

Appendix 4(2)

Value for Money and Policy Review

Current Expenditure on National Road Maintenance (Published - December 2015)

Key Issues and Recommendations – Follow up Actions¹

[Link to Current Expenditure on National Road Maintenance - Published VFM](#)

¹ Please see also Section 7.2 of the Quality Assurance Report.

Recommendation No.	Recommendation	Area	Target date	Follow up Action	Date	Task Completed
--------------------	----------------	------	-------------	------------------	------	----------------

Improve Operation and Efficiency						
4	The NRA, in conjunction with relevant stakeholders such as LAs, the CCMA and SEAI, should continue to work towards better efficiency for route lighting.	Route Lighting	no specific date set	In 2016 the Authority has provided grant funding to all local authorities to fully update lighting inventories on national roads on a consistent basis nationally. This will provide the necessary starting point for delivering future energy efficient initiatives in line with energy saving obligations.		
9	The NRA should continue to work towards achieving asset management best practice in the roads sector such that the network is cost efficient and provides best value for money. In this regard, an assessment of the balance between capital and current funding for national roads should be carried out by the NRA and DTTaS by end-2016. In addition, the collection of the data recommended in this report and its use in maintenance and management systems for prioritisation should be pursued.	Asset Management	end 2016	Work has commenced on the further assessment of funding requirements for network maintenance and capital renewals.		

Recommendation No.	Recommendation	Area	Target date	Follow up Action	Date	Task Completed
--------------------	----------------	------	-------------	------------------	------	----------------

Improve Operation and Efficiency (cont)						
10	The NRA and LAs, in conjunction with all relevant stakeholders, should implement an efficiency programme for national road maintenance which targets improved performance. A feasibility study on this issue should be completed by end-2016 with a programme of efficiency measures to be completed by end-2017.	Efficiency measures	end 2016 and end 2017	Work has not commenced on this exercise		
11	DTTaS and the NRA should continue to have a close working relationship in the roads sector and will seek to minimise any constraints to delivery at the LA level. This should involve an analysis of how management and/or funding systems could be better aligned by end-2016.	Management and funding systems	End 2016	An initial meeting has taken place between DTTaS and TII		

Recommendation No.	Recommendation	Area	Target date	Follow up Action	Date	Task Completed
--------------------	----------------	------	-------------	------------------	------	----------------

Improve Operation and Efficiency (cont)						
12	The NRA, DTTaS and LAs, in conjunction with relevant stakeholders such as the CCMA and RMO, should seek to optimise maintenance operations on a regional basis. As such the feasibility of a formal structure of regional maintenance areas should be explored as a priority, so that best practice can be shared and collaboration targeted.	Regional maintenance management structures	no specific date set	In TII's response to the final draft of the Report, we indicated that whilst acknowledging that the optimisation of maintenance by local authorities on a regional basis was one option, other options including outsourced regional contracts was another and that all options ought to be evaluated also. This matter will be considered further in conjunction with CCMA and DTTaS. following engagement		

Recommendation No.	Recommendation	Area	Target date	Follow up Action	Date	Task Completed
--------------------	----------------	------	-------------	------------------	------	----------------

Data Collection						
1	<p>The NRA should, as part of an overall data collection plan, proceed to fully implement an adequate method of data collection on ordinary maintenance works through the GeoAPP system by end-2015 to ensure that the appropriate data is available for the management and evaluation of the ordinary maintenance sub-programme.</p> <p>Data on costs and outputs produced by the system should be broadly comparable across delivery mechanisms.</p>	Ordinary Maintenance	end 2015	<p>We are endeavouring to establish what constitutes an appropriate level of data collection. The reality is that local authority resources continue to diminish, and the capacity to provide more detailed data is limited. Moreover, in our view, given the already established contractual frameworks for both PPP and MMarC contracts, it is not possible to generate the detailed activity based costings that were recommended in the Report.</p>		

