

Appendix 2

Department of Transport, Tourism and Sport Self-Assessment Checklists

Checklist 2 – Capital Expenditure Being Considered

Q1: Was a Preliminary Appraisal undertaken for all projects > €5m

Q2: Was an appropriate appraisal method used in respect of each capital project or capital programme/grant scheme?

Q3: Was a CBA completed for all projects exceeding €20m?

Q4: Were all Programmes with an annual value in excess of €30m and of 5 years or more duration subjected to an ex-ante evaluation?

Q5: Was an Approval in Principle granted by the Sanctioning Authority for all projects before they entered the Planning and Design Phase?

Q6: If a CBA was required was it submitted to the CEEU for their view?

Q7: Were the NDFA Consulted for projects costing more than €20m?

Q8: Were all projects that went forward for tender in line with the Approval in Principle and if not was the detailed appraisal revisited and a fresh Approval in Principle granted?

Q9: Was approval granted to proceed to tender?

Q10: Were Procurement Rules complied with?

Q11: Were State Aid rules checked for all supports?

Q12: Were the tenders received in line with the Approval in Principle in terms of cost and what is expected to be delivered?

Q13: Were Performance Indicators specified for each project/programme which will allow for the evaluation of its efficiency and effectiveness?

Q14: Have steps been put in place to gather the Performance Indicator data?

Name of Division/Agency	SubHead	Question No.	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 0 – 4	Comment/Action Required
NRA	B.3	1	4	A project appraisal report has been prepared, or is being prepared, depending on the stage of the scheme, for all schemes.
NRA	B.3	2	4	In the case of schemes that went through earlier stage appraisal in earlier years, the appraisal method used was the one applicable at the time.

NRA	B.3	3	4	
NRA	B.3	4	N/A	None are past 5 years since Business Cases were approved.
NRA	B.3	5	4	No schemes can start planning and design without approval. The nomenclature of the approval was that the relevant time.
NRA	B.3	6	N/A	No Preliminary Appraisals have been carried out since the Code mandated that they be submitted to DPER.
NRA	B.3	7	4	Regular review with DTTAS & DPER of potential PPP possibilities; NDFA part of consultation.
NRA	B.3	8	4	All NRA schemes are re-appraised at implementation phase.
NRA	B.3	9	4	No schemes proceed to tender without approval / authorisation.
NRA	B.3	10	4	
NRA	B.3	11	4	
NRA	B.3	12	3	Some tenders below expectation in terms of cost.
NRA	B.3	13	3	Performance indicators on programmes need a little more work; projects in good shape.
NRA	B.3	14	4	
RSA	B.4	1	4	Yes, All Capital Programmes that incur a gross expenditure greater than € 5M is outlined in the Authority's CMOD Return each year.
RSA	B.4	2	3	Yes, All Capital Programmes are assessed in respect of affordability, value for money and with other alternatives.
RSA	B.4	3	N/A	
RSA	B.4	4	N/A	
RSA	B.4	5	4	Yes, The Department of Finance and the Department of Transport Tourism and Sport are made aware of all Capital Programmes and sanction is sought for all programmes.
RSA	B.4	6	N/A	
RSA	B.4	7	N/A	
RSA	B.4	8	N/A	
RSA	B.4	9	4	Yes
RSA	B.4	10	4	All Procurement law, and rules are complied with.
RSA	B.4	11	N/A	
RSA	B.4	12	4	Yes, many programmes total contract cost came in under budget.
RSA	B.4	13	4	KPIs outlined for each programme
RSA	B.4	14	4	Part of the Contract Management piece

MBRS	B.4	1	N/A	MBRS does not have capital expenditure in excess of 5 million
MBRS	B.4	2	4	Yes all capital programmes are assessed
MBRS	B.4	3	N/A	
MBRS	B.4	4	N/A	
MBRS	B.4	5	N/A	
MBRS	B.4	6	N/A	
MBRS	B.4	7	N/A	
MBRS	B.4	8	4	Yes - The Department of Transport, Tourism and Sport is informed of all capital programmes
MBRS	B.4	9	4	Yes
MBRS	B.4	10	4	All procurement rules are compiled with
MBRS	B.4	11	N/A	
MBRS	B.4	12	4	Yes, tenders were received in lin with the approval in principle.
MBRS	B.4	13	4	Yes the public tender process was attired to
MBRS	B.4	14	4	Yes
NTA	B.8	1	4	
NTA	B.8	2	3	All projects and grant schemes are subject to the relevant guideline in the NTA's suite of Project Management Guidelines which include: 1. Guidelines for Projects up to €20m value; 2. Guidelines for the Management of Investment Projects delivered by conventional procurement; 3. Guidelines for Investment Projects delivered by PPP 4. Cost management guidelines for investment projects
NTA	B.8	3	4	
NTA	B.8	4	N/A	
NTA	B.8	5	4	All projects and grant schemes are subject to the guideline controls.
NTA	B.8	6	N/A	No relevant projects
NTA	B.8	7	4	Yes, there has been on-going consultation with NDFA on the Luas Cross City light rail project.
NTA	B.8	8	4	Change control is in place.
NTA	B.8	9	4	Progress of projects is controlled by approval points.
NTA	B.8	10	3	Grant recipients are required to follow public procurement guidelines and all projects and grant schemes are subject to the NTA's cyclical

