is right… why would we call them? They want to oppress you, they want to bring

you down". Below I provide two other examples to illustrate the most common forms of racism Nigerian taxi drivers experience from Gardai. The first is typical of the everyday experiences and the second deals with a false accusation of sexual assault. Both incidents reveal that the racialised regimes of truth, that sustain Afrophobia and anti-Nigerian racism, often underpins the conduct of Gardai towards respondents.

Sean, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 40s), remarked that there is a lack of cultural awareness training for Gardai and this, consequently, places an unreasonable demand on him to be culturally adept in order to manage these interactions. He referred to Nigerians' loud voices compared to Europeans and, following an altercation with Gardai, now knows to adjust his voice while interacting with Irish people:

> **Sean:** He said, "don't shout at me." [Sean replied] "But that's the way I talk". He told me, "reduce your voice"… Authority should not talk like that. You don't even know my age, you don't even know me, and you are telling me would you reduce my voice… Being a service man, you are supposed to come down, you know, because that is your job. (Interview 2016)

This incident demonstrates the types of situations that arise in which Nigerians are forced to become culturally adept to Irish sensibilities. Several respondents expressed resentment to these forms of 'invisibility' that force them to supress innocuous differences. This was also found to be the case in the Cork taxi industry. James, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid-40's) said:

> People believe that if you don't speak the same dialect as me there is no way I can do things with you… You may pretend, but still there is a demarcation, it's very serious issue. (Interview 2017)

The literature shows that language is as key factor leading to labour-market discrimination. Although all participants in this research are fluent English speakers, it has found that the host society's response to Nigerians' speech patterns, such as tone, accent, and dialect, negatively impacts lived experience and integration. Studying Nigerian lived experience reveals the stress involved in the expectation to not only to look like 'us' but to speak and act like 'us'.

The dominant narratives around Nigerian taxi drivers are tied to the historical representation of African men as uncivilised and include the 'sexual predator' trope. Adebayor, A Nigerian taxi driver (early 50's), describes the anxiety of this for Nigerian taxi drivers who must protect themselves against false accusations of sexual assault. Here he referenced a publicised case in which an off-duty Garda falsely accused a Black taxi driver:

138

> **Adebayor**: About three or four years ago a Black taxi driver pick up a girl, em, from Heuston Station… They hadn't gone that far and she said, "pull over". And they pulled over, right. And she said she was going to call the police and claimed that the guy raped her… the taxi driver was so smart. There were two things right. I need to call my lawyer and I need to call my doctor right. If you claim rape, right… And this matter went to the High Court and the girl came back and she said she had mental, eh you know, she is sick and everything. And this girl is a police officer. I don't know if you heard it, it was in the news and everything. (Interview 2016).

This account of an actual incident that gained media attention shows that Adebayor may also not be immune to the spreading of rumours. The official reports at that time were that the woman, who was an off-duty Garda, claimed an attempted assault took place, not sexual, and presented evidence of her torn dress to validate her version of events (Irish Times, 2009). Many of the elements Adebayor described align with facts reported but others are either exaggerated or were details gleaned from elsewhere. The police inquiry found inconsistencies that severely questioned the veracity of her account and she eventually admitted she fabricated the story because the taxi driver 'looked at her funny' (Ibid). Subsequently, a case was brought to court and her defence pointed to mental health issues as a mitigating factor. Adebayor made the point that it is another reason to distrust the professionalism of Gardai: "when you report an incident who are you going to report them to? The people you are reporting to might also have a biased mind".

The following extract from the interview with, Emenike, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 40s), indicates that this concern around police bias is justified. Emenike picked up a young woman in Dublin who falsely accused him of sexual assault and describes his mistreatment by Gardai who immediately presumed him guilty until video evidence proved otherwise:

> **Emenike:** I pick up a lady in O'Connell Street… [she] said that she didn't have money and, "I will call the police and say you want to rape me". I said, "call the police and say that I want to rape you no problem, call the police"… and I drove to Kilmainham Garda station. Immediately I was parking, and do you know what, she started crying [making distressed sounds]. "I was in the car, I was just sleeping, and this guy was touching me putting his hands onto my body". That's what she said [to the attending Garda]. (Interview 2016).

Emenike then described how the guard became aggressive, shouted at him, and manhandled him into the station. However, Emenike had video cameras installed in his taxi that proved his innocence and showed it to the Gardai.

> **Emenike:** "Look at this video is there any way that you can see that I was touching her". I submitted that video to that guard and then he just said, "ah eh, you know girls, you know what girls are like, they are just"... I said, "so what are you going to do? Please take her to the courts"... He said I should just forget about it... can you imagine that? So, I am not putting into concentration any longer, that is unfair judgement.

Emenike said that this incident "really makes you feel I am not welcome in this country". He said that the onus is now on Nigerians' to prove their innocence and that he does not know what would have happened without the video recordings. He said that it had cemented his distrust in Gardai and that on future occasions he 'won't bother to call the guards' and, instead, use the video evidence when in court:

> **Emenike:** I don't [trust Gardai] ... That's why I have all this [pointing to the cameras in his taxi]. If somebody doesn't want to pay you just go away because... they [police] don't attend to me.... It's a big problem.

Emenike's story describes a particular type of police harassment that is less likely to be experienced by Irish taxi drivers. As I discuss in chapter six, many Nigerians are hesitant to name racism because, as Emenike explained: "it would be like you are playing the racist card and I don't want to be finding a substitution". Instead, respondents describe racism in terms such as 'economic bullying' or 'tribalism'. However, participants had little hesitation describing such interactions with Gardai in clearly racist terms. Ropo, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 40s), said that it is also a big problem and that: "some of them [the police] are really racist. Oh my God, there was one that said he doesn't like me and I should go home and sleep" (Interview 2016). Chiemeka, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 30s), described how Gardai sometimes 'play games' when they can't find a legitimate offence. He described one case where he was forced off a legal rank and disrupted his night's work (Interview 2017). Many respondents hoped for reform in the organisation because, as Azubuike said: "I think they are trained to intimidate you, probably part of the training [is] to intimidate you and put you down."

The hesitancy to name racism does not extend to Gardai racism due to their being representatives of the State. Sean, and others, saw Gardai racism as more than simple ignorance or clumsy interpersonal skills. They argued that it was more sinister given the disproportionate attention and differential treatment they received compared to Irish drivers. It is in these encounters that respondents described 'the real hurt' because it illustrates the systemic nature of racism which cannot be explained away as

individual ignorance. As a result, most respondents indicated that they rarely consult Gardai in situations in which Irish people would have little hesitation.

There are therefore serious concerns about the policing strategies that are intended deal with racism both within the force and in their dealings with the public. The findings here align with the existing research and indicate that the various Gardai initiatives have not worked. As I discuss in the conclusion chapter, distrust in Gardai is a major barrier to reporting racism. This is a significant issue for antiracism work that places importance on documenting racist incidents so that the State and wider society are made aware of the both extent of racism and how it is experienced (Michael, 2019: 3).

3. Spatial Practice and the Minoritisation Agreement

Laguerre defines minoritised space as a space of exclusion which comes about as a result of segregated practices that bar a group from participating on an equal footing (Laguerre, 1999). Essed says that 'everyday racism' is systemic and circulates between institutions and individuals, taking place in, and relating to, the immediate environment of a person (Essed, 2002: 186). Agnes Heller's definition of 'everyday life' outlines how the reproduction of the person embedded in social relations "is the aggregate of those individual reproduction factors which… make social reproduction possible" (Heller, 1984: 3). This means 'everyday life' is not only reproductive of persons but also of the positions of persons in social relations and of social relations themselves. Nigerians' 'everyday life' is experienced within majority and minoritised spaces that is the aggregate of hegemonically reproduced social relations. In other words, everyday life is experienced vis-à-vis a tacit, symbiotic minoritisation agreement between institutions and individuals.

Jayamma, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 30s), pointed out that racism is divided into different parts: "from customer side, from my colleagues' side, especially the Irish taxi driver, and from law enforcement agents like guards, or the regulator" (Interview 2016). I have examined the structural sites, or the 'law enforcement side', and in this section I examine wider society's complicity with law enforcement and the role Irish taxi drivers and customers play. I argue these racialised encounters are all connected to the same racism, to 'everyday racism'. I examine how this is spatially practised and

identify the majority spaces where exclusion is most prominent and most heavily regulated.

White Only Taxi Ranks: Regulating Majority Spaces

A theme emerged throughout the interviews in which there is a tacit agreement between Irish taxi drivers and customers to regulate taxi ranks. This was most evident in suburban areas but also included several 'White only' taxi ranks in the city centre. These ranks are known to be controlled by a cohort of Irish taxi drivers who decide who is permitted to use them. Naabhak, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 30s), described the hostility he experienced at the O'Connell Street rank. On one occasion, an Irish man got into his taxi and told him where he was going, but as soon as they left the rank the man told him that he had changed his mind, asked to be let out, and told him that he was not going to pay him. Naabhak was understandably frustrated but accepted it and re-joined the rank at the back of the queue. After a few minutes he realised that the same man was in fact another taxi driver and was sitting in his car near the top of the rank. He said this is a common experience for Nigerian taxi drivers and has 'turned them off going there at all' (Interview 2016). Jayamma also said that this is a common tactic in certain city-centre taxi ranks:

> **Jayamma:** For instance, if you look at them on the rank on O'Connell Street and other parts you cannot see any Black people there. You cannot see Black people there because of the frustration with the way they treat them, the racism, the type of trick they are using for them… If a Black guy go there… one of the Irish guy that is a taxi driver they will now come, they will enter the cab, they will say, "ok, I want you to take me somewhere". So they enter the cab, you know that rank to the Rotunda, I don't know if you know it or not?
>
> **Robert O'Keeffe (RO'K):** I know exactly where you are talking about.
>
> **Jayamma:** Yeah, not too far. So, before they get to the Rotunda they say to taxi that I wat to get out, I want to get something ok, take your three euros or something… they systematically push you out of the rank, because they have done it to two or three of my friends, they systematically push you out of the rank.

Others described how Irish drivers would park their taxis to ensure no space was left at the end of the rank until a White driver arrived. The city centre is also full of unofficial or 'illegal' ranks due to the oversupply of taxis that service busy hotspots such as bars, hotels, and night clubs. On these ranks there is little adherence to any queuing system with many reports concluding that racism experienced here is

particularly overt and aggressive (Maguire and Murphy, 2014; O'Keeffe, 2013). Ikemba, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 40s), describes how Irish drivers marshal these ranks and encourage customers to take White drivers:

> **Ikemba:** [Irish taxi] drivers will come out of his car [and say] that is a Black man do not take him. It's happened to me so many times... the majority of woman like, they just go to that man's taxi. (Interview 2017)

These accounts of regulating majority space are also experienced while driving on the city streets and Jayamma described how Irish drivers believe that they have a greater right to be there:

> **Jayamma:** When they meet you along the road, let's say their lane is blocked... so they will have to force their way in. They always believe that 'I'm Irish, you have to give me way. You have just come to my country', you know. It's their attitude... even if they didn't speak it out, their body language, you know. I'm Irish, you have to obey. Anything I tell you to do you have to do it... They forget that we pay the same tax, we buy the same fuel so, a lot of things. It's not because I'm Black or they're Irish. We do the same thing... I pay my tax here. I don't pay my tax to my country that I came from, I pay my tax here. I pay my house rent here. I pay everything here so I belong to this place. But the top of it, [what] is really important... is the law enforcement agents.

Jayamma was one of the few respondents who named racism regardless of where it appears. However, he said that although he could handle the racism of Irish drivers, it is the racism perpetrated by Gardai that caused him the most frustration. Many respondents said this is regularly played out at taxi ranks and provided stories in which Gardai, alongside Irish taxi drivers, marshal these taxi ranks. Juan, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 50s), also remarked that racial profiling at official and unofficial ranks is a regular practice:

> **Juan:** There are a lot of issues you know with the police... They issue tickets. You know when a policeman see you illegal - there are a lot of illegal parking in town for taxis because no space [on ranks] so guys have to make money - and when a particular, eh, squad car or police car see that that rank is full of Black people, they just park up and start giving tickets. And when Irish are parked like that you just pass them, they do nothing. (Interview 2016)

This was a dominant theme throughout the interviews whereby many claimed they are more likely to receive fines compared to their Irish taxi driver counterparts and is a significant factor in the general distrust in Gardai. Bako, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 50s), described another incident that demonstrates the casual nature in which Gardai marshal these spaces. He described a typical scene at an overfull Dublin rank where

three cars were parked illegally as they waited for space on the official rank. The first two were Black taxi drivers and were moved on by Gardai. The third was a White taxi driver and one Garda started chatting to him which, intentionally or otherwise, enabled him to stay until space was created on that rank. In another incident, Bako witnessed a Black taxi driver remonstrating with a Garda about this type of policing of ranks in favour of White drivers:

> **Bako:** The guard was like 'move on, move on' [aggressive tone] this and that. But the guy, you know, there is nothing much you can do. You just have to harass a little bit and then say that what you did was wrong and then you move on. But it does happen a lot of the time… You try to challenge it but what can you do? Guards accept liability for anything? Gardai cannot… so the Guards really lost their responsibilities. (Interview 2017)

In my ten years of driving a taxi, I was often directed off illegal taxi ranks by Gardai. This was part of the nature of a highly competitive industry and the inadequate infrastructure to accommodate the high volume of new taxis. However, I never received a fine and, although I experienced Gardai aggression, I never experienced the level of hostility respondents describe here. Nonetheless, these accounts align with my own experiences as a taxi driver where I witnessed first-hand Gardai interactions with Black drivers. The accounts provided by respondents confirm my own observations and provide insight into the extent of this type of racialised profiling.

Suburbs and Cab Companies

Nigerian taxi drivers are overwhelmingly concentrated in the city centre due to the hostility they experience at suburban taxi ranks. My previous research identified that Irish taxi drivers marshal suburban ranks alongside customers who describe a preference for 'local drivers' (O'Keeffe, 2013). The parochial mentalities experienced in the suburbs contrasted with the more cosmopolitan city centre and, despite the city's competitive atmosphere, Nigerian taxi drivers are forced to operate in these spaces (O'Keeffe, 2013: 40-49). Ulick, an Irish taxi driver (mid 60s), noted that Black drivers are not made welcome in suburban ranks: "every once in a while, a Black driver will appear for a period of days but would eventually disappear because he 'got the message'":

> **Ulick:** It's rare that they, em, coloured people would be out there [a Dublin suburb]… people would pass and get into my car, or get into a car… with a white man driving it (Interview 2013). (O'Keeffe, 2013: 49)

Ulick said that this was a regular occurrence and recounted a time when he noticed a particular Black driver who 'was around for a few weekends':

> **Ulick:** I haven't seen him for a while, he just probably reckoned waiting behind 3,4,5,6, taxis to get to the front of the rank, gets there and find... 3 or 4 cars behind him are taken before he's taken that would have to be very frustrating. That would do my head in. If somebody thought I didn't suit them that really would be a waste of time trying to go out and earn a few bob. So he has probably decided town is his best option. (O'Keeffe, 2013: 49)

Respondents here confirmed this theme and said that they work in the city due to the exclusion they experience in the suburbs. Tayo, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 30s), gave this example:

> **Tayo:** A couple of times I have tried the suburbs for working... they just keep skipping you... I might be on the queue and there are about 10-15 cars they will take instead of me even though I am at the front of the queue... the suburbs has a lot more of, you know, discrimination in the suburbs. (Interview 2016)

My own experience as a taxi driver supports this finding on discrimination in the suburbs. One striking example that I witnessed was, ironically, during the Festival of World Cultures in Dun Laoghaire. This event ran for a number of years during the 2000s and was established to 'celebrate' diverse cultures, drawing crowds of 150,000 people over three days. I was parked on the Marine Road taxi rank when I heard an Irish driver shouting at a Black driver who had mistakenly joined the queue without using a temporary overflow area arranged by the local drivers. The Irish driver used heavily racialised language, approached the other driver in an aggressive manner, and was encouraged by other Irish drivers. The manner he approached the car suggested a physical confrontation was imminent and he was physically restrained by the other Irish drivers. I got out of my taxi and talked to the Black driver while the other Irish drivers continued to shout abuse from a distance. He was visibly shaken and upset as I explained to him the temporary overflow system. He began protesting to me that he did not know this and that he was not trying to skip the queue. I told him that everybody on the street knows that is the case, including the Irish taxi driver. It was a powerful experience for me because it brought into sharp focus the consequences of racism from the perspective of the racialised. I witnessed up-close the emotional toll, the hurt, frustration, and sense of injustice racism inflicts. The absurdity of the Irish driver's racism continued as he organised an apartheid system in which he became a self-appointed marshal of the rank. For the next few hours he sacrificed his own earnings, as if taking a righteous stand for some greater cause, and directed Black

drivers to a second rank around the corner on Georges Street. While this act of racist exhibitionism is not representative of Irish taxi drivers generally, it did illustrate the power of racist thinking, the readily available support it can engender when acted out, and the lack of will to challenge it.

Another significant area in which exclusion takes place is in cab companies and aligns with the existing research (Jaichand, 2010a; Maguire and Murphy, 2012; O'Keeffe, 2013). Michael, an Irish customer (early 50s), suggests that this is because customers often request an 'Irish driver' from local cab companies:

> **Michael:** You hear a lot of women saying… 'I'm not getting into a taxi with a Black fella'… And the pub would ring Dalkey Cabs and certain girls will say 'tell them not to send them Black drivers right' and the staff don't send a Black driver. 'I'm not going in that Black driver's car… tell them to send such and such' (Interview 2013). (O'Keeffe, 2013: 49)

In the following chapter I discuss respondents' experience of cab companies that points to the neoliberal rationalities that 'justify' excluding Black drivers as a response to the demands of customers (Irish Examiner, 2009). Although many Nigerians interviewed here said that they never wanted to join a cab company, preferring to work off the street and at taxi ranks, those who had tried to do so faced difficulty. This points to the collusion of taxi customers in the minoritisation agreement as Jayamma illustrates in the following quote:

> **Jayamma:** Ok let me say something about the customer side… let me give you an example… I was inside my car and a lady saw me and didn't want to take me [and] one of them say that is unfair [the lady was part of a group]. That one lady told me, "that I don't like to enter an Avensis car". A Toyota Avensis! I just laugh… about 60 per cent of taxi drivers were using Avensis cars. I just look at it and see it as an excuse. "Ok, go ahead take another car". So, you want to do racism but you don't want to do it if its seen as being a racist somebody, disguising it. I have [another] customer who would say, "because of your colour, that's why they do that. That's why they don't want to take your car".

The Production of Minority Spaces

The exclusion from majority space result in limited 'locational spaces' available to Nigerian drivers. This has led to the production of 'minoritised space' with an increased concentration of Nigerian and Black drivers working in the city centre. There are also stories of 'Black-only' taxi ranks, such as in Parnell Street, in which Irish drivers have argued are violent spaces for them (O'Keeffe, 2013). One Irish driver, using a type of 'reverse racism', repeated a rumour that an Irish driver who had insisted on staying on this rank was assaulted by Black drivers. However, in both my experience working and

146

subsequent taxi rank observations, I cannot verify that Black-only taxi ranks are as common as suggested by some Irish drivers. Nevertheless, minority spaces have emerged with majority Black taxi ranks appearing due to the exclusion from the majority spaces discussed in this chapter. Moreover, none of the respondents here were aware of any Black-only ranks in which White drivers are made to feel unwelcome. Several said that it is highly unlikely that Black drivers would tolerate such a system because of the bad publicity it would engender.

My observation of two ranks identified by Nigerian taxi drivers as 'White only ranks' (College Green and O'Connell Street) indicated that the marshalling of these ranks by Irish drivers is a systematic practice. In the overflow space at the College Green taxi rank I witnessed the systematic exclusion of Black taxi drivers. There is a specific etiquette peculiar to that rank in which an adjoining car parking space is used as an overflow for the official rank. The etiquette stipulates that the last taxi to have entered the overflow space must flash their headlights to the next taxi entering to signal that they are after them. This system functions well to compensate the lack of an identifiable queuing system. However, there were several incidents in which Black taxi drivers had to get out of their taxi and ask drivers who was the last taxi driver and were often met with hostility. Several participants interviewed described that they experienced hostility at this rank and felt that it was designed to encourage them to work elsewhere. I also witnessed the systematic racialised exclusion on O'Connell Street and in my own experience working there I found it to be a particularly hostile environment for anyone outside a clique of drivers. Although these experiences were sufficient for me to avoid using that rank, I never experienced the overt exclusion documented by Nigerian taxi drivers throughout the interviews. My experiences were limited to difficulty accessing space on the rank, due to drivers not making room, and intimidating stares from groups of Irish drivers when I managed to secure a space.

Safe Spaces: 'The Kesh' – an Intercultural Space

The accounts provided here indicate that the production of minoritised space is the result of a tacit minoritisation agreement that is systematic and emblematic of 'everyday racism'. Ultimately, these minority spaces are locational sites that have emerged as a result of the systematic exclusion from majority spaces that cannot be explained as the result of the racialised prejudice of an individual few. However, the Dublin Airport taxi holding area, known as 'The Kesh', was found to be free of such racialised exclusion. The Dublin Airport Authority (DAA) has its own computerised

system that ensures the 'first on the rank rule' is maintained. Upon entering the overflow carpark, each taxi driver's plate number is digitally registered and displayed on a large screen, letting drivers know who is next and thereby preventing potential disputes. This is one of several measures the DAA have implemented that has resulted in a 'safe space' against racialised exclusion and has become a sanctuary for some Nigerian drivers. Chinua, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 30s) says that he uses the airport for this reason:

> **Chinua:** In the airport you can't do that [create White only rank]. That's why I am comfortable in the airport… one thing I have noticed right, is that people… don't choose [White drivers]. (Interview 2016)

For many years, The Kesh had a bad reputation with stories of overt racism against Black drivers, so I was interested to see how participants negotiated this environment. I conducted five interviews with Nigerian taxi drivers who use The Kesh as a base to work from. They said that the intense hostility they had experienced there in previous years, including 'obscene' racist graffiti in the toilets, no longer existed. Chinua gave me a tour and said the DAA had introduced a zero-tolerance policy on racism and that the toilets were now regularly painted to remove any graffiti. The most recent DAA Taxi Operations Manual provides a code of conduct that taxi drivers with an airport permit must adhere to (DAA, 2019). It states that a taxi driver must not participate in any acts that cause offence such as: "vending or promoting products, services or events and/or intimidation, verbal abuse, racial abuse, lewd or indecent behaviour or violence" (DAA, 2019; 19). I found it to be very well managed due to these measures and it has consequently become attractive to Nigerian drivers who describe it as a safe-haven, free of the racism experienced elsewhere.

The key areas these participants described that made it a pleasant working environment were the strict computerised queuing system, zero tolerance for harassment between taxi drivers, racial or otherwise, and a more cosmopolitan customer base who are less likely to have internalised the dominant narrative of Nigerian drivers. Also significant is the fact that the taxi rank is marshalled by a DAA representative at the point of contact with the public, who guides customers into each taxi. The experiences detailed in this chapter were echoed by those interviewed in Cork. James described similar issues of racial profiling by Gardai and customers but that this issue is not as prevalent in Cork airport; "racism is a little bit less at the airport than other places because if you refuse a particular taxi you cannot move to the next one like taxi ranks in the city (Interview 2017). The regulations implemented at these

airports, therefore, may provide the template to tackle the general issues raised in this and other research on racism in the taxi industry.

Site Specific Neoliberal Antiracism

Throughout this chapter I have outlined how Nigerian taxi drivers are excluded from majority space with little choice but to occupy the locations assigned to them by the majority population. Allan Pred identifies the 'spatialization of cultural racism' and 'the racialization of everyday social space' (Pred, 2000: 98). His analysis of residential sociospatial segregation argues that the social construction of space becomes one with the social construction of 'race' (Pred, 2000: 125). The existing research on Africans in Dublin has shown that the lack of mixing in the sphere of neighbourhood has been extended to other spheres of life in which 'minority spaces' have emerged due to exclusion and discrimination (White, 2002, 2011; Casey and O'Connell, 2010; Michael, 2015). These identify areas in which the potential for integration does not materialise, such as in education, housing, nightlife, and religious worship. However, the Dublin taxi industry presents a unique zone of encounter whereby the hosts and migrants must engage and become part of each other's daily experience.

In the conclusion chapter I discuss the current debates on antiracism strategies and suggest, based on the findings here, that site-specific 'neoliberal antiracism' may be better suited than current 'liberal antiracism' approaches to address the specific dynamics in each location. Neoliberal antiracism argues for distributive responsibility across local and national authorities reaching to the micro-politics of relations between peer groups, families, and individuals (Nelson and Dunn, 2017: 32). I suggest that the DAA's regulation of 'the Kesh' could serve as a useful example to draw from.

4. Conclusion: Everyday Racism and the Minoritisation Agreement

In this chapter I examined some of the issues related to the themes of 'Regulation and the State' and 'Integration into the Irish family'. The Irish state's approach to integration, as prescribed in Migration Nation, makes distinctions between 'good diversity' and 'bad diversity' signalled by the move from interculturalism to 'integration from below'. However, Nigerians' attempt to adhere to the expectations of 'good diversity' are overwritten by State structures and hegemonic discourses.

I documented the importance of citizenship to respondents as a means to secure both their legal status and in an attempt to be accepted into the 'Irish family'. I outlined the 'warmth' respondents described at naturalisation ceremonies in which 'inspiring' speeches renewed their commitment to integration and the social contract they now entered. However, the formal equality that citizenship confers does not always grant equal treatment and groups defined by 'race' and ethnicity continue to face various forms of exclusion (Koopmans et al., 2005: 6; Joseph, 2016a). The discursive construction of the 'ideal citizen' is one of the 'representational sites' in which Nigerians' identity is constructed against. I argue that the 'ideal citizen' is tied to conceptualisations of Irishness as White and, as the accounts documented in this chapter show, integration into the 'Irish family' is impeded by 'The Fact of Blackness' and Anti-Nigerian racism.

The mobility afforded to the 'ideal citizen' does not apply to them and the accounts documented tell of the constant suspicion from government officials, the NTA, Gardai, and wider society. I argue that these experiences highlight the systemic nature of everyday racism within the Irish society. As such, structural, locational, and ideological sites need to be understood as imbricated (Laguerre, 1999). By examining the intersection between the technologies of the State and technologies of the self, I argue, reveals a tacit 'minoritisation agreement' that is underpinned by racialised 'regimes of truth' that construct the non-White Other in opposition to Irishness.

Stocks of Knowledge

I incorporated Essed's concept of 'everyday racism' to examine how this minoritisation agreement regulates various spatial sites. Essed explains how the fundamental 'stock of knowledge' required to cope in everyday life is transmitted by each generation to its successors. She says socialised meaning-making practices are immediately definable and uncontested so that, in principle, these practices can be managed according to (sub)cultural norms and expectations (Essed, 2002: 186-7). This knowledge is not restricted to knowledge derived directly from the everyday environment but can also include knowledge communicated by the mass media or educational institutions. The system is internalised in everyday life through socialisation processes and is based on expectations and conditions that are taken for granted (Essed, 2002: 187). Jayamma encapsulates the nature of everyday racism and says it is experienced at several sites such as the law, from Irish taxi drivers and customers, the Gardai, and the NTA:

Jayamma: The government, the law, is not balanced because it does not favour the foreigner in this country, the taxi driver… Whether they come for India or Pakistan or from Nigeria or from Uganda or anywhere… The same law that can say, "Ok, you can't refuse the passenger" [but] the passenger can say "Ok, I don't like to enter your car"… They can refuse and because of your colour. They can say "I don't want to take that Black guy, I don't like him, I don't like the way he look at me". So that is racist… The law can make that ok. If the law can balance that and say, "if the taxi does not know the way he's going and says 'I didn't know the place' ok, maybe you can try another guy". But somebody who see you and because of your colour [and] he don't want to take you, no.

Jayamma presents insight into the systemic nature of racism in which the 'stock of knowledge' embedded in the technologies of the State and individual racism are infused with the global racialised regime of truth that depicts the non-White Other as uncivilised. The everyday world is a world in which one must learn to manoeuvre and a world that one must learn to handle. Essed says that without a minimum knowledge of how to cope in everyday life, one cannot handle living in society (Essed, 2002: 187). This includes "knowledge of language, norms, customs and rules, and knowledge to use the means and resources that make living possible (or successful) in a given environment, determined by factors of class, gender, [and] profession" (Ibid). This knowledge includes expectations and 'scripts' (Shank and Abelson, 1977) of everyday situations that are necessary to function in society.

In both chapter six and seven I examine how respondents integrate these stocks of knowledge into perceptions of themselves and in their working practices. While their voice is already overwritten by hegemonic discourses and, for the most part, are excluded from the discursive space in which their identity is constructed, it reveals their existing compatibility as well as 'cultural adeptness' to Irish norms (Bhabha, 2004). In the following chapter I continue with the themes of 'regulation' and the 'Irish family' by examining how respondents subjectively experience and understand regulation and the dominant discourses that narrate their lives.

Chapter Six: Moral Panic, New Technologies and (In)securitisation

Introduction

In this chapter I examine how the global regimes of racialised representation of Nigerians are enacted in the local context of the Dublin taxi industry. I explore how this is subjectively experienced through the site of 'representation', a subsection of Laguerre's 'ideological site', to examine how respondents understand and experience the negative discourses that narrate their lives. In the previous chapter I discussed how computerised technology facilitated an antiracism initiative in Dublin Airport that successfully managed racialised discrimination. In this chapter I examine new technologies of surveillance that, I argue, are embedded in existing forms of subjectification including racialisation and have led to a process of (in)securitisation (Bigo, 2006). This is contextualised against the backdrop of the 'multicultural crisis' and the discourse of 'security' to outline the effects of the new regulatory framework implemented through the Taxi regulation Act (2013). I argue these technologies produced another 'locational site', a 'cyber space', in which racialised discrimination is now practiced through the privacy of mobile phones.

In the first section I examine how Nigerian taxi drivers experienced the 'moral panic' occurring between 2011-15 in which there was heightened discursive hostility toward them. In the second section I explore how Nigerian taxi drivers' perceive the negative discourses and the limited platforms to challenge the dominant narratives. In the third section I examine Nigerians' use of new surveillance technologies in the private sphere and explore the motivations behind their use. In the fourth section I examine the neoliberal rationalities behind the State's introduction of new surveillance and self-management technologies including CCTV and the NTA Taxi Driver Check App. In the fifth section, I examine the power of racialised discursive formations. I theorise this under Gramsci's concept of 'contradictory consciousness' by examining a particular incident in which 'common-sense' understandings of the non-White Other, despite evidence to the contrary, sustain racialised thinking.

1. The 'Moral Panic': Spatial Site of Representation

The global regime of racialised representation constructs Nigerians as a particularly problematic ethnic group and informs anti-Nigerian racism in Ireland. My previous

research in this field identified that Irish taxi drivers and customers qualify racism through culture by specifying that it is Nigerians, not Africans or Blacks, who are the problem (O'Keeffe, 2013). Their attempts to substantiate this position includes references to other Black taxi drivers' xenophobia towards Nigerians (O'Keeffe, 2013: 35). Historically, these groups are either assimilated into Whiteness, such as the Irish in the US (Dyer, 1997: 19), or act as a 'buffer' between the White and Black population (Allen, 1994: 14). This was illustrated by the example of Darren Scully who referenced a 'Ugandan gentleman' who supported his anti-Nigerian stance and served as a buffer from accusations of racism (Heaphy, 2014). The findings here indicate that that Nigerian taxi drivers are acutely aware of these discourses. Obey, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 30s), said that 'it seems being from Nigeria is a crime' and, while he saw it as an act of 'betrayal between Africans', he understood their motives:

> **Obey:** For example, when you get an Angolan driver, the only way he can make you see him as a good Black man is to tell you that I'm not an effing Nigerian. (Interview 2016).

