

## Appendix E

### Implementation of Value-for-Money and Focused Policy Assessment Recommendations

This section provides an update on the implementation of recommendations arising from the following Value-for-Money Reviews and Focused Policy Assessments:

- Green Schools Programme FPA
- National Roads Maintenance Programme VfM Review
- Driver Testing Service VfM Review

## Update on the Implementation of VfM and FPA Recommendations

### Green Schools - Focused Policy Assessment

Recommendation	Target Date	Action Update	Revised Date	Status
<b>Programme Objectives</b>				
Clarify and prioritise objectives.	Not specified	Objectives and deliverables have been clarified and prioritised in the DTTAS/ NTA Green-Schools Agreement.	n/a	Complete
Clarify priorities around expanding the programme vs. the need for behavioural change.	Not specified	Principal priority of modal shift from cars has been clarified and specified in DTTAS/NTA Green Schools Agreement. Targeting of schools has been introduced to maximise gain (the FPA raised issue of spreading coverage of schools at the expense of quality).	n/a	Complete
There is a need for the primary overall objective of the programme to be well-defined.	Not specified	The principal objective of the Green Schools travel programme is to reduce car use and is set out on page 1 of the 2015-2018 agreement.	n/a	Complete
<b>Programme Targets (2008-2012)</b>				
Revise the targets so that they are consistent with the objectives.	Not specified	Targets have been revised from 15% to 7.5% either walking and/or cycling to ensure that they are consistent with objectives.	n/a	Complete
Ensure the targets are achievable.	Not specified	Realistic targets have been set.	n/a	Complete
Ensure the targets are measurable	Not specified	Measurable targets have been set.	n/a	Complete
Ensure targets are focused on areas that can deliver most benefits (such as focusing on walking and cycling rather than mixed modes). All targets should be measured and reported separately	Not specified	A focus is being placed on schools in locations where investment has already been made in infrastructure to encourage a modal shift. Secondary schools are also being targeted in order to raise their participation level. Schools who have received the Green Flag are also being targeted under an enhanced maintenance programme.	n/a	Complete
Programme managers should reconsider the appropriate scale of a mixed-mode target. Possible options for the treatment of mixed modes would be that mixed modes assume the lowest target priority.	Not specified	Cycling and walking are being given the highest priority in current DTTAS/NTA agreement (page 2) because these modes completely reduce the emissions associated with the journey and also assist in congestion reduction..	n/a	Complete
<b>Efficiency of the Programme</b>				
Devise metrics to allow for benchmarking of set cost per school/pupil etc.	Not specified	The database records time spent per school. Metrics to analyse such data, subject to available resources, to be considered for the next DTTAS/NTA agreement.	2015-2018	Being Considered

(continues on next page)

## Update on the Implementation of VfM and FPA Recommendations

### Green Schools - Focused Policy Assessment

Recommendation	Target Date	Action Update	Revised Date	Status
<b>Efficiency of the Programme</b>				
Cost per active school, cost per active pupil, cost per visit and costs per contact hour could be used as benchmark for target setting both in terms of outputs delivered and monetary allocation to the provider.	Not specified	Database available to estimate cost per school/ pupil/ visit/ hour. Metrics to analyse, subject to available resources, to be considered for next DTTaS/NTA agreement.	2015-2018	Being Considered
The value of each activity in achieving modal change should be assessed to establish which activities are achieving most change in schools.	Not specified	It is planned to carry out a full evaluation in year 3 of the programme, including an assessment of each activity and monitoring cost of each activity. It is very difficult to attribute a single activity that can deliver a modal shift as there are normally a number of other variables. A review in a number of pilot schools is being considered for the next DTTaS/NTA agreement.	2018	Being Considered
Devise efficiency metrics to allow for international comparisons to be made.	Not specified	As above.	2018	Being Considered
<b>Effectiveness of the Programme</b>				
Examine the merits of the on-going use of the Green Schools Travel Development Officer given that their primary role was in the year before the schools entered the programme to prepare schools for the Green Schools Travel Programme prior to its introduction.	Not specified	A Green-Schools Travel Development Officer role was required to scale the travel programme from a pilot to national programme. Discontinued in 2013.	n/a	Complete
Linked with the above, clarify the roles and responsibilities of the Green Schools Travel Officer vs. the Green Schools Travel Development Officer	Not specified	The Green-Schools Travel Development Officer role no longer exists. It was required to scale the Travel programme from a pilot to national programme. The Green Schools travel officer is the principal agent in programme delivery.	n/a	Complete
<b>Programme Management and Data Requirements</b>				
A unique school identifier (e.g. roll number) and pupil numbers would facilitate cross-referencing with databases in relation to agreed databases and targets.	Not specified	Roll number and pupil numbers are recorded and are now available.	n/a	Complete