				programme of audit and assurance testing.
NTA	B.8	11	4	Yes in the case of PSO bus fleet investment
	B.8	12	4	Grant recipients are required to follow public procurement guidelines and all projects and grant schemes are subject to the NTA's cyclical programme of audit and assurance testing.
NTA	B.8	13	3	Targets / outcomes have been used.
NTA	B.8	14	3	Project/programme outcome information is gathered.
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	1	4	All projects are subject to internal guidelines. IE adheres to the Public Spending Code in management of projects & programmes
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	2	4	See above
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	3	4	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	4	3	CBA of proposed programme is in accordance with DoF guidelines e.g. Railway Safety Programme. Task Force established recommending the programme of works, with mid term reviews carried out on each of the three programmes
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	5	3	1. The NTA have accepted project execution plans. 2. The DTtaS has a limited number of projects in 2013 which come below the €5M threshold, which were approved in line with internal procedures
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	6	N/A	This is a duty of the Sanctioning Body.
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	7	4	The NDFA were consulted on the DART Underground only. Private financing was not considered appropriate for other projects. This was agreed with the Sanctioning Authority
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	8	4	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	9	4	1. For NTA funded projects with a Project Execution Plan. 2. Non GDA - individual projects were all below the Public Spending Code Thresholds
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	10	4	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	11	4	
Irish Rail (outside	B.8	12	3	General compliance with public

GDA)				procurement rules, however, there was an issue with Reilly's Crossing. Additional funding was approved by the Sanctioning Authority
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	13	3	Targets/outcomes are used for RSP and they follow internal guidelines
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	14	3	Output information is gathered for the RSP
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	D.5	1	N/A	No expenditure being considered
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	D.5	2	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	D.5	3	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	D.5	4	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	D.5	5	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	D.5	6	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	D.5	7	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	D.5	8	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	D.5	9	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	D.5	10	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	D.5	11	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	D.5	12	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	D.5	13	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	D.5	14	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5.	1	4	National Indoor Arena forms part of Campus Master Plan which was approved by Minister and followed prior submission of a Development Control Plan (DCP)
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5.	2	4	Campus Master Plan has been fully appraised as above (included involvement of relevant stakeholders and other Agencies)
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5.	3	0	No formal CBA was prepared. However, DCP and Master Plan for Campus were prepared and submitted for Ministerial approval
National Sports Campus Development	D.5.	4	N/A	

Authority (NSCDA)				
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5.	5	4	Yes. Ministerial approval of DCP and subsequent Master Plan. Standalone projects subject to Ministerial approval
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5.	6	0	No
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5.	7	0	No
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5.	8	N/A	Project has not yet gone to tender - project to be referred to Department post-planning permission and post tender evaluation stages
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5.	9	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5.	10	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5.	11	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5.	12	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5.	13	N/A	However, this will form part of brief to consultant Technical Advisers
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5.	14	N/A	
Failte Ireland	E.3	1	4	
Failte Ireland	E.3	2	4	
Failte Ireland	E.3	3	N/A	We don't have any individual capital projects in excess of €20m
Failte Ireland	E.3	4	N/A	
Failte Ireland	E.3	5	3	In relation to capital grants to projects by third parties, they are various stages when they are presented to FI for Grant funding
Failte Ireland	E.3	6	N/A	
Failte Ireland	E.3	7	N/A	

Failte Ireland	E.3	8	4	
Failte Ireland	E.3	9	4	
Failte Ireland	E.3	10	4	
Failte Ireland	E.3	11	4	Self-certification by the third party is a requirement of the procedures
Failte Ireland	E.3	12	4	
Failte Ireland	E.3	13	4	
Failte Ireland	E.3	14	4	Post grant monitoring
Tourism Ireland	E.4	1	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	E.4	2	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	E.4	3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	E.4	4	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	E.4	5	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	E.4	6	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	E.4	7	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	E.4	8	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	E.4	9	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	E.4	10	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	E.4	11	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	E.4	12	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	E.4	13	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	E.4	14	N/A	

Checklist 3 – Current Expenditure Being Considered

Q1: Were objectives clearly set?

Q2: Are objectives measurable in quantitative terms?

Q3: Was an appropriate appraisal method used?

Q4: Was a business case prepared for new current expenditure?

Q5: Has an assessment of likely demand for the new scheme/scheme extension been estimated based on empirical evidence?

Q6: Was the required approval granted?