Obey said that this 'betrayal' is common amongst other African taxi drivers and is designed to push: "the racial profiling, or discrimination, onto Nigeria for him to be accepted". He said that customers see the African country of origin as a gauge and often 'aggressively' ask him where he is from. In these cases, Obey told customers he was from another African country and said that he knew of others who also practiced this to avoid confrontation. Obey provided one example in which he told a customer that he was from South Africa:

> **Obey:** The guy was on the phone to his friend. "He's not effing one of them, this one is from South Africa, he's not from Nigeria"… Jesus Christ, so being from Nigeria is a crime. I really don't get the reason behind that.

The discursive formation of Nigerians is complex and Obey described his difficulty in understanding the hostility and suggested the perceived threat came from Nigerians' strong work ethic:

> **Obey:** I think maybe they are seeing Nigeria as a threat or that people that works much… because when I look at Nigerian society, where we are from, [and] now here. The people, if you get to for example doctors... Nigeria is one of the highest people that are doctors.

The way Obey rationalises racism is indicative of respondents' general confusion as to why they are targeted. The reason Nigeria has become synecdochical for Africa in the taxi industry may be partly explained by Nigerians being the largest Black migrant

group. However, the 'uncivilised' tropes in existing anti-Nigerian discourse have been utilised to justify this racism. Saying Nigerian instead of African allows one to evade the stain of racism, particularly important in interpersonal encounters, and the racist game of choosing the 'good Black' is deployed to demonstrate a sense of discursive mastery. Obey's rationalisation is also contradicted by the ways in which some Nigerian groups also attempt to distance themselves from the 'bad' Nigerian narratives. Komolafe pointed this out in relation to Nigerian doctors in Ireland moving into middleclass neighbourhoods as a means to mark this distinction (Komolafe, 2008). This was also illustrated in my conversation with an Irish-Nigerian businessman who took my taxi and lamented the arrival of 'uneducated Nigerians' giving him and other Nigerians in Ireland 'a bad name'. While Nigerian doctors experienced racism, it was marked by different experiences as they did not pose the same 'threat' to the hegemonic majority and were afforded better relational space (Komolafe, 2008). Access to this space is more difficult for Nigerian taxi drivers as Job, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 50s), encapsulates by discussing the period of hostility during the 'moral panic':

> **Job:** Once upon a time, I can remember vividly. That time it was too common that a lady will never get into, I don't know, maybe let me say a Black guy car. One day I´m listening to the radio and they bring the topic, ´why they don't get into the Black cab?´ So they explain that some of the Irish drivers tell them that they are rip off, they are this, we are that, they should not patronise us. And during that time too the advert on the radio that says patronise Irish drivers. And that is the old thing that during that time, I can tell you that we hardly get money to take care of my responsibilities… Trust me, I really really feel the pinch during that time. (Interview 2017)

As discussed, 'race' is a floating signifier and how 'race' is talked of and practiced is contingent, *both spatially and temporally*, on the environmental factors in which it occurs. Job's account reflects the period of discursive hostility that was defined by a sharpened public gaze on Nigerian taxi drivers who were seen as a threat and to be avoided.

Existing research has illustrated the detrimental effects of negative stereotypes on marginalised groups. Charles Taylor says self-consciousness exists only by being acknowledged or recognised, and the related implication is that a sense of socio-cultural self-esteem emerges not only from personal identity, but also in relation to the group in which this identity is developed:

154

> Identity is partly shaped by recognition or its absence, often by the misrecognition of others, and so a person or group of people can suffer real damage, real distortion, if the people or society around them mirror back a confining or demeaning or contemptible picture of themselves. (Taylor, 1992: 2526)

Taylor emphasises the importance of 'dialogical' relationships and argues that it is a mistake to suggest that people form their identities 'monologically' or without an intrinsic dependence upon dialogue with others (Ibid). Meer and Modood say that our idea of ourselves "is dependent upon how others come to view us to the extent that our sense of self is developed in a continuing dialogue" (Meer and Modood, 2011: 33). However, it is important not to make presumptions about how Nigerians incorporate the negative portrayal into perceptions of themselves. As discussed later, most participants reject a victim narrative and avoid using the term ´racism´ to describe their experiences of discrimination. This indicates the importance of using a methodology that recognises both the co-constructivism of identities and the possibility of emerging narratives to affect social and political change.

Laguerre's spatial framework includes the 'representation of space' to conceptualise the 'space of representation' created to reflect a 'reality' (Laguerre, 1999: 16). He says that the 'representation of space' either enhances or undermines our ability to understand the 'space of representation' leading to the question, "who is doing the representing and for what purposes?" (Ibid). This question is central to understanding the processes involved in the representation of space which, ultimately, is a site of struggle over the hegemony of meanings (Laguerre, 1999: 16). How space is represented matters greatly to Nigerian taxi drivers because the representation by the dominant group is often "engineered for the social reproduction of the position of the minority group" (Laguerre, 1999: 16). However, the representation preferred by the minorities themselves is usually for the purpose of emancipation (Ibid).

Ultimately, the representation of space is offered as a form of rhetoric intended to acknowledge the existence of the Other, evoke a message, convey one´s identity, or reflect one´s view of reality (Laguerre, 1999: 16). However, such representation can have a negative impact or misrepresent those occupying this space. Laguerre says that these representations are often used as a tool to justify policies by the dominant sector of society in its effort to intervene (Laguerre, 1999: 16). In the following section I incorporate this understanding to analyse the State's response to the *Dodgy Cabs Ltd* programme that depicted 'an industry in chaos'. I argue that the programme's

representation of taxi driver space fed into the existing discourse of 'security' within the industry and led to the intervention of the Taxi Regulation Act 2013.

2. "We are Listening"

My previous research found a resilience from those in the majority space to maintain the cultural distinctions – the civilised 'Us' versus the culturally immature 'Them' – as justifications for racism towards Nigerian taxi drivers (O'Keeffe, 2013). In Abegunde account of his experience with a new immigration law, detailed in the previous chapter, he was quick to counter any possible links in his story to the commonly held stereotypes. His awareness of how Nigerians are represented was indicated by his pre-emptive assurances around his work ethic, that he was not here for welfare, that he was not 'illegal' or breaching the terms of his residency. None of this information was relevant to the point he was making but indicates his acute awareness of the dominant narratives. This was a common theme with respondents keen to refute stereotypes by providing unsolicited information not directly relevant to what was being discussed. In this section I document participants awareness of this discourse and the frustration that, despite their adherence to the values ascribed in ´good diversity´, are nonetheless constructed as ´bad diversity´.

The biggest frustration for Nigerians is how they are represented and that, despite providing a good service, they are continually depicted in a negative light. Throughout the interviews, Nigerians described the various sites in which they have heard these negative perceptions such as at taxi ranks, on radio chat shows, and through mainstream media. Jack, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 30s), pointed to the disparity in media coverage and that radio talk shows tends to focus on minorities. He said that Nigerian taxi drivers experienced specific scrutinisation within these talk show 'debates' as listeners call in with some variation on a standardised rumour:

> **Jack:** There are some serious contributors to these rumours… talk shows that goes up in the night-time… they are a bit like politicians when they want to get listeners. There are areas they will jump into so much that will get Irish people talking. [one of them] is talking about Nigeria… saying anything that will get you listeners no doubt. (Interview 2016)

Abegunde said that: "you just have to listen to the news [and] if you listen to live shows on the radio you keep hearing people calling in [saying] 'I was in a taxi and the taxi

driver was asking me for sex'… to put in the minds of people". Jack also addressed the 'sexual predator' trope highlighting this particular anxiety:

> **Jack:** I remember there was an alleged rape that went on a few months ago. I think in the Phoenix Park. But that was an Irish taxi driver that was alleged of that. That didn't make it to the radio station. But there was a recent one that came up and unfortunately it was a foreign driver who, my goodness, you need to hear what that led to. So, criminals are everywhere… Even [if] proven guilty, it is one person not the nation… People are committing a lot of crimes in the country and each one should be narrowed down to the person. (Interview 2016)

Christie, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 40s), also said that radio shows are a particularly virulent space for people to complain about foreign or Nigerian taxi drivers. I asked him if these rumours are ever contested on the radio shows or if evidence is presented to verify them:

> **Christie:** It never happens, it never happens. Whenever any issue comes up it's the [Irish] drivers that we hear complaining. The client [taxi customers] come into the radio to talk for one reason or the other… [but] we are listening. (Interview 2018)

Another prevalent criticism levied against Nigerians is that they lack the basic street knowledge to do their job. Christie refuted a related rumour that claimed the taxi knowledge test is made easier for foreign drivers. He described his own difficulty passing the test and said: "it doesn't matter the colour of skin; it is the same test they took". Many voiced their frustration at politicians and the media whom, they said, were the key actors responsible. They argued this is where the focus should be because it is these actors who have the power to change the narratives if they so wished. I asked Christie if he thought more action should be taken to dispel the rumours by those who know the facts, such as the Commission for Taxi Regulation:

> **Christie:** When a radio show invites somebody from the street, invite somebody also from the office concerned. So that when somebody talks, the listener compares and contrasts from both sides and know who is saying the truth. But… you only hear one side of the story, the other side you never hear anything. So, the presenter is supposed to, when such issue comes up, invite the driver, invite somebody from the transport industry so that they can talk and people will listen from both of them. That is a balanced argument. (Interview 2018)

However, this balance does not exist, as Victor Chikezie, an African-born taxi driver explained during a national taxi labour strike: "I follow all the rules and [although]

some of the [Irish] taxi drivers are good towards me... most are not... They jump on you for any mistake" (Irish Examiner, 2009b). Phil, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 40s), lamented the lack of willingness by those in power to fight on their behalf:

> **Phil:** If there is a proper awareness, proper awareness on the radio, on the television and everything... the people come on the air and say all kinds of things. It's just appalling... no evidence to prove of most of these things but the radio companies have to keep themselves going on... They keep feeding these kinds of things... One person might hear it and believe it and one person might hear it and not believe it. And the person who believes it will go ahead and tell somebody else, and that person might believe it or not and goes on... very contagious, one person believes it and makes the story so believable and so frightening and they just pass it on. (Interview 2017)

Phil's analysis provides a clear understanding of how rumours are perpetuated and his story highlighted several of the necessary elements required for them to spread. The literature on rumour identifies how 'dread' rumours are much more contagious than positive or 'wish' rumours. However, most respondents said that they had no interest in calling into radio shows to present their side of the story because 'it will just add fuel' to an already hostile situation. Respondents are therefore actively seeking other ways in which they can influence the space of representation:

> **Abegunde:** [We] don't have a voice... whether it is politics, we don´t have an African radio or we don´t have any African newspapers, we don´t have any voice, and that is why such research [this research] is a bit of the way of dispensing [to] you what we can say. (Interview 2015)

Abegunde acted as a gatekeeper for me and advised me that many Nigerians will be wary of speaking about their experiences. He suggested that I should make clear that the interview is for doctoral research to lend credibility. He said that the "fear is that they might say, 'ok, how is this going profit me. How is this going to make anything better'":

> **Abegunde**: I'll be bold about this... I'm not trying to undermine anybody but if I'm not truthful the research fails. If the research fails it's not profitable to me, you know, or anything. But if the research is successful people will build upon it right. And eventually something might be done about it, something like that. I've done research before and if you keep feeding your research with wrong information or lies it eventually might fail. So, I'm going to be a bit truthful. If you are in Ireland from the perspective of my race, right, people don't give you the opportunity to express yourself. (Interview 2015)

The findings here show that Nigerian taxi drivers are attempting to change this narrative of ´bad diversity´. They emphasise that they are not a threat but the weight of representing the whole is evidenced in the anxiety that emerges when one of their group does transgress. This was exemplified by Obey, who said that when news emerges of a sexual assault involving a taxi driver: "we the foreigner are putting our hand on our heads, 'please let it not be a foreign taxi driver'". The same anxiety does not exist for Irish taxi drivers and an accusation of sexual assault has little impact on the everyday lives of those in majority space. News of an alleged transgression of a Nigerian, however, activates the 'sexual predator' stereotype and the incident is weaponised as 'yet another' display of the groups uncivilised nature.

The quote from Obey illustrates participants awareness of the dominant narratives and that the actions of one represents the whole (Simmel, 1950; Pred, 2000). The stereotypes within these narratives have cumulative political power: "requiring everyone ascribed to those groups to negotiate it in some form… leading to the further demonization of large groups of people already diminished in power vis-à-vis the majority" (Lentin and Titley, 2011: 63). Despite the efforts of many Nigerians to live their lives beyond reproach, and to be *seen* to be living their lives beyond reproach, respondents describe how it is only negative actions of some that are inscribed into the narrative. The existing literature identified this theme with one Nigerian taxi driver in Drogheda quoted as saying:

> "We are doing our best, in spite of the mentality, ´Black people are not good, no good´. If I am no good, doesn't mean all black people are no good" (as quoted in Maguire and Murphy, 2012: 32).

In this research, Abuzo, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 40s), pointed to Nigerian heterogeneity and said that while one may have a bad experience with one person: "it's not that everybody is the same… we are human beings… bound to make mistakes, we are bound to quarrel. But the most important thing is to sit down and have a dialogue" (Interview 2015). Many expressed the belief that provided they continue to work hard at integrating from below, a more favourable representation will eventually emerge. Several also claim that this process is already developing through customer interactions:

> **Sean:** They can joke with you about that [Nigerian stereotypes], and say "I´m only joking" … Some Irish people get into your car, they tease you and after a while they tell you the truth, "look at me, I´m not care what anybody say about you guys. I love you guys. I like you that you never give up, you are fighting,

you are a fighter. But you are doing what you are supposed to do, you contributing to society, I´m with you".

In chapter seven I discuss these signs of solidarity in more detail. However, the findings here indicate that perceived negative attributes are still likely to be co-opted into the narrative. Throughout the interviews it was clear that Nigerians are acutely aware of this and adopt various tactics to disrupt the discourse. Also discussed in chapter seven, the particular scrutinisation Nigerians experience means they must practice a form of 'invisibility' to hide elements of themself deemed 'too African' (Fanon, 1967; Moreo, 2012).

3. New Technologies: Protection Against Racism

In this section I explore the impact of new technologies in the private sphere. These, as highlighted by some respondents, may help disrupt the dominant discourses and provide evidence of the good service they provide. However, these technologies also provide the means to continue racialised practices in less overt forms. I begin with Nigerians' experiences with cab companies before examining their use of surveillance technologies such as in-car cameras and Satellite Navigation systems. I also explore their experiences with Apps, such as FreeNow and Uber, and examine the impact these have had on the industry in terms of (self)regulation and discriminatory practices.

Cab Companies

Nigerians were at the vanguard of new technologies with many using GPS systems and in-car CCTV before there use became more widespread. Respondents said these technologies provided safeguards against accusations of ripping off customers, sexual assault, and other negative behaviours commonly attributed to them. Refuge from the effects of these stereotypes were also sought in cab companies. Nigerians hoped that the computerised controller system would negate individual prejudice and lead to a colour-blind distribution of fares. However, Nigerians described the practice whereby controllers would override the computerised systems to dispatch the most lucrative fares to friends in a 'cash for fares' system. I have had personal experience of this in a Dublin city centre cab firm. I received a particularly good fare but was quickly cancelled by a controller which caused both disappointment and suspicion. Talking to colleagues afterwards, it was explained to me that 'brown envelope' arrangements are common

practice between controllers and taxi drivers who pay to skip the queue for lucrative fares. It was a plausible explanation that suggests that one such taxi driver overheard the fare on the CB radio and surreptitiously called the controller to claim it. Throughout my years as a taxi driver, many stories circulated about this practice and was the reason I, and many others I talked to, stopped using cab companies.

The theme of Nigerian exclusion from cab companies first arose in the interview with Bayo, a Nigerian driver (late 30s), when I asked him if he could foresee solidarity between Irish and 'foreign' drivers working together to make the industry better for all drivers. He referred to his attempt to join a cab company and said: "I don't [see] if that could happen because I remember one time… I went to this cab office to just to be one of their drivers. That man told me we are not taking foreigner" (Interview 2017). He said that this is the general experience for Nigerians and that most drivers now avoid cab companies: "because of the bad experience a lot of people had… everyone just run away from the trouble". As mentioned in the previous chapter, cab companies are under pressure from customers who demand local drivers and not 'a Black fella'. Other studies have pointed towards to the prevalence of these attitudes amongst customers such as in Galway (Jaichand, 2010) and in Louth (Maguire and Murphy, 2012). The findings here illustrate that such racialised exclusion can have a lasting emotional and psychological toll:

> **Bayo:** Like that day when I went to the cab office that they told me sorry. I feel so bad and my day was so bad. So, I feel like not to go somewhere where I am going to feel bad and risk that again… So that is [why] some people afraid to go… in our head is that they are going to say no… or they might look at us in a bad way. That is the feeling that everybody has and that is why we don't go.

The choice to take a White driver is often rationalised as the choice to take a superior service. This points to the inflection of neoliberalism in racialised discourses, discussed in the following chapter, that rely on the argument that customers have the right to choose the service they want. This was illustrated in a well-publicised event in Cork when Nigerian taxi driver, Lama Niankowe, passed a taxi picket line during a national taxi strike. He said he approached the Cork Taxi Association (CTA) but was refused membership on racial grounds (Irish Examiner, 2009a). Responding to the controversy, Derry Coughlan, chairman of the CTA, said: "we can only take in local Cork men who are affiliated to the Cork taxi meter area" (Ibid). Coughlan admitted that none of its members are Black and presented the argument that: "they are too new to our shores and too amateur to get the act right" (Ibid). This, despite having existing members from

Tunisia, Chile, Poland, Albania, Bangladesh, England and Scotland (Irish Examiner, 2009a). Coughlan referred to his association's responsibility to provide a good service to customers:

> We receive too many complaints about their [Black drivers'] attitude and manners, and about some drivers not knowing where they are going, especially in rural areas… This has nothing to do with race. But members of the public are telling us they are not happy with them. (Irish Examiner, 2009b)

This emerged as a common theme in the interviews here. As discussed in the previous section, many Nigerians avoid these spaces, such as speaking on the radio or joining cab companies and trade unions, because of the reasonable expectation of racism. It is not that they do not have platforms to speak but that these platforms are seen as hostile and places where they will be met with malice. Few respondents challenge these types of exclusion and instead disengage from the discourses leading to self-silencing and the practice of 'invisibility'.

In-car Cameras: Policing the Police Against Presumptions of Guilt

It became clear that cab companies did not offer the refuge from racialised exclusion Nigerians had hoped. Another measure employed by Nigerians to mitigate racism are in-car CCTV cameras and tracking devices. These technologies have become common throughout the industry and their use is now promoted by many taxi companies across the country (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 288). Despite the concern around privacy and data protection (Daly, 2011) the technologies are in compliance with the relevant regulations and were broadly welcomed by all parties within the taxi industry (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 288).

Both Irish and Nigerian drivers have availed of in-car cameras as a security measure. Nigerians, however, described the security they offer against ´presumptions of guilt´ in cases of conflict. This, they say, is in response to their experiences with Gardai, whom they have little faith will provide a fair hearing during conflicts with Irish drivers and customers. This was vividly illustrated in the previous chapter in the case of the false allegation of sexual assault towards Emenike, in which in-car camera footage proved his innocence. He described the aggressive nature and the presumption of guilt by the attending Garda that suggested prosecution would have been actively pursued if it were not for the CCTV evidence to disprove it. Several other examples were relayed throughout the interviews in which in-car camera footage provided evidence against false accusations of misconduct.

GPS Sat Nav: 'They Don't Know Where They're Going'

Another technology Nigerians commonly use is GPS navigation systems that help ensure the most expedient route is taken and to help avoid disputes. However, this sometimes backfires with customers claiming it as yet another illustration that they 'don't know where they are going´ (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 293). In this research, I also found the widespread use of GPS systems by Nigerian taxi drivers is to mitigate accusations of 'going the long way'. Aside from accusations of malpractice, it is the deficiency in 'local knowledge' that is often cited as a justification for exclusionary practices. However, as Vyncent, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 50s), said: "even Irish drivers don't know the whole city inside out and it takes time to acquire the knowledge, it takes time while on the job, you eventually build up a mental map, it´s the same for everyone not just Nigerian drivers" (Interview 2016). On this point, Christie said 'it doesn't matter the colour of the skin, or where you come from:

> **Christie:** An Irish man that starts the job today will face the same problem. You are Irish doesn't mean that you know Dublin well. You might come from County Galway or wherever, and you come and live in Dublin. If you don't know it, you don't know it. It doesn't matter where you come from. Some passengers even told me that they entered a white man's taxi, and he didn't know where he was going. (Interview 2018)

Jon, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 30s), described frustration at the resilience of racism. He said it 'doesn't matter what we do', and that the racism persists despite their use of GPS (Interview 2017). This, of course, ignores the fact many Irish drivers also utilise these navigation systems without criticism from customers or fellow taxi drivers. As Jon said, "it seems we are damned if we do and damned if we don't", and each effort to avoid racism and to counter the narratives are spun as yet another example that "we are no good".

FreeNow/Hailo: The Move from Overt to Covert Racism

The expanding use of new technologies in the private sector has helped allay the public fear that manifested in the ´moral panic´. While it did not stop racism, it made it less visible, and many Nigerians described their relief from the sustained hostility towards them and the relative discursive calm that followed. The main reason identified was the emergence of new technologies, such as FreeNow, which provided less face-to-face racism. FreeNow was formerly branded as *Hailo* until 2017 and *MyTaxi* until 2019.

Charlie, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 30s), described how racialised practises became less overt due to these Apps:

> **Charlie:** The situation we face in 2011-12 13-14, I think the situation is no more now. It´s no more rampant. Why? Because we have a lot of Apps now, we have Uber, we have Hailo. I think that's what makes it slow down now because when someone wants to get you as a cabman now, if he´s Hailo, he or she gets your details before you even get to him or her. So, if he don't want you as a colour man he can cancel it before you come to him or her. (Interview 2016)

Some Nigerians therefore welcomed these new technologies that allowed them to operate in a calmer environment with less face-to-face racism. This included Charlie who explained how some customers use the Apps to avoid Black taxi drivers:

> **Charlie:** Before you get to that person they [Hailo] have already forwarded your details to that person, the person knows that you are a coloured man, you are whatever country. If you are Nigerian, he or she knows already. So, if she don't want to have you as his or her driver they can cancel it… So you don't take it personally, you just say ok… But unlike before, the way it was before, you may be driving and someone flag hand and you stop to pick them. And when they bend their head and they see that you are a black guy they just turn their back to you. Oh, I experienced that a lot too. So, you know, they just turn their back or they say, "sorry, don't need taxi anymore".

Others were more vehement in their criticism of these technologies citing a heightened gaze adding to their sense of vulnerability. While a minority credited these technologies for an easier life, the consensus was that they did not help in terms of alleviating racism, and the practice of choosing White drivers over Black drivers continued:

> **Paul:** There was a time I wanted to join Hailo but because of racism I didn't join it... There was [a] lady coming from Duke street… there is a rank there, this lady just came over… and all the people on the rank we are black, we are foreigner, black or foreigner. There was Asian guy there as well that day. She look at all of us, she didn't see any white people there. The next thing she do, she make a call, and within five minute this guy just come with Hailo, Irish guy… They [also] do that on Hailo. You see I´m black and you cancel me, immediately because of my colour and they do that… there is no difference this who are doing Hailo and may do my own job [on the street/rank].

Many of those interviewed initially joined Hailo in the hope that it would alleviate public safety concerns about using foreign drivers. Security was a general selling point for these Apps and reassured customers by uploading the drivers' details of each taxi trip to a computer database. However, throughout the interviews it became clear that

racism persisted regardless of the added security offered by this surveillance. Xugo, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 40s), told me that he had stopped using Hailo because of the number of customers cancelling fares: "it is too frustrating, particularly as the cancellation comes after the booking is finalised" (Interview, 2016). It is only after a booking is made that the customer receives the driver´s details and may choose to cancel. As Xugo explained, it is often by that stage the taxi driver may have driven off a rank and so lost their place in the queue. More recently, and in line with new data security directives, these Apps give the driver the option to not have a photo that will appear on their profile. However, Paul said that this is not a deterrent because people also cancel bookings based on African sounding names:

> **Paul:** Even if you cannot see the driver but you can see the name of the driver… you will know… you can see a Paul [pseudonym]… an Irish person can be a Paul, but [says surname]. Everybody will know that is not Irish, most people will even know it is a Nigerian name.

Most agreed that the new technologies had helped end the ´moral panic´ and expressed relief for the dramatic drop in discursive hostility and overt racism. However, many others voiced their concern about their personal information being available to the public at the touch of a button. While private technologies have helped create the current period of discursive calm, in doing so, they have made racism easier to practice, less visible, and therefore become more deeply embedded. The most concerning example, discussed in the following section, was the implementation of the NTA Taxi Driver Check App, at which some Nigerian drivers expressed anxiety at the type of personal information made available to the public.

Technologies such as SatNav and in-car cameras offer certain protection against ´presumptions of guilt´ and the false accusations that sometimes follow. While new technologies provide benefits in terms of less face-to-face racism, they do not eliminate racial profiling. Instead, they provide customers' with the ability to practice racialised exclusion covertly through their mobile phones. In the following section I examine the impact of new technologies in the public sphere. This is contextualised against the neoliberal rationalities behind the latest moment of 'recapture' with the Taxi Regulation Act 2013 and theorised as a process of (in)securitisation (Bigo, 2012).

4. CCTV and the NTA App: (In)securitisation of surveillance

(In)securitisation of Re-regulated Deregulation

Since deregulation, the Irish taxi industry was continually a site of problematisation, with many sectors lobbying for security in the form of surveillance measures that were met with 'almost unanimous approval' (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 287). Many taxi drivers and taxi associations had even appealed to the regulatory authorities for a 24-hour telephone hotline to report the transgressions of other drivers (Ibid). The government's response was a process of intensified re-regulation with new legislation on tougher licensing and assessment policies, the surveillance of drivers by means of CCTV systems and the NTA´s Taxi Driver Check App (National Transport Authority, 2013). Security and compliance with industry standards were the main reasons to justify reregulation and were presented as the government fulfilling its obligation to provide a secure, well-functioning industry. This moment of recapture was followed by a return to government-at-a-distance, with the new technologies facilitating the self-regulation and self-policing of the industry. These, I argue, are cultural configurations that can be mapped onto the spectrum of ´race´, demarcated through the signifiers of skin colour and driver names, to racially exclude Black and Nigerian drivers. In this section I argue that the ´moral panic´ toward Nigerian taxi drivers helped facilitate the consent required for increased surveillance and control throughout the industry. I examine respondents' experiences with these surveillance technologies and the types of racialisations they engender.

Public CCTV

Due to the oversupply of taxis, ranks have become a hotbed of contention with illegal ranks, double parking, and the inevitable conflict that results. Alan Kelly said that the new Act would "allow the National Transport Authority to use cameras, closed circuit television or other apparatus to build its evidence base with regard to breaches of the regulations… at taxi stands" (Kelly, 2013). Despite CCTV being one of the most overt means of surveillance it was broadly welcomed by those in the industry due to its position within security-positive hegemony.

While in-car cameras, GPS tracking, and panic buttons are understandable security measures, the lobbying for surveillance through public CCTV is, I argue, an indication of 'contradictory consciousness', and that the consent of those in majority space was

gained through the security discourse in which the ´moral panic´ negated criticism related to privacy. The existing literature also indicates that much of the blame for an 'industry in chaos' was directed towards Black drivers:

> There's not enough space for our cars… Now you have the lanes off the main street with these fellas, and they're not licensed for here. And they'd [African taxi drivers] give you abuse if you told them to move on. But they're taking our business, because we're where we're supposed to be, but when they see a group – young girls, drunk – they'll shoot out of the lane and shout to them. (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 289)

Irish drivers were therefore more interested in attending to "the potential uses of CCTV to detect 'cloned' cars… [with] explicit reference to 'Black' drivers'" (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 288). Drivers even wanted public cameras to be equipped for automated number plate recognition with one driver quoted as saying, 'you've nothing to fear if you're registered' (Ibid).

Some Nigerian taxi drivers interviewed here also welcomed CCTV in public spaces in the expectation it would offer protection from the same racism that facilitated its wider approval. However, several also vocalised their concern at how it might be utilised by law enforcement. As discussed, participants spoke of the racialised gaze and unequal application of existing laws on Black drivers who are more likely to be issued fines. Phil noted that if Gardai policing trends are an indicator, he did not think CCTV would help alleviate the racism but is more likely to be "used as a tool against them". Others, however, argued for CCTV at taxi ranks to provide evidence of the practice of customers choosing White taxi drivers. Anthony, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 40s), suggested that CCTV could also protect against Gardai presumptions of guilt or incidents when Nigerians are abused by taxi drivers and customers: "They should make CCTV compulsory, you know… because a lot of trouble with passenger, you know, too much". Anthony described an incident in which a woman would not pay a fare and then falsely accused him of harassment. He reported it to the police but instead got a letter from the NTA stating that a woman had lodged a complaint against him. He claimed, however, that both the Regulator and the police had prejudged him 'as the one in the wrong' and encountered an air of disbelief toward him. Although neither the NTA nor the Gardai had contacted him again over the incident, he said that had CCTV footage been available, he may have had evidence to corroborate his version.

Those interviewed therefore provided a mixed response to the issue of public CCTV at taxi ranks. It is accepted that the oversupply of taxis and the limited space at ranks

have resulted in widespread illegal parking. However, presenting CCTV as a means for police to collect evidence against infractions was disingenuous because, particularly on Friday or Saturday night, illegal practices were systematic and unavoidable. This point was addressed by Gardai who said they had to weigh the risks posed by drunken night-time crowds remaining on the streets against the risks presented by illegal parking (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 287).

The NTA Taxi Driver Check App

The most significant issue for respondents was the government's introduction of the NTA Taxi Driver Check App which permits consumers to verify the credentials of their taxi driver before they enter the taxi (Kelly, 2013). The App was launched in early 2013 and allows passengers to check that a taxi is licenced and match the authorised driver to the licence and vehicle. Passenger can input the vehicle registration number, taxi licence number, details from the dashboard ID card, or scan the taxi disc before entering the taxi. They then receive a photograph and details of the driver and can thereby confirm their legitimacy. The NTA also encourages customers to press a 'report' button to instigate a complaint procedure if the details do not match up or the car is not properly registered. The App is therefore a cheap and effective self-regulatory governing tool for registration and compliance in the industry. As Maguire and Murphy point out, the App was launched explicitly as a security measure:

> …that shifts security from the conduct of government to the governmental conduct of conduct within the industry: now passengers and drivers may 'feel safer' by taking responsibility for engaging with the new system and by doing so police those who do not comply. (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 288)

Respondents described how these forms of surveillance produce insecurity and fear not experienced by Irish drivers (O'Keeffe, 2013). While biometric surveillance has consequences for all those under its gaze, the findings here indicate a greater negative impact for Black taxi drivers. Vyncent emphasised this point and complained strongly against the public availability of his personal details in the NTA app. He said that he had been 'vetted the same as everybody else' with his licence and photo displayed on the dashboard as proof: "now they can look in their phone and have too much information about me. It makes me nervous now… If someone wants to track me down, they can".