(continues on next page)

## Update on the Implementation of VfM and FPA Recommendations

### Green Schools - Focused Policy Assessment

Recommendation	Target Date	Action Update	Revised Date	Status
<b>Programme Management and Data Requirements</b>				
Data on separate activities, the level of activity, location of schools, additional costs (in addition to staff costs).	Not specified	Database in operation to record time spent per school/ per activity. Metrics need to be examined to analyse information subject to resourcing requirements. Being Considered for next DTTaS/NTA agreement.	2018	Being Considered
Greater consistency around attribution of costs to aspects of the programme is required to allow for improved programme management.	Not specified	Database in operation to record time spent per school/ per activity. Metrics need to be examined to analyse information subject to resourcing requirements. Being Considered for next DTTaS/NTA agreement.	2018	Being Considered
A clear link between inputs (financial and staff) and outputs (activities) is required	Not specified	This is provided for as part of an overall review of the programme in Year 3. Being Considered for the next DTTaS/NTA agreement.	2018	Being Considered
More robust evidence is required in regard to the evidence of the impacts of the programme.	Not specified	An independent survey of the Green Schools programme has been undertaken to evaluate the impact of the programme and provide robust evidence. The results of this should be available by end of 2016. An evaluation of the programme will be undertaken in year 3. Being Considered for the next DTTaS/NTA agreement.	2017-2018	Being Considered
Survey design and implementation could be improved. The independent monitoring of both behavioural and attitudinal change could improve the certainty of outcomes related to the programme.	Not specified	NTA conducted independent verification of the Hands Up Surveys, comparing individual school results to Census small areas results for the same schools. This review found a high correlation between results reported in class by children and mode used reported by parents in the Census 2011. An independent survey of parents has now been conducted and is currently being analysed. Being Considered for the next DTTaS/NTA agreement.	2017-2018	Being Considered
Consideration needs to be given to the independence of the measures of success.	Not specified	Independent survey undertaken to measure change. This is currently being analysed. Being Considered for the next DTTaS/NTA agreement.	2017-2018	Being Considered
<b>Delivery Mechanism</b>				
If the scheme is continued either through direct award or competitive tender the efficiency and effective issues identified in the FPA should be addressed.	Not specified	Efficiency and effectiveness issues of the programme identified in the FPA have been addressed in the new three year agreement.	n/a	Complete

(continues on next page)