Q7: Has a sunset clause been set?

Q8: Has a date been set for the pilot evaluation?

Q9: Has the methodology and data collection requirements for the pilot evaluation been agreed at the outset of the scheme?

Q10: If outsourcing was involved were Procurement Rules complied with?

Q11: Were Performance Indicators specified for each new current expenditure proposal or expansion of existing current expenditure which will allow for the evaluation of its efficiency and effectiveness?

Q12: Have steps been put in place to gather the Performance Indicator data?

Name of Division/Agency	Sub Head	Question No.	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 0 – 4	Comment/Action Required
NRA	B.3	1	4	New PPPs are the only expenditures in this category.
NRA	B.3	2	4	New PPPs are the only expenditures in this category.
NRA	B.3	3	4	New PPPs are the only expenditures in this category.
NRA	B.3	4	4	New PPPs are the only expenditures in this category.
NRA	B.3	5	4	New PPPs are the only expenditures in this category.
NRA	B.3	6	4	New PPPs are the only expenditures in this category.
NRA	B.3	7	4	Termination Dates in contracts.

NRA	B.3	8	N/A	
NRA	B.3	9	N/A	
NRA	B.3	10	4	
NRA	B.3	11	4	
NRA	B.3	12	4	
RSA	B.4	1	4	Outlined in Annual Budget & Business Plan
RSA	B.4	2	4	KPIS clearly outlined for all current expenditure.
RSA	B.4	3	4	Yes, All Current Programmes are assessed in respect of affordability, value for money and with other alternatives.
RSA	B.4	4	4	Part of the annual Budget & Business Plan approval process
RSA	B.4	5	4	Yes, Business case is prepared to assess the demand model.
RSA	B.4	6	4	Yes
RSA	B.4	7	4	Programmes reviewed annually.
RSA	B.4	8	N/A	
RSA	B.4	9	N/A	
RSA	B.4	10	4	All Procurement law, and rules are complied with.
RSA	B.4	11	4	KPIs outlined for each programme

RSA	B.4	12	4	Part of the Contract Management piece
MBRS	B.4	1	4	Outlined in the MBRS's Estimate and Strategic Plan
MBRS	B.4	2	4	Yes outlined for all current expenditure
MBRS	B.4	3	4	Yes, all current programmes are monitored and assessed for value for money,
MBRS	B.4	4	N/A	
MBRS	B.4	5	N/A	
MBRS	B.4	6	N/A	
MBRS	B.4	7	N/A	
MBRS	B.4	8	N/A	
MBRS	B.4	9	N/A	
MBRS	B.4	10	4	All procurement rules and regulations are compiled with
MBRS	B.4	11	4	Clearly outlined for each programme
MBRS	B.4	12	4	Yes
NTA	B.8	1	N/A	The NTA had a number of Current Expenditure programs on-going in 2013 (see below), however there was no new current expenditure or expansion of existing current expenditure under consideration in 2013.
NTA	B.8	2	N/A	
NTA	B.8	3	N/A	
NTA	B.8	4	N/A	
NTA	B.8	5	N/A	
NTA	B.8	6	N/A	
NTA	B.8	7	N/A	
NTA	B.8	8	N/A	
NTA	B.8	9	N/A	
NTA	B.8	10	N/A	

NTA	B.8	11	N/A	
NTA	B.8	12	N/A	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	1	N/A	No New Current Expenditure.
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	2	N/A	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	3	N/A	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	4	N/A	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	5	N/A	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	6	N/A	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	7	N/A	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	8	N/A	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	9	N/A	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	10	N/A	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	11	N/A	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	B.8	12	N/A	
Irish Sports Council	D.5	1	N/A	No response to current being considered
Irish Sports Council	D.5	2	N/A	
Irish Sports Council	D.5	3	N/A	
Irish Sports Council	D.5	4	N/A	
Irish Sports Council	D.5	5	N/A	
Irish Sports Council	D.5	6	N/A	

Irish Sports Council	D.5	7	N/A	
Irish Sports Council	D.5	8	N/A	
Irish Sports Council	D.5	9	N/A	
Irish Sports Council	D.5	10	N/A	
Irish Sports Council	D.5	11	N/A	
Irish Sports Council	D.5	12	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5	1	N/A	No response to current being considered
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5	2	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5	3	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5	4	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5	5	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5	6	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5	7	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5	8	N/A	

National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5	9	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5	10	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5	11	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	D.5	12	N/A	
Fáilte Ireland	E.3	1	3	
Fáilte Ireland	E.3	2	2	
Fáilte Ireland	E.3	3	3	
Fáilte Ireland	E.3	4	3	
Fáilte Ireland	E.3	5	3	
Fáilte Ireland	E.3	6	4	
Fáilte Ireland	E.3	7	4	Where applicable
Fáilte Ireland	E.3	8	N/A	Only in very limited circumstances have pilots been carried out
Fáilte Ireland	E.3	9	N/A	Only in very limited circumstances have pilots been carried out
Fáilte Ireland	E.3	10	4	
Fáilte Ireland	E.3	11	2	
Fáilte Ireland	E.3	12	2	
Tourism Ireland Limited	E.4.	1	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	E.4.	2	N/A	

Tourism Ireland Limited	E.4.	3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	E.4.	4	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	E.4.	5	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	E.4.	6	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	E.4.	7	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	E.4.	8	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	E.4.	9	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	E.4.	10	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	E.4.	11	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	E.4.	12	N/A	

Checklist 4 – Capital Expenditure Being Incurred

Q1: Was a contract signed and was it in line with the approval in principle?