Most agreed that the NTA app is not necessary from a security point of view and indicated that the App strengthened a racialised gaze. Emenike described his anxiety

when customers openly compared his details against the App. He said it is not common but "when it does happen usually the customer is looking for a fight, even when they see I am not illegal". Others described the feelings of insecurity when people 'hover' around the back of their taxis with mobile phones. I also experienced discomfort when passengers scanned my registration details and, jokingly or otherwise, studied my face against the photo on their phones. However, this type of panoptic surveillance is particularly damaging for racialised groups and elicits specific anxieties. Maguire and Murphy quote one driver who vocalised this anxiety:

> Why should I show my face to people: why should they have my photograph on their phones when they're just passing me on the street. Now they are able to see me moving around on their phones. (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 293)

It is therefore important to understand these software applications as surveillance technologies, in the sense that they exercise a gaze. However, as Maguire and Murphy argue, it is also important to note that "the label 'surveillance' often fails to capture the complexities of technologies that render human sociality as code and thereby facilitate technologically mediated opportunities for forms of sociality and, indeed, economic gain" (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 289). While the market for these Apps is recognised as a potentially transformative one it also gives a glimpse of a potentially Orwellian future (Jeffries, 2013). This, of course, is a concern for everyone, but, as the following section outlines, the NTA App has greater implications for Nigerian taxi drivers because the sharpened gaze that focuses on them is embedded in existing racialised processes. Here, I argue that new technologies, in the effort to enhance a smoother self-regulated industry, is also aligned to the 'minoritisation agreement'.

5. Surveillance and the Language of 'Security'

I have outlined the different responses to new technologies by Irish and Nigerian taxi drivers. While both groups broadly welcomed new surveillance technologies from the private sector, they had different responses to the government NTA App. The power of language to shape meaning is illustrated by the willingness of those in majority space to respond to security motifs and the common-sense rationality 'you've nothing to fear if you're registered'. This leads to three points I make in this section related to the power of discursive formations and ´contradictory consciousness´ to sustain Nigerian racialisation. First, I illustrate the power of discursive formations to narrate

Nigerian taxi drivers as a threat and from whom this technology will protect. I illustrate this by examining a particular incident in which an Irish taxi driver sought to prove the extent of 'cloned' Black taxi drivers operating in Dublin using the NTA Taxi Driver Check App. Second, I illustrate the contradictory consciousness in Irish taxi drivers consent to surveillance technologies in the name of security. Third, I illustrate the contradictory consciousness of Nigerian taxi drivers who reproduce the dominant and 'acceptable' discourses. While respondents reject the narratives that depict them as the threat, I examine how they are constrained by these discourses as they seek to present counter-frames within this security-positive hegemony.

The Power of Discursive Formations

The power of hegemonic regimes of racialised representation is such that the discursive formation of Nigerian taxi drivers becomes deeply embedded in common-sense rationalities. Hegemony constrains what is acceptable discourse and allows racialised thinking to persist even when lived experience provides evidence of alternative narratives. 'Race', and euphemisms such as ethnic difference, immigrant, foreigner, are all tied up in the discursive formation that establishes how those in the majority culture are to think about minority groups. Stuart Hall says representation of the racialised Other is a complex business that engages feelings, attitudes, and emotions and it mobilises fears and anxieties in the viewer at deeper levels (Hall, 1997a). Maguire and Murphy refer to the variety of techniques that "call into being a thoroughly racialized archetype, a phantasmagorical 'black' man who appears and disappears at will" (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 291). Judith Butler says that performance has the "reiterative power of discourse to produce the phenomena that it regulates and constrains" (Butler, 1993: 2). Many examples of the phantasmagorical Nigerian taxi driver are found within the dominant discourses and are reproduced through rumours, stereotypes and racialised regimes of representation (O'Keeffe, 2013). Irish taxi drivers and customers consistently rely on 'representative' examples of questionable behaviour as 'proof' that Nigerian taxi drivers are uncivilised and a threat to the healthy functioning of Irish society (Ibid). The incident detailing the National Concert Hall 'invasion', discussed in chapter three, provided one such example that reinforces the 'uncivilised' Nigerian narrative in opposition to their ´civilised´ Irish counterparts. Illustrating this, Maguire and Murphy quote a ´key figure´ in the taxi industry:

There was a spot check Saturday night and all the Africans disappeared off the town or fifty per cent of them at least. Why did they disappear? They disappeared because they were not complying with the regulations. … I have had a number of complaints with people not showing photo ID. I have had a number of complaints with people confused with who was on that photo ID. […] The public said we cannot identify the blacks at night time in the taxi. […] Now I have another incident where there was another fella not complying, and I was told that it was not his face on the photo. I went up to the car; I asked could I see his photo ID. He wouldn't let me; he drove away, nearly knocked me down pulling off the rank… He wasn't the guy in the photo ID, so he just drove away. […] You cannot tell one from the other… How do you tell them apart? (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 291)

Here we see how in 2010, three years prior to the introduction of the NTA App, the motifs of ´security´ and ´identification´ were already the common-sense rationalities to justify racialised discourses around Black/African taxi drivers. Alternatives to 'security' are outside acceptable discourse and those who object to surveillance are deemed as either irresponsibly promoting ´insecurity' or have 'something to hide'. As discussed, it was Irish taxi drivers who were initially pushing new technologies – for their own and their customers' security – and the State followed in a process of recapture though re-regulated deregulation. But, as Maguire and Murphy point out, in the middle of this contested terrain of political rationalities and surveillance interventions are the processes of subjectification and racialization (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 289). It was within this racialised discourse of ´security´ that the NTA App was embraced by the hegemon who recognised its value to police Black taxi drivers. In the above quote, the industry representative stated that 'you cannot tell one from the other', yet confidently asserted that 'it was not his face in the photo'. Inconsistencies such as this do not elicit scrutiny whereas Nigerian drivers must account for every action. The following section illustrates the power of contradictory consciousness by examining another incident involving an Irish taxi driver who expressed frustration at not being able to ´prove´ the prevalence of ´cloned´ Black drivers using the new NTA App.

Contradictory Consciousness

Gramsci sees power functioning through a ruling ideology, which is a coherent system of thought, and a subordinate ideology, which exhibits contradictory consciousness. This explains how the cultural hegemony shape the consciousness of subalterns to provide elites with the ´spontaneous consent´ of the masses. It explains the passivity of the 'individual conscious' as 'man-in-mass' and although we may be aware of the

contradictions, hegemony deprives us of a space in which to articulate those contradiction. The inability to articulate alternative visions leads to a passivity that prevents us from challenging the hegemony (Gramsci, 1971: 333). As I've argued, it is Nigerian taxi drivers who have been discursively constructed as the security threat and from whom these technologies supposedly offer protection. Contradictory consciousness is therefore useful to understand these two groups in isolation – those occupying majority space, defined as Irish taxi drivers and customers, and those occupying minority space, defined as Nigerian taxi drivers.

To illustrate the power of contradictory consciousness I analyse a story relayed by Maguire and Murphy (2014) in conversation with an Irish taxi driver. Upon the release of the NTA App in 2013, the authors took a taxi journey in the outskirts of Dublin and spoke to an Irish taxi driver about the new measures (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 290). They say he spoke eloquently about the new legislation and the importance of customer safety but when the issue of African drivers was raised, he became increasingly animated: "half them are cloned cars; mostly African fellas driving cloned cars" (Ibid). There are two licences required to operate a taxi – the taxi licence plate for the vehicle and the SPSV licence for the individual. Taxi drivers with an SPSV licence sometimes do not own a taxi plate and lease it from an individual or a private company. The term 'cloned taxi' depicts the illegal practice of several vehicles operating off one taxi licence in which they duplicate roof-signs and calibrate the meter on the black market. This rumour existed before deregulation, when taxi plates had a market value of over €80,000, but has now become associated with Black drivers and suggests that two or more cars are working simultaneously, utilising a single licence. It is often interchanged with other 'bogus taxi' rumours such as illegally sharing the use of a registered taxi with unlicenced drivers (without a SPSV licence) to maximise the profitability of a single vehicle. The NTA Taxi Driver Check App aims to police such practices and requires that each driver 'log in' when they begin each shift so their photo can be matched with the licence details.

The Irish driver, in his attempt to prove the prevalence of 'cloned' Black taxis, began scanning the registration details of Black taxis using the NTA App but could not find any illegality and volunteered to drive the interviewers to another location to continue the search. This example illustrates how different forms of racism develop as 'scavenger ideologies' that range across issues and discourses in search of justifications and keys to legitimacy (Titley, 2011). Gavin Titley says these are shaped and reshaped in different contexts and in relation to the population being oppressed (Ibid). The

172

incident here reveals not only the driver's frustration, but his disbelief that he could not find proof to vindicate his racialised thinking. This is one indication of contradictory consciousness ability to close off or refuse to explore explanations contradictory to hegemonic culture. The prevailing hegemony depends on the tendency of public discourse to make some forms of experience readily available to consciousness while ignoring or suppressing others (Lears, 1985: 577). Counterhegemonic alternatives are then placed beyond the boundaries of what is commonsense and, subsequently, what is even subject to debate. Rather than consider the possibility that the dominant narratives of Nigerians is untrue, the driver sought ´ontological security´ (Giddens, 1991) by continuing his search until the dominant discourse was confirmed.

This ideological and linguistic closing-off of alternatives leads to another aspect of contradictory consciousness that gives a sense of inevitability among subordinate groups regarding the status quo (Robyn, 2008). As Gramsci presents it, contradictory consciousness results in: "a situation in which the contradictory state of consciousness does not permit of any action, any decision or any choice, and produces a condition of moral and political passivity" (Gramsci, 1971: 326). In this state of powerlessness, the status quo appears impenetrable. Hegemony therefore creates a sense of resignation and a tendency to accept hierarchal political culture as somehow inevitable (Lears, 1985: 577). The passivity toward the implementation of the NTA App, despite the privacy concerns, conveys this aspect of contradictory consciousness in which the subordinated is prevented from acting on the truth of their experiences (Robyn, 2008). For those in majority space, there is a lack of alternatives to the security-positive hegemony. This is exemplified in the Irish driver's incredulity that the NTA App did provide proof of 'cloned' Black taxis.

Ultimately, the Irish driver may still believe the negative representation of Black/Nigerian taxi drivers, such is its power, despite his inability to find collaborative evidence. The power of hegemony deprived him of the space or language in which to articulate any contradiction to the preferred narrative (Lears, 1985: 577). This is how racism is talked of and practised within the Dublin taxi industry and, while some may have an awareness of the contradictions, still reproduce these discourses for lack of alternatives. Others illustrate its totalising effects, as one Irish taxi driver said: "if customers get into Black taxis and are ripped off it serves them right, what do they expect" (O'Keeffe, 2013).

While the process of contradictory consciousness functions in the same way for both groups, Nigerians are further constrained as the racialised group. This subaltern position means challenging the discourse of security further isolates them within minority space. This helps explains their eagerness to reproduce security-positive discourses as a tactic towards integration despite these discourses simultaneously excluding them from majority space. This is the bind which offers potential access to model minority space but ensures that there is little examination of the hegemonic discourses that maintain racialised exclusion. However, the one discourse respondents vigorously reject is the one that narrates them as the security risk from whom consent for surveillance technologies was garnered. The challenge for Nigerians is therefore different to those in majority space and, although the processes of (in)securitisation effect both, Nigerian taxi drivers are in a double-bind. For Nigerians, to speak outside the security-positive discourse is not only deemed ´irresponsible´, but also proof they have something to hide.

6. Conclusion: Constructed Against the Stocks of Knowledge

In this chapter I have argued that the new re-regulatory technologies are the latest methods of controlling populations on racial grounds. I argued the neoliberal rationalities behind these technologies are designed to place security and compliance at the hands of the public to self-regulate. However, far from being 'colourblind', I have, following the work of Maguire and Murphy, argued that they are embedded is existing subjectification's such as racialisation. Furthermore, the return to government-at-a-distance relies on the technologies of the self (Foucault, 1988) in which the industry evolved to create ´cleaner´ racialised spaces to continue racist exclusionary practices through the privacy of mobile phones. These software applications are thus understood as surveillance technologies in the sense that they exercise a panoptic gaze facilitating self-regulation as well as the reproduction of racialised practices.

I also examined the varied responses of Nigerian taxi drivers to these new technologies – from those who embrace them, to those whose initial optimism faded when it became clear that these technologies were not as colourblind as first anticipated. I examined how Nigerian taxi drivers understand and experience the new forms of racialisation they produce and outlined the tactics they deploy to use them to their

benefit. Private surveillance technologies, such as in-car cameras and GPS systems, were found to offer protection against ´presumptions of guilt´ by Gardaí in cases of conflict and false allegations of sexual assault.

Studying racism in the taxi industry reveals the power of contradictory consciousness in which the global 'regimes of truth' inform local discourses on integration, neoliberalism, and post-race narratives. These are the 'acceptable discourses' and speaking outside them are deemed irresponsible. Ultimately, Irish drivers and customers still internalise the racialised stereotypes and the process of (in)securitisation has facilitated smoother neoliberal governance. I have argued that 'common-sense' dictates what is 'acceptable discourse' at the expense of competing discourses.

Throughout this chapter I also outlined some of ways respondents are forced to construct themselves against these existing 'stocks of knowledge' that circulate in Irish society. However, discourse analysis has progressed to a critical orientation around power and knowledge which is not only deconstructive but shows the ability to reconstruct social arrangements (Moriarty, 2005). Elaine Moriarty argues that we can move beyond dichotomous relations such as self and Other by "taking account of the power of discourse while articulating the role of actors in relation to it" (Moriarty, 2005: 5). We need to theorise the relationship between language and social context that focuses on practices in which tacitly repeated actions or habits that 'condition' or 'dispose' actors to draw from 'stocks of knowledge' (Moriarty, 2005: 4-5).

I illustrated this using the example of an Irish taxi driver who could not understand how the NTA APP would not vindicate racialised thinking. This, I argue, demonstrates how Irish taxi drivers and customers struggle to accept alternative narratives because they do not align with the motif of ´security´ that directly appeals to the regimes of representation of the African Other. While the Irish driver seeks ontological security though the NTA App, it also suggests the possibility to contest the common stocks of knowledge that led to his behaviour. Moriarty says that these stocks of knowledge:

> …enable people's practices as a matter of routine, without either explicit reason or intention, to be sensible or reasonable, serving to reinforce familiarity and a sense of belonging for those with common stocks of knowledge. (Ibid)

Although these stocks of knowledge provide security, a dialectical approach to identity formation – identity as both fixed and as a process – sees social subjects as capable of

reshaping practices (Moriarty, 2005: 4-5). Moriarty's argument, therefore, states that concentrating on social action and actual lived realities in the performance of meaning making, "suggests that the meaning of discourse derives from accumulated and dynamic social use" (Moriarty, 2005: 5). The Irish taxi driver was faced with the contradictions between the ´common stock of knowledge´ regarding Nigerian taxi drivers and an alternative ´knowledge´ he was unwilling or unable to accept. 'Common-sense' prevailed, and he sought ontological security in the familiar by preserving the hegemonic stock of knowledge that underpins the identity of the non-White Other. However, as the meaning of discourse derives from accumulated and dynamic social use, this suggests possibilities for new meaning making discussed in the following chapter.

A Gramscian conceptualisation also offers insight into the 'bind' for Nigerian taxi drivers who also experience 'contradictory consciousness' and the tensions between 'common-sense' and 'good-sense'. This is also explored in the following chapter where I focus on the theme of 'attitudes to work and individual agency'. Here I examine the significance of Pentecostal and family values, as they seek their own 'ontological security' (Giddens, 1991) in the face of hostile workplace and the wider issue of integrating into the Irish family.

Chapter Seven: Integration from Below

Introduction

In the previous chapters I have examined the various spatial sites in which Nigerian taxi drivers are excluded from the 'Irish family'. In chapter five I outlined the bureaucratic struggles they encounter to obtain residency status and, regardless of naturalisation, the ways in which they continue to be excluded from majority space. In chapter six I examined how the 'moral panic' was subjectively experienced and documented the new forms of exclusion facilitated by new technologies in both the private sector and implemented through government intervention. I theorised this under the concept of 'everyday racism' and neoliberal governmentality to argue that there is a tacit 'minoritisation agreement' between institutions, structures, and individuals. In this chapter I explore the theme of Nigerians attitude to work and individual agency and examine the 'tactics' they deploy to manage regulation, racism, racialised representation, and integration.

I have also argued that Nigerian taxi drivers' self-definitions are overwritten by hegemonic discourses on 'good diversity' and integration. In this chapter I contextualise Nigerians' response to these discourses whereby they are now expected to 'integrate from below'. I examine the ways respondents reproduce these discourses as a tactic to challenge the 'uncivilised' narrative and become accepted into the 'Irish family'. Here I outline how the neoliberal rationalities that inform anti-Nigerian discourses are the same rationalities that inform respondents attitude to work and individual agency. However, Pentecostalism was also found to be a central means through which many respondents understand and interact with the world. This is reflected in their working practises and how they communicate with other taxi drivers, their customers, and representatives of the State such as Gardai. While not everyone interviewed directly referenced their religious faith, the principles and working practises they described echoed those who vocalised the importance of Pentecostalism to make sense of, and manage, the material conditions of their lives.

In section one I discuss the influence of Pentecostalism in respondents' interactions with Irish taxi drivers and customers. Here I examine the similarities to neoliberal values as well as marking the distinctions. In section two I discuss the emotional toll of racism as well as the ways in which respondents challenge the negative stereotypes and discourses. Here, I examine the bind of strategic essentialism for participants that, I argue, help explain the reasons for racism-denial. In section three I outline

respondents underlying values, related to a strong work ethic and refusal of social welfare, that disrupt the existing narratives that depict them as the 'foreigners that we feed'. In section four I outline both their existing compatibility and their cultural adeptness to 'Irish norms' and 'etiquettes' that exist within the Dublin taxi industry. Here I discuss the support wider society offer respondents as well as the signs of solidarity that are emerging in response to their efforts to integrate in a 'friendly manner'. In section five I outline the importance of family values, education, and community values to help explain respondents attitude to work and individual agency. In section six I illustrate how this approach extends to their response to experiences of extreme racism and their overall resolve to meet the challenges of a hostile working environment. I conclude the chapter by outlining their motivation to continue their work – financial, cultural, and spiritual – predicated on the idea that they are pioneers for the next generation.

1. Neoliberal Pentecostalism

In this section I illustrate the various ways respondents' attitudes and working practices are compatible to Irish norms and neoliberal values. Pentecostalism emerged as a central component in respondents approach to integration. As discussed in chapter two and three, Pentecostalism contains similar values to neoliberalism in terms of self-reliance and taking responsibility for one's material conditions. However, there are distinctions to be made as respondents don't view themselves as atomised units in an abstract economy. While they describe the importance of self-reliance, they also emphasised their responsibility to the wider community. I therefore illustrate the ways Pentecostalism influences their working practises, interactions with other individuals, and how they manage hostile encounters. I begin by describing how Pentecostalism relates to their attitude to work and individual agency before outlining the responsibility they feel to the wider community, the Irish family, in which they seek to be valuable and valued members.

Pentecostal Attitudes to Work and Interpersonal Relations

Frederick, a Nigerian taxi driver (50's), is a pastor with a small congregation. He emphasised how his religious faith influences his working practices and his everyday interactions with customers and other taxi drivers:

> **Frederick:** You start from your heart. You just have to think positively. Don't take every information, every word people call you, you know. I put it this way,

178

if you are behind me and you blowing the horn, I don't even look at you because that will annoy me. And then you cross here, and you are trying to raise your [middle] finger, I don't look at you. (Interview 2017)

Frederick said that actively engaging with such antagonism only 'draws attention'. He says these individuals "want me to repeat the same but two wrongs don't make a right". Instead, he says his attitude is to simply focus on himself and that the way to improve these issues is 'to improve yourself first'. He says that while this requires self-discipline, he and other Nigerian drivers need to contextualise these experiences against the fact that 'you are in a foreign land':

> **Frederick**: No matter what happens you are a foreigner… You must accept this fact, [you are] not like Irish born here, there is always that gap… I think the best way to improve is to admit who you are , try to make sure you don't cause trouble with anybody, like exchanging words with people… just be calm, pray for them, they are ignorant, most of them don't know what they are doing.

Frederick argues that if they if they were not ignorant, they would not be trying to incite hostility. He also explained the reasons these people 'don't like you' is because they think 'we are unqualified' and 'are taking our jobs'. However, he argued that before Nigerians came into the industry there were 'people lying in the queue for many hours waiting for a taxi':

> **Frederick**: If I am not qualified then I shouldn't be here, you know. I'm qualified. I am intitled. I went for the test, and I qualified, and I became a taxi driver. I don't think there is anything wrong with that.

Frederick referenced this 'right to be here' in relation to the stereotypes around street knowledge and expectations of 'taking the long way'. On this he provided an example of a dispute with a passenger about the best direction that should be taken.

> **Frederick:** I told the lady that this direction is a longer way because there will be traffic: "If we go this way it will be better but it's your choice". She said "no, go this way". I said, "no problem". I when we go the traffic was huge and she asked me to turn around. I said, "no, I can't turn because it is a one-way road. I said beforehand, there is nothing we can do, so we are stuck in the traffic".

He explained that while the fare is normally about 8.50 Euros the meter was at 16.00 Euros due to the traffic delays. He said that when she realised it would be much more expensive she asked him to stop the meter which he refused. This is a typical experience for any taxi driver and it is at their discretion to either offer a discount or to assert their legal right to charge the fare as displayed on the meter. In this incident the latter can be justified due to the fact that offering the cheaper price for the route she insisted upon would have a negative economic impact for Frederick. Had his advice

on the more salient route not been rejected he would have been available for other fares in a shorter space of time. While this incident would resonate with every taxi driver, Fredericks response may not be typical of how many other drivers deal with such tensions.

> **Frederick:** In the end she was a bit bitchy. But I don't mind her and when we get there, I still bless her. Because I always say "God bless you. Have a blessed day". I always say, 'blessed day', because when you are blessed, your day will be lovely, everything will be.

Frederick said that she was expecting confrontation, something other than being blessed, and that it turned into a very positive experience for both of them. He said that she walked off, paused, and then quickly returned to him and said, "Oh, I'm very sorry". Frederick said that her reaction was 'so powerful' and indicated to him that he is on the 'right path':

> **Frederick:** She was 'wow'. She wanted to tip and gave me 3 Euros. And I spoke my little Irish. I said "go raibh maith agat" [thank you]. Laughter you know. And most time when they are going I use my small Irish, 'Conas ta tu' [how are you] and 'slan go foill' [goodbye]. One or two bits.

Overall Pentecostal faith determined much of how Frederick and others navigate a hostile working environment. This also extends to how they have managed the general issues discussed in the previous chapters: "They open the cab, and they look in and they say, "oh Jesus", and they close the door. And then I laugh". This approach is also applied to the new forms of discrimination experience by new technologies. Frederick said that although Nigerians have the option not to provide their photograph on Hailo they can still discriminate based on their names:

> **Frederick**: Yes, 'funny names' I call it. But I laugh at it. So, you have issues with the funny names?... That is the problem with the Hailo, they cannot discriminate fully, but they could look, and this and that.

Later in the chapter I discuss how some respondents have argued that these new technologies could help to change the negative stereotypes and positively influence the current narratives. I also discuss the signs of solidarity emerging. On both these elements Frederick said that Hailo should provide the option to rate each driver. He said this would be beneficial to him because "I am always efficient":

> **Frederick**: If I want to cancel the job for any reason, I ring you. Sometimes people are not happy even if I ring them and I say, "sorry, I can't make it because there is huge traffic… you can wait, or you can cancel it, or maybe I can cancel it, and you can Hailo someone who is closer". Some of them say, "no problem, I am waiting for you". So, I try to being a preacher man. I try to

do my best not to hurt you… And some people say, "Frederick, I am waiting for you, I am not in a rush". And when I come, I still apologise, "I'm very sorry for the delay". Even though they pay with the card they still give you two Euro tip or whatever, "oh, you are a good man, you are very good. People always say you are a good man"… I have that in my card, "it is good to be good". No matter what, you know, it is good to be good.

Frederick's approach to work was echoed throughout the interviews with many others describing similar approaches to their working practices and interaction with customers and other taxi drivers. As I discuss in a later section, several respondents illustrated their ability to manage particularly hostile encounters or threats of violence. Frederick described a particularly threating situation in which his faith, and how it has shaped how he interacts with other people, helped him diffuse the tension. In this incident Frederick said that a passenger calmly 'showed' him a gun as a 'deterrence' not to 'rip him off'. He said that he understood the act was related to this stereotype and that, while it was unsettling, he did not feel his life was under threat and that the man softened as they began chatting. He described other incidents in which he felt much more threatened and had to 'run for his life'. However, his spiritual outlook shapes how he navigates these and other types of hostile encounters.

> **Frederick**: Most times when this happen the next fare that I will pick will be very good… It happened twice when… I pick up the fare, a very good fare, and at the end I get a very good tip from nowhere. This guy says. "you are a very good guy, I'm going to give you ten euros". And the next guy give my five euros… And I said 'Oh my, God is alive, you know?'. (Interview 2017)

"I am you're Keeper, you are also my Keeper"

Frederick continually referenced that he is a pastor and that it is his duty to spread the gospel not just at Sunday service but in his everyday interactions with other people. James, a Nigerian taxi driver (40's), is also a pastor in his local church in Cork and also spoke about how his faith influences his interactions with the wider society and how he handles hostile encounters.

> **James:** If people, or human being have not able to reason and get it straight that you are my fellow human being, then I care for you. I am your keeper, you are also my keeper. That's not always going to be, it's not always going to work. (Interview 2017)

James says that he does not internalise the negativity because "I put my trust in God, not in man, so whatever comes today or tomorrow I am going to have victory". This, he says, is part of the reason why he is happy driving a taxi:

James: I talk to a lot of people about Jesus in my car… it's kind of a gateway. So, I am happy doing the job and [when] the chance come I tell them about the Kingdom of God, I am happy at the moment."

I asked him what sort of response he gets from customers and he said that they are usually very positive:

James: Some of them open up. They telling you their problem… telling you 'oh, I'm having this kind of sickness' because I have mentioned about God. Sometimes… [we talk about] Marymount, it's a hospital, a place where they cannot help you anymore [Marymount is also a hospice]. They say, 'if you go in there with your front, you come out on your back'. That is what they say [laughing]… I am enjoying it because I am speaking for God and it is easy to get people to the service. I have a chance to get people to the service and they can come.

For James, his evangelical work is therefore not only for the African and Nigerian community. I discuss the theme of racism-denial in the next section, but James had no issue naming racism: "We call a spade a spade. It's racism for me, that's the way I see it because they don't do it to Irish drivers, they only do it to the coloured drivers, how are you going to call it then? For me I don't [know] what else you would call it? That's what I call it, that's it." However, he emphasises that missionary work does not see 'colour' and that most people he talks to focus on the message and not his skin. He said, "it is Irish people I pastor" and paraphrased a quote in the Bible: "a prophet is not known in his own town… So, I am colourblind, by a different colour, they didn't see the colour, they saw what is in me. So that's it, that's the thing".

Frederick also takes this approach and, like James, says "I preach the gospel and I believe in the gospel of Jesus Christ, the Truth. So, I tell you the truth and nothing but the truth":

Frederick: I am an evangelist, I'm a preacher. We have a ministry where I evangelise the work of God, and everyone that comes into my taxi I always share the word of God, one way or the other. I don't use negative words… my words are always positive words... When I see two drunk guys, I try to discourage them, "you know you are destroying yourself and if you can cut back a little bit it will help you in future"

On one such occasion a customer replied, "are you supposed to be a philosopher?" Frederick said that he was not but that, "maybe God brought me here to see you, to talk to you". Several other participants, while not pastors, also referenced that their Pentecostal faith influenced their attitude to work and interactions with wider society.

2. "We're not Victims" and Racism-denial

The 'art of listening' requires more than simply giving voice to migrant lives. As Elena Moreo argued, it needs to be accompanied by a sustained theoretical critique of the conditions which create marginal/central standpoints and produce invisibility or distorted visibility (Moreo, 2012: 80). Although most Nigerians interviewed conveyed themselves as strong, proud, and resourceful, and continually refer to their resistance to adversity and robust work ethic, some also expressed the 'depression', 'hurt' and 'pain' they experienced from racial exclusion. In this section I provide accounts of those who vocalised this before detailing their overt rejection of a victim narrative by almost all participants. I then address the theme of racism-denial and argue that this is tied to their neoliberal and Pentecostal values of self-reliance. I argue that calling out racism is seen as counterproductive, and that racism-denial is a tactic to avoid further scrutiny under the White gaze.

The Emotional Toll of Racism and Rejecting the Victim Narrative

Respondents' vigorously reject a victim narrative, and to focus too deeply on the emotional toll of racism would undermine this tactic toward integration. Nonetheless, the psychological and emotional effects of racism are part of Nigerian lived experience. Bayo said that his exclusion from the cab company, as discussed in chapter six, had a significant effect on his sense of wellbeing. He explained that the first person he spoke to at the cab company was hesitant and 'less direct' in the language used, but that a second person explicitly stated that 'we don't take foreign drivers´. Bayo reasoned that the overt reference to 'race' was because he "might turn up again to see if circumstances have changed". As well as emotional wellbeing, this incident of racial exclusion impacted future decisions on where he might work:

> **Bayo:** In that depression that I got from the man to not let me go [work]. Even to this cab office in my area here [another Dublin suburb]. I don't even feel like going there because I have the, eh, feeling that they might say something similar to me. But it might happen that they might not, but because of what happened to me, what happened to other people… So, we don't feel like going there.

Bayo's experience reflects the literature on the damaging psychological effects of racism. Maguire and Murphy´s research outlined how a great many African taxi drivers they interacted with reflected on the ways in which racism reached into their 'sense of being' and quoted a Nigerian taxi driver who exemplified this:

We are all human beings. I donate blood, my blood is not black. We cannot ask God: 'Make me white, or make me black?' So we are the same thing, we eat the same, we talk the same, we breathe the same, we have the same eyes. So I don't know why they are saying, 'Fucking Ni**er'. And I hate that statement! I hate it! People say, 'Ni**er'. They say, 'Oh no, that is a Ni**er taxi. I am not going with Ni**ers'. Sometimes, because when I am mad, I roar out, 'You are a prick'. (as quoted in Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 292)

Throughout the interviews in this research it became clear that racism effected each participant at some level. However, it is important to avoid the idea of minorities as ´victims´ as it is a potentially reductive category that can obscure people´s agency, experience, and opinions (Lentin and Titley, 2011: 64). Bayo's experience is an example of how racism can be felt on an emotional level. It also points to his agency whereby he uses these experiences to avoid potentially racialised spaces. Bayo was not seeking sympathy, but simply offered an honest reflection on the emotional effects of racial exclusion and how it informs working practices: "So, everybody just keep their barrier. This is my barrier, this is my barrier, this is my barrier… I feel like not to go somewhere where I am going to feel bad… that is why we don't go".