Recommendation No.	Recommendation	Area	Target date	Follow up Action	Date	Task Completed
--------------------	----------------	------	-------------	------------------	------	----------------

2	The NRA should, as part of an overall data collection plan, continue to collect data centrally on the delivery of winter maintenance to facilitate evaluation and analysis.	Winter Maintenance	no specific date set	We are continuing to collect data on winter maintenance activities. Our biggest challenge is in ensure that local authorities input the necessary data into the Road Weather Information System.		
---	---	--------------------	----------------------	--	--	--

Data Collection (cont)						
3	The NRA should, as part of an overall data collection plan, proceed to build and maintain an accurate register of lighting assets on the national road network before end-2016 to facilitate asset management and future sub-programme evaluation.	Lighting register	End 2016	TII has provided grant allocations to local authorities to ensure that inventories are fully updated by the end of 2016.		

Recommendation No.	Recommendation	Area	Target date	Follow up Action	Date	Task Completed
5	As part of an overall data collection plan, the NRA will devise and implement a change to the Eirspan bridge management system by end-2016 such that the system will include details of maintenance works that have been carried out and their cost in a format that will allow all such information to be accessed on a national and regional basis	Bridge Maintenance	End 2016	The necessary upgrade to the Eirspan bridge management software has been undertaken, and the outstanding data is being uploaded and will be available in the coming months.		
6	The NRA will proceed to implement a system to track, monitor and evaluate the level of performance and maintenance carried out in regard to ITS maintenance. This system will be operational by the end of 2015.	ITS	End 2015	The system of monitoring ITS maintenance contract activities and performance is in place.	2015	Complete

Data Collection (cont)

Recommendation No.	Recommendation	Area	Target date	Follow up Action	Date	Task Completed
8	By end-2015 DTTaS and the NRA should consider the implementation, in consultation with relevant national and international stakeholders, of a national road user survey that is completed to assist in the evaluation and management of this and other NRA programmes.	National Road User Survey	End 2015	TII has taken initial steps in this regard through discussions with our marketing department and peer jurisdictions in Europe.		

Recommendation No.	Recommendation	Area	Target date	Follow up Action	Date	Task Completed
--------------------	----------------	------	-------------	------------------	------	----------------

Future Monitoring and Evaluation						
7	The Department of Transport, Tourism and Sport will carry out a Focused Policy Assessment of this programme's efficiency within 3 years following the implementation of an adequate data collection plan by the NRA. This should incorporate a cost effectiveness analysis of insourced vs. outsourced programme delivery to ascertain if the current mix of delivery mechanisms is in the most efficient. This analysis should also take into account differences in the quality of output.	FPA - Programme Efficiency	End 2018			
13	The NRA should develop the use of performance indicators across the programme, complete a short report on the trends evident from these indicators and submit this to the DTTaS's Roads Division annually. These indicators should include unit costing and benchmarking analysis as highlighted in this report.	Performance Indicators - complete programme	Annually beginning 2016	TII has presented a draft set of KPIs to DTTaS in relation to our pavement management programmes. A full set of KPIs will be in place by year end 2016.		

Recommendation No.	Recommendation	Area	Target date	Follow up Action	Date	Task Completed
--------------------	----------------	------	-------------	------------------	------	----------------

15	DTTaS will carry out an in-depth check ⁽²⁾ as part of the Quality Assurance process in 2016 and 2017 to assess progress for this review's implementation.	In Depth Check	2016 and 2017			
----	--	----------------	---------------	--	--	--

Overall Recommendation						
14	The Current Road Maintenance Programme on national roads should continue to be carried out by DTTaS and the NRA. The recommendations of this report should be implemented such that efficiency and effectiveness are enhanced.	Efficiency and Effectiveness	on-going			

⁽¹⁾ Please see also Section 4.4 of the Quality Assurance Report.

⁽²⁾ Note: Recommendation 15 in the VFM report referred to an In Depth Check. The DTTaS did not carry out an In Depth Check in 2015 an In Depth Check may follow at a later date in the future.