Q2: If a construction or ICT project was the contract for a fixed price?

Q3: Are suitable management structures in place, commensurate with the scale of projects?

Q4: Did management boards/steering committees meet regularly as agreed?

Q5: Were Programme Co-ordinators appointed to co-ordinate implementation?

Q6: Were Project Managers, responsible for delivery, appointed and were the Project Managers at a suitable level for the scale of the project?

Q7: Were monitoring reports prepared regularly, showing implementation against plan, budget, timescales and quality?

Q8: Did the project keep within its financial budget and its time schedule?

Q9: Did budgets have to be adjusted?

Q10: Were decisions on changes to budgets or time schedules made promptly?

Q11: Did circumstances ever warrant questioning the viability of the project? (exceeding budget, lack of progress, changes in the external environment)

Q12: If circumstances did warrant questioning the viability of a project was the project subjected to adequate examination?

Q13: If costs increased was approval received from the Sanctioning Authority?

Q14: Were any projects terminated because of deviations from the plan, the budget or because circumstances in the environment changed the need for the investment?

Q15: For projects > €20m were quarterly reports on progress submitted to the MAC or Management Board and to the Minister?

Q16: Were prescribed annual tables on projects, completed or in progress and > €20m submitted to the Department of Public Expenditure & Reform?

Name of Division/Agency	Question no.	Sub Head	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 0 – 4	Comment/Action Required
NRA	1	B.3.	4	
NRA	2	B.3.	4	GCCC approved contracts.
NRA	3	B.3.	3	Management understaffed.
NRA	4	B.3.	4	
NRA	5	B.3.	N/A	No programme for which Programme Co-ordinators required.
NRA	6	B.3.	3	Generally yes, but problems with PMs for

				PPPs.
NRA	7	B.3.	4	
NRA	8	B.3.	3	A number of projects were late completing.
NRA	9	B.3.	4	Contract budgets not adjusted once approved for implementation - over/under budget forecast.
NRA	10	B.3.	4	Cost/schedule issues identified early.
NRA	11	B.3.	No	Not in 2013, but yes in other years.
NRA	12	B.3.	N/A	Approval to proceed to next phase refused because analysis determined BCR unsatisfactory.
NRA	13	B.3.	4	
NRA	14	B.3.	No	Approval to proceed refused because BCR insufficient. The decision arose out of normal review, not exceptional circumstances.
NRA	15	B.3.	4	Monthly reports to NRA Board (not Minister).
NRA	16	B.3.	N/A	This is the first report.
MBRS	1	B.4	4	Yes were necessary a contract was signed
MBRS	2	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	3	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	4	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	5	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	6	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	7	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	8	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	9	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	10	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	11	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	12	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	13	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	14	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	15	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	16	B.4	N/A	
RSA	1	B.4.	4	Yes, all capital expenditure is underpinned with signed contracts in place.
RSA	2	B.4.	4	Yes, the Authority only uses fixed price contracts/pricing
RSA	3	B.4.	4	Contracts and Programmes are approved in live with the Authority Procurement & Purchasing policy and procedures.
RSA	4	B.4.	4	Yes, on all major capital programmes
RSA	5	B.4.	4	Project Management in place on all material projects
RSA	6	B.4.	4	Yes
RSA	7	B.4.	4	Yes, using Prince 2 project management reporting tool
RSA	8	B.4.	4	Yes, tight management and reporting on project spend
RSA	9	B.4.	4	Yes, sometimes to take account of project