Bayo also noted that cab companies are only responding to the demands of their customers and their right to choose the service they want. Several other respondents presented a clear understanding of these tensions and identified the contradictions within neoliberalism. For those who named racism I asked whether they ever challenged it directly and the vast majority said that it did not serve any purpose. Brian, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 40s), identified the neoliberal rationalities behind how 'race' and racism is talked about and practiced in the industry:

> **Brian:** I was in the queue up in the rank… and my car was in the front. Somehow, they [customers] said they were not going to get into my taxi. So, I came out and I said, "I am first". They said, "oh yeah, we know you are first, but we hate *Black* Mercedes Benz". So, I said, "Oh, ok", and I went back and sat in my car. So, you can´t do anything about it yeah. They say, "We hate *Black* Mercedes Benz". So, fair enough. So, it´s difficult to fight it. (Interview 2015)

Brian said that the reason he doesn't challenge racism is because "Irish people are one of the most educated people in the world… even if it is plumbing you have to be certified for it":

> **Brian:** …if you see a well-educated person on the street [refusing to take a Black taxi driver] how do you challenge them? Like, what are you going to say? The Regulator [Kathleen Doyle] said something like you have the right to make a choice, the customer has the right to make a choice on who they want to travel with right. And so, because of that, if you have the right of who you want

to follow then there is no way I can challenge it. The only way I can challenge it is if I can prove it that there is a taxi driver in front of me and he is black and he has done nothing and people go and just came in and start saying, "Go back to your country," and start punching him. I may be able to start to do something, you understand? I may be able to say, "Oh leave him alone," or bring my camera out and video them and put it on YouTube or something like that. But if somebody says he is not going to go with me, you know. The choice is the person´s right. I don´t have any say or anything. If I say I want to do something, then I´m going beyond my balance then.

Brian illustrates a common theme in which respondents try to maintain a sense of equilibrium, a 'balance', required if they are to integrate successfully. He also indicates his awareness of neoliberal rationalities that justify racist practises by protecting the ´fundamental´ right to choose the service one wants. Brian's account also alludes to the lack of trust in Gardai and instead identifies new technologies as a more reliable means of protection. The priority for these participants is not judicial recourse, but to disrupt the post-race narrative, their misrepresentation, and for wider society to recognise and call out racism on their behalf. An incident in April 2019 illustrated the effectiveness of new media to bring this to the attention of wider society. A video of a violent racist attack on a Black taxi driver in Dublin went viral on YouTube and subsequently garnered mainstream media attention, public condemnation, and an appropriate response from Gardai (McGreevy, 2019).

As discussed, Nigerians' recourse to new technologies is a response to how racism operates in 'post-racial' Ireland whereby new racisms are better disguised. The story relayed by Brian was a clear demonstration of this and the thinly veiled, "We don't like *Black* Mercedes," highlights the underlying racism. The customer directly pointed to both the racism and its disguise illustrating how new racisms, cloaked in post-race euphemisms around culture, are defended through neoliberal rationalities. To challenge the sanctity of ´the customers right to choose the service they want´ is outside 'acceptable' discourse and, as Brian says, going beyond his 'balance'. Neoliberal ideology therefore constrains the ability to directly challenge these 'new racisms' and Nigerian taxi drivers are forced to seek alternative tactics.

Many others also described their anger and frustration at these types of racialised exclusion. However, their accounts of racism inevitably incur distortion because their voices are enmeshed in hegemonic discourses. The reproduction of these discourses contains elements of contradictory consciousness that involve both 'common-sense' and 'good-sense' (Gramsci, 1970). Their rejection of victimhood is both a reflection of their sense of self and as a tactic toward smoother integration. Calling out and

reporting racism risks feeding into a victim narrative and is a central element of the 'bind' in which 'successful' integration reproduces 'race' and minority space.

Racism-Denial

I argue racism-denial is a 'tactic' to manage working in a hostile work environment and that calling out racism is unhelpful because it draws further attention from the White gaze. Respondents also managed to dismiss certain acts of racism as individual ignorance because it is not coming from a position of power. However, respondents had little hesitation naming experiences of institutional racism as it points its systemic nature:

> **Azubuike:** The only concern that I want is that the government, the police, everybody should help… The thing that you can´t face so much is when the system is failing you. That is the hurtful part… that the system is failing you, really, it is very hard.

The vast majority of participants therefore refused to call out individual acts of racism as 'racism'. I argue this illustrates the pervasiveness of neoliberalism which has become incorporated into the common-sense way we interpret, live in, and understand the world (Harvey, 2005: 3). James Carr says that race-blindness has neoliberal rationalities at its core that "direct the attitude of government and ´conduct of conduct´ of neoliberal individuals" (Carr, 2016: 9). As such, neoliberal discourse constrains what can and cannot be said with post-race assumptions placing discussions of racism outside acceptable and reasonable discourse. The power of this colour-blind discourse extends to the racialised and influences the language they deploy to describe racism. It is in this context, contesting common-sense neoliberal 'wisdoms', such as 'the colour of a man is never consulted in the making of a bargain', is dismissed as irrational. Nigerian taxi drivers therefore explain their racialisation within these accepted neoliberal rationalities and replace 'racism' with less confrontational language. Many respondents thus deployed euphemisms, such as 'tribalism' or 'economic bullying', they deemed better suited to align with the post-race narrative.

On this point Nathan, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 50s), said that the language used is very important if we are to enter into 'authentic dialogue' through which we genuinely listen to each other's point of view, engage with each other, learn lessons, and move forward in a positive, integrational way. While the language I use in this dissertation directly names racism where it appears, Nathan provides an example of the ways in which respondents avoid doing this:

> **Nathan:** That´s the thing I mostly use. The word ignorance, not even racism. Some people are doing it and not knowing the reason why they are doing it. They discriminate without having a reason, or maybe you see another person did it so it´s good to do it. So, it´s ignorance and what they need is education, proper education, and how to socialise with people. Look, you don't expect someone who has never left his village to live in another place, to behave well when he sees another person who is not from that village. But someone who has travelled far and wide – even in the workplace who has worked with different nationalities – and you see that people are the same irrespective of where you come from and the colour of your skin. (Interview 2018)

Abuzo, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 30s), also refused to name racism and said that ´bullying´ is a more appropriate term. He warned that we need to be careful with the language used to define racism and emphasised the need to recognise the inherent confusion in racialised thinking: "Whether you call it racism, you call it bullying… you know, people are just confused" (Interview 2017). Abuzo highlighted the inherent risk of naming racism which, he said, can be construed as 'pulling the race card'. He argued that naming racism is unhelpful and obscures the underlying issues that need resolving:

> **Abuzo:** I know why people always think these things are racist. It´s just the language you see, the language is always the problem. So, when somebody use language instead of the simple language you can use, friendly language… So, when you are using inappropriate language [such as] ´you are racist´… you have lost the thing you are trying to explain. So, the thing is the language. Let the people choose the right language that is appropriate for what they try to explain [or] you have lost it.

Abuzo saw racism as a discourse that creates antagonism and therefore deemed alternative language more productive if the issues of racism are to be resolved. Obey was also reluctant to name racism but for different reasons. In an altercation with Gardai he pointed to the constraints of ´acceptable´ language in racial discourse and his inability to call-out racism despite wanting to do so. I relayed to him an argument made another respondent who pointed out the disparities in Gardai issuing traffic fines to Black drivers compared to Irish taxi-drivers. Obey replied: "Thank God you mentioned it yourself because there are some areas that I want to go that would be like you are playing the racist card". In another interview John claimed that racism was endemic in the industry but also agreed that naming racism was not helpful. He emphasised the importance of understanding the reasons for racism which, he argued, is as a direct result of the material conditions in which they are spoken:

> **John:** The racism we were experiencing in those days [2000-2006 before the oversupply of taxis] are from the drivers, fellow drivers. Like they just, wind down [window] 'oh, [vocalised racist abuse]'. And you know why? Because they are angry about the government policy, not really about the drivers… Imagine someone who bought their licence for €80,000 and somebody came from another country and bought it for €6,000 [actual price €6,500]. The anger, the annoyance, they just want somewhere to express it and so they tend to express it to the fellow drivers. Before we don´t really feel the racism [from] passengers. Maybe because they have no choice number one. Because at that time there was not too many taxis. And again, the second, they don´t really care, you know. They can´t really see the difference. But now every little thing they place the importance of it, every little thing. Because you know it´s me and you [i.e. Us and Them].

This initial period John described was shortly after deregulation in which there was a serious undersupply of taxis to service the high demand on weekends. His account highlighted customers' concern with the difficulties of getting home after a night out whereby racial differences were less relevant. During this period, his experience of racism was predominantly from Irish taxi drivers but as supply began to meet demand his experience of racism included customers. He said people began to discriminate, choosing White drivers over Black drivers, and believed it would continue unless decisive measures were taken by those in authority:

> **John:** Until people get educated and get good awareness. You know this type of mentality that people think the foreigners in the country, you know, they ruin everything. During the time of boom they don´t really care who you are. Even in other industries they don´t really care where you come from. You know, you make your money, I make my money. But this period… when there is a scarcity of resources there is bound to be a competition and when there is competition there is bound to be a segregation… So, what we are passing through is just like a scale of preference. And when it comes into a scale of preferences when there are two ethnic groups are involved then it becomes racism. So that is just the level it gets to, and people won´t really know what they are doing is racist but that is exactly what they are practicing.

Although John names racism and offers valuable insight into the underlying conditions for the racism he experiences, he also presents a ´scapegoat´ theory in which responsibility for racism is placed on the individual. In framing racism this way, John does not fully ´transgress´ government and hegemonic post-race discourses.

Naming Racism: the Bind of Strategic Essentialism

Nonetheless, reproducing 'race' by naming 'race' is a legitimate concern and is reflected in these findings with preference for euphemisms to replace the term

'racism'. This point was also raised by Theo, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 40s), who told me that I am part of the problem by conducting this research. He argued that I was reproducing 'race' and by placing such sharp focus on Nigerians I was thereby impeding their integration. Theo had agreed to meet me on the encouragement of a gatekeeper, but his main motive was to express his disapproval. After a twenty-minute conversation we established a rapport and he agreed that I could record the remaining part of the conversation for the purposes of this research. Nonetheless, he maintained that the best strategy for integration is to stop talking about ´difference´. Mino, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 40') made a similar point when I asked where he was from in Nigeria and he immediately expressed his frustration at society's obsession with this question:

> **Mino:** Whatever about us going back after living here for sixteen years, which isn't going to happen. But what about our children who all they know is here. It would be a serious culture shock to go back so at what point are people just going to accept it? (Interview 2016)

He said that he does not know how people will become less interested in Black individuals' place of birth but that they need to realise 'we are here to stay'. This was echoed by several other respondents such as Chinua, (mid 40s), who said: "once people realise we´re not going to go back perhaps we can move forward". Respondents had mixed views about the best approach to deal with this issue that suggested to me the existence of an internal debate within the Nigerian community. It also raises an important point around the ease at which I, a White academic, can name racism without consequence, whereas for Nigerians it is an unhelpful discourse with very real consequences.

Racism was explained by some as a natural response to the competition from foreigners. Many elected to 'avoid trouble' and explained racism as an understandable consequence of 'diversity' in a badly managed and overcompetitive industry. Others saw racism as collateral in a competitive environment in which one group will understandably utilise 'difference' to gain economic advantage. While this argument may account for the racism experienced from Irish taxi drivers, it fails to explain the discrimination practised by customers. As argued, this can be explained under neoliberal rationalities, that 'justify' the customers' right to choose, but which draw on racialised representation of the non-White Other. In terms of Nigerian response, I argue racism-denial, for the most part, is a tactic to try to manage racialisation in a 'post-race' neoliberal taxi industry.

3. Visibility/Invisibility: Challenging Stereotypes

Nigerian taxi drivers are thus caught in hegemonic discourses on integration and struggle to be recognised as 'good diversity'. This ambiguous status vis-à-vis the dominant discourses goes hand-in-hand, as discussed in chapter six, with "techniques of supervision exemplified by state technologies of surveillance" (Maguire and Titley, 2010: 5). Although Nigerians are acutely aware of the discourses, they work to disrupt the negative stereotypes in a non-confrontational way. They therefore take a pragmatic approach and manage racism in a 'friendly manner' that includes a refusal to 'throw mud back'. In this section I incorporate Bhabha's concept of 'mimicry' and Fanon's concept of 'visibility' to explain why respondents modify certain characteristics to 'adopt, adapt, adept' (Bhabha, 2004) in which they hide certain elements that 'repel' as a tactic to challenge the dominant narratives and misrecognition. Here I outline the various ways they challenge the existing narratives to provide evidence that they are not a threat by conforming to Irish norms and hegemonic discourses.

Tere, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 50s), provides an example of this general approach to integration:

> **Tere:** You see, we don´t want to say these things [naming racism] because it will look like we are trying to counter back what people are doing to us by fighting back, you know. People are saying 'we are bad, we are bad'. If we keep saying 'they are bad as well' we only look like we are trying to fight back. (Interview 2016)

This tactic is designed to avoid perpetuating the existing hostility and to avoid the negative publicity that 'fighting back' is likely to engender. Peter, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 40s), noted that this is a common tactic amongst Nigerians who do not want to 'talk ill of others' as it will compound the problem and, ultimately 'will reflect bad on us' (Interview 2015). This points to their condition as one of one of 'visibility/invisibility' (Fanon, 1967). Invisibility happens when one does not see people because one 'knows' them through some fabricated preconception of group formation (Goldberg, 1997: 180). Invisibility is enabled by forms of interpellation whereby the subjectivity of the Other is erased by our own preconceptions about them (Moreo, 2012: 79). Moreo, quoting Fanon, says:

> Othering produces specific forms of invisibility or distorted visibility whereby the other person is only embodied though representational repertoires out of her control, rather than attaining visibility through an act of self-determination (Fanon, 1967: 109).

190

For Nigerians, invisibility also means the 'holding from view' alternative narratives as they focus on promoting their neoliberal and ´Irish values´. Ultimately, their confinement in minority space is based upon 'race' and is produced by social, cultural, and political invisibility. These forms of invisibility mean any challenge to the existing stereotypes are constrained by the hegemonic discourses. Nigerians therefore aim to disrupt the discourses of 'incompatibility' by reproducing those hegemonic discourses and must find other means to change the narrative.

Not the 'Foreigners that you Feed'

Respondents reject the narratives that depict them as ´scheming´ and seeking to take advantage of Ireland´s ´generous´ welfare system. This point was illustrated by Christie:

> **Christie:** I had a passenger at one certain time, he was telling me, I think that guy he was from Poland. He said that he heard that the Nigerian drivers are also on social welfare (laughter). So, I asked him, "do you listen to radio shows?" And he said, "yeah". And I said, "that is the reason why. I am driving a taxi. I am paying my taxes. So whatever thing you hear… it is not like that". There are people on social welfare, there are people working. They are two different people. Ask me where any tax office is, that is where I will show you. I don't know where any social welfare offices are. I never received social welfare in my life, in my country, all the places I visited before coming here. I believe in working my way out. Wherever I go I look for job, I get job, I work, I make money, I contribute to the state. That is what I know in my life, I never received social welfare before, I don't believe in that.

'I am a good worker' is a classic response of racialised migrants in a society which scrutinises their economic value. It is also interesting that a Polish immigrant, a demographic that has also been racialised in Irish society, is aware of this racialised discourse (Haynes, Devereux, and Breen, 2009). The perception that a disproportionate number of Nigerians are on social welfare is regularly cited in mainstream discourse (Lally, 2006). However, the findings here show that Nigerians are extremely reluctant to 'take handouts' and, aligning with literature, many of those who are receiving benefit are the result of racialised exclusion in the workplace (Joseph, 2018b). Several respondents detailed workplace racism before entering the taxi industry in which they were severely disadvantaged against their White/Irish counterparts. John, for example, was told 'off-the-record' in a job interview that although his CV and qualifications were very impressive, the company had a de facto policy of privileging Irish candidates. He described the pain and frustration of investing in his future through education only to be met with such overt exclusion:

John: For about two years I have over twenty-six applications, did over ten interviews. So, what´s my fate? So that´s when I notice this pain. It is painful, and it is a big discouragement on my own side. So, I have invested in education, I have tried.

Christie also relayed similar experiences in accessing the labour market and said that despite looking for a job for almost three years, he never received a reply to any of his applications:

Christie: I don't know where the application were going. It was like it was falling into the deep ocean. No reply was coming from anybody, you understand me? If I didn't have driving skill what would I do? I have to survive. I would go queue in the social welfare. At least hand me the money and let me just use it to feed… I don´t believe that any Nigerian comes here just for the purpose of social welfare. Anyone that is on social welfare is because of the circumstance that the government put them because they need to survive. Every Nigerian is hardworking.

Christie says that Nigerians are 'ambitious', 'always want to improve', and that competition is ingrained into their mentality:

Christie: Competition is inborn, it drives from the day we are born. Competition has already been part of you because of the society… Different tribes, with everybody surviving, you know, to get for himself or his tribe. So, we find out that the competition is there. So, when we come here it is the same way, work your way out. Back home nobody gives you anything, whatever you have is you make it by yourself. So, anybody is in social welfare is, as I said, the result of not having paper to go out there to look for a job. If they are well integrated, they will look for a job, they will be happy doing it, just as I´m happy doing my own.

Although John and Christie are highly educated, both have found themselves driving taxis as a result of discrimination in other areas of the labour market. The discussion with Christie moved toward Ireland's Direct Provision system in which asylum applicants were not permitted to work. I asked him whether that would constitute, in his opinion, ´institutional racism´. Despite his hesitancy to name racism, he heavily criticised Direct Provision policy that prevents asylum seekers working – subsequently amended with the *Labour Market Access Permission* scheme that includes some bureaucratic caveats (Citizeninformation.ie, 2021). Christie also pointed to the fact that many of those outside Direct Provision – those who have leave to remain, are naturalised citizens, or obtained a work permit by other means – are still unable to find employment and therefore seek social welfare to survive.

Luke, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 50s), also emphasises Nigerians' resourcefulness in a hostile environment in which they will take jobs they are overqualified for:

> **Luke:** I came here in the first place I have to fix my papers which was easy for me because of the way I came in. I came here with a visa, you understand me? So, after fixing my paper I have to start looking for a job. Applied for jobs, putting in applications every day. When somebody is desperate looking for something, so I didn't stop. No answers, no reply, nothing. But I didn't stop there. I continued and continued until a friend of mine advised me since you have your driving licence why don't you come and join me in the taxi industry? Initially, I was very reluctant to because I needed something better, but nothing was coming. When I started getting frustrated, I had to consider what my friend told me. I started to study the maps because I didn't drive in Dublin for one day. And getting the knowledge of Dublin I felt it wasn´t easy but that didn't stop me, I had to. (Interview 2015)

Luke described his desperation of being unable to find employment related to his profession. He said that he accepted that his previous career has suffered irreparable damage. However, his biggest concern was at how close he came to relying on social welfare and said that without his driving licence he would 'have no other choice'. I asked him what his plans are for the future, how long he intends working as a taxi driver, and whether he still has hopes of working in the field in which he is qualified:

> **Luke:** No, I don't have any time limit or whatever. In short, I have chosen to do the job. I don't think I will start to look for any other jobs anymore because most of the experience I´ve got first I feel it will maybe be still the same. So, this one I´m holding it now, just let me just hold it, and I´m ok.

Luke admitted that if his personal circumstances were different, he would leave Ireland to pursue his preferred career elsewhere. He explained that his children are now settled in school, feel part of the Irish community, and that he did not want to jeopardise this sense of security. Other respondents described a Nigerian 'brain-drain' of well-educated Nigerians relocating to the US and UK where, it is claimed, there are more opportunities with less virulent workplace racism.

The Nigerians interviewed therefore take alternative approaches to overcoming racialisation incorporating various tactics to quietly integrate from below. Rather than speaking out against racism, they strategise by working towards changing the narrative through reproducing hegemonic discourses. The silencing constraints of this form of 'invisibility' indicates the precariousness of integrating into a hostile society in which they must navigate the discourses of 'bad diversity' and 'incompatibility'. The ´multicultural crisis´ and corresponding 'moral panic' between 2011-15 exacerbated

the problem of speaking out under these conditions and the attendant risk of being depicted as the ungrateful ´foreigners that we feed´. Alternative strategies are therefore deployed to focus on reproducing the dominant discourses on integration.

4. Compatibility to Irish Norms

The discourses of Nigerian incompatibility are disrupted when examined against the shared Christian value system established by Ireland's historical ties with Nigeria through Irish priests and education programmes. As well as espousing Western values, several respondents referred to Irish priests and teachers as paternal figures during their formative years. They therefore viewed Ireland and the Irish as an extended family and was the 'obvious choice' to build a better life. In this section I outline respondents compatibility to Irish norms as well as their cultural adeptness to manage elements of their identity that cause friction. I examine how everyday racisms are played out in the daily interactions with Irish drivers and customers. Here I discuss the ways in which a predominant trope regarding 'street knowledge' is deployed to justify exclusionary practises. However, as not every experience is racialised, I also document the examples of solidarity participants experience with Irish taxi drivers, customers, immigration officials, and Gardai. I also document their intention to integrate by making friends in wider society and provide examples of signs of solidarity with Irish taxi drivers and customers.

Cultural Adeptness

Paul, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 40s), said that customers often asked him where he is from – a common opening gambit for confrontation – and therefore often replies that he is from a different African country. It is a strategy he employs to position himself in a space where 1) he can better manage potential aggression and 2) he can challenge the stereotypes around Nigerian taxi drivers:

> **Paul:** [Customers] believe them so much [rumours about Nigerians] because everybody is talking about them. And you know the funny part, when I tell somebody, if I pretend that I´m not a Nigerian… and they say, 'oh yeah, I don´t like Nigerians'. And I say, 'oh wow, why do you not like them?' [they say] 'I just don´t like them, they eh, scammers…'. (Interview 2017)

This example demonstrates how Paul tried to influence the discourse from the outside, pretending to be from another African country. Nigerian's exclusion from the discourse

194

became a dominant theme throughout the interviews, with many respondents lamenting their exclusion from the space of representation. As a result, Nigerians attempt to mark out micro spaces to try to affect the discourse. Femi, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 30s), suggested that this requires good interpersonal skills and that humour is an effective tool:

> **Femi:** They will say 'where are you come from?' My first answer is that I will say to them that, "I am Black Irish". That's what I used to tell them. They say, "ok, you are Black Irish, who are you, where are your parents come from?" And I used to joke that my dad is from Kerry and mum from Kildare [laugher]. But they don't accept, and I say, "I was born in Dublin, so I'm a Dub". And then they say, "well if you're a Dub you don't have the accent at all"… Some people take it serious [laughter]. (Interview 2017)

Femi's use of humour reflects his cultural adeptness to diffuse potential racialised hostility and find a common ground to connect with customers. The importance of cultural adeptness is a dominant theme throughout the interviews and most Nigerians said that they modify traits deemed 'too African'. Most respondents therefore work very hard to mitigate their 'African-ness', adept through 'mimicry' of Irish cultural norms (Bhabha, 1994a). Several respondents said that they lower their voices in conversation with Irish people because it is often confused with aggression. Tony, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 50's), said "sometimes the way we speak gets [us] into trouble" and others described how they modify their accent and body language, avoid playing African music, wear 'European' clothes while working, and some are conscious not to display religious iconography that advertises their Pentecostal faith.

However, there were also those who argued against having to align with Irish norms in this way and presented arguments that align with intercultural approaches to integration. Taahir, Nigerian taxi driver (late 50s), pointed to the unfairness of assimilating into Irish norms and voiced his frustration at being forced to change certain cultural attributes to be accepted (Interview 2017). Sean also argued that integration is a two-way street and pointed to the responsibility of the host culture to also adapt. He recounted a particularly hostile encounter with a Garda who had to told him to lower his voice. In this incident, Sean argued that Gardai, as representatives of the State, should have the training, the awareness, and the interpersonal skills to recognise difference and adapt accordingly. Nonetheless, both Femi and Sean said that they generally adapt to Irish 'norms' to 'avoid trouble' or 'misunderstanding'. I asked whether they were talking to me in their normal voice and both admitted that it was modified. Sean said that his voice is "a little bit high [louder] to a normal [Irish] voice…

if I´m talking with a Nigerian man it would be higher than this". John, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 30s), said that Nigerians are 'expressive' but is often misinterpreted as 'anger':

> **John:** By the time you listen to my intonation on this you will see the difference. Someone will say 'oh, you are angry with that guy', you know. But this is the way we are brought up. But we tend to learn. It was when I went to college here that I became [began] to lower my voice you know. There has to be body language. So, I began to adapt to body languages and all these things. (Interview 2016)

Some respondents described the unfairness of pandering to some people's delicate sensibilities by hiding otherwise innocuous parts of themselves from public view. However, some refused outright to hide elements deemed 'too African', arguing that they should be judged against the standards of service they provide. Overall, most practiced cultural adeptness to avoid misunderstanding and potential confrontation.

Street-Knowledge and Everyday Interactions

The most pervasive reason given for taking local/White taxi driver is that immigrant/Black taxi drivers 'don't know where they are going'. However, throughout the interviews it became clear that Nigerians actual 'street knowledge' is in stark contrast to this popular trope. As mentioned, much of participants behaviour is in response to the negative stereotypes and I examined some of the ways respondents try to affect the discourses. This is connected to the theme of 'attitudes to work and individual agency' and, according to several participants, are having a positive effect with signs of solidarity emerging with Irish taxi drivers and customers.

Using 'local' taxi drivers is rationalised as the neoliberal right to choose the service one deems to be of most value. In the taxi Industry street-knowledge is, understandably, central to the provision of value within this service. Participants said that the argument that they don't know where they are going because they are not born here was particularly frustrating. However, many responded by dismantling the flaws in this trope by providing the best possible service they could. However, they also pointed to the need for customers to be understanding and, as Christie pointed out, "whether you are Irish or a foreigner, it is impossible to know everywhere". Despite this, he said that there exists a disproportionate expectation for him to 'know everywhere' compared to Irish drivers. Xugo described a scenario in which this was played out when he sought clarification between similar sounding street names:

Xugo: The person will open the door and will say to you, "Dawson Street" [in a strong Irish accent]. If I repeat 'Dawson Street'… [they say], "Ah fuck off, you don't know where you are going." Sorry for my language. And I say, "Come on, I don't mean I don't know where that is, but I have to understand you first. Now you pronounce 'Dawson Street' and I can take you to Dorset Street but when I get to Dorset Street you can say, "No, you didn't understand what I said".

Xugo said that if an Irish driver were to seek clarification in this way it would illicit a different response and therefore identified a racialised element. He also argued that difficulty with accents is a specific issue for Nigerians: "somebody from the northside and somebody from the southside, they don't have the same accent. So, all these things are the things coming into your head. I want to understand all the accents". He said that deciphering accents is not an issue for Irish drivers but cannot see why customers make 'such a big deal about it'. Regardless of the fact that accents can also be an issue for Irish drivers operating in a multicultural city, Xugo made the argument that customers should be more understanding:

Xugo: Why can´t you be patient and explain to me? The pronunciation sounds the same… They close the door believing you don't know where you are going but you are trying to explain that the pronunciation are alike, although the spelling is quite different, so it´s up to [customers' to] decide to be patient and understand each other. There is no need to argue about it.

Xugo, like many interviewed, has been driving a taxi for several years and has intimate knowledge of the Dublin city's streets. The fact he was able to recognise and mitigate the potential confusion with two similar sounding street names indicates in-depth knowledge accumulated from his experience as a taxi driver. Paul has also been driving a taxi for many years but says his street knowledge is often challenged. He says that if his knowledge is not questioned in these types of confrontations, it is accusations of 'taking the long way'. The following quote from him highlights the stress that such assertions can cause when accompanied with threats of being reported and the presumption of guilt that often follow:

Paul: This lady is going to Croke Park Conference Centre. You know when you are going to Croke Park, you know. I ask you 'what route do you take'?"

RO'K: Probably Church Street, Dorset Street, I don't know, there's a few ways you could go".

Paul: Yes, that is the route I took. I took Church Street, Dorset Street etc. So, for me to cross it to go to North Circular and that lady started to complain saying, "There is too much traffic, too much, eh, traffic lights". How a passenger could complain about too much traffic lights! All the way stopping

197

the fare is €11. "Too much traffic lights what do you want me to do… too much traffic lights! Do you want me to break the law?"

Paul said the customer had complained that he should have taken an alternative route with less traffic lights, which she claimed would have only cost about 7 Euros. Paul explained to her that both routes are equally good and said: "This is my job. This I do for a living… this is what I do every day and I know it will be almost the same price". Paul said that the customer finally told him to stop short of the destination, asked him for the receipt, and told him that she was going to report him to the NTA. While this type of encounter is experienced by all taxi drivers and causes stress regardless of 'race', the anxiety for Nigerian taxi drivers is heightened due to the inevitable 'presumptions of guilt'. Given my own intimate knowledge of the industry, the story, as relayed by Paul, resonated and I can verify that the two alternative routes he outlined are commonly disputed but cost roughly the same.

Ultimately, the incident outlined that Paul has comprehensive street-knowledge of this area in Dublin and has significant expertise in navigating the most expedient route. 'Race' is a significant factor in the level of anxiety such occasions produce and was a major theme that Nigerians outlined in their lived experience. Christie said that this was part of his daily experience and argued that the prevalence of this theme persisted even though "most people [already] know where they are going in Dublin" and can easily direct drivers with their preferred route. He said that the issue of street-knowledge is the same for everybody, not only foreigners:

> **Christie:** In every town… there is someone who didn't know where they are going, you know. And it was not only the foreigners, it was also from the Irish. When you call a southside Irish taxi driver, he don't know any side in the north. When you call the northern side guy, he don't know anywhere in the south, you know. But we are not bred from Dublin so we know most of the places. And beside when you are in the industry newly, unlikely to know every area very well, so it is left for the person to tell you. For instance, when I started new and I didn't know the place I´d say "I don't know it. If you prefer you can take another taxi or if you know you can direct me… But if the person is a racist he´ll be ranting, "Oh, you are a taxi driver you should know the place". I say, "There is no way I can know every place… there are thousands of millions of streets in Dublin, there is no way"… But they keep ranting, "Oh, he doesn't know where he is going".

Several respondents also gave examples of incidents in which Irish taxi drivers asked them for directions, to which they responded with compassion and understanding. On this point, Drumm, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 40s), called into a radio chat show that

was discussing the 'problem' with 'foreign' taxi drivers not knowing their way around Dublin:

> **Drumm:** I explained on the radio it´s not about we, the black guys, or the foreigners. I could remember I picked a guy one day, he actually left a taxi guy, a White guy. He mentioned the place, and I said, "Yeah I know the place". And he was actually going to, eh, Duke Street, and yerman [the White driver] took him to Ballsbridge… He said, "The taxi driver doesn't know where the Duke Street is". I said, "probably he is working on the northside and he may not know much about the southside". And so he came to me, the taxi driver, and he said, "I´m really sorry but I work on the northside". And I said, "I was just saying that to the guy, it´s just a simple misunderstanding". If you want I will direct you and he said, "No, it´s ok"… I said, "Ok, and I take you to the destination". So, it happens to everybody… I don't need to make noise about it. So, a white taxi driver doesn't know the road! And we know that was the problem most people were facing then. It was not the problem of being from the northside or the southside. What they were explaining to us was that we were not allowed to operate.