## Update on the Implementation of VfM and FPA Recommendations

### Green Schools - Focused Policy Assessment

Recommendation	Target Date	Action Update	Revised Date	Status
<b>Delivery Mechanism</b>				
A long term plan should be developed to cater for continuous development and to assess the benefits of working with similar programmes such as Health Service Executive Active Flag Programme	Not specified	The Travel element of the Active Flag programme is usually the Green-Schools Travel programme repeated for the purposes of a different award. The methodology of the Active Flag is based on the Green-Schools international programme of environmental management, which is based on ISO standards. A review of synergies between this and other programmes to assess the benefits of working in co-operation with them has been undertaken and is Being Considered for the next DTTaS/NTA agreement.	2018	Being Considered
A new Service Level Agreement (SLA) should be negotiated to ensure transparency (including clear definitions of roles and responsibilities).	Not specified	Agreement between DTTaS and NTA for each 3-year funding cycle with specific details of roles and responsibilities has been reached.	n/a	Complete
A sunset clause for the programme should be considered, possibly in keeping with a three year award.	Not specified	A new three year agreement has been established will see the current programme completed and evaluated in year 3. Next agreement period from 2018-2022	n/a	Complete
Improved monitoring of a future programme should ensure any enactment of a sunset clause is fully informed with robust data.	Not specified	Any enactment of the sunset clause will follow a full evaluation of the programme in year 3. The 2018 evaluation is complete and is Being Considered for the next DTTaS/NTA agreement.	2018	Being Considered
Devise appropriate efficiency metrics to assess ways of improving the efficiency of the delivery of the programme.	Not specified	Data available pertaining to the delivery of the programme. New metrics and resourcing to assess ways of improving efficiencies is Being Considered for the next DTTaS/NTA agreement.	2018	Being Considered
Linked with the above is the recommendation to examine the efficient and appropriate use of contact between the Green Schools Travel Officers and the schools/pupils.	Not specified	Green Schools Travel Officers have been requested to target schools that have the potential to deliver most change. Being Considered for the next DTTaS/NTA agreement.	2015-2018	Being Considered
<b>END</b>				

## Update on the Implementation of VfM and FPA Recommendations

### National Roads Maintenance Programme - Value for Money Review

Recommendation	Target Date	Action Update	Revised Date	Status
<b>Improve Operation and Efficiency</b>				
The NRA, in conjunction with relevant stakeholders such as LAs, the CCMA and SEAI, should continue to work towards better efficiency for route lighting.	Not specified	TII have undertaken a number of initiatives including a pilot scheme at 4 motorway junctions in 2017 in which they eliminated excess lighting. Subject to successful review, TII plan to turn off lights at up to 40 further junctions. TII have tendered for an energy reduction scheme on town bypasses in the north west of the country in early 2018. TII also plan to introduce lower energy lighting into the Dublin tunnel in 2018 and 2019.	2018	Ongoing
The NRA should continue to work towards achieving asset management best practice in the roads sector such that the network is cost efficient and provides best value for money. In this regard, an assessment of the balance between capital and current funding for national roads should be carried out by the NRA and DTTaS by end-2016. In addition, the collection of the data recommended in this report and its use in maintenance and management systems for prioritisation should be pursued.	End 2016	TII has reviewed maintenance expenditure profiles in neighbouring jurisdictions and are amending their motorway contracts (which are being re-tendered this year) to allow clearer correlation between outputs and costs for routine maintenance. However, TII has noted that has been difficult to obtain data from local authorities in relation to maintenance. The continuing cuts in maintenance to virtually half their 2008 level and way below the levels of peer jurisdictions makes it very difficult to achieve efficient operation	2018	Ongoing
The NRA and LAs, in conjunction with all relevant stakeholders, should implement an efficiency programme for national road maintenance which targets improved performance. A feasibility study on this issue should be completed by end-2016 with a programme of efficiency measures to be completed by end-2017.	End 2017	TII have implemented arrangements whereby those local authorities who use the GeoAPP system and can demonstrate more efficient operations. However progressive cuts in annual funding over recent years mean that TII have insufficient funding available to effectively fund this programme.	2018	Ongoing
DTTaS and the NRA should continue to have a close working relationship in the roads sector and will seek to minimise any constraints to delivery at the LA level. This should involve an analysis of how management and/or funding systems could be better aligned by end-2016.	End 2016	Discussions have taken place with City and Country Managers Association (CCMA), but progressive cuts to maintenance funding levels make it very difficult to achieve progress.	2018	Ongoing
The NRA, DTTaS and LAs, in conjunction with relevant stakeholders such as the CCMA and RMO, should seek to optimise maintenance operations on a regional basis. As such the feasibility of a formal structure of regional maintenance areas should be explored as a priority, so that best practice can be shared and collaboration targeted.	Not specified	In TII's response to the final draft of the report, they indicated that whilst acknowledging that the optimisation of maintenance by local authorities on a regional basis was one option, other options including outsourced regional contracts was another and that all options ought to be evaluated also. This matter will be considered further in conjunction with CCMA and DTTaS following engagement. As part of current review of winter operations, a regionalised structure is one of the options under consideration.	2018	Ongoing