				changes in scope
RSA	10	B.4.	4	Yes, through management team meetings
RSA	11	B.4.	No	
RSA	12	B.4.	N/A	
RSA	13	B.4.	N/A	All capital projects in Authority funded from own resources
RSA	14	B.4.	No	
RSA	15	B.4.	N/A	
RSA	16	B.4.	N/A	
NTA	1	B.8	4	Contracts are, in the main, by way of letters of offer to grantee organisations. For direct NTA projects, contracts are in place.
NTA	2	B.8	4	Where appropriate projects are delivered on a fixed price basis.
NTA	3	B.8	4	Yes. In addition the NTA has published a set of guidelines for projects of different scales. Please see http://www.nationaltransport.ie/publications/transport-investment/ for detailed guidelines.
NTA	4	B.8	4	Yes. Also please refer to NTA's detailed project management guidelines at http://www.nationaltransport.ie/publications/transport-investment/ for detailed guidelines.
NTA	5	B.8	4	Yes. Also please refer to NTA's detailed project management guidelines at http://www.nationaltransport.ie/publications/transport-investment/ for detailed guidelines.
NTA	6	B.8	4	Project Managers are engaged by the delivery organisations. Through participation in steering committees / project boards for the larger projects, NTA assures itself that appropriate project managers are in place.
NTA	7	B.8	4	Yes. Also please refer to NTA's detailed project management guidelines at http://www.nationaltransport.ie/publications/transport-investment/ for detailed guidelines.
NTA	8	B.8	3	Adjustments can be mandated by external circumstances such as progress of delivery
NTA	9	B.8	3	Adjustments are carried out in a structured change approval manner. Grant payments are not discharged in the absence of approval.
NTA	10	B.8	4	Yes, the NTA responds in a timely fashion over budgets and time schedule changes.
NTA	11	B.8	Yes	External funding environment and limited – availability of government funds. In these

				circumstances projects are de-scoped or retendered e.g. Rail Re-signalling project or are deferred completely.
NTA	12	B.8	4	Yes. Full examination was carried out of projects, including whether they could be re-scaled, before they were deferred.
NTA	13	B.8	4	Yes. The NTA operates within the funds provided by DTTAS and reports regularly on progress. In addition the NTA consults regularly with DTTAS on project inventories and viability aspects.
NTA	14	B.8	Yes	There were instances when projects needed to be terminated due to external factors, for example Dart Underground, Metro North and Metro West projects.
NTA	15	B.8	4	Yes. For example monthly progress reports on the Luas Cross City project are shared with DTTAS and the Minister for Transport.
NTA	16	B.8	4	The prescribed tables were completed.
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	1	B.8	4	1. Contracts under NTA funded projects are made by way of Letter of Offer. 2 RSP is covered by programme rules drawn up by the Railway Safety Task Force
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	2	B.8	4	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	3	B.8	4	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	4	B.8	4	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	5	B.8	4	Program Managers were appointed
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	6	B.8	4	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	7	B.8	4	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	8	B.8	4	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	9	B.8	3	Reilly's crossing budget was increased.
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	10	B.8	4	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	11	B.8	Yes	Reduced government funding meant certain projects had to be reviewed eg CTC and City Centre Resignalling Project
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	12	B.8	N/A	N/A
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	13	B.8	4	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	14	B.8	Yes	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	15	B.8	4	Submitted to Advisory Group, IE Board and Sanctioning Authority

Irish Rail (outside GDA)	16	B.8	4	The prescribed tables were completed
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	1	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	2	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	3	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	4	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	5	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	6	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	7	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	8	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	9	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	10	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	11	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	12	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	13	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	14	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	15	D.5	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	16	D.5	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	1	D.5	4	Contracts in place for technical advisers. Construction contracts not placed in 2013
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	2	D.5	4	All construction contracts are fixed price
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	3	D.5	4	Project Managers or Technical Advisers are appointed and report to Development Manager/CEO
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	4	D.5	4	All progress reported directly to the Authority/Board
National Sports Campus	5	D.5	N/A	No programmes

Development Authority (NSCDA)				
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	6	D.5	4	Technical Advisers are in place and reported to Development Manager/CEO
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	7	D.5	4	Regular reporting to Development Manager, including cost reporting and cost risk analysis
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	8	D.5	3	Any divergence from contract price is agreed in advance and with input or recommendation from Technical Advisers
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	9	D.5	4	Yes - as above. However, value engineering was used to further reduce contract prices where appropriate
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	10	D.5	4	Yes
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	11	D.5	No	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	12	D.5	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	13	D.5	0	No. Any cost increases were managed through value engineering or adjustments within overall capital allocation. No additional funding sought
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	14	D.5	No	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	15	D.5	N/A	No project of that scale as yet undertaken.
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	16	D.5	N/A	N/A
Fáilte Ireland	1	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	2	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	3	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	4	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	5	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	6	E.3	4	

Fáilte Ireland	7	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	8	E.3	3	
Fáilte Ireland	9	E.3	3	
Fáilte Ireland	10	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	11	E.3	Yes	
Fáilte Ireland	12	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	13	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	14	E.3	Yes	
Fáilte Ireland	15	E.3	N/A	
Fáilte Ireland	16	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	1	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	2	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	3	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	4	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	5	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	6	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	7	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	8	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	9	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	10	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	11	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	12	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	13	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	14	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	15	E.3	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	16	E.3	N/A	

Checklist 5 – Current Expenditure Being Incurred

Q1: Are there clear objectives for all areas of current expenditure?

Q2: Are outputs well defined?

Q3: Are outputs quantified on a regular basis?