Drumm clearly outlined the fallacy in this argument and its underlying aim to discredit Nigerians' ability to provide an adequate service. In this instance Drumm maintained a dignified manner, empathising with the Irish driver, and received a similar response in return. Greg relayed a similar encounter of an occasion in which he knew of an obscure address to the surprise of an Irish taxi driver and customer at a Dublin city rank. Both the driver and customer approached him to ask if he knew a specific street and they expressed astonishment at his level of knowledge. Greg explained that he did not have photographic street-knowledge but that he, coincidently, passed that street daily when walking his child to school. Many others interviewed recognised the racism inherent in this trope and that the 'problem' was not a lack of street knowledge, but ultimately, as Drumm observed, "we were not allowed to operate".

These are some of the more subtle ways in which racism is inflected and is part of the everyday racisms Nigerian taxi drivers face in Dublin. As discussed, the right to choose the service you want is presented as a fundamental neoliberal principle. However, in the context of the Dublin taxi industry, this 'right to choose' is often determined on racialised grounds that relies on Nigerian stereotypes such as being aggressive, sexual predators, and more likely to overcharge. The seemingly innocuous 'lacking street knowledge' stereotype is the most effective means to disguise racism because, as CTA Director Gerry Coughlan argued, "they are too new to our shores to get their act right" (Irish Examiner, 2009a) and, as politician Paschal Mooney said "most foreigners don't know one end of one street from the other" (Bohan and Hyland, 2013).

These attempts to shield itself from accusations of racism relies on the common-sense logic in which 'locals' obviously have better street knowledge. The argument ignores the many facets that combine to create taxi driver 'street knowledge' including the need to pass the official NTA knowledge test, the knowledge built from experience while driving a taxi, and satellite navigation systems. It also fails to consider that in most journeys the customer already knows the route and can direct the taxi driver. Further, many 'Irish' drivers were born outside Dublin and the pre-existing street-knowledge of Dublin-born drivers is also limited in most cases. Dublin is an old city, and unlike younger cities with grid street systems, the intricate street layout makes it difficult to navigate. Knowledge of the thousands of streets and one-ways systems that make up Dublin is always a work in progress for any taxi driver. This is further complicated by continuous improvements to transport infrastructure, such as the LUAS works at that time, that necessarily involved changes to traffic management systems.

"Here to Make Friends" and Signs of Solidarity

However, it is not an industry that is always characterised by immigrant victims and native racists. While there is certainly hostility and the lack of knowledge trope is heavily utilised, the incidents described above also indicate the significant element within Irish society that exhibit warmth and appreciation toward Nigerian taxi drivers. There were also many incidents in which respondents talked of the solidarity with Irish drivers. Tere, a Nigerian taxi driver (late 40s), described integration as a continuing process in which we are 'always learning from each other'. He argued that education is the best way to change the public attitude toward them. He defined education as more than the schooling system and said that we 'learn off each other through our daily interactions' (Interview 2016). He described his contentment when he has inspired a customer with 'a positive feeling' after having gone a particularly expedient route that they had not known before:

> **Tere:** Sometimes they tell me, "Oh, I didn't realise there was a quicker way, fair play to you". So education is happening there… we learn in every environment, in every situation, knowledge is everywhere only if you are interested to know.

Rather than naming racism, Tere aims to educate by example and felt that in these interactions he challenges the street-knowledge trope by working hard to ensure he takes the most expedient route. This approach reemphasises the overarching tactic to subvert the myths and stereotypes by conducting themselves in a 'dignified manner'

to help to facilitate alternative narratives into the hegemonic reality. The example given by Drumm earlier also indicates how this can be put to practice and is indicative of respondents' attitude to work and individual agency. As discussed, most respondents arrived in Ireland already equipped with the expected values of self-reliance and a strong work ethic. However, as Abuzo pointed out, this is written out of the narratives and until 'we move closer and communicate', Nigerians will always be misrepresented:

> **Abuzo:** Most of them stay far. You can't be afar to describe somebody. You couldn't be far to know somebody. If you want to know anybody come closer have a chat with the person and you understand… You are hearing but you are not actually discussing me one on one, not knowing who I am.

Abuzo recognised that mainstream society are 'hearing' the dominant narratives without consulting actual Nigerian drivers. As Laguerre says, a representation of space is offered as a form of rhetoric intended to acknowledge the existence of the Other, evoke a message, convey one´s identity, or reflect one´s view of reality (Laguerre, 1999: 16). As I have argued throughout, the Nigerian taxi driver identity is constructed in racialised terms. Abuzo argued that for this to change requires opening up a space of communication in which the dominant narratives are put to one side:

> **Abuzo:** … we then enjoy the conversation… but the thing is that you don't stay away and start judging people, come close. Most people who talk about Irish tell you that 50% of Irish drivers who talk about Nigerian people never meet them. They can't even say who is a Nigerian. So, it's just like when I put my name here and you seeing my name here on the dash. And when you say, "you are from Nigeria" and am looking at the name and are comfortable to talking about it. You want to know, and I love it. You want us to mix up, you want us to talk. But when you come, "how the fuck do you pronounce this, your name?". It's not friendly. But when you try, my name is so simple. When they want to pronounce my name, they will look at it and pronounce it. And they say, "here, you're from Nigerian". And I say, "well Biafra actually". And they, "Ohhh!" and they're interested, and they want to talk, and they want to discuss. "How did you come to know who is a Nigerian and who isn't?" They say, "I know by the name", which means we are mixing up. So, when I say, "so you're from Connemara" and they say, "how did you know that?" I say, "your accent". "Oh, you must have been here for long". So, we need to mix up, we need to integrate.

Although many talked of the desire to make Irish friends, they also relayed stories which emphasised the difficulty of being 'welcomed in'. Femi estimated that about sixty percent of Irish are 'generally nice' and forty percent are 'not nice'. Of the latter

forty percent, he speculated it was because "they're ignorant, they're not civilised… maybe they have never travelled out of Ireland, maybe they don't travel a lot… they have a small narrow mind… because as somebody would just see you and start calling you names, 'n***er', 'black' etc. All sorts of name which is not nice". Femi's analysis was representative of many other respondents who identified the irony of racial tropes depicting Nigerians as 'uneducated'. Many understood racist attitudes as the result of those 'uneducated', 'narrowminded' Irish who 'had never travelled'.

However, this understanding was often presented alongside an expression of sympathy toward their aggressor. Ibe, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 40s), said "they blame us for making their life harder, it is not us who is to blame, but to think that must be very depressing, so I feel for them" (Interview 2017). Ibe also said that the main contributing factor for their racialised representation is the language used by politicians, the media, and a 'smear campaign' perpetuated by Irish taxi drivers. Ibe reasoned that the only way for Nigerians to change this representation is through a measured and thoughtful approach and to avoid 'mudslinging' or a 'war of words'. Ibe said that he came here 'to make friends' and "the last thing we want to do is respond by throwing mud back because that is not going to make us look good or solve anything."

The literature indicates that Ireland, unlike the US, the UK, and other EU and Anglophone countries, has not been infected with the rise of anti-immigrant and nativist populist sentiment (see Fanning, 2021). In the taxi industry it clear that not everything is defined by racism with examples of solidarity with Nigerian taxi drivers amongst various sectors in society. James, for example, says that only about twenty percent of customers 'don't like to enter our cabs'. He pointed to a growing solidarity which he thinks is due to the interaction enforced by sharing the enclosed environment of a taxi. In relation to taxi drivers, Frederick said some of his Irish taxi driver colleagues 'are very nice' and described examples where they defended him against other Irish drivers: "they would go and say, 'No, you are wrong, this fellow is here' and they deal with it". Frederick said it is mainly the older Irish drivers who have a sense of entitlement and 'kind of own that place':

> **Frederick**: they are not happy seeing us in the business…they stare at you straight away with a very strange look… but I just come in and say "hello" and mind my business. And when people want to come into my taxi, I say "welcome".

However, amongst the younger cohort he said things are improving and he described an incident where an Irish driver made an overt gesture of solidarity towards him.

> **Frederick:** one time there was this fellow, he doesn't talk to me, but he saw an issue and he came down and stood for me. I was 'wow'… this was a good guy. I spoke to my friend, and he said, "yeah Kevin is like that, he will stand up for you". So, most of them are nice when you taking a bad fare [a customers who has a bad reputation]… and they signal to you that they are no good… and there are a few friends [Irish taxi drivers]… will tell you there is something happening here, go over there [a common gesture whereby taxi drivers inform colleagues to locations with multiple fares].

Throughout the interviews it also emerged that there is significant solidarity amongst Nigerian taxi drivers. Although some pointed to an issue of creating African cliques it was not seen as representative. Most respondents said their fellow Nigerian/African colleagues are 'easy-going' and 'look after each other'. Of those who do isolate themselves, James said he does not agree with them: "[it's] like group ganging. They say, 'these people are against us'. I say, 'No, there is nobody against us, it is how you made up your mind'". As discussed, James is a paster in Cork and has been working as a taxi driver for just over a year. He is therefore a well-known figure in the African community:

> **James:** So, when I start driving taxi a lot of them know me. So [if] there is something going on, they call me [to] come there pick up a fare… When I started they come and say, "No, this is the wrong spot, you can't get a fare here"… Again, If I'm picking a bad fare they will tell me, "Get your money before you move, that fellow won't pay you". So, there is [solidarity], not just Nigerians, but other Africans.

In this section I have examined the more subtle ways in which respondents work to integrate at the local and community level. It reveals that the tactics to make friends and create intercultural space are producing positive results. Their attitudes to work, their application of the communitarian aspects of Pentecostalism, and their non-confrontational approach to hostile encounters, has invited Irish drivers to build a sense of comradery as well as build trust with the wider community.

5. The Irish Family: Education and Community Values

Throughout this chapter I have documented Nigerian attitudes to work and individual agency. Pentecostalism has emerged as a central lens through which many respondents conduct themselves in relation to wider society in their attempt to integrate successfully. The importance of family values is contained within this

approach and respondents presented an image of themselves as pioneers for the next generation. However, Pentecostalism advocates a greater responsibility to the wider community in contrast to the inherent individualism within neoliberal ideology. In this section I document how Nigerians help reconcile this contradiction in which their focus on family and education is designed to facilitate better integration into the wider Irish family.

The Irish Family: Irishness vis-à-vis Blackness

Frederick talked about his pride of being Irish and his frustration that this is questioned due to his Blackness. During an exchange with the customer on the best route to take, discussed earlier, he said that the woman told him "this is my country" implying she is better positioned to decide on the most expedient route:

> **Frederick:** I said, 'this is my country too. Just because you were born here. I am Irish by naturalisation, and I am privileged to be Irish. I'm proud to be Irish, so it's our country'. She didn't say anything.

Frederick has two children, 14 and 17, both born in Ireland and have Irish accents. He described his concern about the attention they might get outside the home regarding their skin colour. He tries to instil confidence to mitigate against this and teaches them "to be who they are, to be positive, and don't let anybody let you down, be proud of yourself":

> **Frederick:** I teach my kids to be positive, and make sure that you create or do something positive in this land because it is a lovely land. It's a peaceful land… There is no war going on, you can easily walk around freely… I mean no one is harassing to rob you, it's freer to see them here [than Nigeria]. I teach my kids to be positive and make sure you are the best, I don't care what you want to be in future. If you are a carpenter, be the best carpenter. If you are a painter, be the best painter Ireland has produced… The only way you can stand out regardless of your colour is when you do something positive people will appreciate it. So, when I say, 'I am Irish' to people most time they are looking at me, 'what you mean'? I say, 'what do *you* mean?. [with an Irish accent], that's part of the Irish that I am proud of, you know.

Frederick's approach echoed that of many other respondents. The central focus on family and their children's future is therefore with a view to establishing a platform for the next generation's integration into wider society, into the Irish family.

This echoes the literature that identified first generation migrant parents see their children's education is a priority for their children's integration (Darmody, 2011). This despite migrant parents own experience of discrimination in which high levels of education do not always translate to equality of opportunity in the labour market

(inter alia HEA, 2015, 6; McGinnity, et al. 2021; Ni Chonaill, 2021: 51). Nonetheless, respondents here maintain a focus on education to both combat racialised thinking and to establish a less racialised environment for the next generation.

Education: "The Best Way to Fight Racism"

Several participants described their role in providing guidance for their children to receive the best possible education and secure their place in Ireland's future. Formal education, for both themselves and their children, is therefore seen as extremely important. Tunda, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 50s), emphasised this point:

> **Tunda:** I don't want to just believe that they can slap you [dismiss as incompetent] just because you are a Black guy in a taxi… Being a taxi driver doesn't mean that you are senseless, you don't know anything. Cause some people take it that way. "Oh, that's a taxi driver maybe he doesn't know right from left sometimes". I can be honest with you. If you see most of the Nigerian driving this cab, most of us are graduates. So, most of us were educated. So, all we are looking for is basically, we want future, we want bright future for our kids. We want to be a good example for them, and we want them to contribute to the society where we brought them in, where we born them. We want them to be important, you know. To do things where they get the opportunity from. They have to give back to the system… I didn't say there is no bad parent there [but] there is good parent. And the good one, trust me, all they are doing is to be a good legacy for their kids. (Interview 2017)

While some Nigerians interviewed had little formal education, Tunda's level of education was representative of a significant number of interviewees, many of whom were continuing, or intended to continue, their own education. Regardless of the level of their education, all respondents who were parents pointed to the importance of their children's education. They explained that their job was to work hard, provide the necessary financial stability, and 'buffer' their children from distractions that may 'lead them astray':

> **Tunda:** I always tell my kids I like to further [my education], I like to go college too. I want to. They ask me, "why I want to go?". I say, "I want to go, trust me". I don't want them to criticise me. But you see I'm having it in my plans… So, my daughter[s]… I've seen the way I am pushing the two of you. I am just wanting you to get your feet very well first. I don't want to change your plans, but just your future first, if you get what I mean. I have another two too. One is six and the other is twelve. So, I just want to guide them. I want to guide them to know that this world is a very good place to live if you can keep your best and that you don't give up. You give up easily if you don't see people guiding them.

Tunda advises his children to get their education first before they travel: "do whatever you want, but first get your education". Tunda's eldest daughter has completed her degree while his second eldest daughter is an undergraduate in Trinity College Dublin. He said that she wants to travel and explore the world, but he insists that her education is the priority:

> **Tunda:** That's her plan, when she finished college, she just want to do a Masters… she just needs a little bit of push… Along the line they can be distracted so when you are there to give a little bit of push you know… they know that… So, all that I want for you guys, I just want you to get your education. Get it first, when you get it then you can go and do whatever it is you want to do. You are free to do it.

Leon, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 40s), echoed this outlook and described the potential for any Nigerian child to forge a successful future in Ireland provided they set the educational groundwork. He also outlined his children's individuality, their different dreams and aspirations, but regardless of the field they are interested in he says education is the first step:

> **Leon:** You have what it takes to become whatever you want to become. But it is only you [who] know what it is that you want. What you want is what you want. What someone else wants may not be want you want, you see what I mean? That is the simple thing. But the bottom line is get your education. (Interview 2017)

Informal Education

As discussed, the majority of respondents avoid 'mudslinging', 'fighting back' and engaging in a 'war of words', and instead, rely on 'informal education' whereby they 'lead by example'. In the previous chapter, Tere pointed to the power of informal education in which a customer was impressed with his level of street-knowledge by taking a better route they had not known. Tere said 'education is happening' there and that these types of encounters can engender trust and help change the narratives. This extends to educating wider society that Irishness and Blackness are not mutually exclusive. On this, Frederick described one particular incident that 'stuck in his head' when a customer asked him a particularly absurd question "why am I Black'?" He too thought it strange question:

> **Frederick:** It doesn't make sense. Can you see how ignorant you are? I said, "I am Black because my parents are Black. And why are you White?" You know, it doesn't make sense.

Frederick accepted that some people are simply 'ignorant' but said that most Irish are educated people and 'ask very educated questions'. He said that it does not take long in a conversation to realise the level of education of customers. He says that this is not just formal education, but knowledge gained through experience such as travelling and working outside Ireland has a direct impact on attitudes toward him. He provided an example where this played out in a conversation he had with two customers in his taxi:

> **Frederick:** His friend was taking, and the other fellow said, 'shut up, you don't know anything. I know how this fellow feel' cause he said, 'I lived in Malaysia for five years. I know how it is to be in a foreign land, so I know what you feel, I know how it is'. And he was telling his friend, 'you don't have a clue, you haven't even leaved Ireland so know nothing'. And he was calling me 'brother'… [he] was saying "don't mind him brother"… And I say, 'thank you', and he say, 'I understand, I live in abroad for many years so I know what it is to live in a foreign land'.

This type of informal education is considered by many respondents as the best way to fight racism. Equally, formal education is also deemed essential to both their and their children's integration. Although many complained that employers seem to ignore their level of education, they nonetheless maintained optimism that racialised discrimination will be less of an issue for their children.

6. No 'Shrinking Violets': Managing Overt Racism

While there are clear signs that Nigerian attitudes to work and induvial agency are having baring fruit with solidarity emerging. Equally, many Irish taxi drivers and customers are challenging the dominant narratives, offering support, and welcoming respondents into the Irish family. However, it also became clear that Nigerians know how to stand up for themselves in a tough and competitive industry with an ability to directly confront racism when required. Anayo, a Nigerian taxi driver (early 40s), pointed out that Nigerian taxi drivers are not 'shrinking violets'. This, he said, is necessary in an oversupplied industry in which former 'etiquettes' have been abandoned by all taxi drivers:

> **Anayo:** The ranks are full so I don't use the ranks much because… they don't respect the rank rule. Nobody respects the rules. When I started anyway, I think everybody respected the rank, you know. We go to the rank and that is going smoothly until the industry is oversupplied you know. I remember one day I was travelling along Capel Street, you know, and somebody flagged me by the side and I just moved up in order to be able to get in. But he didn't just

want to walk around and just stopped the next one who blocked the road. So, what you have to do now is just block the road. (Interview 2016)

Anayo described the new nature of a heavily competitive industry – one in which the loss of an ´etiquette´ has been attributed to Nigerian ´Lagos rules´ rather than the result of the general mismanagement by the State (O'Keeffe, 2013). The oversupply means that heavily congested streets full of taxis create difficulty for drivers trying to access official taxi ranks. While Irish drivers experience this frustration, Nigerians must also manage the racialised narratives that construct them as creating the problem.

Respondents also described the practice of hailing 'White' taxis passing close to the rank when there are no White drivers. Anayo says that taxi drivers that accept these fares was a new development and considered a breach of the former taxi etiquette. However, this was something I witnessed daily as a taxi driver and my previous research also documented how at night, Irish drivers advertised their Whiteness by leaving the light on inside their car or 'rest their hand on the dashboard' (O'Keeffe, 2013). While Anayo avoided using taxi ranks as it was 'too stressful', he said that to survive amongst these new conditions 'you must be bold and stand your ground' and now he also 'blocks the road'. As is evident for anyone driving a taxi in Dublin, if you respect other road users and pull in out of the way, as Anayo described, it risks another taxi collecting that fare. However, incidents where Nigerian's practice this are often used as evidence to support the negative stereotypes.

While Anayo's story highlights the need to be assertive to secure fares, other examples highlight how Nigerians assert themselves when the injustice is too painful or the racism too overt. Some Nigerians also described that after a series of incidents there comes a 'breaking point' and admit to vocalising their anger. The findings here suggest that physically violent racist attacks are not as common as in other countries. Nonetheless, the *threat* of violence is an underlying feature of Nigerian taxi driver lived experience. While most use avoidance tactics or confront racism in a 'friendly manner', several Nigerians also described situations whereby more assertive action was deemed necessary. These incidents reveal the ability to take decisive action when the threat is deemed serious enough to warrant it. Brian describes the continued intimidation he experienced from one Irish driver whilst working in the Kesh. It points to the ever-present fear of physical violence as well the interpersonal skills of some respondents when dealing with racist individuals:

> **Brian:** There is a fellow in the Kesh right [airport taxi holding area]… Every time I walk passed him he would say something like, "Oh I wish I had a gun and put

it in this Nigerian's head and blow it off". And, you know, he kept saying this and something kept coming to me, "Oh, this guy might actually get a gun one day and come into this place". You know, that happen in UK one time where somebody got a gun and went into a taxi rank and started shooting people right. So that fear came on to me and [I] said, "Oh, you need to do something, right. If not, this guy is going to get a gun one day and shoot as many Nigerians as he can see". So, he kept doing that, kept doing that, kept doing that. So, one day I walked up to him…

RO'K: And you shot him?

Brian: [laughter] So, I walked up to him and I said, "Hello, do you have a minute?" And he was, "Wha wha wha?" He wanted to see if I was coming to be aggressive, yeah? And I said, "No, I just want two minutes". And [he] said, "What do you want?". I said, "My name is Brian [pseudonym], what´s your name?" "Oh, my name is Jack [pseudonym]". I said "I´ve heard you a couple of times, you saying that you are going to shoot [a Nigerian]. I don´t know who is this person you is talking about. Did he personally offend you?" And he said, "No no no, there was one Nigerian guy, he was renting fleet of taxis and he got me [cheated him] and that really wrecked me head"… And I said, "that really wrecks my head as well." And he looked at me secondly [a confused look] and I said, "Yeah, I don´t blame you about thinking bad about him. If he is ripping us all off, we´re trying to make money, and somebody is doing something that is hurting me as well". I said, "I don´t blame you… but let me tell you all Nigerians are not like that right. All Nigerians, most of us came to Ireland because we want to make money and to make friends.

Brian said that they are here 'to make money and friends', and as such, 'could help each other'. The incident also showed Brian's awareness of the power of stereotyping in which the Irish driver's revenge fantasy involved all Nigerians, not the specific individual who 'cheated' him. Brian explained that Nigerians usually resolve disputes in a non-confrontational way and outlined this as an example of the positive effects of this approach:

Brian: He changed his mind and then he stopped saying that and he has now become my friend, you know, my friend. So obviously he is not racist, it is just something that has happened and he´s grumbling about and there is no one to help him out of that situation, to see the light, the way it should be. But luckily for him and myself, right. Because only God knows where the guy could have easily gone to the point where he could have a stroke or a heart attack for shooting a Nigerian or something like that… it´s not healthy for anyone. So, he´s friendly now and he´s relaxed.

Not all Nigerians interviewed incorporated this approach and several described questionable working practices such as excessive hustling or soliciting fares at bus stops. However, the vast majority disapproved of this behaviour that 'give us a bad

name'. The example given by Brian also helps explain Nigerians' racism-denial, in which a clearly racist individual was absolved as a tactic toward the overall aim of moving beyond 'race'. This Freirean (Freire, 1970) approach was also illustrated by John in his management of Gardai hostility and he highlighted the value of interpersonal skills to deal with such incidents. He described an interrogation he received from a Garda who, in his determination to find an infringement, turned his questioning to the legality of the car's manufacture design:

> **John:** He [the Guard] was just playing games with me. 'Why is it the break light not at the bumper?' I said, "I am not the maker of the car". He said, "I should of got a better car". I said, "Better car!... this is not a Nigerian car [laughter]" … He now is saying, "now you are annoying me, I don´t like… just go home for tonight, go home and sleep".

On this occasion, John was unjustly forced to drive away from a legal taxi rank and disrupt his nights work. He nonetheless adopted a pragmatic approach and detailed a subsequent interaction with the same Garda in which he told him that he had recorded the previous conversation. Rather than pursue the complaint he elected to engage with him on a personal level and told him it was 'unacceptable behaviour'. John argued that his approach was vindicated and led to an amicable resolution:

> **John:** "If I want to get you out of a job [I could]… but please don´t do it again, it´s too bad". And after this moment… he can park by my side and I would be like this [arms folded]… And now we have become best of friends.

While these stories from Brian and John exemplify the approach taken by most interviewed, they also referenced a small cohort of 'uneducated' Nigerian drivers that are a 'problem'. Several others also referenced these Nigerian taxi drivers but argued that they are a small minority and do not represent Nigerians. On this point, John argued the need for good interpersonal skills but: "not everybody that understand that, it depends on your level of education before you go out to deal with people".

The examples illustrate the exhaustive emotional labour required for Nigerians to defuse racial violence in this way. Nonetheless, they are bringing about elements of success. The incident Brian described at The Kesh in Dublin Airport is an example of how this approach managed to diffuse a particularly hostile encounter. This, as I discuss in the conclusion chapter, aligns with the call for site-specific neoliberal antiracism (Nelson and Dunn, 2017: 32) in which there is a distributive responsibility amongst various actors within a specific site. The local actor, in this case the DAA, helped provide the environment in which peer-groups and individuals responded in kind.

210

7. Conclusion: Pioneers for the Next Generation

In this chapter I have outlined the compatibility of Pentecostalism to neoliberal rationalities as well as mark the distinctions in which respondents challenge the individualistic elements with a responsibility to the wider community, to the Irish family. I examined the emotional toll of racism and how misrepresentation can provide real distortion and have damaging consequences. I outlined the ways in which they try to mitigate this and the tactics they deploy to challenge the negative stereotypes. I also outlined Nigerian taxi drivers' existing compatibility to Irish norms as well as the ways in which they display cultural adeptness to soften elements of their culture deemed 'too African'. I also discussed 'racism-denial' and argued that this illustrates the 'bind' Nigerians face to call out racism due to both the Pentecostal and neoliberal values of self-reliance' and taking responsibility for one's material conditions. I also argued that naming racism is counterproductive due to the risk of reproducing victim narratives as well as the fear it would be construed as 'throwing mud back', 'pulling the race card', or confirm racialised thinking (i.e., no smoke without fire). I've argued that respondents reproduce neoliberal values as a central tactic to aid integration that they emphasise through the values of self-reliance, strong work ethic, and disinterest in 'handouts' such as social welfare. Finally, I outlined the importance of family, education, and community values which, I argued, illustrate their attitudes to work and individual agency. In the following chapter I provide the conclusion to this dissertation. Here I provide a summary of the main findings, the strengths and weakness of research design, how it adds to the literature, and offer suggestions for future research.

Chapter Eight: Conclusion

Introduction

In what ways are Nigerian taxi drivers discursively constructed in opposition to concepts of Irishness, how do they perceive this, how is this experienced in exclusionary ways, and what tactics do they employ to change this narrative? How is regulation and the State subjectively experienced by respondents and how does this inform the spaces they occupy? What are Nigerians attitudes to work and how do they exert individual agency in a hostile working environment? These are the central questions I established in chapter one to address the main themes of this study. In this chapter I summarise the main findings related to these questions with consideration of the methodological constraints and present my main theoretical arguments.

In the first section I discuss some of epistemological issues of the research and reflect on the research design. In section two I summarise the systemic nature of 'everyday racism' that manifests in a tacit 'minoritisation agreement' to exclude Nigerians from majority space in the Dublin taxi industry. I outline how participants respond to a 'distorted visibility' and the exclusion they experience due to the 'Fact of Blackness' and anti-Nigerian racism. In section three I summarise the findings that debunk the narrative of Nigerian incompatibility to Irish 'norms' and argue that racism-denial is a tactic in their aim to successful integrate into the Irish family. In section four I discuss how the hegemony is shifting to include 'race'. This is reflected in State responses as well as in wider society whereby signs of solidarity are emerging. I discuss how racism-denial presents a problem for antiracism initiatives such as iReport. I also discuss the antiracism initiative in Dublin Airport which may provide insight for potential 'neoliberal antiracism' initiatives in other spatial sites throughout the taxi industry. I contextualise the findings against the current debates on nativist populism, Irishness-as-White, and coalition building. Finally, I outline the original contribution of this research to the field of 'race' and anti-Nigerian racism in Ireland. Here I outline how this research fills a gap in the literature and identify other possible themes that could have been explored with suggestions for future research.

1. Reflections

Epistemological Issues

The aim of this study is to provide an understanding of the implications of Irish governmentality, its connection to wider systemic racism, and the consequence of this for Nigerian taxi drivers' lived experience. To mitigate against my standpoint

epistemology and bias, I incorporated a methodological and theoretical framework to help provide a representation that is reflective of participants lived experience. I maintained an ongoing awareness of my position as a White researcher embedded in a Euro/ethnocentric social location. The fact remains, however, that as a researcher socially located in majority culture, I do not possess the intimate knowledge that a Nigerian researcher would.

Many studies have identified the mechanisms of racism at a societal level, but there is a dearth in research on the impact of racism on the daily experiences of Blacks (Essed, 2002: 176). I therefore aimed to make visible the lived experience of racism and analysed Nigerian perceptions about racism in everyday life (Essed, 2002: 176). Essed says that Blacks are familiar with dominant group interpretations of reality and have knowledge of racist ideas and interpretations of reality:

> Their sense of history, through communication about racism within the Black community, and by testing their own experiences in daily life, Black people can develop profound and often sophisticated knowledge about the reproduction of racism (Essed, 2002: 176).

It is these qualities that make Black definitions of racism important for academic inquiry into 'everyday racism' (Ibid). However, knowledge is always relative to social location and we are always condemned to the inevitability of politics. The centring of Nigerian taxi drivers voice must also be theorised to avoid 'ethnographic objectification' (Moreo, 2012: 91). Theorisation is necessary to manage the inevitable contradictions that arise when researching a heterogenous group in which various approaches to integration do not provide a neat picture. Theory is also important to mitigate both my own and respondents' universalistic thinking and to guide me as I interpreted the words and stories provided in the interviews.

In the constructivist view, researchers represent a constituency of interests and that the knowledge produced inevitably favours one set of interests. However, 'knowledge-interests' retain the belief that one aspect of interest can be isolated and relatively objectively commented on (Muller, 1999: 56). I argue that that my unique social location as a former taxi driver provided me with a particularly valuable vantage point to interpret Nigerian taxi drivers lived experience. However, the main epistemological challenge for me was to avoid 'intrusive' empiricism. I therefore aimed to provide a balance between theoretical inquiry and empirical investigation and provide both the space for Nigerians' voice to be heard and the space for this voice to be theorised.

Review of the Research Design

The data collection methods of this research relied predominantly on in-depth interviews with 28 Nigerian taxi drivers. There are, therefore, questions related to the limited ethnographic data collection method in this research. However, the data is also supplemented with ethnographic elements such as participant observation and 'walking the city'. It also includes data gleaned from informal conversations with Nigerian taxi drivers and my own experience as a taxi driver. These other data collection methods helped provide richer data as well as confirm or contest the data produced from the interviews. Although the thematic strands emerged mainly from a grounded theoretical approach, much of what was conveyed through the interviews resonated with my own experiences. Equally, much of what was relayed presented a sharp contrast to my perspective and challenged my previous thoughts and assumptions. While my existing knowledge allowed me to direct the discussion into areas that I deemed important, my approach to interviewing also empowered participants to direct me to the relevant theories based on the salient issues raised by them. Interviewing also allowed me to identify the inconsistencies and contradictions that invariably arise.

All those interviewed are first-generation immigrants and therefore experience the challenges of integrating into a new culture. The findings are, for the most part, reflective of those who agreed to be interviewed. Nonetheless the sample is representative of the three main Nigerian ethnic groups in Ireland, includes a broad age-range, and is representative of class and educational backgrounds. The sample also represents the various pathways that Nigerians take into Ireland. Therefore, I argue that it reflects the overarching desire of most Nigerian taxi drivers to successfully integrate and become valuable members of society. While the participants came from various backgrounds and therefore hold different world views, strong themes emerged in how respondents interpreted their lived experiences. However, many voices were not included, and future research must create the space for Nigerians who may feel these findings do not represent them.