(continues on next page)

## Update on the Implementation of VfM and FPA Recommendations

### National Roads Maintenance Programme - Value for Money Review

Recommendation	Target Date	Action Update	Revised Date	Status
<b>Improve Operation and Efficiency</b>				
The NRA should, as part of an overall data collection plan, proceed to fully implement an adequate method of data collection on ordinary maintenance works through the GeoAPP system by end-2015 to ensure that the appropriate data is available for the management and evaluation of the ordinary maintenance sub-programme. Data on costs and outputs produced by the system should be broadly comparable across delivery mechanisms.	End 2015	TII is endeavouring to establish what constitutes an appropriate level of data collection. The reality is that local authority resources continue to diminish, and the capacity to provide more detailed data is limited. As part of re-tendering our Motorway Maintenance and Renewals Contracts in 2018 TII are endeavouring to ensure the future availability of clearer data on costs and outputs.	2018	Ongoing
The NRA should, as part of an overall data collection plan, continue to collect data centrally on the delivery of winter maintenance to facilitate evaluation and analysis.	Not specified	TII are continuing to collect data on winter maintenance activities. Their biggest challenge is in ensure that local authorities input the necessary data into the Road Weather Information System.	2018	Ongoing
The NRA should, as part of an overall data collection plan, proceed to build and maintain an accurate register of lighting assets on the national road network before end-2016 to facilitate asset management and future sub-programme evaluation.	End 2016	A full inventory of lighting assets has been prepared for the national road network.	n/a	Complete
As part of an overall data collection plan, the NRA will devise and implement a change to the Eirspan bridge management system by end-2016 such that the system will include details of maintenance works that have been carried out and their cost in a format that will allow all such information to be accessed on a national and regional basis.	End 2016	The necessary upgrade to the Eirspan bridge management software has been undertaken. We will however be proceeding to integrate the bridge management system into a broader asset management system commencing in 2018 and scheduled to be completed in 2019.	n/a	Complete
The NRA will proceed to implement a system to track, monitor and evaluate the level of performance and maintenance carried out in regard to ITS maintenance. This system will be operational by the end of 2015.	End 2015	The system of monitoring ITS maintenance contract activities and performance is in place.	n/a	Complete
By end-2015 DTTaS and the NRA should consider the implementation, in consultation with relevant national and international stakeholders, of a national road user survey that is completed to assist in the evaluation and management of this and other NRA programmes.	End 2015	TII has taken initial steps in this regard through discussions with our marketing department and peer jurisdictions in Europe.	2018/2019	Ongoing

(continues on next page)

## Update on the Implementation of VfM and FPA Recommendations

### National Roads Maintenance Programme - Value for Money Review

Recommendation	Target Date	Action Update	Revised Date	Status
<b>Future Monitoring and Evaluation</b>				
DTTaS to carry out a Focused Policy Assessment of this programme's efficiency within 3 years following the implementation of an adequate data collection plan by the NRA. This should incorporate a cost effectiveness analysis of insourced vs. outsourced programme delivery to ascertain if the current mix of delivery mechanisms is in the most efficient. This analysis should also take into account differences in the quality of output.	End 2018	The National Roads Maintenance Programme is due to be selected for an In-Depth Check in 2019 as part of the Quality Assurance process reviewing 2018 expenditure. It has already been reviewed as part of the post-project review element of the 2016 DTTaS Quality Assurance process.	2018	Ongoing
<b>Overall Recommendation</b>				
The Current Road Maintenance Programme on national roads should continue to be carried out by DTTaS and the NRA. The recommendations of this report should be implemented such that efficiency and effectiveness are enhanced.	Not specified	n/a	n/a	Ongoing
<b>END</b>				