Q4: Is there a method for monitoring efficiency on an on-going basis?

Q5: Are outcomes well defined?

Q6: Are outcomes quantified on a regular basis?

Q7: Is there a method for monitoring effectiveness on an on-going basis?

Q8: Have formal Value For Money evaluations or other evaluation been completed in the year under review?

Q9: Are plans for new evaluations made in good time to ensure that they are completed in time to feed into the annual budget cycle?

Q10: Are unit costings compiled for performance monitoring?

Name of Division/Agency	Question No.	Sub Head	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 0 – 4	Comment/Action Required
NRA	1	B.3	3	The score for directly managed maintenance expenditure would be close to 4, but less so for LA-managed expenditure.
NRA	2	B.3	3	The score for directly managed maintenance expenditure would be close to 4, but less so for LA-managed expenditure.
NRA	3	B.3	3	The score for directly managed maintenance expenditure would be close to 4, but less so for LA-managed expenditure.
NRA	4	B.3	3	The score for directly managed maintenance expenditure would be close to 4, but less so for LA-managed expenditure.
NRA	5	B.3	3	The score for directly managed maintenance expenditure would be close to 4, but less so for LA-managed expenditure.
NRA	6	B.3	3	The score for directly managed maintenance expenditure would be close to 4, but less so for LA-managed expenditure.
NRA	7	B.3	2	The score for directly managed

				maintenance expenditure would be close to 4, but less so for LA-managed expenditure.
NRA	8	B.3	?	There are regular VFM activities in relation to maintenance, and competitive bidding for outsourced activities. Not sure if this is what is meant.
NRA	9	B.3	4	
NRA	10	B.3	3	The score for directly managed maintenance expenditure would be close to 4, but less so for LA-managed expenditure.
MBRS	1	B.4	4	Yes - Outlined in the MBRS's Estimate and Strategic Plan
MBRS	2	B.4	4	Yes
MBRS	3	B.4	4	Yes - Outlined in the MBRS's Estimate and Strategic Plan
MBRS	4	B.4	4	Yes - Expenditure is monitored monthly
MBRS	5	B.4	4	Yes
MBRS	6	B.4	4	Yes
MBRS	7	B.4	4	Yes
MBRS	8	B.4	Yes	Yes
MBRS	9	B.4	4	Yes - as applicable
MBRS	10	B.4	N/A	
RSA	1	B.4	4	Yes, In accordance with RSA Strategy and Business Plan
RSA	2	B.4	4	Yes, through annual business planning process
RSA	3	B.4	4	Measured monthly through suite of KPIs
RSA	4	B.4	4	Yes, all services are measurable with set of KPIs
RSA	5	B.4	4	Yes
RSA	6	B.4	4	Monthly
RSA	7	B.4	4	Financial and non Financial Measurements
RSA	8	B.4	No	
RSA	9	B.4	Yes	
	10	B.4	Yes	
NTA	1	B.8	4	Yes, there are clear objectives for all areas of Current Expenditure. The NTA's main Current Expenditure programs are listed in the note below. All the PSO programmes are controlled by rigorous contracts.
NTA	2	B.8	4	Yes.
NTA	3	B.8	4	Yes, outputs quantified on a regular basis across all Current Expenditure Programs. For example extensive quarterly reporting on the PSO

				contracts is required for the discharge of subsidy performance payments.
NTA	4	B.8	4	Responsibility for monitoring rural transport was with Pobal for 2013, which operated their control processes to rural transport as per their other programmes. Direct monitoring is moving to the NTA in 2014.
NTA	5	B.8	4	All programmes contain performance outcomes either via contract or Service level Agreements..
NTA	6	B.8	4	All outcomes are quantified either quarterly or monthly.
NTA	7	B.8	4	The NTA operates contract and service agreement management with dedicated project managers monitoring delivery.
NTA	8	B.8	?	Examples include the Bus Market Review, the review of Green Schools Programme, and the review of Smarter Travel Workplaces.
NTA	9	B.8	4	Yes.
NTA	10	B.8	4	Yes, where appropriate. for example this is done as part of the performance monitoring for Public Service Obligation (PSO) Contracts.
Irish Rail (Outside GDA)	1	B.8	0	In Process.
Irish Rail (Outside GDA)	2	B.8	0	
Irish Rail (Outside GDA)	3	B.8	0	
Irish Rail (Outside GDA)	4	B.8	0	
Irish Rail (Outside GDA)	5	B.8	0	
Irish Rail (Outside GDA)	6	B.8	0	
Irish Rail (Outside GDA)	7	B.8	0	
Irish Rail (Outside GDA)	8	B.8	No	
Irish Rail (Outside GDA)	9	B.8	0	
Irish Rail (Outside GDA)	10	B.8	0	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	1	D.5	4	There are objectives set out in our strategy and business plans for each programme.
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	2	D.5	4	The outputs are set out in our strategy and business plans
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	3	D.5	3	Progress is monitored against the strategy and the Board is updated
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	4	D.5	3	Directors and Managers responsible for the programmes have to give an update to the CEO on an on-going basis, timelines are specified in the business plans
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	5	D.5	4	Outcomes are specified in the