My initial attempts to source participants proved difficult as many were understandably suspicious of my motives as a White researcher. I therefore had to adjust how I approached potential participants, and to refine my interviewing techniques. I had initially drawn up a questionnaire for respondents to fill out to provide empirical data such as age, ethnic group, and pathways into Ireland. Although

this information would have been of value, it interfered with building trust and building a rapport within the interview setting. Respondents' stories outlined the suffocating bureaucracy they endured to try and obtain legal status, and I did not want to add yet another form aimed at extracting personal information. On reflection, I am satisfied with this approach as it aided building the trust needed for respondents to be more forthcoming about their experiences. However, the quantitative data that the questionnaire would have provided would have strengthened the empirical value of this research. Future projects that make provisions for the collection of this type of data collection would be beneficial provided that trust had been established and respondents are satisfied such data benefits them and aids their integration.

In chapter four I outlined the usefulness of narrative inquiry to portray a person's or group's experience in all its depth and fullness (Riessman, 2008: 23). This analytical method highlights the importance of attending to linguistic markers to illustrate the 'historical and cultural contexts' that influence the construction and performance of narrative (Riesman, 2008: 19, 124). Narrative analysis therefore helped me identify Nigerians awareness of the dominant narratives and thus uncover and offer insight into themes such as racism-denial. As discussed in chapter five, respondents have little hesitancy in naming racism from representatives of the State such as Gardai because, as Emenike said, "it really makes you feel I am not welcome in this country". However, as the quote from Tayo (on page 145) indicated, participants are aware of the existing narratives but are reluctant to use the word 'racism'. His hesitancy before settling on the word 'discrimination' indicates his awareness of the existing narratives as well as the power of his words to challenge them. This illustrates the usefulness of Critical Discourse Analyses to identify how language – speech patterns and the specific words used – can provide insight into how narratives are understood, experienced, and challenged.

Overall, this approach to interviewing provided very rich data otherwise unavailable to traditional quantitative methodologies. The abstracted empiricism in some quantitative approaches would have failed to capture the complexity of the racism respondents experienced. Racism-denial was a major theme, and it typically took about fifteen to thirty minutes before respondents would explicitly talk about racism. While the majority still resisted naming this discrimination as racism, the research design enabled me to discern it as 'racism' as defined in this research. In quantitative approaches such racism-denial, taken *prima facie*, would underestimate the nature and extent of racism. I am therefore satisfied that the data collection methods and

research design was sufficient to meet the aims of this research. However, for further insight I suggest that future research could include a broader suite of methods and, provided trust is firmly established, focus groups and deeper participation observation may facilitate this objective.

Potential Theme on the Intersection of Gender

Existing research in Ireland has indicated that men were are five times more likely to illegally discriminate in the workplace as women (Michael, 2019: 18). Although the taxi industry is male dominated, it is estimated there are about 400 women working as taxi drivers in Dublin (Healy, 2008). As pointed out in chapter four, a female dominated taxi company was established to address some of the issues of sharing an enclosed space with a strange man (Foley, 2008; Healy, 2008). Although this was outside the scope of this study, future research to focus on the lived experience of female taxi drivers and customers would be worthwhile. A theme that focuses on the intersection of 'race' and gender could provide important insight into variations of racialised attitudes and experiences of racism.

2. Everyday Racism and the Minoritisation Agreement

The Minoritisation Agreement

The interviews took place in the aftermath of the so-called 'multicultural crisis' and the publication of *Migration Nation* in 2008 that marked the shift from interculturalism to the expectation that migrants 'integrate from below'. The interviews also took place in the aftermath of the implementation of the Taxi Regulation Act 2013. This was a particularly important moment to examine the effects of Irish neoliberal governmentality to Nigerian drivers' lived experience of working in the Dublin taxi industry. I was also an important moment to examine how 'race' and racism is talked about and practiced by wider society and assess the potential changes in attitudes toward migrants during this period of austerity.

I found that Nigerian lived experiences and self-definitions are overwritten by State structures and hegemonic discourses. Laguerre says that hegemonic practices define the space of the majority and set boundaries on minority space (Laguerre, 1996: 105). With this understanding I found that Nigerians' agency is diminished, and the power to expand the boundaries of minority space is largely resisted by the majority population (Laguerre, 1996: 105). I mapped out their experiences under Laguerre's

spatial framework and theorised it under Essed's concept of everyday racism. I found that a tacit 'minoritisation agreement' exists in which systemic racism operates through various mechanisms and actors. While the State is complicit, it is only one actor, and the concept of hegemony and governmentality helped illustrate the systemic nature of everyday racism and the salience of colourblind neoliberal rationalities as the dominant 'regime of truth'. The main areas this manifest is in participants interactions with immigration officials, the Taxi Regulator, and Gardai, where respondents detail 'presumptions of guilt' and consistent racial profiling. I also illustrated how this agreement manifests between Gardai and Irish taxi drivers who regulate majority spaces such as taxi ranks. Customers were also found to be complicit with the common practice of choosing White taxi drivers in preference to Black taxi drivers. I also found this to be the case in the Cork taxi industry. Although this tacit minoritisation agreement is not the result of a racialised conspiracy it is an illustration of the systemic nature of 'everyday racism' that circulates throughout the taxi industry.

Discourse of Security: Common-sense and Good-sense

The 'justifications' for racialised practices rely on historical racialised regimes of truth. Respondents described a 'moral panic' (2011-15) with an increased discursive hostility depicting them as 'rogue' and to be avoided. However, from 2015 onwards, in which the interviews took place, they described a relative discursive calm, and while racism still existed, it was practiced in more covert forms. This provides insight into how racisms evolve and how these changes influence lived experience. The new technologies facilitated more covert forms of racism that are now practiced through the privacy of mobile phones. I have argued that, through common-sense rationalities, Nigerian taxi drivers have been framed as the threat within a discourse of 'security'. I have argued that Nigerian taxi drivers are also under the sway of contradictory consciousness but because it is *they* who are constructed as the threat they are placed in a particularly precarious position. While they do not accept this narrative, to overtly speak outside the security-positive hegemony is not an option. When it comes to ´security', participants indicate that they are on the same page: "if somebody is about to bomb a tram [LUAS]… you stop the person… this man is about to commit a crime to my fellow human beings" (Ndulue page 132).

While the process of (in)securitisation has consequences for of all taxi drivers, the accounts provided here reveal that it is particularly damaging to Nigerian lived experience. Nigerian taxi drivers revealed how they understand and experience these

new technologies – from those who embraced them, to those whose initial optimism faded when it became clear that these technologies were not as colour-blind as first anticipated. Many also voiced their concern at the governments recapture of the industry and described an intensified White gaze under the NTA APP. While it facilitated less overt hostility, the new form of panoptic surveillance led to an increased sense of vulnerability and insecurity.

I outlined the three interrelated characteristics of contradictory consciousness that enable passive consent. The first establishes the boundaries of acceptable discourse and determines what is seen as ´tasteless´ or ´irresponsible´ (Lears, 1985: 572). I argued that consent to technologies of surveillance was facilitated by the 'moral panic' and the existing discourses of 'security', 'illegality', and 'criminality'. I also examined an incident whereby the NTA Taxi Driver Check App (now the TFI Driver Check App) was used by an Irish taxi driver to 'prove' the proliferation of 'cloned' Black taxi drivers and described his disbelief when it did not confirm his racialised thinking. This incident highlighted the power of contradictory consciousness to determine 'common-sense' understanding of the Other and place 'good sense' outside acceptable discourse. It therefore has the power to devalue the lived experience of Nigerian taxi drivers in favour of the prevailing hegemony (Lears, 1985: 577). Under this conceptualisation, Nigerians' racialised position is constrained by the dominant narratives that see their material conditions as the result of personal failure. The lack of alternatives often lead to a sense of inevitability regarding the status quo and individuals are prevented from acting on the truth of their experiences. Although respondents acknowledge that the discrimination they face is largely out of their control, they try to make sense of this within the 'hegemonic reality' that contradicts that experience. This creates a sense of resignation in which respondents accepted the hierarchal political culture, and racism, as somehow inevitable.

The second characteristic of contradictory consciousness refers to the significant role language plays in shaping perceptions of the world (Gramsci, 1971: 326). This, I argue, is exemplified in the dominant theme of racism-denial which is contradictory but also understandable because of the negative response calling out racism can elicit. While 'good sense' is like a philosophy, in that it is inherently coherent and critical, it can only emerge if it elaborates on existing common-sense:

> [good sense is] an intellectual unity and an ethic in conformity with a conception of reality that has gone beyond common sense and become, if only within narrow limits, a critical conception. (Gramsci, 1971: 333)

This process of 'good sense' entering acceptable discourse, therefore, does not entail "introducing from scratch a scientific form of thought into everyone's individual life, but of renovating and making 'critical' an already existing activity" (Gramsci, 1971: 331). 'Security' is rationalised as ´protection´ that resonates with the hegemonic mass and to argue against 'security' is to argue for insecurity. However, the concept of 'good sense' points to the third element of contradictory consciousness; the possibility to create counter-frames. In this context, Nigerian taxi drivers' racism-denial makes 'good sense' when weighed against the risks of reproducing 'race' and reinforcing 'the single story'. Respondents are clear in their desire to articulate counter-hegemonic alternatives but feel that naming racism is an unhelpful practice which will impede the emergence of new cultural frames and narratives.

The Danger of the Single Story

The term 'Nigerian' is a convenient container, or euphemism, to disguise overt reference to biology. This is what Adichi calls the 'danger of the single story' (Adichi, 2009). The literature revealed that Nigerian identity in Ireland is marked by an accumulation of meanings across different contexts such as media, social and political institutions, laws, and personal prejudice (see inter alia Moreo, 2012: 80; McGee, 2003: 194). In the context of the taxi industry the literature shows that that this continues to be an issue:

> It was reported by [taxi] drivers in focus groups that rumours and false accusations are being used by some non-ethnic minority drivers deliberately as a means of control within the industry. (ICI, 2015: 15)

In 2019, Shane O'Curry of the Irish Network Against Racism (INAR) said that racist rhetoric and attacks on minority drivers in the industry is still happening and that "this creates stress and anxiety… impact on their work patterns and make them more reluctant to pick up fares to and from certain areas (as quoted in McGuire, 2019).

There are, of course, Nigerian taxi drivers operating in Dublin that do engage in questionable working practices that align with the negative stereotypes. To recognise this is to recognise the full complexity of what it is to be human. As Les Back argued, the danger of presenting 'heroic portrayals' is that we make the very people whose humanity one may want to defend less than human (Back, 2007: 156). Lentin and Titley say there are always elements of cultural differences that may attract, alienate, fascinate, bore, or repel (Lentin and Titley, 2011: 63). While there is nothing racist per se in this, differences that 'repel' because they do not strictly correspond to majority cultural 'norms' are more problematic. The actions of Nigerian taxi drivers in certain

219

situations are not always a response to racism but can be reflective of their pre-existing value systems, as with Irish or White taxi drivers. In my own experience as a taxi driver, I encountered aggressive working practises of Black taxi drivers that 'repelled' and caused frustration and anger because they did not align with my idea of acceptable working practices. However, the racialised discourses circulating at that time homogenised all Nigerian drivers whereas Irish drivers were afforded their individuality. Questionable working practices by them were not understood as representative of all Irish drivers.

In this research several respondents relayed questionable working practices they engaged in, such as illegally soliciting fares at bus stops and hustling for fares without being hailed. Those who 'hustled' in this way justified it as a necessary response to a highly competitive industry. More sophisticated understandings that go beyond simplistic concepts of 'cultural immaturity' are therefore required to understand why some engage in these practices. Analysis should be contextualised against working in a racialised environment that raises questions on the obligation to follow supposed etiquettes in an industry that excludes them from operating on an equal footing.

Regardless, caution should be exercised when drawing attention to examples of where the stereotypes of cultural incompatibility fit. This is particularly important given the findings of this research demonstrate that the overwhelming majority of respondents are working hard to show that these outliers do not represent them. As respondents are fully aware, to focus on the practices of a small minority who have come to represent the whole runs the very real risk of reproducing and sustaining those narratives. Discussions did arise in which respondents talked of some Nigerians 'giving us a bad name' but, aligning with their central tactic to change the narrative, most avoided discussing how to manage these individuals.

A characteristic of the 'single story' is that it creates a separate set of standards to those in majority space. This was exemplified by Ben, a Nigerian driver (30s), who was transparent about his pathway into Ireland through a legal 'loophole' that existed before the Citizenship Referendum in 2004. Ben explained that he and his pregnant wife availed of *jus soli* citizenship laws and arrived in Ireland to give birth to their child with the intention to obtain legal residency status. Ben's openness may be either naivety to the racialised discourses or a direct refusal to accept a double set of standards. Fintan O'Toole pointed to the hypocrisy of government discourses on immigration with support for the 'undocumented' Irish in the US in contrast to the

'illegal' migrants in Ireland from whom we need to protect the 'integrity' of our citizenship laws (Lentin and McVeigh, 2006: foreword). There are thus two distinct immigration discourses. One, in which 'race' is not present and the 'Irish' are deserving of support. The second, 'race' is present and the 'Other' are deserving of suspicion.

The danger of documenting Ben's pathway into Ireland is that it mobilises the second racialised discourse in which alternative language is deployed. Rather than 'availing' of 'legitimate' legal avenues, indicating Ben's resourcefulness and ambition, this pathway is framed within a discourse of security in which Ben 'exploited' a legal 'loophole'. Ben's frankness highlights the unequal playing field and he spoke of 'race' and 'racism' in clear terms. This 'radical' approach, I argue, provide the necessary conditions to have conversations about the root of 'race' and racial inequality in Ireland. Although Ben's 'legality' or 'illegality' is irrelevant to the arguments made in this dissertation, the public debates on such issues are nonetheless framed within this discourse. As such, there is an argument to be made that this hypocrisy is all the more potent when Ben, and so many others like him, are, and always have been 'legal'.

Distorted Visibility and 'The Fact of Blackness'

Fanon argues that racism produces 'invisibility' in which the racialised are excluded from the conversation (Fanon, 1967). As discussed, 'invisibility' happens when one does not see them because one 'knows' them through the fabricated preconception of group formation (Goldberg, 1997: 180). Nigerian subjectivity is therefore replaced by a distorted visibility though representational repertoires out of their control (Fanon, 1967: 109). As Moriarty argued, the routinisation of racist discourse rely on this distortion, the stereotypes, to provide validity and ensure they are reproduce and maintained (Moriarty, 2006: 292-312).

The majority culture thus maintains control over the discursive space that defines Nigerian identity. Although Nigerian taxi drivers are visible it is a 'distorted visibility' (Moreo, 2012: 80). This is illustrated in the dominant narratives in which they are often depicted as sexual predators, wanting to rip you off, are loud and aggressive, and unable to follow the ´civilised´ Irish taxi etiquette (O'Keeffe, 2013). It also draws on a 'cultural chauvinism' that refuses to acknowledge the positives outside Western influence and insists that Ireland represents the standards of civilisation and moral progress (Goldberg, 2002b: 294-5). Respondents in this research recognise this distortion and that their voice is continually overwritten by the dominant discourses that narrate their lives. As Moreo argues, the struggle against racialising

representations is "not simply a struggle over meaning but is a vital struggle against… fear and abasement" (Moreo, 2012: 79). The implications of this – in terms of racism, institutional neglect, Gardai abuse, discrimination while working, and the unequal application of citizenship rights – are the central concerns for many Nigerian taxi drivers in this research.

I have argued that these narratives rely on the 'Fact of Blackness' as the central signifier and restrict Nigerians 'right to the city' and access into the Irish family. 'The Fact of Blackness' makes self-imposed invisibility all the more important. While most respondents expressed pride in their Nigerian origins, they also outlined the need for cultural adeptness by making 'invisible' elements deemed 'too African'. This resembles Du Bois 'double consciousness' (1903) that indicates an awareness of racial identity characterised by the majority in an unfavourable way. Although all participants in this research are first-generation migrants, not African-American, they are also forced to try to reconcile this. Pittman describes this as being "in a state of double-mindedness, ambivalence, inner turmoil or indecision in relation to conflicting or opposed views and feelings about oneself and/or one's social situation" (Pittman, 2016). Their struggle against racialised discrimination is therefore also the struggle for a space for self-expression and self-determination. However, there are new understandings about the agency of subaltern groups who are not as ideologically dominated as once understood. This suggests that Nigerian taxi drivers do have greater ability to challenge hegemonic realities.

3. Debunking the Discourses of Incompatibility

The Nigerian Bind: Integrating from Below

Respondents described their wish to integrate into their new 'Irish family' and have dedicated themselves to providing the best service they can as a tactic toward integration. The move away from intercultural approach to integration, as a two-way street, placed greater focus on migrants responsibility to quietly integrate from below. The expectations of 'good diversity' are centred on the neoliberal rationalities of self-reliance and taking responsibility for ones conditions. Throughout the findings chapters participants illustrated how they fulfil these expectations but are nonetheless narrated as 'bad diversity'. Nigerian efforts toward integration are continually overwritten by hegemonic discourses, anti-Nigerian racism, and the construction of the non-White Other. Respondents also pursue citizenship, not only to secure their

222

residency status, but as another means to be accepted into the 'Irish family'. However, citizenship does not always grant equal treatment and respondents continued to face exclusion regardless of the formal equality citizenship confers (Koopmans et al., 2005: 6).

Nigerian Compatibility to Irish Norms

As Nigerians are a heterogenous group, there is no unifying concept that can wholly encapsulate their approach to integration. The respondents in this research can be broken down into three groups. The largest group are those already Westernised, educated, came from large Nigerian cities, and faced the least difficulty integrating. The second largest group were those who had less social capital in Nigeria, less formal education, and had to work harder to adapt to cultural differences. The third group came from harsher backgrounds, experienced very difficult living conditions in Nigeria, and were more likely to have arrived through Direct Provision. However, despite their heterogeneity, dominant themes emerged throughout the interviews including the rejection of a victim narrative, reproduction of hegemonic discourses, and racism-denial.

It is clear Nigerian taxi drivers want to be valuable, and valued, members of the community rather than atomised units in an abstract economy. While neoliberalism does not create racism, free-market rationalities were found to be a central element through which racism is talked about and practiced in the industry. Neoliberal rationalities manage to disguise racism as the result of individual capacity rather than the result of structural inequalities. While this led to a sense of inevitability, respondents nonetheless showed their commitment to 'proving' themselves as neoliberal subjects par excellence and, despite their doubts, saw this as the most expedient route out of racialisation. However, as the salience of neoliberalism established itself it also became clear the focus on self-reliance and work ethic are connected to their strong Pentecostal faith. Although Pentecostalism promotes both economic independence and responsibility, it mitigates against the more sterile components of neoliberalism with a sharper focus on individuals responsibility to the wider community. This is found to be central to respondents' attitude to work and individual agency in a highly competitive and often hostile working environment.

Overall, the similarities between Nigerian and Irish ´values´ demonstrated throughout this research are in direct contrast to the anti-Nigerian narratives circulating in Irish society. The findings disrupt the ´clash of civilisations´ and 'failure of multiculturalism'

discourses that narrate the non-White Other as a 'threat to our way of life'. Although Nigerians' have a sense of inevitability when dealing with racism, they nonetheless try to mitigate it by practising 'invisibility', hiding certain elements deemed 'too African', and cultural adeptness, by mimicking Irish norms. Many respondents modify or conceal behaviours deemed too African, such as speech patterns, dress, and religious iconography. While some objected to being forced to make invisible innocuous modes of 'difference', most complied to aid their integration and to mitigate against misrecognition. Respondents therefore aim to quietly integrate from below by reproducing government discourses on integration and display a robust work ethic, self-reliance, and the rejection of social welfare. I have outlined the various ways respondents incorporate this into their working lives and how, alongside the importance of family values, includes a degree of responsibility to bring spirituality to the wider society that has now become their home.

Triumph over Adversity: Pioneers for the Next Generation

Many of those interviewed conceptualise themselves as pioneers for the next generation in terms of their children and the wider Irish family. I have highlighted the resourcefulness of Nigerian taxi drivers on how to manage racism and the vast majority have elected to quietly integrate from below:

> **Obey**: I believe the only way you change the bad thing is to continue what is good. When they are saying 'you are bad' you can change it by doing what is good and talk when you can. And defend when you can and don't take it at every level. (Interview 2015)

Overall, respondents were very keen to show that they do not present a threat and take responsibility for their material conditions. They strongly reject handouts, such as social welfare, and firmly reject any victim narrative. Instead, they describe their ability to navigate hostility with the belief that as long as they continued as they were, they and their families would be seen as valuable members of Irish society. They describe their main motivation as providing financial security for their families and creating a more equitable platform for their children. In terms of racism, Chibuzo encapsulated the dominant approach that Nigerian taxi drivers take:

> **Chibuzo:** I find it difficult to use the language racist you know. That's the problem I have. Talk to me. If you have a problem, talk to me. I will explain my own side, you explain yourself. Maybe along the line we will understand each other.

As discussed, some were not even aware of the concept of racism before arriving into Ireland and others, whose migratory paths included other European countries, had experienced different types of racism elsewhere. Unsurprisingly, respondents provided mixed responses to the racism they experienced but were united in their objective of providing a more equitable platform for the next generation. The three main conclusions drawn are that Nigerians taxi drivers 1) want to be free of racialisation 2) see representation as the key concern and 3) are working towards disrupting their misrepresentation. Respondents therefore challenge the narratives of 'bad diversity' by reproducing the dominant hegemonic discourses on integration, neoliberalism, and 'Irish values'.

4. Signs of Solidarity and Current Debates

Hegemony Expanding to include 'Race'

As discussed, it is not only 'race' that explains Nigerian lived experience and there are signs of solidarity from wider society emerging. Many respondents argued that the negative discourses were often propelled by Irish taxi drivers who openly compelled customers not to take 'foreign' taxis (particularly advising women as a precautionary measure against sexual assault) and pointed to the regularity in which customers complied. This corresponds to my previous research that found Irish drivers are active in reproducing and promoting these discourses (O'Keeffe, 2013). However, not every experience is racialised and respondents described positive encounters with Gardai, helpful and sympathetic immigration officials, and support from Irish taxi drivers and customers. While racism is a central issue and informs lived experience it is not the full picture and respondents described situations that indicate that negative attitudes towards them are abating. Respondents, therefore presented a vision that racialised practices can change through education, both formal and informal, and emphasised that solidarity is also emerging as a result of their working practices and interactions with Irish drivers and customers.

In chapter three I argued that Ireland's hegemony was expansive to incorporate issues related to gender and sexuality, but that it was limited in relation to 'race'. I argued that the value of Nigerian taxi drivers' consent (their power) correlates to the spaces they occupy within the hegemon. At the time of the interviews, Nigerians political capital, the value of their consent, was minimal due to the disempowering nature of racism and the fact they had not reached a critical mass in Ireland. Lentin argued that

in 2010 migrant organisations strategically appropriated governmental discourses to secure funds and a place at the table, but that these discourses ultimately negated power inequalities and therefore a meaningful independent migrant voice (Lentin, 2010). Migrant activists in Ireland during this time were far from radicals working to dismantle the State but, instead, pushed a model of political activism centred on participation (Lentin, 2012: 3).

In Laguerre's spatial framework he identifies a ´time distance´ site that refers to the time it takes to cross the temporal space (Laguerre, 1996: 108). Temporal spatiality denotes the distance that exists between majority time and minority time, and is a product of the time lag created by the uneven participation of the majority and the minority in mainstream affairs: "Immigrant minorities tend to follow a time-trajectory that is different from that of the mainstream; their cultural, social, and political times are not synchronised with those of the mainstream" (Laguerre, 1996: 108-9).This aligns with Gramsci's conceptualisation of hegemony which also points to the shifting nature of power and the possibility of meaningful change.

In recent years Black migrants have reached a critical mass with signs that the State is responding to this hegemonic shift. This has been demonstrated in the recent gains whereby the State now works with grassroot organisations, such as The Movement of Asylum Seekers in Ireland (MASI, 2020), to actively engage with the issues of Direct Provision. In 2021 'race' also entered mainstream discourse with the global BLM movement finding its voice in Ireland (Joseph, 2021; Michael and Joseph, 2021; Ni Chonaill, 2021). Furthermore, the nativist populism that has affected other countries has not yet entered the Overton Window – the range of views it is acceptable to express – of Irish mainstream politics (Fanning, 2022: 75, 80).

Current Debates on White Irish Nationalism

David Stanton, the *Minister* of State at the *Department of Justice* and Equality, claimed that Ireland 'has been remarkably open and welcoming to migrants' and pointed to the ESRI's latest report on integration to confirm the diversity of Ireland's population (Stanton, 2020). Stanton also pointed to the government's support of CERD's work (UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination) and claimed that Ireland has taken 'extensive actions… to promote equality and to combat racial discrimination' (Stanton, 2020). He also pointed to the Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission Act 2014 that underpins public bodies responsibility on equality, human rights, and the combatting of discrimination, including racism (Stanton, 2020).

However, INAR (Irish Network Against Racism) said that these improvements are piecemeal and do not adequately address migrants' rights and State obligations (INAR, 2019: 11). Recent literature, instead, argues the need to addresses issues of White Irish nationalism. Michael argues that Ireland's institutions, policies, and practices are actually structured to produce and allow racist outcomes (Michael, 2019). Furthermore, in relation to policing, she said the UN recommendations to outlaw racial profiling still go unheeded (Ibid). Fanning points out that the Irish, historically, were no less susceptible to racism than other white Westerners (Fanning, 2022: 48). He says that understanding this legacy "takes on a new importance at a time when black African Irish seek acknowledgment for their experiences of racism" (Fanning, 2022: 48). He argues that the versions of Irish history that obfuscate past Irish racism "have proven to be a toxic export and may well exert future malign influence on Irish politics and society" (Fanning, 2022: 56). While he agrees that specific policies are needed to deal with racism, he also argues that "other problems experienced by black and ethnic minority groups… are often best addressed by policies aimed at supporting everybody in marginalised neighbourhoods" (Fanning, 2022: 117). This 'adaptive nation building' approach include issues related to housing, education, and access to employment. Those interviewed in this research agree with Fanning because it moves away from framing their experiences within a discourse of 'race'. They also agree that terms such as 'ethnic nepotism' are more suitable definitions to describe their experiences.

However, in Joseph's most recent work she asked: "can any predominantly white country in the global North be free of white supremacy?" (Joseph, 2022: 79). As mentioned, the Irish were historically racialised and it is only in the last century that they became recategorised as White (Fanning, 2022; Dyer, 1997; Ignatiev, 1995). Joseph argues that this change "on the racial ladder came at a price of subscribing to white supremacy" (Joseph, 2022: 79). She defines white supremacy as the "unacknowledged, everyday positioning of white superiority", as opposed to White extremism, and argues that Whiteness is employed as a determinant of Irishness (Ibid). She argues for a much more radical examination of Whiteness and calls for a decolonized narrative in Ireland (Ibid).

I have argued that the discursive construction of Nigerian taxi drivers draws on existing narratives that depict the non-White Other as culturally immature. I have argued that the theory of 'everyday racism' connects 'race' to power and helps explain the systemic nature of racism, the minoritisation agreement, functioning throughout society. I have outlined the societal praxis of this through Laguerre's spatial framework

to identify how racism is experienced at the ideological, structural, and locational sites. In terms of regulation, it also became clear that State intervention did not provide a race-neutral means of governance and respondents voiced their frustration at their continued racialisation with new technologies. As the findings here illustrate, the 'Fact of Blackness' is the central signifier impeding Nigerians' integration into the Irish family.

If the Irish state is serious about racial equality, I argue it must challenge its reliance on narratives of common ancestry and genuinely work towards breaking down the existing conceptualisations of Irishness as White. A critique of racial formations is therefore essential to addressing the complexities of racial groups beyond a Black/White binary. This research has examined the racial formation of Nigerian taxi drivers and the ways in which ethnicity and cultural 'incompatibility' is used to 'justify' racialised practices that often rely, in the first instance, on 'The Fact of Blackness'. It therefore offers insight into the ongoing questions surrounding Whiteness in the Irish context and, alongside other qualitative research, presents a clearer understanding of how this is experienced by the non-White Other. Therefore, alongside examining the competing political aims that support or hinder racial progress, the role of non-state actors are also important (Smith, 2017: 2).

5. Racism-denial and Antiracism Initiatives

Racism-denial: Reporting Racism under the White Gaze

While gains have certainly been made, the findings here indicate the continued salience of 'race' in Nigerian taxi drivers' lived experience. The discourse of 'security' still frames them as a threat and helps explain the wider consent for new modes of (in)securitisation through new technologies of surveillance. I have also examined the neoliberal rationalities that underpinned this intervention to create an industry better able to self-regulate and police. These align to the values emphasised in *Migration Nation* with the expectation that 'good diversity' regulate themselves by integrating quietly from below. However, the panoptic surveillance of new technologies, such as the NTA Taxi Driver Check App, has led to increased exposure to a racialised White gaze. I argue that respondents recognise that vocalising the discrimination they experience as 'racial discrimination' is unhelpful and therefore try to limit their exposure by integrating quietly from below.

I argue that racism-denial is a symptom of the 'bind' Nigerians face integrating into a post-race, liberalised taxi industry. Racism-denial also needs to be understood in the context of their own existing neoliberal and Pentecostal values in which self-reliance and taking responsibility are deemed important character traits. However, some of those who were initially hesitant became more comfortable in naming racism as the interviews progressed. Others, who articulated this `post-race´ view, often appeared to not fully believe this narrative but adopted it as the best strategy toward their integration. Although a minority were more direct in naming racism, they too indicated a need for sensitivity and approach the issue in a 'friendly manner'. These often qualified their comments by explaining racism as an understandable response to strangers arriving on their shore. Overall, the findings here show that, for Nigerians, naming racism risks eliciting responses such as 'pulling the race card', 'ungrateful foreigners that we feed', be interpreted as 'no smoke without fire', or feed into a victim narrative.

iReport and Antiracism Initiatives

Racism-denial therefore problematises the current focus on reporting and documenting racism to create datasets as leverage for government action (Allen, 2022a, 2012; Hickman, 1998; King O´Rain, 2007; Moore and Hickman, 2012; Carr, 2016). Carr argues that the dearth of specific datasets in Ireland mean targeted policies on different forms of racism have no empirical grounding to influence policy makers and thereby challenge racism (Carr, 2016: 11). This argument is based on European 'best practice' models which claim that capturing data on racism is an effective tool to challenge racism – both at state level and to provide a platform from which civil society, including the racialised, can challenge racism (Carr, 2016: 12). Data on 'race' that measures the outcomes of racial inequality also aids the ability to analyse the reasons for these outcomes. Antiracism advocates therefore encourage those targeted with racism to report their experiences (Fahey, McGinnity, and Quinn, 2019; Michael, 2019; Ní Chonaill, 2021: 51).

However, respondents do not expect meaningful State intervention and are therefore wary of any action that invites further scrutiny under the White gaze. This is an understandable response due to the lack of trust that the State will, upon receiving this data, take appropriate action, as well as the fear it could be misinterpreted to fit the existing narratives. On this point, Joseph problematises the recent liberal initiatives of various organisations that organise educational events with talks from Black guests

who had experienced racism (Joseph, 2021: 22). She says that the 'parading of Black bodies' to tell their stories is a superficial listening exercise that prove to be an inadequate attempt "to fix 500 years of racism, with all of its structurally and institutionally embedded divisions" (Ibid). While these events raise awareness, Joseph argues that the lack of follow-up action defeats the purpose and points to the importance of critically interrogating racism with theoretical perspective that goes beyond simply providing quantitative accounts (Ibid). This problem with current forms of allyship is also identified by Emma Dabiri (2021) who argues that some 'allies' sought to centre themselves in the struggle for Black lives rather than centring the struggle itself (Ibid). This, as Joseph argues, "consume Black stories of racist violence, discrimination and racist labour market experiences without awareness of the trauma of revisiting experiences of racism" (Joseph, 2021: 23).