## Update on the Implementation of VfM and FPA Recommendations

### Driver Testing Service - Value for Money Review

Recommendation	Target Date	Action Update	Revised Date	Status
<b>Improve Operation and Efficiency</b>				
By end-2017, the RSA should design and put into operation a methodology for allocating direct, indirect and estate costs to each test centre. This data will be used as the basis for comparative analysis of similar test centres, to identify performance indicators and potential areas for improved efficiency. The unit cost per test at each centre should be published at least annually.	End 2017	Ongoing. RSA estimate a Q3 2018 target date for completion.	Mid 2018	Ongoing
By end-2017 the DTS will finalise a methodology to determine the costs and unit costs relating to specific test categories. This data is also to be published at least annually.	End 2017	As above.	Mid 2018	Ongoing
The RSA to endeavour to provide all test applicants with the option of selecting the date and time of their driving test from an online calendar system.	Not specified	RSA estimate a Q2 2019 target date for completion.	Mid 2019	Ongoing
By mid-2017, the RSA is to complete its review of the methodology used to calculate national average waiting times and reassess past figures. This average should be maintained on an ongoing basis on the RSA website.	Mid 2017	RSA believe this action has been achieved.	n/a	Complete
DTTAs and the RSA to agree annually on the number of test applications that can be received and delivered without exceeding the ten-week national average waiting time target. This figure to be included in the Performance Delivery Agreement between them.	Annual	Further scoping required.	Annual	Not started
RSA to develop statistical monitoring system to identify test centres not meeting a sufficient level of test applications relative to similar centres within the same region.	Not specified	Further scoping required. RSA estimate a Q4 2018 target for completion.	End 2018	Not started
RSA to explore the feasibility of developing an evaluation system to determine a maximum number of tests that can be delivered by individual test centres.	Not specified	Further scoping required. RSA estimate a Q4 2018 target for completion.	End 2018	Not started

(continues on next page)

## Update on the Implementation of VfM and FPA Recommendations

### Driver Testing Service - Value for Money Review

Recommendation	Target Date	Action Update	Revised Date	Status
<b>Improve Effectiveness</b>				
Future analysis of Driving Test Pass Rates at National and Test Centre levels should be carried out to include the assessment of possible factors influencing differences in pass rates between men and women, and between different age groups.	Not specified	Further scoping required. RSA will include this in business planning for 2019.	TBD	Not started
Future analysis should also include research into the distinct and enduring regional differences in pass rates, particularly between Western and Eastern test centres.	Not specified	Further scoping required. RSA will include this in business planning for 2019.	TBD	Not started
The statistical monitoring process for individual examiners' pass rates should account for the different vehicle category tests that examiners undertake and calculate the deviation accordingly. For example: an examiner's average pass rate for motorcycle tests should be compared to the comparison group's expected average pass rate for motorcycle tests, as opposed to conducting a comparison based on overall pass rates.	Not specified	RSA estimate a Q4 2018 target date for completion.	End 2018	Ongoing
Measures should be explored to end the possibility of those who hold a third or higher iteration of their learner permit repeatedly renewing their permit without actually sitting the driving test.	Not specified	RSA engaged in monitoring.	TBD	Ongoing
RSA to explore further the possibility of including a Hazard Perception element to the Driver Theory Test and an Independent Driving element to the practical Driving Test.	Not specified	Further scoping required.	TBD	Not started
<b>Data Collection</b>				
By end-2017, RSA and other relevant bodies (i.e. the CSO, An Garda Síochána) should have begun to collect information on license type, driver age, experience, and cause of collision for all drivers involved in collisions.	End 2017	The RSA believe this action has been achieved.	n/a	Complete