				business plans
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	6	D.5	4	Reviews and research is carried out on a regular basis to ensure that the programmes are delivering the required outcomes.
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	7	D.5	3	Speak reports are used to monitor the progress of Local Sports Partnerships. Mid year reviews and annual meeting are held with National Governing bodies. Athletes progress is monitored. Research is used to monitor progress.
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	8	D.5	No	No Value for Money evaluation was carried out in 2013
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	9	D.5	3	Plans are developed well in advance and feed into the budget as part of the business plans.
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	10	D.5	N/A	Not relevant
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	1	D.5	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	2	D.5	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	3	D.5	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	4	D.5	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	5	D.5	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	6	D.5	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	7	D.5	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	8	D.5	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	9	D.5	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	10	D.5	N/A	
Fáilte Ireland	1	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	2	E.3	3	
Fáilte Ireland	3	E.3	3	
Fáilte Ireland	4	E.3	3	

Fáilte Ireland	5	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	6	E.3	3	
Fáilte Ireland	7	E.3	3	
Fáilte Ireland	8	E.3	No	
Fáilte Ireland	9	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	10	E.3	4	Where applicable
Tourism Ireland	1	E.4	4	Each three years Tourism Ireland prepares a Corporate Plan and each year it prepares a Business Plan. These documents set out the strategic direction of Tourism Ireland and the high level activities that will be undertaken by the organisation to achieve those objectives. These objectives are filtered down through the organisation and include operational and quantitative objectives for non marketing areas.
Tourism Ireland	2	E.4	4	Targets are set in the Corporate and Business Plans both in terms of visitor numbers/revenue and in terms of the metrics by which Tourism Ireland will assess the efficiency and effectiveness of the activities it undertakes.
Tourism Ireland	3	E.4	4	See item 2 above.
Tourism Ireland	4	E.4	4	There is a detailed process underlying the planning of the activities to be undertaken, individual services are dully tendered for and the suppliers monitored and assessed.
Tourism Ireland	5	E.4	4	See item 2 above.
Tourism Ireland	6	E.4	4	See item 2 above.
Tourism Ireland	7	E.4	4	Within the organisation there is a much more extensive series of reports and research undertaken to measure the results and assess the effects of the activities undertaken.
Tourism Ireland	8	E.4	Yes	Tourism Ireland carries out an exercise on a regular basis to assess the return it receives on its marketing spend (ROMI). A zero based budgeting approach has been adopted for admin areas to assess the value/necessity etc of spend prior to budget approval of this spend.
Tourism Ireland	9	E.4	4	See items 4 and 7 above.
Tourism Ireland	10	E.4	?	

Checklist 6 – Capital Expenditure Recently Ended

Q1: Were the required post-project reviews carried out?

Q2: Was a post project review completed for all projects/programmes exceeding €20m?

Q3: If sufficient time has not elapsed to allow a proper assessment of benefits has a post project review been scheduled for a future date?

Q4: Were lessons learned from post-project reviews disseminated within the Sponsoring Agency* and to the Sanctioning Authority**?

Q5: Were changes made to the Sponsoring Agencies practices in light of lessons learned from post-project reviews?

Q6: Was project review carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation?

Name of Division/ Agency	Question No.	Sub Head	Self- Assessed Compliance Rating: 0 – 4	Comment/Action Required
NRA	1	B.3	N/A	Reviews are normally not carried out in year of completion - they are carried out once traffic patterns settle a few years post-construction.
NRA	2	B.3	3	All projects of €20m + are reviewed; we are a little behind in finalising some of the reports.
NRA	3	B.3	4	
NRA	4	B.3	4	
NRA	5	B.3	4	
NRA	6	B.3	4	
MBRS	1	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	2	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	3	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	4	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	5	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	6	B.4	N/A	
RSA	1	B.4	1	Minimal post project reviews carried out
RSA	2	B.4	N/A	
RSA	3	B.4	N/A	
RSA	4	B.4	0	
RSA	5	B.4	N/A	
RSA	6	B.4	0	
NTA	1	B.8	4	No because none were required. The NTA has a number of rolling capital investment programmes within which some individual