However, as Brid Ni Chonaill argues, these stories are important and must be listened to if racial equality and institutional change is to be achieved (Ní Chonaill, 2021: 52). She agrees with Joseph, and says that data collection methods cannot work on their own and must include both a decolonial approach and an analysis of the structures that facilitate racist incidents (Ní Chonaill, 2021: 52-3). Respondents in this research recognise this and, while most were reluctant to point out individual racism, there was less hesitancy to name racism experienced from State representatives such as immigration officials, Gardai, and the NTA:

> **Obey:** The one that is in my mind that is hurtful is not much about someone that is a racist. If somebody has grown up and are calling me names in the street and all that. But one thing that hurts is when you see the system is failing you.

Nonetheless, respondents' have determined that reproducing hegemonic discourses is the best tactic toward successful integration. Instead of naming racism, they take responsibility for their material conditions in the hope that their resilience and work ethic will eventually be recognised by the majority culture.

Site-specific Neoliberal Antiracism

James Carr argues that because neoliberalism has assumed a hegemonic status – no one can escape it, stand aside from, or externally criticise it – racism should therefore be met on neoliberal terms (Carr, 2016: 15). He claims that antiracism strategies within a neoliberal framework, and drawn from lived experience, can lead to an 'insurrection of subjugated knowledge' (Carr, 2016: 15). However, neoliberal rationalities are central to the bind that Nigerian taxi drivers experience, and without challenging

'colour-blind' neoliberalism it is unclear how lasting change is possible. Calling out racism within a neoliberal framework is also problematic because it is appealing to a government that does not always recognise its role in systemic racism.

Nonetheless, neoliberal antiracism initiatives have had degrees of success. As discussed in chapter five and seven the antiracism measures implemented in the 'Kesh' support the move towards a 'neoliberal site-specific' approach to issues of racism that distribute responsibility amongst various actors in the field (Nelson and Dunn, 2017: 27). The site-specific regulation implemented by Dublin Airport Authority (DAA) proved successful and may provide a template for neoliberal antiracism initiatives tailored to the specific dynamics of other sites such as the suburbs, the city centre, and the various 'White only' ranks.

Alastair Bonnet made a distinction between liberal antiracism, that could occur within an existing framework, and radical antiracism that emphasises societal transformation as a necessary condition (Bonnet, 1993: 33). Nelson and Dunn, however, say a 'neoliberal antiracism' should replace both these to addresses the specific dynamics in each location (Nelson and Dunn, 2017: 27). They argue that racism cannot be treated as a spatially homogenous system and, instead, should be understood as 'everywhere but different' racism to reflect the specific histories of inter-ethnic and cross-cultural relations in a particular place (Nelson and Dunn, 2017: 26). Ash Amin argued for a relational reading of cities and regions whereby the local is seen to bring 'together different scales of practice/social action' (Amin, 2004: 38). The political task of antiracism, therefore, is seen as situating antiracist struggles in those sites where they will have the most effect (Nelson and Dunn, 2017: 28).

However, Nelson and Dunn also highlight the challenges of a depoliticised local anti-racism action for local actors to have effective control or authority over defined geographical territories (Nelson and Gunn, 2017: 32). They say responsibility for anti-racism should be shared among both local and national authorities (Nelson and Dunn, 2017: 32). They also argue for distributive responsibility across community action, both vertically and horizontally, reaching to the micro-politics of relations between peer groups, families, and individuals (Ibid). They recognise this distributive responsibility does evoke the concerns of neoliberalising subjectification, in which individuals and 'communities' are asked to self-discipline and govern themselves (Ibid). Nonetheless, they argue that the 'local' is a site of anti-racist action where multiple players could potentially contribute: "using programmes that are sensitive to the specific

manifestations of racism, which are cognizant of the structural underpinnings of racism and which leverage micro-political action (Nelson and Dunn, 2017: 32-33).

The example of Dublin Airport illustrates this shared responsibility with the 'local player' (the DAA) resolving the practical issues related to queuing and zero tolerance to any forms of discrimination. As discussed in chapter six, this appeared to have reached into the micro-politics in this site whereby individuals, both Nigerian and Irish taxi drivers, also took responsibility for easing racialised tensions. While site-specific neoliberal antiracism can alleviate the material conditions of racial discrimination, there are inherent contradictions in this approach. I argued that reproducing government and hegemonic discourses, particularly colour-blind neoliberal values, does not contest the systemic nature of racism circulating in Irish society. Nonetheless, a central tenet of antiracism is that the racialised control the methods used in their liberation. While this tactic of ignoring racism does not represent a true 'insurrection of subjugated knowledge', it is an understandable approach that may have longer term success.

6. Conclusion

The Literature

This research makes an original contribution back to the literature on Nigeran lived experience, labour-market discrimination, racism, Irish neoliberal governmentality, and African Pentecostalism. It adds to current debates about 'race' and Whiteness in Ireland and offers insight into how 'The Fact of Blackness' can lead to exclusionary practices (Michael, 2015; Michael and Joseph, 2021). It offers insight into how regulation and the State influences peoples 'right to the city' with the emergence of majority and minority spaces. It therefore contributes to the field of 'race' and anti-Nigerian racism in Ireland. It helps fill a gap in lived experiences by outlining the mundane tactics Nigerian taxi drivers deploy to manage the everyday racisms while working in a hostile and competitive industry. The study also adds to the literature on the processes of (in)securitisation found in new technologies of surveillance as the latest methods of categorising and controlling populations (Bigo, 2012; Maguire and Murphy, 2014). This aligns with Maguire and Murphy assertion that although new technologies promised a race-neutral means of governing, they nest in already existing cultural configurations including racialisation (Maguire and Murphy, 2014: 293).

The findings show Nigerian taxi drivers are primarily engaged in staking out a space to build new lives and become valuable members of Irish society but are impeded by Irish neoliberal governmentality. It therefore aligns with the literature that concludes that integration has mostly been left to the economy and, while political parties express support for integration, it does not always translate into practice (Fanning, Shaw, and O'Connell, 2012: 2-3). It also aligns with the literature on poor policing practices, the distrust it creates, and the reasons why those experience racism are often reluctant to reporting their experiences (Browne, 2008; Carr, 2016; Lynch, 2009; NCCRI, 2007).

It aligns with current understandings of the importance Nigerians place on Pentecostalism, family values, education, self-reliance, and taking responsibility for one's material conditions. It aligns with the existing literature on African lived experiences that shows that the main motivations for many was the right to free movement conferred by secure residency status so that their children will have a future and free movement (Fanning, 2018: 179). It aligns with the literature that shows Pentecostal churches act as a refuge from the anxieties of their material conditions as well as the aim to spread the 'heath and wealth gospel' (Fanning, 2018: 192). However, it does not align with some other studies and finds that Pentecostalism does have a significant role in terms of social integration within the wider Irish society (Ukah, 2013: 74; Ugba, 2009; Soothill, 2010: 216). This is reflected in the general positive interactions as well as some customers attending their church services.

The findings also align with the existing literature that show Nigerians are one of the most educated migrant groups but yet experience the poorest labour-market outcomes. It agrees that 'race' and ethnicity are key factors in labour market discrimination, both in accessing employment and workplace racism. However, the findings here differ to the extent that Nigerians will vocalise the racism they experience that may be significant to initiatives aimed at having those who experience racism to report those experiences.

Suggestions for Future Research

Throughout, it became clear that representation is the most important issue facing the Nigerian taxi drivers interviewed. Rather than vocalise the racism they experience, they placed their focus to the potential of new technologies, such as the NTA App, FreeNow App, and Uber. Here, many felt they could provide statistical data that proves the high standard of service they provide. Several participants argued that counterhegemonic narratives could emerge through ´rating systems´ in these Apps

233

and disrupt the negative discourses that currently narrate their lives. Vigo, a Nigerian taxi driver (mid 30's), also suggested that the NTA App could collect statistical data on 'cloned' or illegally operating taxi drivers as well as provide demographic classification on general malpractice such as overcharging (Interview 2016). He suggested that the NTA should categorise this data ethnically in order to provide statistics on the standards held by each taxi driver demographic. This, he concluded, would counter the dominant narratives by revealing the high standard of service Nigerian taxi drivers provide. However, ethnic categorisations of taxi drivers operating in Dublin do not exist, such as is compiled (controversially) in the national Census, and therefore a breakdown of offenders via ethnicity is problematic both practically and ethically.

The majority of respondents did not have any interest in collective action, and many were wary of Irish trade unionism and the racism they were likely to receive. This aversion is also related to the overarching tactic to avoid bringing attention to themselves. However, many were open to the idea of joining a union, such as Christie, who supported collective action but said that Irish trade unionism must first reach out to Nigerians. He believed that if this happened, and if they were reassured that they would be represented on an equal footing, that most Nigerian taxi drivers would respond. This points to the potential for a meaningful coalition in which Irish trade unionism, working with Nigerian and all migrant taxi drivers, could also continue the process of the declassificatory politics that respondents currently pursue through informal education and working practices.

Within the current political landscape, INAR's iReport system is a valuable resource, and the reporting and documenting of racism is necessary. However, respondents here are very hesitant to insert themselves politically as they believed that the risks of reporting are greater than the potential benefits. Research should therefore investigate what provisions could be made to enable victims of racism to trust that further exposure under the White gaze will be worthwhile. My suggestion for future research is to explore this possibility whereby Nigerian taxi drivers can engage in activism that does not present them as 'victims of racism'. Instead, activism that is truly outside the 'grid-of-debt', that is part of a wider coalition including Irish drivers, and in which 'race' has no relevance. This, based on the findings of this research, is the only platform that Nigerian taxi drivers will engage.

Bibliography

Adichi, Chimamanda Ngozi. 2009. "The Danger of a Single Story." *TED Talk*. Retrieved (https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D9Ihs241zeg).

Alasuutari, Pertti. 1995. *Researching Culture: Qualitative Method and Cultural Studies*. London: Sage.

Allen, Theodore W. 1994. *The Invention of the WHite Race. Volume 1*. London: Verso.

Alvermann, Donna. 2000. "Narrative Approaches." *Reading Online* 4(5).

Ambrose, Susan, Michael W. Bridges, Michele DiPietro, Marsha Lovett, and Marie K. Norman. 2010. *How Learning Works: 7 Research-Based Principles for Smart Teaching*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass Publishers.

Amin, Ash. 2004. "Regions Unbound: Towards a New Politcs of Place." *Geofrafiska Annaler: Series B, Human Geographies* 86:33–44.

Anderson, Benedect. 1983. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. London: Verso.

Anyim, Benjamin, Ngozi Chijioke, and Francisca O. Anyim-Ben. 2019. "Nigeria, Nigerians and Xenophobic Attacks; Political and Economic Implications: A Phenomenological Approach." *GNOSI: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Human Theory and Praxi* 2(2):22–29.

Arendt, Hannah. 1963. *On Revolution*. London: Faber and Faber.

Asuzu, Okechukwu Jones. 2006. *The Politics of Being Nigerian*. Lulu.com.

Back, Les. 2006. "The Problem of the Immigration Line: State Racism and Bare Life." Pp. 32–52 in *Race and State*, edited by R. Lentin and A. Lentin. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Press.

Back, Les. 2007. *The Art of Listening*. London: Bloomsbury Publishing Plc.

Balibar, Etienne and I. Wallerstein. 1991. *Race, Class, Nation: Ambiguous Identities*. New York: Verso.

Bardon, Sarah and Mark Hilliard. 2017. "Gardaí 'Exaggerated Number of Breath Tests by 1.45 Million.'" *Irish TImes*, September 6.

Barrett, A., A. Bergin, and D. Duffy. 2006. "The Labour Market Characteristics and Labour Market Impacts of Immigrants in Ireland." *The Economic and Social Review* 37(1).

Barrett, A. and D. Duffy. 2008. "Are Ireland's Immigrants Integrating into Its Labour Market?" *International Migration Review* 42(3):597–615.

Barrett, A. and Y. McCarthy. 2007a. "Immigrants in a Booming Economy: Analysing Their Earnings and Welfare Dependence." *Labour* 21(4):789–808.

Barrett, A. and Y. McCarthy. 2007b. "Immigrants in a Booming Economy: Analysing Their Earnings and Welfare Dependence." *Labour* 21(4).

Benveniste, Emile. 1996. *Problems of Geneneral Linguistics*. edited by M. E. Tr Meek. Miami: Miami University Press.

Bergbom, B., M. Vartia-Vaananen, and U. Kinnunen. 2015. "Immigrants and Natives at Work: Exposure to Workplace Bullying." *Employee Relations* 37(2):158–75.

Bhabha, Homi. 1994a. "Of Mimicry and Man: The Ambivalence of Colonial Discourse." Pp. 85–92 in *The Location of Culture*. London: Routledge.

Bhabha, Homi. 1994b. *The Location of Culture*. London and New York: Routledge.

Bigo, D. 2006. "Internal and External Aspects of Security." *European Security* 15(4):385–404.

Bigo, D. 2012. "Security, Surveillance and Democracy." Pp. 277–85 in *Routledge Handbook of Surveillance Studies*, edited by B. K and K. Haggerty. London: Routledge.

Billig, Michael. 2017. "Banal Nationalism and the Imagining of Politics." Pp. 307–21 in *Everyday Nationhood*. London: Palgrave Macmillan UK.

Blanche, M. T. and K. Durrheim. 2004. *Research in Practice: Applied Methods for the Social Science*. Cape Town: Cape Town Press.

Blessing, Mberu and R. Pongou. 2010. *Nigeria: Multiple Forms of Mobility in Africa's Demographic Giant*.

Bohan, C. and P. Hyland. 2013. "I Won't Choose Taxis Driven by a Foreign Driver, Says Fianna Fáil Senator." *Thejournal.Ie*, January.

Du Bois, W. E. B. 1903. *The Souls of Black Folk*. London: Longmass, Green and Co Ltd.

Bonnet, Alastair. 1993. *Radicalism, Anti-Racism and Representation*. London: Routledge.

Bourdieu, Pierre. 1986. "The Forms of Capital." Pp. 241–58 in *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education*, edited by J. G. Richardson. New York: Greenwood Press.

Bracey, Glenn. 2014. "Toward a Critical Race Theory of State." *Critical Sociology* 41.

Brown, Wendy. 2006. *Regulating Aversion: Tollerance in the Age of Identity and Empire*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Browne, C. 2008. "Garda Public Attitutes Survey 2008." Retrieved September 1, 2012 (www.garda.ie?Documents/User/24.%2520GARDA%25PUBLIC%2520ATTITUDES%2520-%25202008.pdf).

Brubaker, Rogers. 1992. *Citizenship and Nationhood in France and Germany.* Boston: Harvard University Press.

Bruner, J. 1987. "Life as Narrative." *Social Research* 54(1):11–32.

Bruner, Jerome. 1991. "The Narrative Construction of Reality." *Critical Inquiry* 18(1):1–21.

Bryman, Alan. 2006. "Integrating Quantitative and Qualitative Research: How Is It Done?" *Qualitative Research* 6(1):97–113.

Butler, Judith. 1993. *Bodies That Matter*. New York: Routledge.

Butler, Martin and John Solomos. 2004. "Introduction: Researching Race and Racism." in *Researching Race and Racism*, edited by M. Butler and J. Solomon. London and New York: Routledge.

Byrne, M. 2014. "Performing Distance: The Response of Irish Professionals to Immigrants and Immigration." Trinity College Dublin.

Byrne, Nicola and Martin Bright. 2002. "Fury at Kenny 'joke' Spreads." *The Guardian*, September 15.

Carr, James. 2014. "Experiences of Anti-Muslim Racism in Ireland."

Carr, James. 2016. *Experiences of Islamophobia: Living with Racism in the Neoliberal Era*. Oxford UK.: Routledge.

Casey, S. and M. O'Connell. 2010. "Pain and Prejudice." in *Cultivating Pluralism: Psychological, Social and Cultural Perspectives on a Changing Ireland*, edited by M. MacLachlan and M. O'Connell. Dublin: Oak Tree Press.

Central Statistics Offfice. 2011. *Profile 6: Migration and Diversity*. Dublin.

De Certeau, Michel. 1984a. *The Practice of Everyday Life*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

De Certeau, Michel. 1984b. "Walking the City." Pp. 16–19 in *The Practice of Everyday Life*. Berkeley California: California University Press.

Charmaz, Kathy. 2006. *Constructing Grounded Theory: A Practical Guide Through Qualitative Analysis*. London: Sage.

Cheal, David J. 1979. "Hegemony, Ideology and Contradictory Consciousness." *The Sociological Quarterly* 20(1):109–17.

Citizeninformation.ie. 2021. "Direct Provision System." *CitizenInformation.Ie*. Retrieved April 22, 2021 (https://www.citizensinformation.ie/en/moving_country/asylum_seekers_and_refugees/services _for_asylum_seekers_in_ireland/direct_provision.html#).

Clandinin, Jean and Michael Connelly. 2000. *Narrative Inquiry: Experience and Story in Qualitative Research*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass Publishers.

Clifford, Michael. 2017a. *A Force for Justice: The Maurice McCabe Story*. Dublin: Hachette Ireland.

Clifford, Michael. 2017b. "Garda Claims Colleagues Bullied Him over Ethnicity and Religion." *Irish*

Examiner.

Clinton, Bill. 2000. "Human Genome Project." *National Human Genome Research Institute*. Retrieved August 28, 2020 (https://www.genome.gov/10001356/june-2000-white-house-event).

Cole, Mike. 2009. "Critical Race Theory Comes to the UK: A Marxist Response." *Ethnicities* 9(2):246–69.

Collins, P. H. 2001. *Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, Consciousness and the Politics of Empowerment*. New York: Routledge.

Colombijn, F. and A. Erdentug. 2002. *Urban Ethnic Encounters: The Spatial Consequences*. London: Routledge.

Committee, Anti-Racism. 2021. *Interim Report to the Minister for Children, Equality, Disability, Integration and Youth*. Dublin.

Connelly, F. M. and D. J. Clandinin. 1990. "Stories of Experience and Narrative Inquiry. Educational Researcher." *Educational Researcher,* 19(5):2–14.

Cook, Ian and Mike Crang. 1995. *Doing Ethnographies*. Norwich: Geobooks.

Mac Cormaic, R. 2007. "Finding a Creative Voice to Break the Stereotypes of Victimhood." *The Irish Times*, May 23.

Crenshaw, K. 2000. "Race, Reform and Retrenchment." Pp. 549–60 in *Theories of Race and Racism, A reader.*, edited by L. Back and J. Solomos. London: Routledge.

Cresswell, Tim. 2006. "The Right to Mobility: The Production of Mobility in the Courtroom." *Antipode* 38(4):735–54.

Creswell, J. W. 1998. *Qualitative Research and Design*. London: Sage.

Creswell, J. W. 2007. *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*. 2nd Editio. London: Sage.

Creswell, J. W. 2012. *Educational Research: Planning, Conducting, and Evaluating Quantitative and Qualitative Research*. New Jersey: Pearson.

DAA. 2019. *Dublin Airport Taxi Operations Manual*.

Dabiri, Emma. 2021. *What White People Can Do Next: From Allyship to Coalition*. London: Penguin.

Dail Debates. 2013. "Taxi Regulation Bill 2012 [Seanad]: Second Stage." *Kildarestreet.Com*. Retrieved October 4, 2020 (https://www.kildarestreet.com/debates/?id=2013-05-16a.151).

Daly, Susan. 2011. "Data Commissioner Concerned about CCTV in Taxis." *Thejournal.Ie*.

Daly, Susan. 2012. "This Is What One Taxi Driver Thinks of the Green Light Debate." *Thejournal.Ie*, May 24.

Darmody, Merike. 2011. "Power, Education and Migration into Ireland." *Power and Education* 3:224.

Das, Veenas. 2007. *Life and Words: Violence and the Decent into the Ordinary*. Berkley and LA: University of California Press.

Davis, Rowenna. 2011. "Irish Police Chief Apologises for Officers Who Joked about Raping Protesters." *The Guardian*, April 8.

Dean, M. 2010. "A Response to the Question What Is Neoliberalism? Contesting Neoliberalism and Its Future. Workshop." *University of Sydney*. Retrieved January 30, 2015 (https://sydney.edu.au/arts/political_economy_downloads_Mitchell_Dean.pdf).

Delgado, R. and J. Stefancic. 2012. *Critical Race Theory: An Introduction*. New York: New York University Press.

DiAngelo, Robin. 2018. *White Fragility: Why It's so Hard for White People to Talk about Racism*. Boston: Beacon Press.

Dickie, Virginia A. 2003. "Data Analysis in Qualitative Research: A Plea for Sharing the Magic and the Effort." *American Journal of Occupational Therapy* 57:49–56.

Dillon, Niamh. 2019. "Migration Nation: Barriers to Integration for Asylum-Seekers in Ireland." *Studies in Arts and Humanities* 4(2):51–69.

Douglas, Mary. 2001. *Purity and Danger: An Analysis of Concepts of Pollution and Taboo*. London: Routledge.

Duarte, M. E. 2017. *Network Sovereignty: Building the Internet Across Indian Country*. Seattle: University of Washington Press.

Duque, Lyle. 2010. "Review: Narrative Methods for the Human Sciences by Catherine Riessman." *Forum: Qualitative Social Research, Sozialforschung* 11(1, 19).

Dustmann, C., F. Fabbri, and I. Preston. 2003. *Labour Market Performance of Immigrants in the UK Labour Market. Home Office Online Report 05/03.* London.

Dyer, Richard. 1997. *White*. London: Routledge.

Eatwell, Roger and Matthew Goodman. 2018. *National Populism: The Revolt Against Liberal Democracy*. London.

Ejimabo, Nick Obioma. 2015. "The Effective Research Process: Unlocking the Advantages of Ethnographic Strategies in the Qualitative Research Methods." *European Scientific Journal* 11(23).

ESI. 2022. "ESI." *European Social Survey*. Retrieved May 11, 2022 (https://www.europeansocialsurvey.org/).

Essed, Philomena. 2002. "Everyday Racism: A New Approach to the Study of Racism." Pp. 176–94 in *Race Critical Theories*, edited by P. Essed and D. T. Goldberg. Oxford: Blackwell.

Eurobarometer. 2022. "Eurobarometer." *Eureopean Union*. Retrieved May 11, 2022 (https://europa.eu/eurobarometer/surveys/detail/2532).

European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights. 2018. *Second European Union Minorities and Discrimination Survey: Being Black in the EU*.

Evers, Liz. 2021. "Buckley, Christine." in *Dictionary of Irish Biography*. Royal Irish Academy.

Faber, Goodbody Economics Consultants and Irish Marketing Surveys. 1998. *Review of the Taxi and Hackney Carriage Services in the Dublin Area*. Dublin.

Fahey, Éamonn, Frances McGinnity, and Emma Quinn. 2019. *Data for Monitoring Integration: Gaps, Challenges and Opportunities*. Dublin, Ireland.

Fanning, Bryan. 2002. *Racism and Social Change in the Republic of Ireland*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Fanning, Bryan. 2012. *Racism and Social Change in the Republic of Ireland*. Mancheser: Manchester University Press.

Fanning, Bryan. 2018. *Migration and the Making of Ireland*. Dublin: University College Dublin Press.

Fanning, Bryan. 2021. *Diverse Republic*. Dublin: University College Dublin Press.

Fanning, Bryan, Brian Killoran, Saorlaith Ni Bhroin, and Geoff McEvoy. 2011. "Taking Racism Seriously: Migrants Experiences of Violence." *MCRI Publications*. Retrieved March 2, 2014 (http://emn.ie/files/p_201211220244102011_TakingRacismSeriously_ICI.pdf).

Fanning, Bryan, Shaw., and O'Connell. 2012. *Irish Political Parties, Immigration and Integration in 2007*. Dublin.

Fanon, Frantz. 1967. *Black Skin, White Masks*. New York: Grove Press.

Farouk, Bibi, Humphrey Ukeaja, and Dele Ishaka. 2019. "The Effects of Xenophobia on South Africa-Nigeria Relations: Attempting a Retrospective Study. BY." *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science* 8:39–48.

Fine, Michelle. 1994. "Working the Hyphens: Reinventing Self and Other in Qualitative Research." Pp. 70–82 in *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, edited by N. K. Denzin and Y. S. Lincoln. California: SAGE Publications, Ltd.

Foley, Catherine. 2008. "Women at the Wheel." *The Irish Times*, October 29.

Foucault, Michel. 1969. *Archaeology of Knowledge*. edited by A. M. Tr Sheridan Smith. London: Tavistock.

Foucault, Michel. 1980a. "Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977 by Michel Foucault." Pp. 78–109 in *Two Lectures*, edited by G. C. Edinburgh: Pearson.

Foucault, Michel. 1980b. *Power/Knowledge*. edited by C. Gordon. Brighton: Harvester.

Foucault, Michel. 1980c. "Truth and Power." Pp. 104–34 in *Michel Foucault Power/Knowledge: selected interviews and other writings 1972-1977 by Michel Foucault*, edited by C. Gordon.

Foucault, Michel. 1980d. "Two Lectures." Pp. 78–109 in *Michel Foucault Power/Knowledge: selected interviews and other writings 1972-1977 by Michel Foucault*, edited by C. Gordon. Edinburgh: Pearson.

Foucault, Michel. 1988. *Technologies of the Self: A Seminar with Michel Foucault*. edited by M. Luther, H. Gutman, and P. Hutton. Massachusetts: University of Massachusetts Press.

Foucault, Michel. 1990. *The History of Sexuality (Vol 1)*. London: Penguin.

Foucault, Michel. 1991. "Governmentality." Pp. 87–105 in *The Foucault Effect: studies in governmentality*, edited by G. Burchell, G. Gorden, and P. Miller. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Foucault, Michel. 2008. *Foucault on Governmentality and Liberalism: The Birth of Biopolitics: Lectures at the Collège de France, 1978—1979*. edited by trans. G. Burchell. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

FRA. 2017. *EU-MIDIS II: Second European Union Minorities and Discrimination Survey – Main Results*. Luxemburg.

Freeman, Michael. 2012. "Taxis Face Licensing Crackdown in 'radical' Reform Plan." *Journal.Ie*, January 31.

Freire, Paulo. 1974. *Education for Critical Consciousness*. 2013th ed. New York: Bloomsbury Publishing Plc.

Freire, Paulo. 1996. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. London: Penguin.

Freyne, Patrick. 2012. "Dissent on the Ranks." *Irish TImes*, August 18.

Fromm, Eric. 1994. *The Art of Listening*. New York: Continuum.

Frow, John. 2005. "Discourse." Pp. 91–93 in *New Keywords: A Revised Vocabulary of Culture and Society*, edited by T. Bennett, L. Grossberg, and M. Morris. Oxford: Blackwell.

Gallagher, Aisling. 2012. "Neoliberal Governmentality and the Respatialisation of Childcare in Ireland." *Geoforum* 43(3):464–71.

Gallagher, Conor. 2018. "Just One in 240 Gardaí from a Minority Background." *Irish TImes*, May 30.

Gallagher, Conor. 2020. "Proactive Contact Is Key to Policing Diverse Society, Says Report's Author." *Irish TImes*, August 20.

Garner, Steve. 2012. *Racisms: An Introduction*. London: Sage.

Gartland, Fiona. 2010. "Taxi Group to Take Action over Regulation Act." *Irish TImes*, August 2.

Geertz, Clifford. 1973. *The Interpretation of Cultures*. New York: Basic Books.

Giddens, Anthony. 1991. *Modernity and Self-Identity: Self and Society in the Late Modern Age*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Gilroy, Paul. 2002. "The End of Antiracism." Pp. 249–64 in *Race Critical Theories*, edited by P. Essed and D. T. Goldberg. Oxford: Blackwell.

Gilroy, Paul. 2004. *After Empire Melancholia or Convivial Culture?* London: Routledge.

Glaser, B. and A. Strauss. 1967. *The Discovery of Grounded Theory*. Chicago: Aldine.

Goldberg, David Theo. 1997. *Racial Subjects. Writing on Race in America*. London: Routledge.

Goldberg, David Theo. 2002a. "Modernity, Race, Morality." Pp. 283–306 in *Race Critical Theories*, edited by P. Essed and D. T. Goldberg. Oxford: Blackwell.

Goldberg, David Theo. 2002b. *The Racial State*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Goldberg, David Theo. 2009. *The Threat of Race: Reflections on Racial Neoliberalism*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell.

Goldberg, David Theo. 2010. "Racial Neoliberalism." Pp. 591–98 in *A Dictionary of Cultural and Critical Theory*, edited by J. R. Barbera and M. Payne. UK: Wiley and Blackwell Publishing.

Goldstein, DM. 2012. "Decolonialising Actually Existing Neoliberalism." *Social Anthropology* 20(2):304–9.

Goodall, Bud H. L. 2001. *Writing the New Ethnography*. California: AltaMira.

Goodbody Economic Consultants. 2009. *Economic Review of the Small Public Service Vehicle Industry*. Dublin.

Gottdiener, M. 1993. "A Marx for Our Time: Henri Lefebvre and the Production of Space." *Sociological Theory* 11(1):129–34.

Gramsci, Antonio. 1971. *Selections from the Prison Notebooks*. London: Lawrence & Wishhart.

Graugaard, Jeppe Dyrendom. 2013. "Doing Narrative Ethnography: Methods and Research Design." Retrieved May 16, 2019 (https://patternwhichconnects.com/phd/academic_writing_files/Doing narrative ethnography %28JDG%29.pdf).

Gray, Breda. 2006. "Migrant Integration Policy: A National Fantacy of Management and Control?" *Translocations: The Irish Migration, Race and Social Transformations Review* 1(1):118–38.

Gray, Breda. 2011. "Governing Integration." Pp. 93–105 in *Globallisation, Migration and Social Transformations: Ireland in Europe and the World*, edited by B. Fanning and R. Munck. Farnham: Ashgate.

Guerin, P. 2002. "Racism and the Media in Ireland: Setting the Anti-Immigrant Agenda." in *Racism and Antiracism in Ireland*, edited by R. Lentin and R. McVeigh. Belfast: Beyond the Pale Publications.

Gunaratnam, Yasmin. 2003. *Researching "Race" and Ethnicity: Methods, Knowledge and Power*. London: Sage.

Gupta, A. and J. Ferguson. 1992. "'Beyond 'Culture': Space, Identity, and the Politics of Difference." *Cultural Anthropology* 7(1):6–23.

Hall, Stuart. 1997a. "Race, The Floating Signifier." London: Medai Education Foundation.

Hall, Stuart. 1997b. "'The Spectacle of the Other.'" in *Representation: cultural representations and signifying practices*, edited by S. Hall and O. University. London: Sage in association with the Open University.

Hall, Stuart. 2016. "Diásporas, Ou a Lógica Da Tradução Cultural." *Matrizes* 10(3):47.

Hammersley, M. and P. Atkinson. 2009. *Ethnography: Principles in Practice*. Abington: Routledge.

Hammersley, M. and A. Traianou. 2012. *Ethics in Qualitative Research: Controversies and Contexts*. London: Sage.

Hannerz, Ulf. 1996. *Transnational Connections: Culture, Peole, Places*. London: Routledge.