(continues on next page)

## Update on the Implementation of VfM and FPA Recommendations

### Driver Testing Service - Value for Money Review

Recommendation	Target Date	Action Update	Revised Date	Status
<b>Data Collection</b>				
The RSA should investigate collision rates, broken down by license type, driver age, driver experience and cause of collision in other countries, in order to better benchmark driver performance and behaviour, and potentially identify specific areas of driver training and testing to target for improvement.	Not specified	The RSA believe this action has been achieved.	n/a	Complete
The RSA should begin to compile data on test fault marking statistics, distinguishing between candidates who pass and fail. This data should be coordinated with the 'cause of collision' data to enable comparison and analysis. This should be used to identify specific behaviours and competencies which should be targeted to improve road safety.	Not specified	Further scoping required. RSA estimate a Q2 2019 target date for completion.	Mid 2019	Ongoing
<b>Future Monitoring &amp; Evaluation</b>				
Once methodologies have been developed and implemented to accurately record and assess costs at a test centre level and by test type, and no later than 18 months after the publication of this report, the RSA should conduct a review of the delivery requirements of the DTS, including a cost-benefit analysis of identified options. This should identify future options for the estate and operational structure of the DTS, and how this will develop over future years.	Mid 2019	Further scoping required. RSA estimate a Q4 2019 target date for completion.	End 2019	Ongoing
The RSA is to monitor the annual difference between Total Costs (incl. Estate Costs) and Fee Income for the DTS on a rolling 3-year basis. This data is to be published annually.	Annual	Further scoping required. RSA estimate a Q2 2019 target date for completion.	Mid 2019	Not started
By end-2017, the RSA will conduct an assessment of the DTS's ability to apply resources where required so as to ensure a consistent level of waiting times between test centres.	End 2017	Ongoing. RSA estimate a Q3 2018 target date for completion.	Mid 2018	Ongoing

(continues on next page)

## Update on the Implementation of VfM and FPA Recommendations

### Driver Testing Service - Value for Money Review

Recommendation	Target Date	Action Update	Revised Date	Status
<b>Future Monitoring &amp; Evaluation</b>				
By Q1 2018, the RSA to have explored the possibility of developing a demand forecasting model for Driving Test Applications. As part of this process it should be investigated whether demand forecasting can be broken down geographically and/or seasonally.	Early 2018	Ongoing. RSA estimate a Q3 2018 target date for completion.	Mid 2018	Ongoing
A focused evaluation of the EDT and IBT programmes to be undertaken by 2018 to assess the impact of the programmes on road safety, pass/fail rates and attendance rates.	End 2017	Planned to commence in Q4 2018.	2019	Not started
Following the RSA's review of the delivery requirements of the DTS, DTTaS should undertake a policy review of the DTS including the possibility of outsourcing the service.	Not specified	The RSA are awaiting feedback from DTTaS on this recommendation.	TBD	Not started
DTTaS should consider, where feasible, explicitly including the recommendations made in this report as measurable targets in their Performance Delivery Agreement with the RSA.	Not specified	The RSA are awaiting feedback from DTTaS on this recommendation.	TBD	Not started
The RSA and OPW should work together to identify alternative uses of estate that is found to be surplus to the requirements of the DTS, as part of the review of the delivery requirements of the DTS.	Not specified	Further scoping required. Analysis of other recommendations required to implement this recommendation.	TBD	Not started
DTTaS will carry out a check as part of the 2018 and 2019 Quality Assurance processes to assess progress on the implementation plan for this report.	Mid 2018/2019	Progress Implementation plan reviewed in June 2018.	Mid 2018/2019	Ongoing
<b>END</b>				