				projects come to completion but the programme carries on, for example each local authority has a wide array of small traffic management projects.
NTA	2	B.8	4	Programmes are determined through the preparation of multi-annual investment plans approved by DTTAS. Within this process reviews are undertaken. Some large projects necessitate individual post-project review but none came due in 2013.
NTA	3	B.8	4	Reviews are timed to allow for full project close-out and a period of user adoption.
NTA	4	B.8	4	Yes. In addition, outcomes of internal controls and other reviews are used to inform improvement activities.
NTA	5	B.8	4	In general, yes. Control processes and project development processes are continually refined.
NTA	6	B.8	4	Project reviews are delivered by NTA who are independent of project delivery.
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	1	B.8	4	Economic evaluation/detailed post project reviews are carried out 3 to 4 years after project completion, where appropriate
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	2	B.8	4	See above
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	3	B.8	4	Reviews are timed to allow for full project close out and a period of user adoption
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	4	B.8	4	Post project reviews to be carried out prior to close out where appropriate. 1. Lessons learnt/exercises carried out. 2. Economic evaluation/detailed post project reviews are carried out 3 to 4 years after project completion, where appropriate
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	5	B.8	N/A	
Irish Rail (outside GDA)	6	B.8	4	Mid-term review carried out for RSP3 in October 2012 by Risk Solutions. RSP3 ended in 2013. The IMMAC will be the new contractual arrangement for Exchequer funding of Railway Infrastructure safety asset renewal and maintenance for period 2014 to 2018
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	1	D.5.	N/A	No response to Capital completed section

Irish Sports Council (ISS)	2	D.5.	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	3	D.5.	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	4	D.5.	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	5	D.5.	N/A	
Irish Sports Council (ISS)	6	D.5.	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	1	D.5.	N/A	No formal post-project review undertaken. Review & testing of facilities with stakeholders undertaken. Completed projects below €20m
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	2	D.5.	N/A	N/A
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	3	D.5.	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	4	D.5.	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	5	D.5.	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	6	D.5.	N/A	
Failte Ireland	1	E.3	3	
Failte Ireland	2	E.3	N/A	
Failte Ireland	3	E.3	4	The 2007-2013 capital scheme will be reviewed in 2014
Failte Ireland	4	E.3	0	It is envisaged that there will be lessons learned and these will be taken on board in the next programme
Failte Ireland	5	E.3	0	
Failte Ireland	6	E.3	0	Review will be done by a third party
Tourism Ireland Limited	1	E.4	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	2	E.4	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	3	E.4	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	4	E.4	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	5	E.4	N/A	
Tourism Ireland Limited	6	E.4	N/A	

Checklist 7 – Current Expenditure Recently Completed

Q1: Were reviews carried out of, current expenditure programmes that matured during the year or were discontinued?

Q2: Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were effective?

Q3: Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were efficient?

Q4: Have the conclusions reached been taken into account in related areas of expenditure?

Q5: Were any programmes discontinued following a review of a current expenditure programme?

Q6: Was the review commenced and completed within a period of 6 months?

Name of Division/Agency	Question No.	Sub Head	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 0 – 4	Comment/Action Required
NRA	1	B.3.	N/A	
NRA	2	B.3.	N/A	
NRA	3	B.3.	N/A	
NRA	4	B.3.	N/A	
NRA	5	B.3.	N/A	
NRA	6	B.3.	N/A	
MBRS	1	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	2	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	3	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	4	B.4	N/A	
MBRS	5	B.4	N/A	No - MBRS's functions are laid out under RTA
MBRS	6	B.4	N/A	
RSA	1	B.4	3	Most current expenditure programmes are recurring in nature.
RSA	2	B.4	N/A	
RSA	3	B.4	N/A	
RSA	4	B.4	N/A	
RSA	5	B.4	N/A	
RSA	6	B.4	N/A	
NTA	1	B.8	N/A	No Current Expenditure Programmes matured or were discontinued during the year.
NTA	2	B.8	N/A	
NTA	3	B.8	N/A	
NTA	4	B.8	N/A	
NTA	5	B.8	N/A	

NTA	6	B.8	N/A	
Irish Rail (non GDA)	1	B.8	N/A	Current Expenditure Programs On-Going.
Irish Rail (non GDA)	2	B.8	N/A	
Irish Rail (non GDA)	3	B.8	N/A	
Irish Rail (non GDA)	4	B.8	N/A	
Irish Rail (non GDA)	5	B.8	N/A	
Irish Rail (non GDA)	6	B.8	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	1	D.5.	N/A	No Completed projects
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	2	D.5.	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	3	D.5.	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	4	D.5.	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	5	D.5.	N/A	
Irish Sport Council (ISS)	6	D.5.	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	1	D.5.	N/A	No response on current completed provided
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	2	D.5.	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	3	D.5.	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	4	D.5.	N/A	
National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	5	D.5.	N/A	

National Sports Campus Development Authority (NSCDA)	6	D.5.	N/A	
Fáilte Ireland	1	E.3	3	Where applicable
Fáilte Ireland	2	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	3	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	4	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	5	E.3	4	
Fáilte Ireland	6	E.3	4	
Tourism Ireland	1	E.4	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	2	E.5	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	3	E.6	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	4	E.7	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	5	E.8	N/A	
Tourism Ireland	6	E.9	N/A	