Harvey, David. 2005. *A Brief History of Neoliberalism*. Oxford: Oxford Univeristy Press.

Haughey, Nuala. 2002. "Nigerians Are Flocking to Their Own Churches." *Irish TImes*, October 28.

Haynes, Amanda, Michael Breen, and Eoin Devereux. 2005. "Smuggling Zebras Far Lunch : Media Framing of Asylum Seekers in the Irish Print Media." *Études Irlandaises* 30(1):109–30.

Haynes, Amanda, Eoin Devereux, and Michael Breen. 2006. "Fear, Framing and Foreigners: The Othering of Immigrants in the Irish Print Media." *International Journal of Critical Psychology* 16.

Haynes, Amanda, Eoin Devereux, and Michael Breen. 2009. "In the Know? Media, Migration and Public Beliefs." *Translocations: Migration and Social Change* 5(1):1–21.

HEA. 2015. *Higher Education Authority 2018-2022 Strategic Plan*. Dublin: Higher Education Authority.

Healy, Alison. 2008. "Women Taxi Drivers Sought for New Service." *The Irish Times*, January 17.

Heaphy, E. 2014. "Delicate Recollection." *Univeristy Times*, May.

Heller, A. 1984. *Everyday Life*. London: Routledge.

Heneghan, Grace. 2011. *Immigrant Council Report Rallies Against Racism*. Dublin.

Heppner, P. .., D. .. Kivlighan, and B. .. Wampold. 1999. *Qualtiative Research, in Research Design in Counselling*. California: Wadsworth.

Herve, F. 1988. "Late Paleozoic Subduction and Accretion in Southern Chile." *Episodes* 11:183–88.

Hilgers, M. 2013. "Embodying Neoliberalism." *Social Anthropology* 21:75–89.

Hogh, A., I. Gomes Carneiro, H. Giver, and R. Rugulies. 2011. "Are Immigrants in the Nursing Industry at Increased Risk of Bullying at Work? A One-Year Follow-up Study." *Scandinavian Journal of Psychology* 57(1):49–56.

Holloway, John. 2010. *Change the World Without Taking Power*. New York: Pluto Press.

Howard, M. 2009. *The Politics of Citizenship in Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Huddleston, Thomas and Maarten P. Vink. 2015. "Full Membership or Equal Rights? The Link between Naturalisation and Integration Policies for Immigrants in 29 European States." *Comparative Migration Studies* 3(1):8.

ICCL. 2006. *Implementing MorrisAn Agenda for Change: Placing Human Rights at the Core of Policing in Ireland*. Dublin.

ICI. 2015. *Taking Racism Seriously Experiences of Violence, Harassment and Discrimination in The Taxi Industry*. Dublin.

Ignatiev, N. 1995. *How the Irish Begam White*. London: Routledge.

Irish Examiner. 2009a. "African Taxi Worker Admits Tension with Irish Drivers." *Irish Examiner*, April 2.

Irish Examiner. 2009b. "Taxi Driver Denies Accusations of Racism." *Irish Examiner*, April 1.

Irish Statute Book. 2003. *Taxi Regulation Act 2003*. Ireland.

Irish Statute Book. 2004. *Twenty-Seventh Amendment of TheConstitution Act 2004*. Ireland.

Irish Statute Book. 2013. *Taxi Regulation Act 2013*. Ireland.

Irish Statute Book. 2015. *Marriage Act 2015*. Ireland: Irish Statute Book.

Irish Statute Book. 2018. *THE HEALTH (REGULATION OF TERMINATION OF PREGNANCY) ACT 2018*. Ireland.

Irish Times. 2001. "Taxi Deregulation Decision 'Seemed Unreasonable.'" *Irish TImes*, January 13.

Irish Times. 2007. "Concern at Bias against Black Taxi Drivers." *Irish TImes*, September 28.

Irish Times. 2009. "Garda Who Lied about Taxi Attack Had Made Earlier False Assault Complaint." *Irish TImes*.

Jaichand, Vinodh. 2010a. *Riding Along With Racism ?* Galway.

Jaichand, Vinodh. 2010b. *Riding Along With Racism? Research on the Galway Taxi Industry: Employment Opportunities, Patterns of Public Use and User Perceptions*. Galway.

Jeanpierre, W. A. 1965. "Sartre's Theory of 'Anti-Racist Racism' in His Study of Negritude." *The Massachusetts Review* 6(4):870–72.

Jeffries, Adrianne. 2013. "Taxi Race: Can Uber and Hailo Deliver a Real-Time Revolution?" *The Verge*. Retrieved December 14, 2020 (https://www.theverge.com/2013/2/7/3964394/taxi-race-can-uber-and-hailo-deliver-a-real-time-revolution).

Jhally, Sut. 1997. "Stuart Hall Lecture - Race, the Floating Signifier [Part 17].Avi." *Youtube*. Retrieved January 17, 2020 (https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D6lIg9QVJ-I&list=PLfDA1UCYHRyfh7EpZbhmwxpyZHSsdhuO4).

John M. 2014. "The Discursive Construction of Nigerian Taxi Drivers in Dublin." *Taxiorg.Ie*. Retrieved April 12, 2016 (http://irishtaxi.org/forum/index.php/topic,27265.0.html).

Johnson, B. and L. Christnesen. 2012. *Educational Research, Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Approach*. 4th Editio. California: Sage.

Joseph, Ebun. 2018a. "Whiteness and Racism: Examining the Racial Order in Ireland." *Irish Journal of Sociology* 26(1):46–70.

Joseph, Ebun. 2018b. "Whiteness and Racism: Examining the Racial Order in Ireland." *Irish Journal of Sociology* 26(1):46–70.

Joseph, Ebun. 2021. "Disposable Workers: Responses to #BLM and Covid 19 as Temporary Disruption to the Status Quo." Pp. 20–29 in *The Sociological Observer: Black Lives Matter*, edited by L. Michael and E. Joseph. Kildare: Sociololgical Associalton of Ireland.

Joseph, Ebun. 2022. "The Wages and Price of Whiteness." *Radical History Review* 2022(143):79–88.

Joseph, Lauren. 2008. "Finding Space Beyond Variables: An Analytical Review of Urban Space and Social Inequalities." *Spaces for Difference: An Interdisciplinary Journal* 1(2):29–50.

Joyce, Sindy. 2018. "Minceirs Siuladh: An Ethnographic Study of Young Travellers' Experience of Racism in an Irish City." University of Limerick.

Judaken, Jonathan. 2008. "Sartre on Racism." Pp. 23–42 in *From Existential Phenomenology to Globalization and "the New Racism."* Albany: State University of New York Press.

Kaas, L. and C. Manger. 2012. "Ethnic Discrimination in Germany's Labour Market: A Field Experiment." *German Economic Review* 13(1):1–20.

Kapferer, Bruce. 1988. *Legends of People, Myth of State*. Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press.

Kelly, Alan. 2013. "New Regime to Allow for 'clean up' of Taxi Sector." *Labour.Ie*. Retrieved October 4, 2020 (https://www.labour.ie/news/2013/05/16/new-regime-to-allow-for-clean-up-of-taxi-sector-mi/).

Kelly, Olivia. 2011. "Call for Fees Surplus to Fund Taxi Industry." *Irish TImes*, May 28.

Kiberd, Declan. 1997. *Inventing Ireland*. Boston: Harvard University Press.

King-O'Riain, Rebecca Chiyoko. 2007. "Counting on the `Celtic Tiger'." *Ethnicities* 7(4):516–42.

Kingston, Gillian, Frances McGinnity, and Philip J. O'Connell. 2015. "Discrimination in the Labour Market: Nationality, Ethnicity and the Recession." *Work, Employment and Society* 29(2):213–32.

Kingston, Gillian, Philip J. O'Connell, and Elish Kelly. 2013. *Ethnicity and Nationality in the Irish Labour Market: Evidence from the QNHS Equality Module 2010*. Dublin: ESRI.

Komolafe, Julius. 2002. "Searching for Fortune: The Geographical Process of Nigerian Migration to Dublin, Ireland." *Irinkerindo: A Journal of African Migration* (1).

Komolafe, Julius. 2008. "Nigerian Migration to Ireland: Movements, Motivations and Experiences." *Irish Geography* 41(2):225–41.

Konechi, K. 2008. "Touching and Gesture Exchange as an Element of Emotional Bond Construction: Application of Visual Sociology in the Research on Interaction between Humans and Animals." *Forum for Qualitative Research* 9(3):1–46.

Koopmans, Ruud, Paul Statham, Marco Giugni, and Florence Passy. 2005. *Contested Citizenship: Immigration and Cultural Diversity in Europe*. Minnesota: University of Minnesota Press.

Laguerre, Michel. 1999. *Minoritised Space: An Inquiry into the Spatial Order of Things*. Berkeley California: Insititute of Governemental Studies Press and the Insititute of Urban and Regional Development University of California.

Lally, Conor. 2006. "Inquiry Reveals Welfare Fraud by Foreign Nationals." *Irish TImes*, September 11.

Landy, David. 2011. *Jewish Identity and Palestinian Rights: Diaspora Jewish Opposition to Israel*. London: Zed Books.

Law, John and John Urry. 2004. "Enacting the Social." *Economy and Society* 33(3):390–410.

Lears, T. J. Jackson. 1985. "The Concept of Cultural Hegemony: Problems and Possibilities." *The American Historical Review* 90(3):567–93.

Lefebvre, Henri. 1991. *The Production of Space*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Lehtovuori, Panu. 2011. "Even in Sweden: Racisms, Racialized Spaces, and the Popular Geographical

Imagination." *Sociological Research Online*. Retrieved December 20, 2020 (https://www.socresonline.org.uk/6/1/pred.html).

Lemert, Charles. 2004. "Can the Worlds Be Changed? On Ethics and the Multicultural Dream." *Thesis Eleven* 78.

Lentin, Alana and Gavan Titley. 2011. *The Crisis of Multiculturalism: Racism in a Neoliberal Age*. London: Zed Books.

Lentin, Ronit. 2004. "From Racial State to Racist State: Ireland on the Eve of the Citizenship Referendum." *Variant* 2(20):7.

Lentin, Ronit. 2007. "Ireland: Racial State and Crisis Racism." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 30(4).

Lentin, Ronit. 2008. "From Racial State to Racist State? Racism and Immigration in Twentieth Century Ireland." Pp. 255–73 in *Race and State*, edited by A. Lentin and R. Lentin. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Press.

Lentin, Ronit. 2012. "Turbans, Hijabs and Other Differences: 'Integration from below' and Irish Interculturalism." *European Journal of Cultural Studies* 15(2):226–42.

Lentin, Ronit and Alana Lentin. 2006. *Race and State*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Press.

Lentin, Ronit and Robbie McVeigh. 2006. *After Optimism? Ireland, Racism and Globalisation,*. Dublin: Metro Eireann Publications.

Lentin, Ronit and Elena Moreo. 2012. "Introduction: Immigration in Ireland and Migrant-Led Activism." Pp. 1–20 in *Migrant Activism and Integration from Below in Ireland*, edited by R. Lentin and E. Moreo. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.

Levine, Philippa. 2000. "Orientalist Sociology and the Creation of Colonial Sexualities." *Feminist Review* (65):5–21.

Liamputtong, P. 2010. *Performing Cross-Cultural Research*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Lincoln, Y. .. and E. .. Guba. 1984. *Naturalistic Inquiry*. California: Sage.

Looney, Cormac. 2003. "Garda Retained 'inappropriate' Data on Pulse." *Irish TImes*, April 30.

Lynch, C. 2009. *Racism in Ireland. European Network Against Racism Shadow Report, Ireland, 2008*.

Macarthaigh, Sean. 2019. "Taxi Driver Numbers Increase for First Time in Almost a Decade." *Irish TImes*, July 16.

Macey, David. 2000. *Dictionary of Critical Thinking*. London: Penguin.

MacMillan, J. H. and S. Schumacher. 2001. *Research in Education. A Conceptual Introduction*. 5th Editio. Boston: Longman.

MacNamee, Garreth. 2017. "Gardaí Thank Whistleblower Maurice McCabe for Bringing the Penalty Points Scandal to Light." *Thejournal.Ie*, December 1.

Maguire, Mark and Fiona Murphy. 2012. *Integration in Ireland: The Everyday Lives of African Migrants*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Maguire, Mark and Fiona Murphy. 2014. "Neoliberalism, Securitization and Racialisation in the Irish Taxi Industry." *European Journal of Cultural Studies* 17(3):282–97.

Maguire, Mark and Fiona Murphy. 2016. "Ontological (in)Security and African Pentecostalism in Ireland." *Ethnos* 81(5):842–64.

Maguire, Mark and Gavin Titley. 2010. "The Body and Soul of Integration." *Translocations* 6(2).

Maines, David R. 1993. "Narrative's Moment and Sociology's Phenomenon: Toward a Narrative Sociology." *The Sociological Quarterly* 34(1).

Malik, Kenan. 2008. *Strange Fruit: Why Both Sides Are Wrong in the Race Debate*. Oxford: Oneworld.

Marshall, C. and G. .. Rossman. 1999. *Designing Qualitative Research*. 3rd ed. London: Sage.

MASI. 2020. "Statement on the Programme for Government." *Masi.Ie*. Retrieved January 5, 2021 (https://www.masi.ie/2020/06/19/statement-on-the-programme-for-government/#more-752).

Maso, Ilja. 2001. "Phenomenology and Ethnography." in *Handbook of Ethnography*, edited by A. Coffey and S. Delamont. California: Sage.

Maxwell, J. A. 1996. *Qualitative Research Design: An Interactive Approach*. California: Sage.

McCrea, Niamh. 2016. "Community Development, Venture Philanthropy and Neoliberal Governmentality: A Case from Ireland." Pp. 103–20 in *"Politics, power and community development."* Policy Press.

McFadyen, C. 2008. *Getting on From Migration to Integration: Chinese, Indian, Lithuanian, and Nigerian Migrants Experiences in Ireland*. Dublin.

McGee, Harry. 2003. "Media Responses to Asylum." Pp. 187–202 in *Sanctuary in Ireland - Perspectives on Asylum Law and Policy*, edited by U. Fraser and C. Harvey. Dublin: Insititute of Public Administration.

McGinnity, F, S. Enright, E. Quinn, B. Maitre, I. Privalko, M. Darmody, and M. Polakowski. 2020. *Monitoring Report on Integration 2020*. Dublin.

McGinnity, F., D. Watson, and Gillian Kingston. 2012. *Analysing the Experience of Discrimination in Ireland: Evidence from the QNHS Equality Module 2010*. Dublin.

McGinnity, Frances., Raffaele. Grotti, Sarah. Groarke, and Sarah. Coughlan. 2018. *Ethnicity and Nationality in the Irish Labour Market*. Dublin, Ireland.

McGinnity, Frances., Jacqueline. Nelson, Pete. Lunn, and Emma. Quinn. 2009. *Discrimation in Recruitment: Evidence from a Field Experiment*.

McGinnity, Frances, Merike Darmody, and Aisling Murray. 2015. *Academic Achievement among Immigrant Children in Irish Primary Schools*. Dublin.

McGinnity, Frances, Raffaele Grotti, Sarah Groarke, and Sarah Coughlan. 2018. *Ethnicity and Nationality in the Irish Labour Market*.

McGinnity, Frances, Philip J. O'Connell, Emma Quinn, and James Williams. 2006. *Migrants' Experience of Racism and Discrimination in Ireland: Survey Report*. Dublin: ESRI.

McGinnity, Frances, Ivan Privalko, Éamonn Fahey, Doireann O'Brien, and Shannen Enright. 2020. *Origin and Integration: A Study of Migrants in the 2016 Irish Census*. Dublin, Ireland.

McGinnity, Frances, Emma Quinn, Evie McCullough, Shannen Enright, and Sarah Curristan. 2021. *Measures to Combat Racial Discrimination and Promote Diversity in the Labour Market: A Review of Evidence*. Dublin, Ireland.

McGreevy, Ronan. 2012. "Gardaí Put Brakes on 19 Rogue Taxi Drivers in Two-Hour Blitz." *Irish TImes*, April 29.

McGreevy, Ronan. 2019. "Gardaí Investigate Alleged Racist Attack on Taxi Driver." *Irish TImes*, April 28.

McGuire, Erin. 2019. "Some Taxi Drivers' Bumper Stickers Target Immigrants." *Dublin Inquirer*, April 17.

McNeice, Stephen. 2019. "Irish-Nigerian Man Warns of Dangers of 'riling People up' about Immigrants." *Newstalk*, November 14.

McQuinn, Cormac. 2013. "Report Finds Gardai Snooping on Celebrities and Sports Stars." *Irish Independent*, May 20.

Meer, N. and T. Modood. 2011. "How Does Interculturalism Contrast with Multiculturalism?" *Journal of Intercultural Studies*.

Melia, Paul. 2012. "Taxi Regulator to Put Brakes on Drivers as Complaints Rise." *Irish Independent*, January 22.

Mezzadra, Sandro, Julian Reid, and Ranabir Samaddar. 2013. "Introduction: Reading Foucault in the Postcolonial Present." in *The Biopolitics of Development: Reading Michel Foucault in the Postcolonial Present*, edited by S. Mezzadra, J. Reid, and R. Samaddar. New York: Springer.

Michael, Lucy. 2015. *Afrophobia in Ireland: Racism against People of African Descent*.

Michael, Lucy. 2016. *IReport.Ie: Reports of Racism in Ireland 2016*. Dublin.

Michael, Lucy. 2017. "Anti-Black Racism: Afrophobia, Exclusion and Global Racisms." Pp. 275–99 in

Critical Perspectives on Hate Crime. London: Palgrave Macmillan UK.

Michael, Lucy. 2019. *Ireport.Ie: Reports of Racism in Ireland 2019*.

Michael, Lucy. 2020. *Reports of Racism in Ireland*. Dublin.

Michael, Lucy and Ebun Joseph. 2021. "Black Lives Matter." *THE SOCIOLOGICAL OBSERVER* 2(1):63.

Mill, John Stuart. 1913. *On Liberty*. London: Longmans, Green and Co.

Misawa, Mitsunori. 2010. "Queer Race Pedagogy for Educators in Higher Education: Dealing with Power Dynamics and Positionality of LGBTQ Students of Color." *International Journal of Critical Pedagogy* 3(1):26–35.

Molotch, Harvey. 1993. "Review: The Space of Lefebvre." *Theory and Society* 22(6):887–95.

Moreo, Elena. 2012. "On Visibility and Invisibility: Migrant Practices between Regimes of Representation and Self-Determination." Pp. 72–94 in *Migrant Activism and Integration from Below in Ireland*, edited by L. Ronit and E. Moreo. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.

Moriarty, Elaine. 2005. "Telling Identity Stories: The Routinisation of Racialisation of Irishness." *Sociological Research Online* 10(3):90–106.

Moriarty, Elaine. 2006. "Routinised Practices and Technologies of the State: Dialectical Constitution of Irishness and Otherness." Pp. 292–312 in *Race and State*, edited by R. Lentin and A. Lentin. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Press.

MRCI. 2010. "Racism and Migrant Workers in Ireland." *Migrant Rights Center Ireland* Policy Pap.

Muller, Johan. 1999. "Reason, Reality and Public Trust. The Case of Educational Research for Policy." Pp. 1–367 in *GETTING LEARNING RIGHT Report to the President's Education Initiative Research Project*, edited by N. Taylor and P. Vinjevold. SA: The Joint Education Trust.

Murphy, Claire. 2008. "'I'm Irish' Stickers Further Stoke Taxi Tensions." *The Herald*, September 18.

Murphy, Clíodhna, Leanne Caulfield, and Mary Gilmartin. 2019. "Developing Immigrant Integration Policy in the Irish Public Sector: An International Human Rights and Public Sector Duty Approach." *Administration* 67(4):27–45.

Myrdal, Gunnar. 1972. *An American Dilemma*. New York: Random House.

National Transport Authority. 2013. "TFI Taxi Driver Check App." *Transport for Ireland*. Retrieved December 14, 2020 (https://www.transportforireland.ie/getting-around/by-taxi/driver-check-app/).

NCCRI. 2007. *Reported Incidents Relating to Racism and Strategic Response from the NCCRI Jan-June 2007*. Dublin.

Nedeljković, Vukašin. 2020. *Asylum Archive*. Dublin: Asylum Archives.

Nee, Martina. 2010. "Taxi Industry Racism Report Criticised as Biased and Divisive." *Galway Advertiser*, December 9.

Nelson, Jacqueline and Kevin Dunn. 2017. "Neoliberal Anti-Racism." *Progress in Human Geography* 41(1):26–43.

Neuman, L. W. 2003. *Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Appproaches*. 5th ed. New York: Allyn and Bacon.

Ni Chonaill, Brid. 2021. "Black Lives Matter and Higher Education in Ireland." Pp. 49–56 in *Black Lives Matter: Sociiological Observer*, edited by L. Michael and E. Joseph. Kildare.

Ní Chonaill, Bríd. 2021. "Black Lives Matter and Higher Education in Ireland." Pp. 49–55 in *The Sociological Observer: Black Lives Matter*, edited by L. Michael and E. Joseph. Kildare: Sociololgical Associalton of Ireland.

NTA. 2012. *Taxi Regulation Review – List of Recommended Actions*. Dublin.

NTA. 2016. *Statistical Bulletin Number: 01/2016*. Dublin.

O'Carroll, Gerry. 2012. "Are Some Dublin Taxi Drivers Using Covert Signal of 'Irishness.'" *The Herald*, February 20.

O'Connell, John. 2002. "Travellers in Ireland: An Examination of Discrimination and Racism." Pp. 57–71 in *Racism and Antiracism in Ireland*, edited by R. Lentin and R. McVeigh. Dublin: TCD.

O'Connell, Philip J. 2019. "Why Are so Few Africans at Work in Ireland? Immigration Policy and Labour Market Disadvantage." *Irish Journal of Sociology* 27(3):273–95.

O'Connell, PJ. and F. McGinnity. 2008. *Immigrants at Work: Ethnicity and Nationality in the Irish Labour Market*. Dublin.

O'Connell, PJ and O. Kenny. 2017. "Annual Monitoring Report on Integration 2016." Pp. 18–31 in *Employment and Integration*, edited by P. O'Connell and O. Kenny. Dublin: ESRI.

O'Doherty, Caroline. 2012. "Taxi Drivers Unhappy with Planned Use of €20m Fund." *Irish Examiner*, January 2.

O'Halloran, Marie. 2019. "TD Accused of Racism after Questioning Billions in Remittances Sent to Nigeria." *Irish TImes*, November 12.

O'Keeffe, Robert. 2013. "The Discursive Construction of Nigerian Taxi Drivers in Dublin. Unpublished Mphil Thesis." Trinity College Dublin.

O'Leary, Zina. 2010. *Teh Essential Guide to Doing Your Research Project*. London: Sage.

O'Toole, Fintan. 2006. "Foreword." in *After Optimism? Ireland, Racism and Globalisation*, edited by R. Lentin and R. McVeigh. Dublin: Metro Eireann Publications.

O´Faolain, Aodhan. 2017. "Garda Who Claims He Has Been Subjected to Racial Abuse Takes High Court Challenge over Sick Pay." *Thejournal.Ie*.

Oireachtas Report. 2011. *Priority Questions - Taxi Industry*.

OMI. 2008. *Migration Nation: Statement on Integration Strategy and Diversity Management*. Dublin.

Omi, M. and H. Winant. 1986. *Racial Formation in the United States*. New York: Routledge.

Pager, D. and L. Quillian. 2005. "Walking the Talk? What Employers Say versus What They Do'." *American Sociological Review* 70(3):335–80.

Pasura, D. 2011. "Shades of Belonging: African Pentecostals in Twenty-First Century Ireland." *African Affairs* 110(438):154–55.

Patton, M. Q. 2002. *Qualitative and Research and Evaluation Methods*. California: Sage.

Phenninx, R., D. Spenser, and N. Van Hear. 2008. *Migration and Integration in Europe: The State of Research*. Oxford: Oxford Univeristy Press.

Pittman, John P. 2016. "Double Consciousness." *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Retrieved January 4, 2021 (https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/double-consciousness/#Conc).

Pred, Allan. 2000. *Even in Sweden: Racisms, Racialized Spaces, and the Popular Geographical Imagination*. Berkeley California: University of California Press.

Radhakrishnan, R. 1996. *Diasporic Mediations*. NED-New. University of Minnesota Press.

Rafferty, A. 2012. "Ethnic Penalties in Graduate Level Over-Education, Unemployment and Wages: Evidence from Britain." *Work, Employment and Society* 26(6):987–1006.

Rattansi, A. 2011. *Multiculturalism: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford Univeristy Press.

Reform, Department of Justice Equality and Law. 2005. *Planning for Diversity – The National Action Plan Against Racism*. Dublin.

Rhodes, R. A. W. 1994. "The Hollowing Out of the State." *Political Quarterly* 65:138–51.

Riessman, Catherine Kohler. 2008. *Narrative Methods for the Human Sciences*. California: Sage.

Ritchie, J. and J. Lewis. 2003. *Qualitative Research Practice: A Guide for Social Science Students and Researchers*. London: Sage.

Robyn, Ryle. 2008. "Some Are Good and Some Are Bad: Contradictory Consciousness in a Suburban Community." in *American Sociological Annual Meeting*.

RTE. 2011. "Primetime Investigates: Dodgy Cabs Ltd."

Ruhs, Martin. 2005. *Managing the Immigration and Employment of Non-EU Nationals in Ireland*. Vol. 19.

Russell, H., E. Quinn, R. O'Riain, and F. McGinnity. 2008. *The Experience of Discrimination in Ireland. Analysis of the QNHS Equality Module. Dublin*. Dublin.

Ryan, Orla. 2014. "Rogue Taxi Drivers Beware: Gardaí Are Clamping Down." *Journal.Ie*, November 29.

Said, Edward. 1979. *Orientalism*. New York: Vintage.

Sassen, Saskia. 2002. "The Repositioning of Citizenship: Emergent Subjects and Spaces for Politics." *Berkeley Journal of Sociology* 46:4–26.

Schegloff, Emanuel A. 1997. "Whose Text? Whose Context?" *Discourse and Society* 8:165–87.

Schwandt, T. A. 2001. *Dictionary of Qualitative Inquiry*. 2nd Editio. London: Sage.

Schwandt, T. A. 2007. *The Sage Dictionary of Quantitative Inquiry*. London: Sage.

Seale, C. 2000. *The Quality of Qualitative Research*. London: Sage.

Sennett, Richard. 2003. *Respect: The Formation of Character in an Age of Inequality*. London: Allen Lane and Penguin.

Shank, R. C. and R. Abelson. 1977. *Scripts, Plans, Goals and Understanding*. New Jersey: Hillsdale.

Shields, MA and S. Wheatley Price. 2001. "Language Fluency and Immigrant Employment Prospects: Evidence from Britain's Ethnic Minorities." *Applied Economics Letters* 8(11):741–45.

Shortell, Timothy and Evrick Brown. 2016. *Walking in the European City*. London: Routledge.

Siapera, E., E. Moreo, and J. Zhou. 2018. *Hate Track: Tracking and Monitoring Racist Speech Online*. Dublin.

Silberman, R., R. Alba, and I. Fournier. 2007. "Segmented Assimilation in France? Discrimination in the Labour Market against the Second Generation." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 30(1):1–27.

Silverman, David. 2010. *Doing Qualitative Research*. Third Edit. edited by Sage. London.

Simmel, Georg. 1950. "The Stranger." Pp. 402–8 in *'The Stranger': The Sociology of Georg Simmel*, edited by K. H. Wolff. London: Free Press.

Smith, Jason A. 2017. "Racial Formation." *Global Social Theory*. Retrieved December 2, 2020 (https://globalsocialtheory.org/topics/racial-formation/).

Soja, Edward. 1989. *Postmodern Geographies: The Reassertion of Space in Critical Theory*. London: Verso.

Solomos, John. 2001. "Race, Multiculturalism and Difference." in *Culture and Citizenship*, edited by N. Stevenson. London: Sage.

Soothill, Jane. 2010. "Abel Ugba. Shades of Belonging: African Pentecostals in Twenty-First Century Ireland. Trenton, N.J., and Asmara: Africa World Press, 2009. Xii + 284 Pp. Diagrams. Bibliography. Index. $29.95. Paper." *African Studies Review* 53(2):216–17.

Stanton, David. 2020. "Statement by Minister Stanton on Racism Affecting Ethnic Minorities in Ireland." *Department of Justice and Equality*. Retrieved October 27, 2020 (https://www.gov.ie/en/speech/d17dfb-statement-by-minister-stanton-on-racism-affecting-ethnic-minorities-/).

Stout, Vanessa. 2016. "'Your Place or Mine?' An Examination of Nigerian Incorporation in Dublin and Los Angeles Cityspace." Trinity College Dublin.

Strauss, A. and J. Corbin. 1990. *Basics of Qualitative Research*. California: Sage.

Taylor, Charles. 1992. "The Politics of Recognition." in *Multiculturalism and the Politics of Recognition*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Titley, Gavan. 2011. "It Ain't Easy Being Blue." *Polotico.Ie*. Retrieved May 12, 2019 (https://magill.ie/archive/it-ain't-easy-being-blue).

Titley, Gavin. 2013. "Asylum Seekers in Ireland Languish in the Magdalene Laundries of Our Time." *The Guardian*, October 3.

Tyler, Imogen. 2013. *Revolting Subjects: Social Abjection and Resistance in Neoliberal Britain*. London: Zed Books.

Ugba, Abel. 2006. "African Pentecostals in 21st Century Ireland." *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review* 95(378):168–73.

Ugba, Abel. 2009. *Shades of Belonging: African Pentecostals in Twenty-first Century Ireland*. New Jersey: Africa World Press.

Ukah, Asonzeh. 2013. "Review: SHADES OF BELONGING: AFRICAN PENTECOS- TALS IN TWENTY-FIRST CENTURY IRELAND." *Religious Studies Review* 39(2).

De Vos, A. S. 1998. *Research at Grasssroots*. Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Wacquant, L. 2012. "Three Steps to a Historical Anthropology of Actually Existing Neoliberalism." *Social Anthropology* 20(1):66–79.

Walker, C. J. and C. A. Beclerly. 1987. "The Effect of Anxiety on Rumor Transmission." *Journal of Social Behavior and Personality* 2:353–60.

Walker, C. J. and B. Blaine. 1991. "The Virulence of Dread Rumors: A Field Experiment." *Language and Communication* 11.

Watt, D. 2007. "On Becoming a Qualitative Researcher: The Value of Reflexivity." *The Qualitative Report* 12(1):82–101.

Weir, Stephen. 2019. "The Liberalisation of Taxi Policy: Capture and Recapture?" *Administration* 67(2):113–35.

White, Elisa. 2002. "Forging African Diaspora Places In Dublin's Retro-Global Spaces: Minority Making in a New Global City." *City: Analysis of Urban Trends, Culture, Theory, Policy, Action* 6(2):251–70.

White, Elisa. 2011. *Modernity, Freedom, and the African Diaspora: Dublin, New Orleans, Paris*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Wodak, Ruth, Rudolf de Cillia, Martin Reisigl, and Karin Liebhart. 2010. *The Discursive Construction of National Idenity*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Zuberi, T. 2008. "Deracializing Social Sciences Statistics: Problems in the Quantification of Race." in *White Logic, White Methods: Racism and Methodology*, edited by T. Zuberi and E. Bonilla-Silva. Landham MD: Rowman and Littlefield.